Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

Edited by

Inayatullah, Rubina Saigol and Pervez Tahir

Council of Social Sciences, Pakistan [COSS]
Islamabad
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

Edited by

Inayatullah, Rubina Saigol and Pervez Tahir

Council of Social Sciences, Pakistan
[COSS]
Islamabad
Website: www.coss.sdnpk.org
Email: coss@apollo.net.pk
# 307-Dossal Arcade, Jinnah Avenue, Blue Area, Islamabad
Preface

This book is focussed on the evaluation of the state of social sciences in Pakistan. The Council of Social Sciences (COSS) – a non-profit and autonomous organisation of social scientists – initiated this study in 2003.

In preparing the book, COSS is indebted to:

- The writers of studies, the two joint editors with me Rubina Saigol and Pervez Tahir; and Mr. Yasser Arafat who looked after grammatical correctness and stylistic consistencies in the book.
- Islamabad office of UNESCO and its former Director/Representative Ms. Ingeborg Brian (presently working in UNESCO’s office in Geneva) and Dr. Humala Khalid for providing funds, which enabled COSS to pay honorarium to the writers and editors of this book and meet its printing cost.
- Local office of ActionAid and its then Director Fauzia Saeed for providing funds for establishing an independent office of COSS, for purchasing certain office equipment and for paying the salaries of the staff.
- To Dr. Zarina Salamat, Dr. Rais Ahmad Khan, Dr. Syed Ahmad-uddin Hussain, the volunteer members of the Executive Committee of COSS, and Mr. Muhammad Anwar, partly volunteer office incharge of COSS.
- Mr. Imran Iqbal, Mr. Irtaza Abbas Naqvi, Mr. Khubaib Atta, Mr. Shahid Iqbal, Mr. Tahir Jamil, Mr. Waheed Ahmed, Mr. Abubakar Siddique, Mr. Asim Shehzad and Ijaz Anjum who assisted COSS in processing the data for use in the book.
• To the deans of the faculties of social sciences and arts, chairpersons of social sciences departments and directors of Area Studies, Pakistan Studies, and Women’s Studies Centres in public universities for helping us in the collection of data used in this book. Notable among them are: Dr. Ijaz Hussain (the then Dean of the Faculty of Social Sciences of Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad), Dr. Muhammad Pervuz, Dr. Ghulam Hyder Sindhi, Dr. Muhammad Islam, Dr. Farzana Bari and Dr. A. H. Dani of Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad; Dr. Asad Zaman of International Islamic University, Islamabad; Dr. Riffat Haque of Allama Iqbal Open University, Islamabad; Dr. Abdul Rauf Butt, Dr. Rubina Javed, Dr. Naeem Ahmad and Dr. Munawar Mirza of Punjab University, Lahore; Dr. Najeeb Jamal and Dr. Razia Musarrat of Islamia University, Bahawalpur; Prof. Abdullah Phulpoto of Shah Abdul Latif University, Khairpur; Prof. Iqbal Ahmed Qureshi, Dr. Rafia Ahmad Sheikh, Prof. Chand Bibi Sultana Bukhtiar Zai and Dr. Parveen Shah of Sindh University, Jamshoro; Dr. Abu Zar Wajidi, Dr. Syed Jaffar Ahmed and Dr. Nasreen Aslam Shah of Karachi University, Karachi; Dr. Karamat Ali and Dr. Ishtiaq Ahmad Chaudhary of Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan; Dr. M. A. K. Malghani, Dr. Qamar Zafar, Dr. Naadir Bakht, Prof. Farkhanda Aurangzeb and Dr. Munir Ahmed Baloch of Balochistan University, Quetta; Dr. Taqi Bangash and Dr. Taj Moharram Khan of Peshawar University.

• To Registrars, Controllers of Examinations, Chief Librarians and Librarians of the public sector universities for providing data needed for this book. They include Dr. Waheed Ahmad and Kashif Khurshid of Punjab University, Lahore; and Dr. Muhammad Iqbal of University of Peshawar, Peshawar.

• Mr. Muhammad Ashraf, Research Officer, Ministry of Women Development, Social Welfare & Special Education, Islamabad.

Inayatullah
February 15, 2005
CONTENTS

Preface
Introduction
Inayatullah.......................................................................................... 1

1. Teaching of International Relations in Pakistani Universities
Rasul Bakhsh Rais ............................................................................. 9

2. Development of the Discipline of Political Science in Pakistan
Inayatullah........................................................................................ 31

3. The Development of Strategic Studies in Pakistan
Ayesha Siddiqa ................................................................................ 53

4. The State of Educational Discourse in Pakistan
Rubina Saigol................................................................................... 77

5. Development of Philosophy as a Discipline
Mohammad Ashraf Adeel ............................................................. 129

6. The State of the Discipline of Psychology in Public Universities in Pakistan: A Review
Muhammad Pervez and Kamran Ahmad........................................ 153

7. Development of Economics as a Discipline in Pakistan
Karamat Ali.................................................................................... 177

8. Sociology in Pakistan: A Review of Progress
Muhammad Hafeez........................................................................ 199

9. Anthropology in Pakistan: The State of Discipline
Nadeem Omar Tarar ........................................................................ 221

10. Development of the Discipline of History in Pakistan
Mubarak Ali .................................................................................... 237
11. The Discipline of Public Administration in Pakistan
Zafar Iqbal Jadoon and Nasira Jabeen ...........................................255
12. Journalism and Mass Communication
Mehdi Hasan...................................................................................269
13. Area Studies in Pakistan: An Assessment
Muhammad Islam...........................................................................285
14. Pakistan Studies: A Subject of the State, and the State of the Subject
Syed Jaffar Ahmed .........................................................................305
15. The State of the Discipline of Women’s Studies in Pakistan
Rubina Saigol .................................................................................343
16. Peace and Conflict Resolution Studies
Moonis Ahmar & Farhan H. Siddiqi .............................................387
17. Linguistics in Pakistan: A Survey of the Contemporary Situation
Tariq Rahman .................................................................................403
18. Contribution of the NGOs to Social Science Research in Pakistan
Anwar Shaheen...............................................................................427
19. Quantitative Development of Social Sciences
Pervez Tahir ....................................................................................459
20. Conclusions
Rubina Saigol .................................................................................471
Contributors ....................................................................................485
Index ...............................................................................................491
List of Tables and Annexes............................................................509
Abbreviations ..................................................................................511
Introduction

Be it an individual, group, institution or a system of knowledge, critical self-evaluation is a necessary condition for its growth and development. Such evaluation is more important in the field of knowledge because only through rigorous evaluation, testing and verification, it gains validity, accuracy and a scientific status. Evaluation of knowledge both at a given point and over time needs an explicit set of criteria. If the criteria are not explicit, or different criteria are used for evaluation of similar phenomena at different times, one cannot achieve comparability of results and identify the changes over time in the phenomena under study.

In countries with advanced social sciences, evaluation is part of academic activities of the practitioners of a discipline. Individual scholars write papers about it and present them in annual conferences of their professional associations. The presidents of associations in their presidential addresses often review the progress of disciplines, analyse problems they face and identify the challenges that they need to meet. These multiple activities set the directions and future agenda for a discipline and act as a self-correcting mechanism for it.

In Pakistan the process of evaluation of social sciences, both at the level of separate disciplines or taken together, has remained underdeveloped. With a few exceptions, the practitioners of different disciplines have not conducted systematic studies of their disciplines. Only a small number of studies on the disciplines of Economics, Sociology and Mass Communication
SoSocial Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

appeared in mid and late 1990s. To some extent, this happened
due to the absence of functioning professional associations of
individual disciplines. For some disciplines no professional
association emerged. The associations that emerged for others
remained moribund during most of their existence and (with rare
exceptions) did not make any significant contribution towards
evaluation and development of their disciplines.

The evaluation of social sciences as a whole did not even start
during the first three decades of the life of the country. The first
time it was done was in early 1980s when the University Grants
Commission established the Centre of Social Sciences and
Humanities (COSH) in 1983. COSH constituted a group of
social scientists to conduct a study to assess the needs of five
social science disciplines — History, Political Science and
International Relations, Psychology, Sociology/Anthropology/
Social Work and Philosophy. The group prepared a report
which, though useful in understanding the problems specific to
each discipline, did not provide insights into their collective state
and identify the causes of their underdevelopment. This was
mainly due to the lack of well-articulated theoretical framework
and failure to use explicit criteria of evaluation.

The second step to study social sciences as a whole was taken by
the Faculty of Social Sciences of Quaid-i-Azam University when
in 1986 it got papers prepared on the development of 12 social
science disciplines, three of them multidisciplinary. The writers
of papers were provided specific guidelines and a theoretical
framework. After they were presented and discussed in the first
ever conference of social scientists in 1988, S. H. Hashmi, the
then Dean of Social Sciences in QAU edited them and published
a book with the title The State of Social Sciences in Pakistan. In
2002, S. Akbar Zaidi pursued this task further and prepared a
comprehensive and thought-provoking monograph, Dismal State
of Social Sciences in Pakistan.

To pursue further the task of evaluation of social sciences,
Council of Social Sciences (COSS), which came into existence
in 2000, initiated a research project in 2003. In order to facilitate cumulative growth of knowledge about social sciences in Pakistan, COSS project maintains a certain degree of continuity with Hashmi’s edited volume and Zaidi’s monograph. It incorporates some of the concepts and questions used in them. However, it makes one departure from it. It has extended the number of disciplines for study from 11 in Hashmi edited book to 16 by including five more disciplines. They include Philosophy, Anthropology, Women Studies, and two emerging disciplines, Peace and Conflict Resolution Studies, and Linguistics. Besides, a special paper on the contributions of Non Governmental Organisations (NGOs) to social science research was commissioned.

The focus of this research project is only on social science departments in public universities in the country. It does not include departments in colleges that award postgraduate degrees and the research institutes that do not award such degrees.

The writers of papers were provided with a set of guidelines for preparing their studies with the request to follow them as far as possible. They were also requested to organise their studies around three aspects of their disciplines: quantitative growth, qualitative development and identification of the factors that limited or fostered them.

Under the general rubric of quantitative and qualitative development, the writers were asked to collect specific information about the number of departments in their disciplines and changes that occurred in their strength over time. Such information was also to be collected about PhD and MPhil theses these departments produced. The theses were to be categorised in accordance with a given set of criteria that was provided by guidelines. The writers were also requested to provide and organise material concerning the syllabi and courses for MA and MPhil degrees. Further, a specific question was asked about the inclusion of a course on research methodology. Furthermore, a number of questions were asked about interdisciplinary
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

orientation in the discipline; its ideologisation in terms of Westernisation, secularisation, indigenisation and Islamisation; the development of a professional community around a discipline; the existence of a dialogue within disciplines and departments and across them; the number of journals being issued, and quality of publications in the discipline.

The writers of the papers collected some data for their papers directly from heads of the departments of their disciplines. To further facilitate their work in answering some of the above questions, COSS also collected and tabulated some quantitative data and provided it to the writers. Specifically COSS data was about the number of social science departments, the number of teachers in them, and the level and origin of their degrees. In its raw form, this data was taken from seven Handbooks issued by the Inter University Board and the University Grants Commission at different times. COSS also provided data to the writers about the number of PhD and MPhil theses produced by social science departments from 1948 to 2001, which was taken from a UGC publication. As this publication had information only for the period of 1947 to 1991, COSS collected further data from the heads of social sciences departments and the deans of their faculties and brought it forward to 2001. The data collected by writers and COSS is not always mutually consistent: first for the reason that they have been collected from two different sources and second, because most writers collected their information up to the year 2003 while cut off point for COSS data was the year 2001.

Initially the writers were requested to focus their papers only on the period of 1985-2001. However, as information on some questions became available from 1948 to 2001 this limitation was lifted. Some writers extended this period to 2003 — the year in which they collected their information. This created a dilemma for the editors about the title of the book. Finally we decided to name it 'Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile'.

The writers faced several problems while preparing their studies. First, with the exception of the papers in Hashmi edited book and
Introduction

Zaidi’s monograph there was no systematic studies on the development of different disciplines on which they could have built on. Most of the writers sent questionnaires to the departments teaching the discipline for getting the information they needed for their papers. On an average only half of them responded. It seems that many departments do not maintain the requested information and some heads of the departments who had such information were reluctant to share it. Some writers were able to collect a great deal of information about their disciplines with relative ease because of their higher status in departmental hierarchy. Others had to struggle to get information of some reasonable amount.

The papers included in this project represent a wide range of interests, priorities and emphases. As mentioned above, although all writers of papers were provided with a uniform set of guidelines to carry out the research, and provided with data on certain aspects of their studies, a significant variation has occurred resulted in the kind, level, quality, depth and emphasis that the papers represent. Some of the papers are detailed, thorough and examine the discipline with great depth. Others are general overviews of the discipline. This makes comparative analysis somewhat difficult, but the papers still provide some insights into the state of the subject.

The papers in this volume were prepared to serve two objectives: first to provide an in-depth understanding of a particular discipline and second to provide material for developing an overall picture of social sciences in the country. The papers related to the first category are included in the present volume. To give the readers a preview of this picture two papers: one by Pervez Tahir ‘Quantitative Development of Social Sciences’ and the other by Rubina Saigol ‘Conclusion’ have been included in this book. For realising the second objective, a comprehensive and in-depth view of overall development of social sciences in Pakistan another volume is under preparation, using material from the papers in this volume as well as information from other sources.
This book presents facts and their scientific interpretation about the state of social sciences in Pakistan. It can produce two different attitudes among the academic community and policy makers. It may depress some and in others it may generate energy and insight to reverse the policies and national priorities that produced these facts. If the book promotes the second attitude, the labour of the writers, editors and financial assistance of donors will be rewarded.
Notes

1 These studies have been compiled and edited by S. A. Zaidi with the title, *Social Sciences in Pakistan in the 1990s* (Council of Social Sciences, Islamabad, 2003).
4 COSS, Islamabad, 2002.
5 To keep the project manageable, a number of disciplines which fall within the broad category of social sciences such as Social Work were not included in the list of COSS study.
6 During the last quarter of twentieth century a number of civil society organisations popularly known as NGOs have emerged in the country. Some of them have made significant direct contributions to social science research, others have produced material that can be used by social scientists in their work. Anwar Shaheen’s paper on ‘Contribution of the NGOs to Social Science Research in Pakistan’ offers detailed analysis of the quantity and quality of their research emphasising the need for collaborative work between the academics and NGO researchers.
7 However, a few writers have included postgraduate colleges and research institutes in their papers.
8 These guidelines were provided to make the studies comparable. Most of the writers have followed them to varying degrees.
9 Before their finalisation, each paper went through a lengthy process of review by the editors followed by meetings of the writers in Lahore, Karachi and Islamabad in which the papers were thoroughly examined.
11 *National Bibliography of Research Theses Submitted to the Universities of Pakistan* (University Grants Commission, Islamabad, 2000).
Teaching of International Relations in Pakistani Universities

Rasul Bakhsh Rais

Introduction
Although there is some degree of sameness in the functional aspects of international relations of all states, the modernised nations and Third World countries have vast differences in the content and process of interaction with other states and non-state actors. Factors such as power, capabilities, size, resources, technologies and level of development play important role in shaping goals and mobilising appropriate means for realising them. Ideographic differences in values, goals, means, and domestic systems present difficulties in the development of a general theory of International Relations that would be capable of explaining behaviour of all type of states. We are far away from this destination, and some would even question if we need to pursue the goal of building such a theory. Failures to build a unified theory have not deterred us from launching fresh efforts. Impressed by the intellectual advancement of other social sciences, the specialists in our field by applying diverse approaches and methodologies have turned the discipline from dry, empty to fulsome and elegant. This can be gauged from the rich literature that has emerged as a result of efforts to construct theories. There is a new effort to theorise in the light of post-Cold War developments by revisiting some of the theoretical constructs that we developed during the Cold War decades. That is part of our learning, relearning, correcting and thus moving
forward by constantly re-examining our theories and their explanatory power.

The ideas, debates and scholarly discourses that normative, realist, neo-realist, positivist, neo-Marxist, political economy and world society paradigms have greatly enriched the field of International Relations. However most of the theoretical developments in the field have taken place in the American universities that have a strong tradition of intellectual rigour, free debate and competitive academic environment. English and European universities have equally strong tradition in diplomatic history and their focus on Area Studies has produced excellent works in the field. The insights, conceptual frameworks, models, methodologies and approaches that have emerged as a result of research and writings in the field have fast travelled to our parts of the world. Those of us who had training in the American and European universities have brought back all the debates of the field to the classrooms and seminars.

Mechanism of Transfer of Western Thought
The Western influence on our thoughts and academic practices is not confined to our years of education in American and European universities. It has continued to dominate our writings and teaching in the field in three different ways. First are the fellowship programmes and academic priorities of the award granting foundations, universities and think-tanks. They invite applications within specific areas of political, security, economic and social concerns. By pre-determining the academic agenda of the researchers from our part of the world, they fundamentally influence the production of knowledge in our field according to their own policy concerns. This influence is not confined to the Third World countries alone, the scholars in the Western countries have also to conform to the fellowship agenda if they hope to win a fellowship grant. It is more confining in the case of Third World scholars because of lack of adequate grant facilities in the home countries. The Western scholars have greater ability to secure funding for their projects from the universities and a great variety of other sources. However, it would be unfair to say
that any grant or fellowship imposes any restriction on academic freedom or intellectual independence of any researcher or scholar. The list of areas of general preference is also adequately broad and gives considerable choice. The only confining element is the list itself.

The second source of continuing influence is the American and British textbooks. Since the field of International Relations has mostly developed in these countries, the quality of works, the scope and depth of scholarship is remarkably high, which no teacher or writer in the developing world can ignore. The American and British Scholars have continued to add to and refine the theories, concepts and analytical frameworks. They have stayed far ahead of us in their intellectual lead, which rather gives us an opportunity to bring fresh insights to our classrooms by using the most recent of their works. This is also reflected in the contents of the professional journals, where most of the scholarly debates have been taking place. It is only in the professional journals in the field that some of us have been able to make contributions, and that has added to the variety and enrichment of the field. Although some of the works produced by the South Asian scholars including Pakistanis are being used in the course outlines in the American and European universities, the course contents here and there are largely dominated by the works of Western scholars.

The culture of seminars and conferences is a third important means of promoting new ideas, introducing fresh works for debates and discussion and encouraging research in new areas. Most of the conferences have specific themes and narrow focus depending on the major academic interests of the grant awarding institutions. It is only the professional conferences like the annual conference of the Associations of International Studies that offer an open, free and quite stimulating environment and opportunity for the growth of scholarship. In this important area, our representation has been very marginal, owing to lack of funding from the home country sources. In Pakistan, despite qualitative growth of teaching of International Relations, none of
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

us has succeeded in convening even a first International Relations conference to explore the various sub-fields and the contemporary debates. We will return to this theme little later.

**Indigenisation**

The question of relevance of the material content, debates, and global issues that we teach as International Relations in Pakistani universities is fundamental one. This is because the countries around us and within the extended region have very specific and unique characteristics in the circumstances of their birth and development. Their geopolitical conditions and the foreign and security policy agendas are equally distinctive. While fundamental concepts that have defined theorising in International Relations may have a degree of universality, the specificity of each state and its regional environment and problems would require an extended and varied theoretical outlook. That in case of Pakistan and many other states is missing.

The central argument of this essay is that conceptualisation of International Relations rooted in the Western experience of statehood and international system may be regarded as incomplete without reflections on the realities of the Third World. With the dominance of Anglo-American perspective, the field of International Relations has essentially remained ethnocentric. Even juxtaposition of Third World into a single analytical unit would encounter serious difficulties in establishing common patterns of actions because of the variations in development, political processes, and nature of external linkages. By arguing that all states are functionally similar and their structural and behavioural characteristics produce the same system of ‘ordered anarchy’, the various theories of International Relations have partially addressed this dilemma. Since all states operate in conditions, understood differently ranging from anarchy to complex interdependence, the uniqueness of each nation does not matter, as the functional elements of their operational environment are the same. Pursuit of national interest and legal notions of sovereign equality are
Teaching of International Relations in Pakistani Universities

common values that have provided intellectual tools to discover the global patterns. There are some critics who argue that the International Relations theory is hegemonic in terms of its focus on nation state and its central concerns with sovereignty and national security.\(^\text{10}\)

This brief paper attempts to examine various aspects of the discipline of International Relations in Pakistani universities, its quantitative and qualitative growth during the past fifteen years, the quality of research and teaching and where it stands today as compared to other social science disciplines. As discussed above our basic contention is that the Pakistani experts in the field like their counterparts in South Asia have heavily borrowed from the Western social sciences.\(^\text{11}\) The field of International Relations is no exception. The analytical models and themes developed by Western scholars continue to influence our teaching and research interests. This is also reflected in the designing of our courses and selection of reading materials and choosing themes for publications.

**State of Indigenous Scholarship**

Although the discipline of International Relations has witnessed remarkable growth in the opening up of new departments at different universities during the past three decades, the Pakistani scholars have not produced a single work in the core areas that could be used as a textbook. Almost two generations of university teachers have failed to give the Pakistani students basic introductory texts in those sub-fields of the discipline that are generally considered as compulsory for the completion of the programme. Compared to American universities, one notices an unusually long list of compulsory courses in the departments of International Relations here. These include, Introduction to International Relations (goes under a variety of titles), International Law, Strategic Studies, International Relations Since 1945, Political Economy, Theories of Comparative Politics, Politics of Pakistan (both are Political Science stuff), Foreign Policy and Research Methodology.
A scant look on the contemporary research interests of the academic and non-academic writers would reveal that security issues relating to Afghanistan, Pakistan and South Asia have dominated their research agenda more than any other subject. This interest is shown in the great number of books and research articles that have appeared in Pakistani and foreign journals. The works of Institute of Strategic Studies and Regional Studies, and Islamabad Policy Research Institute also focus largely on regional security issues. Their journals, seminars and conferences have security related content and discussion, but also cover a great deal in the area of foreign relations and wide range of contemporary themes of world. These three institutes along with the Pakistan Institute of International Affairs, the oldest in the country have provided excellent forum to Pakistani and foreign policy makers and scholars to debate world affairs and publish their researches.

Some teachers in the various departments of International Relations have done pretty well in getting their articles published in scholarly journals abroad, in Australia, Britain and the United States. Some of them have got books published by foreign presses. Actually, the culture of publishing in various fields of social sciences developed only in late seventies and 1980s. Very few teachers of International Relations and Political Science published during the first three decades. History was an exception. Getting published in recognised foreign journals was result of competitive academic environment that developed in 1980s, particularly at Quaid-i-Azam University. Newly trained faculty members in British and American universities brought back the tradition of research and writing believing that national and international professional recognition could only be possible through quality writing and research. A small group of such scholars has established a good tradition of publishing in the field of International Relations. The quality of much of their writing is comparable to international standards with usual variations that would be natural even among community of scholars in American and British universities. In the coming years, this trend is likely to grow, as better students are coming
Teaching of International Relations in Pakistani Universities

out of the departments of International Relations that are being absorbed by various policy-oriented both private and semi-autonomous think-tanks.

**The Study and Teaching of International Relations**

The study and teaching of International Relations has seen rapid expansion and popularity in Pakistani universities. Karachi University was the first to open the Department of International Relations in the 1958. At that time Karachi being the capital city attracted a good number of writers and professional diplomats who in some way had been either involved in conducting diplomacy or had scholarly interest in the field. In the early years of Independence they established Pakistan Institute of International Affairs, which continues to be one of the prominent think-tanks in Pakistan. The Institute has seen many ups and downs during the past fifty-six years, but has survived and has done pretty well in promoting study of International Relations and Foreign Policy.

The founding fathers of the Institute of International Affairs were deeply committed persons and with great quality of intellectual leadership. Among them, Khawja Sarwar Hassan played a vital role in launching various programmes of the Institute. Khawja Hassan in our view is the real pioneer of research and writings in the discipline of International Relations. He started with policy-oriented research, collection of documents and their publications. At his Institute, he organised seminars and lectures where the top policy makers of the new nation delivered their talks. The most enduring contribution of the Institute has been the regular publication of its journal, the *Pakistan Horizon*, which is the pioneer in the field of International Relations in Pakistan. Comparing it to what it was in the early years, its quality has regrettably declined.

Besides Karachi University, five other universities in Pakistan have departments of International Relations. Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad introduced this discipline in 1972 with very limited faculty sources. In order to cater to the rising
demand of the students in this new area in the social science faculties, later on, the Sindh University, Jamshoro, University of Balochistan, Quetta and Shah Abdul Latif University, Khairpur, and University of Peshawar also opened departments of International Relations. These universities are located in different regions of the country and enrol students from the local communities. In terms of numbers the departments have proliferated. In addition to International Relations departments, departments of Defence and Strategic Studies, at Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad, Fatima Jinnah Women University, Rawalpindi and Punjab University, Lahore have introduced degree programmes in Defence and Diplomacy.

Departments of Political Science almost in every university offer courses in International Relations. Some of these departments offer specialisation in International Relations besides offering one or two introductory courses. This would require students to take about three to four courses or in lieu of two courses and write an MA dissertation on a topic relating to International Relations. Teaching of International Relations in the departments of Political Science is an old academic tradition. Many of the old teachers and scholars in the field of Political Science consider International Relations as its sub-field. Likewise, most of the American and British universities continue to place International Relations under the departments of Government, Politics or Political Science, as they go by different nomenclature. It has never raised any eyebrows among the old teachers of Political Science over the opening up of so many departments of International Relations, often next to their parent departments. Rather, there is a wider recognition in Pakistan that International Relations is a distinctive discipline, which has the quality of absorbing concepts, theories and intellectual substance from so many diverse disciplines of social sciences.

During the past two decades, the subject of International Relations has emerged as a very popular field among students. The Department of International Relations, Quaid-i-Azam University receives more than 200 applications and it admits
Teaching of International Relations in Pakistani Universities

only 50 on annual basis. Recently, it has started granting admission twice a year. Fifty is roughly the number that the International Relations departments in other universities can accommodate annually, but annual intake drastically varies from one university to another. There are three reasons for the popularity of International Relations among both young men and women. First, many of the students who enter social science departments want to pursue careers in government bureaucracy through competitive examinations. A general perception among students is that study of International Relations gives them greater depth and exposure and covers greater variety of subjects than the traditional subjects (for instance History, Political Science), which they think they can prepare through independent reading. There is no data to compare but general view is that candidates who have degree in International Relations have done comparatively better in these examinations than students from other social sciences. Second, because of the problems that Pakistan and many other Islamic countries face, the war in Afghanistan, first Soviet and now American intervention there, Palestine and Kashmir issues and general sense of powerlessness among Muslims invokes considerable interest in world affairs among Pakistanis. The young generation entering the university system of Pakistan carry that social interest to their choice of academic disciplines. Thirdly, young students have a tendency to study something new when they enter the university system. The colleges affiliated with various universities don’t offer International Relations at BA level except Sindh University Jamshoro and Shah Abdul Latif University, Khairpur on limited basis. Also, the relative decline of traditional disciplines, like History and Political Science has pushed relatively better students toward International Relations. Almost all universities are successfully running MA programmes in International Relations, although the quality and focus of their programmes varies. We will address this issue little later. All of them however, have failed to develop PhD programmes. Almost all the International Relations departments of the Pakistani universities have approved MPhil and PhD programmes on the academic calendars. But not all of them have been pursuing
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

these degree programmes with similar consistency, rigour or regularity.

Table 1: PhD and MPhil Theses Produced in Seven International Relations Departments by the Year 2002

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>University</th>
<th>PhD</th>
<th>MPhil</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>University of Karachi, Karachi</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad</td>
<td>Nil</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sindh University, Jamshoro</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan</td>
<td>Nil</td>
<td>Nil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shah Abdul Latif University, Khairpur</td>
<td>Nil</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University of Peshawar, Peshawar</td>
<td>n/a</td>
<td>n/a</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Balochistan University, Quetta</td>
<td>Nil</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>57</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: National Bibliography of Research Theses submitted to the Universities of Pakistan (MPhil and PhD equivalent levels) University Grants Commission, Islamabad, 2002, pp. 226-36; Information individually supplied by departments of International Relations to the Council of Social Sciences.14

We would like to analyse the data though limited in the above table by raising two questions: first, why these departments have failed to develop PhD programmes? Second, what are the topics and trends that theses written so far reflect? Taking the first question first, there are many reasons for failure in developing PhD programme. The most important one is lack of interest in academic profession among the bright students who prefer to take competitive examination, or since the early nineties have been seeking placement in non-governmental organisations that have much higher scale than the universities can offer them. At the time of this writing, almost all the departments of International Relations lack a core faculty of highly trained scholars that could provide the nucleus for developing and promoting higher education leading to the PhD degree. At best, the departments, at a given point of time, have had the services of two to three such scholars who could devote themselves to guiding PhD students. But unfortunately, many of them pressed by economic hardships have little time and energy to devote themselves fully or take greater responsibility of supervising theses. With new economic incentives (Supervisor of PhD thesis would get Rs. 40,000 a piece) we may see greater interest in PhD research. But without a transparent system of accountability that
Teaching of International Relations in Pakistani Universities

the public universities in Pakistan lack, unscrupulous teachers, (we have good share of them among us) may start just fixing signatures on substandard, poor quality or even plagiarised dissertations. Some teachers privately confide that this has already started happening. Are we going to have a new glut of paper-degree holders in International Relations and other disciplines of social sciences? I am afraid, yes, if the research is not made a genuinely meaningful exercise, and the economic incentive is misused to get some one cross the line for the buck.

One of the most regretful aspects of development of the discipline of International Relations is that the hiring policies in the departments of International Relations do not match the popularity of the discipline among young students. Overwhelming majority of the teachers that is about 62 in six universities are without PhD degrees. There are only 12 teachers in all the universities mentioned above who have PhD degrees, and only seven of them have the benefit of education in American and British universities. The problem is that highly trained teachers in this discipline are not available in the country for various reasons. Some of the salient reasons are poor salary, unfriendly academic environment, pettiness generally associated with the academic profession and lack of opportunities for higher education in social sciences. Those with higher degrees in the discipline are more attracted to job in the foreign universities than to work in low paid positions in Pakistan. There is good number of Pakistani scholars who are teaching abroad in the departments of Political Science, Public Administration and International Studies, but they would not like to work in Pakistan for the above reasons. Even some of those who have preferred to come back for family or other reasons have gone to work with the NGOs. In recent years, lots of private universities have emerged that are offering far better pay structures to PhD degree holders than the public universities. I am afraid the public universities in Pakistan are not going to retain the foreign trained teachers for too long. The lure of bigger salary elsewhere is just too great to stay glued to the old, and in many ways, decaying institutions. A new cadre of trained teachers could be created
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

through foreign scholarship programme for in-service teachers. But with our bias in favour of natural sciences, training of teachers in International Relations or in other social sciences has not received attention of the Ministry of Education, University Grants Commission, now renamed as Higher Education Commission, or by the universities themselves.

The second question relates to the themes of PhD and MPhil dissertations in the departments of International Relations. Although it is very difficult to draw strictly sub-disciplinary boundaries among a great variety of topics, we draw somewhat arbitrarily the following categories: Dealing with theoretical issues, Pakistani state and society, other countries and those doing some type of comparison.

Table 2: Theme of PhD and MPhil Theses Submitted in Seven Departments of International Relations by the Year 2002

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Theoretical</th>
<th>Pakistan state and society/ Bilateral relations</th>
<th>Relations and problems of other Countries</th>
<th>Comparative</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PhD</td>
<td>Nil</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>Nil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MPhil</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>Nil</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: National Bibliography of Research Theses submitted to the Universities of Pakistan (MPhil and PhD equivalent levels) (University Grants Commission, Islamabad, 2002), pp. 226-36; Information individually supplied by departments of International Relations to the Council of Social Sciences.

Among the dissertations listed in our data, theoretical and comparative studies haven’t attracted the attention of researchers. There are only two dissertations written at any department of International Relations towards completion of MPhil that roughly fall into the category of theoretical work. One is on Islamic theory of International Relations by Mujeeb Afzal and the second is by Asad Hayauddin on decision-making theory and Pakistan’s Afghan policy. It is more of an application of an existing theory than new theoretical speculation. Afzal’s work however for the first time brings into light some Islamic theoretical strands in the field trying to explain international
Teaching of International Relations in Pakistani Universities

politics. Rest of the theses are generally about Pakistan’s relations with other countries, on regional cooperation organisations, bilateral disputes or about problems and foreign polices of either major powers or Muslim states in Central Asia and the Middle East. Three topics seem to have been consistent focus of researchers, Afghanistan, nuclear proliferation in South Asia and Pakistan’s relations with the United States. Besides these being repeated one finds a rich variety of subjects on which dissertations have been written. A great majority of these however directly or indirectly relate to Pakistan and its neighbourhood in South Asia, Central Asia and the Middle East. This brief survey is about the nature of topics and in no way we comment on the quality of the research produced. It would be unfair to pronounce any judgement until one has read all of them in entirety. In our view some research is better than no research at all. In our universities, there is a strong trend toward research, its standards do vary from place to place and from one researcher to another, which is equally true of other countries and universities. During the period under investigation 1987-2002, one sees remarkable quantitative growth of research dissertations compared to other periods in Pakistan’s academic history. Why is it so? Two more years in the university for doing MPhil gives students appearing in the competitive examination an edge over those who quit after an MA degree. Secondly, it places them in better position both for teaching and research jobs in the country. Thirdly, MPhil degree prepares students better to pursue higher studies in foreign universities. This is not the only reason but one of the main considerations for students opting for MPhil in International Relations in any other social science discipline. Finally, ‘economic, social and cultural globalisation has exponentially increased the salience and relevance of International Relations.’ Many of International Relations graduates are getting placement in the growing NGO sector, media and development consultancy.

For entering the PhD programme, the motivations are different. No university teacher can get promoted to the rank of an Associate Professor without a PhD degree in his or her
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

respective field. This has some marginal influence over the teachers. Many of them are enrolled in PhD programmes though few have been able to complete their work. The new trend is toward obtaining the degree, as it would make the teacher look more dignified and accepted by the academic establishment. Others who are entering afresh want to pursue academic careers in teaching and research, as the degree would give them a competitive edge over those who don’t have it.

Course Content
Largely owing to the shortage of trained teachers, teaching of International Relations has remained inadequate and backward with few exceptions where the teachers had significant exposure to foreign academia. The discipline of International Relations, as indicated in the beginning of this essay, has undergone profound intellectual transformation the world over. Unfortunately, majority of the teachers in Pakistan are not familiar with the classical debates, fresh approaches, methodologies and contemporary controversies of the field. A teacher or a student of International Relations may not be able to comprehend the subject fully without exposure to the classical literature and the fascinating debates that have been going on for the past five decades. With poor academic background a teacher in the field may not fully introduce the discipline to a student and initiate him to independent learning. Most of the students entering the university and taking courses in the International Relations have no background of this discipline and have no ability to challenge the knowledge and understanding of the half-baked and ill-prepared teacher on the other side of the rostrum.

A review of the curricula run by the International Relations departments in our universities suggests that they meet just the basic requirements. But the titles of courses with short descriptions are hollow shells; the substance is always provided by the teacher. Theoretically, he has the responsibility to select the most recent readings and assign them to students. A cursory look at the reading list for various courses, particularly departments running on annual system, would indicate that the
Teaching of International Relations in Pakistani Universities

books and authors have long lost their relevance. Some of the authors of old textbooks died long ago and their books are no longer in use or in print anymore in the Western world. Frankly speaking, they don’t have any relevance to what is the real stuff of International Relations today. The photocopy machine and the old-fashioned teachers have kept the redundant works and their authors alive. The case of classical works is different, as their utility as a starting point and in relating to the progress in the field is immense, but this kind of stuff rarely captures the imagination of our teachers.

It should be institutional responsibility of the International Relations departments and the university to provide recent publications to the faculty members and have the references and main libraries well stocked. They have utterly failed in this because of the budgetary constraints. On their own, the faculty members have little means to spare to build up their personal collections with the meagre salaries that they have to live with. Therefore, many of the teachers end up having limited or no access to recent publications in their respective fields of teaching. This reflects back in the classroom. Our failure to catch up with the most recent works keeps our students below the acceptable level of understanding of the subject matter.

Another problem is that availability of a teacher in a particular field has largely determined the selection of both the subject matter as well as the choice of courses that a department would offer for study. The basic requirements of the degree or well-rounded intellectual development of the students is generally left out of the scheme of things. Students in many departments have little option but to study only those courses that the department can offer or teachers find themselves confident to teach. In most of the cases, it is stale, old stuff that teachers have been offering to students year after year without any change in the content or the reading list. In theory, the option to select courses is there, but practically, since the number of faculty members is very small, students are left out of any choice. This deficiency could be compensated if students were allowed to take some of the
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

courses in other departments of the social science faculty. In many cases, students can at the most be permitted to take one or two courses outside their own departments. Allowing students to undertake courses in the departments of History, Economics, Sociology, Anthropology and Political Science would help the students acquire a broad-based understanding of the forces that shape international politics. Unfortunately, our faculties have drawn very narrow intellectual boundaries around themselves. Given the fact, cross-fertilisation with other social science disciplines virtually does not exist.

International Relations programmes in Pakistani universities are primarily generalist in orientation. Most of the departments have taken an Area Study approach to organise their teaching programmes with little attention to the main fields of the discipline. Some of the departments have specified areas of specialisation, such as, International Relations, Strategic Studies, International Law and Organisation, South Asia, Middle East and Comparative Politics. But students have very little or no specialisation in real terms. They are rather exposed quite cursorily to the various sub-fields. Given the fact that students entering the Master programme in most of the International Relations departments have no exposure to even basics of the field, generalist approach may be the most appropriate. But this approach is not carried through the entire programme. The distribution of courses in various areas and the core interests of the field are very lopsided. It is again the problem of limited faculty and their narrow focus that don’t allow the students to explore different sub-fields adequately.

Related to the above problems is the question of rationalising the classification of the subjects as optional and compulsory. In some cases, the list of compulsory is short, while in others the number is too excessive that leaves students very little choice of subjects. In some departments of International Relations as many as nine to eleven courses are listed as compulsory, which is roughly fifty percent of the courses required to complete the degree requirements.
Major Challenges
There are three major challenges that the teaching and research in the field of International Relations in Pakistan faces. The first one is lack of theoretical orientation of the courses. Even the core courses are empty in terms of modern theoretical controversies. In some departments either theory is entirely non-existent or extremely week. This gives most of the departments an orientation of diplomatic history or foreign policy. Why it is so? This brings us back to the poor academic training of most of the faculty members. Most of them were never exposed to various theoretical strands that have dominated our field. Our contention is that without understanding various theoretical strands and introducing them to students, the real substance of International Relations may stay out of our discourses.

The second important challenge, and if you may, critique of the teaching of International Relations is its weak multidisciplinary character. The discipline started out by borrowing heavily from other disciplines and has demonstrated its capacity to absorb their concepts, approaches and theories. In the Western academia, it is not only the social science but also the natural sciences that have greatly added to the teaching and study of International Relations. The new fields, like Environmental Security relies heavily on Chemistry and Biology along with social sciences. Likewise, the nuclear proliferation, missile regimes, the space based defence system also require some understanding of the basic sciences. This cross-fertilisation has not occurred in Pakistan. Even the core disciplines like Economics find very little space on the course list of the International Relations departments.

The third important challenge is the lack of nexus between the policy makers and the Pakistani academia. The foreign policy establishment operates from within its own shell. It is less open to the researchers than anywhere in the world. Its archives are inaccessible. Repeated efforts to get the thirty years old files open to public have failed. The government of Pakistan has yet
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

to enact any enabling legislation in this respect. Nor is there any strong tradition of consulting the academics and researchers on important foreign policy matters. The very purpose of establishing Area Study Centres at six universities that cover all the regions of the world and funding of Institute of Regional Studies, Institute of Strategic Studies, and Islamabad Policy Research Institute was to support the foreign policy making process in Pakistan. Interaction between the foreign policy bureaucracy and the academia is better today than it was a decade ago but we still institutional linkages between the two are as weak as the tradition of consulting the expert by the bureaucrats.

The number of semi-autonomous institutes and centres has proliferated during the past two decades. The non-government organisations like the Islamabad Council of World Affairs (ICWA), Foundation for Research on International Environment National Development & Security (FRIENDS), Sustainable Development Policy Institute (SDPI) are also making valuable contribution in introducing new debates and alternative discourse on foreign and security policy issues. There is lot of interaction mostly through seminars and conferences between the faculty of the departments, institutes, and NGOs. Although the quality of debate and research interests of many of these institutions varies greatly, they have definitely added to resilience of intellectual culture in Pakistan. They are also emerging as important part of the fledgling civil society of Pakistan. The Foreign Office or governments in future may not be able to ignore their voice on foreign policy issues.

There are some additional concerns that we have to take into account. In our view, the shortage of trained faculty is the main challenge that the departments of International Relations face today. Those few with higher qualifications are drawing close to retirement. There is no sign or initiative that they would be replaced by equally qualified ones. If it is not done in the immediate future, not only will the quality of teaching decline
but also the culture of research and inquiry suffers a grave setback.

The most recent books in the field and journals that carry the debates about International Relations are not available at all the departments and universities. The spread of Internet may be supplementing some of the deficiency, but it is not a good substitute for well-funded and well-stocked library resources.

In the coming decades, the market forces will largely determine the relevance of various disciplines. The old-fashioned approach to the study and content of International Relations may further diminish the job prospects for the students of discipline if the changes in the job market are not kept in mind. We need to retool ourselves and make the discipline marketable in the changing environments of our economy. Focus on international development, study of media, civil society and marginalised communities may bring us out of the traditional state-centric mould and introduce new thinking and approaches to the study of International Relations.

**Recommendations and Conclusion**

Given the problems in teaching and research in International Relations discussed above one may make a number of recommendations.

1. International Relations department at the Quaid-i-Azam University be expanded and upgraded into a centre of excellence on the pattern of School of International Studies at Jawaharlal Nehru University. In order to retain the current faculty and attract qualified teachers, more positions at Associate and Professor level be created. The problem of shortage of qualified teachers in the field is so acute that even losing two foreign-trained faculty members would deal a deathblow to the relatively strong academic character of the department at this premier public university.

2. A pool of qualified teachers can neither work nor train young scholars without a good library. Each department of International
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

Relations needs a separate specialised library with major focus on acquiring all significant periodicals.

3. Efforts should be made to publish a professional journal in the field. There are quite a few journals that are being published by the research institutes out of the universities, yet we need a journal that should be devoted to the promotion of professional research. Such a journal may achieve excellence and recognition only if it has strict criteria for the evaluation of research material by anonymous referees.

4. Most of the research work in the field of International Relations is the product of scholar's individual efforts. The concept of sponsored or contract research in this field has not taken off. The government of Pakistan, the NGOs and the research institutes may assign studies to the teachers working in the universities.

5. Cooperation and greater interaction among the departments of International Relations, Political Science, Defence and Strategic Studies, Defence and Diplomacy of the universities for the development of our discipline, or for that matter, in other disciplines would be necessary. There is no professional forum that could bring all of them together on annual basis. There are national seminars and conferences on subjects relating to International Relations but they never address the core professional aspects of the field. Founding of Pakistan Association of International Studies is long overdue. Once we have that, teachers and scholars of International Relations and other related fields can meet annually under the aegis of the Association to discuss the status of teaching of International Relations and its various sub-fields. Annual gathering will help us learn from one another for developing curricula, design courses and exchanging our experiences. There is lot that we can do together. Since the academia in Pakistan and other South Asian countries face more or less similar problems, it would be useful if we create a regional body, something like South Asian Association of International Studies that may provide a regular forum for debate on theoretical issues, new researches, course contents and redesigning of curricula.
Teaching of International Relations in Pakistani Universities

Notes

1 James N. Rosenau, New Directions in the Study of Foreign Policy (Allen & Unwin, Boston, 1987); Alexander L. George, Bridging the Gap: Theory and Practice in Foreign Policy (United States Institute of Peace, Washington D.C., 1993); Lloyed Jensen, Explaining Foreign Policy (N. J. Englewood Cliff, Prentice Hall, 1982).


4 Kenneth W. Thompson, Schools of Thought in International Relations (Louisiana State University Press, Baton Rouge, 1996).


7 Some of the professional journals in the field are: World Politics, International Security, Foreign Policy, Orbis, International Studies Quarterly, Conflict Resolution, Foreign Affairs.


12 Hasan Askari Rizvi from Political Science Department of University of the Punjab was the first to publish. But he first began in the field of Politics, later developed his interest in International Relations. Pervaiz Iqbal Cheema could be considered the first generation scholar of International Relations who began to publish in foreign journals. Before him, a few teachers, notably, Mohammad Ahsan Choudhry from the University of Karachi also published widely. Ijaz Hussain, Mohammad Waseem, Zafar Iqbal Cheema, Tahir Amin, Ruksana Siddiqui, Rifaat Hussain, and this scribe from the Quaid-i-Azam University have been conducting research within and outside the country. Mehtab Ali Shah from Sindh University Jamshoro, Moonis Ahmar, Talat Wizarat, Sikandar
Mehdi of Karachi University have maintained good tradition of quality publications. It is difficult to put all names here, but in my view a large number of teachers in the field are engaged in writing and research in the field of International Relations.

13 See University of Karachi website: http://www.ku.edu.pk/
14 The data gathered by these sources include information only about International Relations departments and do not include the research theses both MPhil and PhD written at the Area Study Centres, Centre of Pakistan Studies and departments of Political Science which have produced large number of theses that focus on international relations topics. Therefore, this paper is confined only to the work done in the departments of International Relations.
15 Author’s private conversation with serving and retired members of Social Science Faculty at the Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad.
16 See a letter to editor by Dr. Moonis Ahmar, *Dawn*, 14 September 2003.
17 Varun Sahni, ‘International Relations Teaching in Indian Universities,’ in *Teaching of International Relations in South Asian Universities* (The United States Educational Foundation in India, New Delhi, 2003), p. 22.
Development of the Discipline of Political Science in Pakistan

Inayatullah

Introduction
This paper examines the development of the discipline of Political Science in public universities in Pakistan. Both quantitative and qualitative aspects of development are described and analysed. Where data was available, the development of Political Science is compared with the development of other social science disciplines.

Why some people in a society have more power than others? How is power acquired and used? What is the legitimate use of power and when such use becomes illegitimate? These are some questions, which have attracted the attention of thinkers in different societies and at different times. During the last two centuries, philosophers and social scientists in the West, using what is called scientific methodology, have discussed these questions. The use of this methodology has earned the discipline investigating these questions the title of ‘Political Science’ the only social science discipline that carries the term ‘science’ in its nomenclature.

Pakistan inherited the discipline of Political Science along with Economics and History from the British rule in India. Before Partition, the first department of Political Science in areas
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

comprising the present Pakistan was opened in 1933 in Punjab University. Immediately after the Partition its functioning was disrupted but in short time it resumed teaching. The discipline as a whole also started developing. From one department in 1947, the number of departments rose to seven by 2001.

The intellectual orientation of the inherited Political Science discipline was predominantly legalistic, descriptive, and normative, and did not related political phenomena to their social structure and culture context. Originating in British universities in 19th century this orientation of the discipline came to Indian universities with British rule. It remained more or less frozen and did not undergo the changes, which occurred in the discipline in Europe and US and Britain itself during the first half of the century. Whatever changes in this orientation occurred in other Indian universities they did not have much impact on Political Science in Punjab University as it lay at the periphery of centres of academic debates in Indian universities.

While tracing the general development of the discipline of Political Science in Pakistan, this chapter particularly focusses on its quantitative growth and qualitative development. For determining the quantitative growth, the number of departments, the number of teachers, level and source of their degrees, student teacher ratio at different times is examined. For identifying qualitative development both quantity and quality of research output and change in academic orientation, which the discipline inherited, is discussed.

**Growth of Departments**

As discussed above, at the time of Partition, Pakistan inherited one department of Political Science. By 2001 the number of departments had risen to seven. Due to lack of information one cannot give the exact year of establishment of other Political Science departments. However, the seven Handbooks issued by the Inter University Board and the University Grants Commission at different times show the existence of these departments at the time of publication of these Reports. On the
basis of this information following conclusions about the growth of Political Science departments have been derived.

From one department in 1947, the number of Political Science departments rose to four by 1963. They were located at the University of the Punjab, University of Karachi, University of Sindh and University of Peshawar. By 1968, no new department was opened. By 1976 another three departments located at University of Balochistan, Bahauddin Zakariya University and Islamia University were created, taking the total to seven. Between 1976 to 2001 no new departments were opened. Thus by the year 2001, the number of Political Science departments remained seven, the same as in 1976. Among the departments of 14 disciplines of social sciences existing by 2001, the number of departments in seven disciplines was higher than Political Science departments. The number of departments of six disciplines in 2001, was less than the departments of Political Science discipline.

If 1963 is taken as base year, by 2001 Political Science departments registered a growth of 75%. Compared with the growth of departments of other social science disciplines this is the second lowest growth. Unlike some other social science disciplines particularly Economics, no centre or institute of Political Science was ever created in Pakistani universities.

The average number of teachers per department varies with different disciplines. For Political Science it is nine, which is lower than three disciplines and higher than ten disciplines.

**Number of Teachers and their Qualifications**

The numerical strength of teachers and their qualifications decisively shapes the quality of teaching and research output in a department. The data from 1963 Handbook shows that the total number of teachers in the four Political Science departments existing at that time was 20 with an average of five teachers per department. By the year 2001 the total number of teachers in seven Political Science departments rose to 61, the average per
department becoming nine, which is almost twice the average number of teachers in 1963. In 1963 Sindh University, Jamshoro had the largest number of teachers (seven) while Peshawar University had the smallest number of teachers (two). By 2001 both Sindh University and Peshawar University retained their positions with Sindh University having 13 and Peshawar University having six teachers.

From among the total number of teachers of social sciences in 2001, six percent were political scientists. This percentage is lower than five disciplines, equal to two disciplines and higher than six disciplines.

More than the numerical strength of the teachers, it is their qualifications that reflect the quality of research and teaching in a discipline. There are two indicators of determining such quality: first, rise in the percentage of teachers with higher degrees such as PhD and second the rise in the percentage of teachers who earned their degrees from foreign universities. Using the two indicators the changes in quality of degrees of teachers of Political Science that occurred during 1963 to 2001 are examined below.

The 1963 Handbook shows that out of 20 teachers in Political Science departments that year, four (20% of all teachers) had PhD degrees, no teacher had MPhil degree and the remaining 16 (80%) teachers were MAs. By 2001, out of 61 teachers 20 (33%) were holding PhD degrees, three (5%) MPhil degrees and 38 (62%) teachers possessed MA degrees. Between 1963 and 2001, it shows an increase of 13 percentage points for PhDs, an increase of 5 percentage points for MPhils and 18 percentage points decrease for MA degrees. In other words, upward replacement occurred for PhDs and MPhil degrees and a downward replacement for MA degrees. At first sight this suggests an improvement in degrees of Political Science teachers.
An increase in the share of higher degrees is a necessary but not sufficient condition for improvement in the discipline. An important factor is the level of advancement of the universities from which the degrees have been earned. As social sciences in universities in the West are more developed than in Pakistani universities, it can be assumed that degrees earned from the former will have greater impact on the quality of education and research than those earned from Pakistani universities. To determine if there was rise or decline in foreign qualified teachers the percentage of teachers with foreign degrees out of all teachers by 1963 and 2001 was computed. Out of 20 teachers of Political Science in 1963, eight (40%) had their degrees from foreign universities. By 2001, out of 61 teachers nine (15%) had such degrees showing a decline of 25 percentage points in foreign qualified teachers.\textsuperscript{13}

If the gender of teachers of Political Science is taken into account there was no woman teacher in 1963. By 2001, their number rose to 22 (36%), which was more than 1/3rd of all the teachers. Among them only two (9%) had foreign degrees. Rank-wise gender distribution is as follows: among 11 professors, there was no woman; among ten associate professors two were women; among 20 assistant professors six were women and among 20 lecturers 12 were women. This suggests that the higher the academic rank the lower the share of women. The share of women teachers was the highest in Sindh University and lowest in Balochistan and BZU.

\textbf{Curriculum}

The contents of a curriculum to an extent help identify the nature and quality of what is taught to the students. In particular they reveal whether the discipline is connected to international developments in the discipline and new knowledge is flowing in.

To identify the topics that are part of Political Science curriculum and changes in them since 1985 a questionnaire was sent to seven Political Science departments. Four departments replied. From the list of titles of courses provided by them it
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

comes out that none of these courses are similar in wording though in substance they may have some common contents. It appears from their titles that 21 compulsory courses for MA Political Science of the four departments fall into the following categories: courses related to international relations (eight), philosophy (six), government and politics of Pakistan (five), comparative politics and research methodology (two). At the MPhil level research methodology is a common course in all the four departments.

The information in reply to the request about five books used in the five compulsory courses at MA and MPhil levels that the four departments provided is given in Annex I. The comparison of the lists of four departments shows that only the titles of two books are common in them. Both were written by non-Pakistanis. The remaining 18 books appear on one list only showing that the judgement of teachers about the relevance of a book for teaching compulsory courses differed widely. Out of 18 books that appeared on the four lists, 13 were written by non-Pakistanis and five by Pakistanis. No name out of 61 teachers teaching Political Science in 2001 appears on the list. The fact that most of the books were written by non-Pakistanis reveals that the knowledge from abroad is flowing in. It also shows that Pakistani political scientists have yet to produce books that can be used for teaching compulsory courses.

To a question concerning revisions in curriculum of Political Science since 1985, the four departments informed that MA courses were revised twice and MPhil courses once. In the MPhil courses research methodology and political thought were added. The introduction of research methodology must be considered a positive step as it imparts a scientific character to a discipline.

Teaching Methods
As a medium of communication the methods of teaching play a significant role in helping students to grasp what they are being taught. Generally some methods such as seminars, term-papers and class-presentations are considered more effective than direct
lectures as they are often mechanical and passive method of imparting knowledge and do not help students to become participants in the learning process.

As in the most social science disciplines in Pakistani universities, the teachers of Political Science frequently use lecture method. This is confirmed by the replies of four departments. Our information about the medium of instruction used in teaching MA courses suggests that most of the departments of Political Science use both English and Urdu though mix varies between departments.

Research within the Framework of Political Science and on Politics of Pakistan

1. Books
The faculty of an academic department is expected not only to teach but also engage in research that can take the form of books and articles published in professional journals.

For analysing the books written within the framework of Political Science and those written on politics of Pakistan, their writers have been placed into seven categories: Political Science teachers, teachers from other social science departments, Pakistani civil servants, Pakistani expatriates, foreigners, independent scholars working in private sector and others, which include journalists, politicians and military leaders.

The number of books written by political scientists during the last five decades within the framework of Political Science theory using scientific methodology is very small. This indicates that Political Science departments like most of the other social science departments in Pakistan are primarily teaching departments where very few teachers engage in research and produce books. Of course there are a few exceptions such as Manzooruddin Ahmed, Mohammad Waseem, Hassan Askari Rizvi, Tahir Amin and Saeed Shafqat. There may be several reasons for the lack of research including absence of motivation,
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

time and resources needed for doing research and absence of conducive academic environments.

In the second category are social scientists other than political scientists who have done significant work are the historians. I. H. Qureshi, M. Rafique Afzal, K. K. Aziz, Mubarak Ali and linguist Tariq Rahman. Afzal and Aziz’s works are predominantly descriptive and are based on library research but are useful for building and testing political theories. The work of the prolific Tariq Rahman being interdisciplinary and focussed on distribution and the use of power is a significant breakthrough in social sciences in Pakistan and is highly useful for political scientists.

A third group of writers consists of civil servants that have made important contributions towards the understanding of Pakistani politics. They include Shahid Javed Burki, Hassan Zaheer, Safdar Mahmood and now expatriate anthropologist Akbar S. Ahmed. A fourth group of writers from among the expatriate Pakistani social scientists who have written on politics and helped to promote understanding of political process in Pakistan include political scientists Khalid B. Sayeed and Anwar Hussain Syed, historians Ayesha Jalal and Iftikhar H. Malik and sociologists Hamza Alavi, Hasan Nawaz Gardezi and Feroz Ahmad. The contributions of scholars in this category are notable for interpreting political phenomena in Pakistan in the broader context of society, economy and culture.

A fifth group of scholars who have written on Pakistani politics consists of foreign academics, which include Americans, British and Russians besides others. Both in quantity and quality the contributions of American scholars are relatively more significant reflecting modern trends in Political Science.\footnote{15}

The sixth group consists of independent scholars who work individually or are based in civil society organisations. Since the emergence of these organisations during the 1990s some scholars associated with them have made significant contributions to
Development of the Discipline of Political Science in Pakistan

Political Science particularly in the field of women studies.\textsuperscript{16} Notable among these organisations are the Institute of Women’s Studies Lahore (IWSL), Shirkat Gah, Simorgh, Women’s Resource and Publication Centre and Sustainable Development Policy Institute (SDPI), Islamabad.\textsuperscript{17} The seventh group consists of politicians, retired generals, journalists, lawyers and retired judges.\textsuperscript{18} The contributions of this category, though uneven in quality, can provide raw material for developing the discipline.

2. PhD and MPhil Theses
For earning a professional degree at the level of PhD and MPhil the completion of a thesis is a necessary requirement for a student. The quality and quantity of theses produced by a department reflect on its academic strength as well as its contribution to the preparation of well qualified researchers who will be teaching or doing research in the discipline.

Since the emergence of the country up to year 2001, the seven public university departments of Political Science that came into existence during this period produced 82 theses: 64 PhD and 18 MPhil with an average per year of 1.2 PhDs and 0.33 MPhil theses. Karachi University produced the largest number of theses (23 PhDs and nine MPhils) followed by University of the Punjab (19 PhDs and no MPhil) and University of Sindh (11 PhDs and three MPhils).\textsuperscript{19} The remaining four universities together have produced 27 theses.

The decade wise breakdown of theses shows that one PhD thesis was produced in the 40s, none in the 50s, four (three PhD and one MPhil) in the 60s, 13 (nine PhD and four MPhil) during the 70s, 28 (23 PhDs and five MPhils) in the 80s, and 31 (24 PhDs and 7 MPhils) during the 90s. Five theses (4 PhD and 1 MPhil) were completed in year 2001. It may be noted that 59 out of 82 theses were produced in 80s and 90s, which is twice the number of theses produced in all other decades. One possible explanation of increase in the number of theses during 80s and 90s could be the increase in the number of departments of Political Science.
In order to categorise them, the titles of all 82 theses were searched using certain key words. Eighteen of them contain the word ‘Islam’, eight ‘constitution’, eight ‘Pakistan Movement’, five ‘local government’, three ‘government’ alone, two ‘USA’, two each ‘federalism’, ‘judiciary’ and ‘democracy’. One each contained the key word ‘national integration’, ‘Jinnah’ and ‘nuclear’.

The above search reveals a narrow range of topics of theses. First, the term ‘Islam’ appeared in the largest number of titles followed by ‘constitution’. No title contained the term political parties, armed forces, bureaucracy, elections, Pan-Islamism and nationalism. Forty five out of 82 theses were written on subjects directly related to Pakistan. Only three dealt with other countries: one with ‘Pak-India relations’, one with Nigeria and one with Regional Co-operation for Development (RCD). Only four theses contained the term ‘theoretical’ and none used comparative method comparing certain aspects of political system of Pakistan with those of other countries. Apparently the thesis writers and their advisers chose a limited number of issues for research within the institutional approach and did not branch out into new directions particularly the area of empirical theory and comparative politics.

Out of 82 theses 65 were written in English. Fourteen in Urdu, two in Sindhi and one in Arabic. Sixty three writers of these theses were men and 19 women.

The number of PhD theses produced by all the three inherited disciplines by 2001 shows that Political Science produced the highest number of such theses (64), followed by Economics (45), and History (38). The figure for MPhil theses produced by the three inherited departments shows that by 2001 the Departments of Economics produced 184, History 84 and Political Science 18, placing Political Science at the third position.
In the above paragraphs, quantitative data about theses has been given. But quantity does not by itself inform about the quality of theses. For assessment of their quality, the chairpersons of seven departments were asked about the quality of theses written in their departments. Four of them who replied claimed that their departments produced high-quality theses. Obviously these opinions do not reveal much. A somewhat objective method would be whether the examiners of a thesis recommended its publication. Unfortunately, no such data is available to ascertain this. A few political scientists interviewed have informed the author that very few theses were recommended for publication by the examiners and still fewer were actually published.

3. Articles in Professional Journals
Besides books, research by teachers can take the form of articles published in professional journals, local or international. Very few Pakistani political scientists have published their research in international journals. The number of articles published in local journals is also small. Only a limited number of journals in which such articles can be published exist. Out of the present seven Political Science departments only the department at the Punjab University issues a Political Science journal with the title *Al-Siyasa: The Journal of Politics, Society and Culture*. It was probably started in Summer 2001. By the year 2004, six issues have come out. Another journal is issued by Government College University, Lahore entitled *The Journal of Political Science* of which 22 volumes have been produced. The Department of Political Science of the University of Karachi started its journal named *Pakistan Political Science Review* in 1991. After the publication of its first issue it ceased to exist. Pakistan Study Centre of the University of Karachi is regularly publishing its journal named *Pakistan Perspectives*. Although it is not an exclusively Political Science journal, it frequently publishes articles related to politics and Political Science.

**All Pakistan Political Science Association (APPSA)**
One reason for lack of research in Political Science in Pakistan could be the absence of a Political Science Association. A
professional association of a discipline creates a platform where the development of the discipline is reviewed from different perspectives, guidelines for its future development are discussed and the problems facing it identified. The All Pakistan Political Science Association (APPSA) was established in 1950. Like professional associations of other social science disciplines it developed slowly. It was somewhat active during the 50s and the 60s and held four annual conferences: first in 1950 at Punjab University, second in 1951 at Peshawar University, third in 1962 at Karachi University and fourth in 1966 at Karachi University again. After separation of East Pakistan it was renamed Pakistan Political Science Association. Efforts to revive it during the 70s, the 80s and the 90s did not bear fruit. At present it is virtually dead.

II. Evaluation of Qualitative Development of Political Science

The quantitative development of Political Science in Pakistan has been described above. In this section an attempt to assess its qualitative development will be made. However, this aspect of evaluation is relatively more difficult due to lack of any systematic research on the subject. The political scientists in Pakistan, like other social scientists in the country, have not made any serious attempt to evaluate their disciplines. No study on the history of the discipline exists. All Pakistan Political Science Association and Pakistan Political Science Association, which could have done such an evaluation remained indifferent to this task while they were active. The only exception to this generalisation is the paper by political scientist Saeed Shafqat written in mid-80s.

As mentioned in the beginning of this chapter Political Science tradition that Pakistan inherited from pre-Partition India was essentially institutional, normative, a-historical, descriptive, and non-contextual. To what extent the changes that have occurred in social sciences globally and particularly in the West have affected this tradition will be examined here to determine the qualitative changes in Political Science in Pakistani universities.
Generally social sciences have accepted the norm of developing themselves on the pattern of natural sciences seeking to develop theories and hypotheses to describe and explain social phenomena and test them with quantitative data. In the process they attempt to become universal contributing to cumulative growth of knowledge of their discipline. They seek to use paradigm and theories from each other and aim to become interdisciplinary thus broadening the scope of their areas of academic interest. With the help of knowledge so acquired they offer solutions of problems of local, national and international societies. Within the general framework of patterning social sciences on natural sciences, a number of approaches have emerged particularly in the US and Europe. They include behavioural approach, political economy approach, Marxist theory and dependency theory.

The basic issue whether social sciences should be patterned on natural sciences has not received much attention by social scientists in Pakistan except by some philosophers. Post-modernists critique of this approach thriving in the West also has not caught the attention of enough Pakistani social scientists to generate a debate. From among the four sub-approaches mentioned above there is some impact of behavioural approach on social sciences in Pakistan under the influence of a group of Pakistani political scientists trained in the US and Britain. However, it cannot be claimed that it has taken root in the academic soil of the country. Consequently, Political Science in Pakistan did not benefit from certain features of behavioural approach such as departure from institutional framework, focussing on behaviour of political actors and accumulation of quantitative data.

The other three approaches — Marxist theory, political economy and dependence theory — seem to have had very little impact on the development of Political Science in Pakistan. They have been used rarely in research and teaching. Thus the tradition that
Political Science in Pakistan inherited from pre-Partition period has not been seriously dented. 

Earlier in the paper seven groups of writers who wrote books within the framework of Political Science or simply on politics of Pakistan have been identified. It is an enormous task to evaluate their work. Writing in late 80s well-known Pakistani political scientist Saeed Shafqat commented on the works of academic political scientists of Pakistan and wrote that they ‘... lack analytical rigour and theoretical under-pinning’. After more than two decades of this evaluation, the overall situation has only marginally changed. This change is reflected in the writings of a number of political scientists produced during last two decades. In addition to these writers, the works of some Pakistani expatriates and Western writers particularly the American scholars, which are being used in teaching and are cited in research in Pakistani universities are pushing Political Science in Pakistan in the direction of theoretical and methodological rigour.

Like most other social science disciplines in Pakistan, Political Science has yet to develop interdisciplinary orientation and contextual approach of studying political phenomena in the broader context of social structure and culture both in research and teachings. It is difficult to identify from the titles of the 82 Political Science theses discussed above as to how many of them followed the interdisciplinary and contextual approach. However, their titles suggest that their writers generally used institutional approach. However, one finds the use of such approaches in the works of some political scientists during the late 80s. Interdisciplinary approach in teaching in Political Science departments also has not yet emerged. Besides other reasons, an important reason is the absence of semester system, which provides opportunity to students for taking courses in other disciplines.

The diversity and the range of the subjects of writings in a discipline can also be a measure of its development. Applying
this measure we analyse here the diversity and range of topics that political scientists have studied by examining the topics of the 82 (by 2001) theses, the papers presented in the Conference of Pakistan Political Science Association held in 1966 and the general focus of some other studies.

One indicator of the development of social sciences is the range of issues, which its practitioners study. As discussed in section 5(b) on theses, the range of titles of theses produced by Political Science departments has been narrow. Generally the thesis writers confined themselves to traditional areas of research and did not branch out into new directions particularly the areas related to the development of the discipline. Even the national political institutions such as judiciary, parliament, political parties and elections received little attention.

Another source of determining the range of research topics is the papers presented in the 1966 Conference. The Conference was divided into five sessions: 1. Muslim Political Theory and Institutions 2. Constitutional Development in Pakistan 3. Special Session on Regional Co-operation for Development (RCD) 4. Local Government and Basic Democracies and 5. Public Administration. This division and the 25 papers that were presented during these sessions reveal that no paper was presented on theory and methodology of the discipline. The papers presented in the theory session focussed on normative and not on empirical theory.

As the case with theses, the books produced by academic political scientists also reflect a narrow range of subjects. The few books that were produced during the first five decades focussed on the development of political institutions. However, during the last two decades this range is gradually broadening. Some academic political scientists are adding new issues to the list of their research such as elections, ethnicity, civil military relations and the role of women in politics. This change, however, has not yet become a significant part of the research agenda of political scientists.
Conclusions
The discipline of Political Science in Pakistan compared to its counterparts in the West and India remains underdeveloped both quantitatively and qualitatively. Taking into account the number of departments and the average number of teachers in a department its position relative to other social science disciplines in Pakistan is generally weak. The changes in the degrees of teachers of Political Science that occurred in the discipline from 1963 to 2001 reveal that there was no upward replacement of degrees. The percentage share of foreign qualified teachers during this period considerably decreased. The range of topics of the 82 Political Science theses was narrow as was of the books and articles produced by teachers. Some changes have occurred in the curricula of Political Science with the introduction of new courses such as Research Methodology. However, in teaching these courses the teachers often rely on textbooks produced by Western scholars. The list of the few Pakistani scholars whose books were being used for teaching does not include the names of the teachers who were teaching Political Science in 2001.

The teachers of Political Science in the country have yet to weld themselves into a professional community. Pakistan Political Science Association (PPSA), which succeeded All Pakistan Political Science Association after the separation of East Pakistan is virtually dead. Efforts to revive it during the 70s, the 80s and the 90s did not succeed. Neither the PPSA nor individual departments have attempted to start a national journal of Political Science.

The descriptive, normative and institutional tradition that Political Science in Pakistan inherited from pre-Partition India has mostly remained intact. The new developments in the discipline at international level have only marginally touched it. The Pakistani Political Scientists started applying their inadequately developed discipline for understanding the politics of Pakistan and suggesting political solutions to the national
problems before the discipline achieved adequate scientific maturity.

The explanation of why Political Science in Pakistan has not achieved scientific maturity and why it lags behind some other social sciences lies in some factors specific to the nature of the discipline and some in the general level of development of social sciences in Pakistan. As Shafqat has pointed out degrees in Political Science do not open door to employment other than that of teaching, which is not a very attractive career for brilliant students. Some students study it in order to get into government service. Others learn it believing that it brings good marks. Unlike economists and psychologists there is hardly any demand for a political scientist in the private sector.

The lack of development of Political Science in Pakistan is also related to the general underdevelopment of social sciences in the country, by the neglect of higher education by the Pakistani state, itself suffering from continuous political instability, military coups and burdened with high security related expenditure. Under these conditions the political scientists in Pakistan cannot by themselves, do much to upgrade their discipline.
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

Annex I

The List of Books that Four Selected Departments of Political Science Use in Teaching their Five Compulsory Courses

1. Ian Talbot, *Pakistan: A Modern History*
4. Judd Hermon, *Political Thoughts from Plato to Present*
5. G. M. Career, *Major Foreign Powers*
6. Jannet B. Johnson, *Political Science Research Methods*
7. Almond & Powell, *Comparative Government*
11. Lawrance Ziring, *Pakistan in 20th Century*
12. Theodore J. Wolf, *Introduction to International Relations*
13. Khalid Bin Sayeed, *Political System of Pakistan*
14. Hamid Khan, *Constitutional & Political History of Pakistan*
15. S. M. Huda, *The Economic Development of Pakistan*
17. Haroon Sherwani, *Muslim Political Thoughts and Administration*
18. Ishtiaq Hussain Qureshi, *Struggle for Pakistan*
Development of the Discipline of Political Science in Pakistan

Notes


2 For detailed informations on the Handbooks see footnote 10 of the Introductory chapter of this book.

3 The 1976 Handbook shows that before its publication three new departments of Political Science were established at the University of Balochistan, the University of Multan and the Islamia University, Bahawalpur. The 1987 Handbook shows that the number of Political Science departments rose to eight with the establishment of a new department at Azad Jammu and Kashmir University Muzaffarabad. However, actually there were no separate department of Political Science in the University. Two political scientists in the university used to teach Political Science in other departments. The Postgraduate College for Women affiliated with the university awards MA degree in Political Science. The 1987 Handbook also shows the existence of Political Science department at Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan, which was renamed as Department of Political Science and International Affairs. This Handbook also reveals that the name of University of Multan was changed renaming it Bahauddin Zakariya University through an Ordinance in 1979. The 1994 Handbook shows that before its publication a new department of Political Science was established at Shah Abdul Latif University, Khairpur making the total of departments nine. But according to Abdullah Phulpoto, Dean of Faculty of Arts, Shah Abdul Latif University, the university awards an MA degree in Political Science under the Department of International Relations and there is no separate department of Political Science in the university. The 2001 Handbook dropped the names of both departments and listed the names of only seven departments.

4 Education 21, Economics 18, History 12, Public Administration 10, Pakistan Studies nine, and Psychology and Sociology each eight.

5 International Relations and Area Study Centres six each, Philosophy five, Social Work four, Defence and Strategic Studies two, and Anthropology one.

6 The data about growth is taken from a study of COSS under preparation whose source of information is Handbooks of the Universities of Pakistan for the year 1963 and 2001.

7 During 1963-2001, The discipline of Public Administration/Management sciences grew by 900% (The first department of Public Administration was established at the University of Karachi in 1955), Education (600%), International Relations by 500% (The first department was opened in 1958), Economics (260%), Psychology (166.7%), Sociology (166.7%), History (100%), Social work (100%), Political Science (75%), Philosophy (66.7%).

8 The disciplines with average of teachers per department are the following: Public Administration/Administrative Sciences (13), Economics (11), International Relations (10), Political Science (9), Defence and Strategic Studies (8), Anthropology (8), Education (7), Psychology (7), Sociology (7),
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

History (6), Pakistan Studies (6), Area Study (6), Social work (6) and Philosophy (5).

9 The disciplines, which had larger number of teachers per department than Political Science by 2001 are Public Administration/Administrative Sciences (13), Economics (11) and International Relations (10) while other 11 disciplines have smaller number of teachers per department.

10 Economics (22%), Education (14%), Public Administration/Management Sciences (14%), History (8%) and International Relations (7%).

11 Psychology and Sociology.

12 Pakistan Study (5%), Area Study Centres (3%), Philosophy (3%), Social Work (3%), Defence and Strategic Studies (2%) and Anthropology (1%).

13 In the case of other social sciences, Psychology experienced the highest decline of 56 percentage points and Public Administration/Business Administration improved from zero in 1963 to 29% in 2001. The remaining eight disciplines fall in between.

14 The five Pakistani authors whose books were being used are Hamid Khan, S. M. Huda, M. M. Sharif, Haroon Sherwani and Ishitiaq Hussain Qureshi.

15 Some prominent names of American scholars are Keith Callard, Ralph Braibanti, Leonard Binder, Stanley Wolpert, Charles H. Kennedy, Lawrence Ziring, Robert Wirsing and Andrew Wilder.

16 Prominent among them are Rubina Saigol, Saba Gul Khattak, Neelam Hussain, Aysha Khan, Durre S. Ahmad, Najma Sadeque, Samina Rahman, Munnaa Khawar and Farida Shaheed.

17 For detailed discussion see Rubina Saigol, ‘The State of the Discipline of Women’s Studies in Pakistan’ in this volume.


19 Out of 82 theses the information on the names of their supervisors is available only for 71. According to this information Manzooruddin Ahmed supervised the highest number of theses, ten PhDs and five MPhil. He is followed by Arshad Syed Karim who supervised six PhDs and one MPhil. Muniruddin Chuqta of Punjab University supervised five PhD theses and Dr. Iqbal Ahmed Qureshi (Sindh University) supervised three PhD and one MPhil theses. The names of those who supervised at least three thesis are Mehmoon Ali Shah (University of Balochistan), Khawaja Syed Akhlaq (Islamia University Bahawalpur), Asrar Hussain (University of Peshawar) and Syed Rizwan Ali Rizvi (University of Karachi).

20 Nine of them were produced in the Political Science Department of Karachi University.
Development of the Discipline of Political Science in Pakistan

21 Five of them were produced in the Political Science Department of Karachi University.
22 Eleven in Karachi University, two in Bahauddin Zakariya University and one in Punjab University.
23 We chose the three inherited departments (History, Economics, Political Science) for comparison as they existed at the time of emergence of Pakistan.
24 The Presidents of the APPSA and PPSA have been Ishtiaq Hussain Qureshi, Muniruddin Chughtai, Manzooruddin Ahmed and Arshad Karim.
25 Shafqat, ‘Political Science: Problems...’, op.cit.
26 There are several schools of social scientists, which question this position. Among them are relativists and post-modernists.
29 They include Saeed Shafqat, Mohammad Waseem, Tahir Amin, Hasan Askari Rizvi, Jaffar Ahmed, Ayesha Siddiqa and Saba Gul Khattak.
30 The names of some of them appear in the above footnote.
31 Out of the proceedings of four Conferences held under the auspices of All Pakistan Political Science Association, this writer has only the proceedings of the Conference held in 1966.
32 Saeed, ‘Political Science: Problems...’, op.cit., p. 130.
33 For analysis of underdevelopment of social sciences in Pakistan see the papers of Inayatullah and Mohammad Waseem in Hashmi, The State of..., op.cit. and Zaidi, Dismal State of Social..., op.cit. For security related expenditure, see Pervez Tahir, Defence and Development, Individual Research Paper, National defence College, 1993.
The Development of Strategic Studies in Pakistan

Ayesha Siddiqa

Introduction

Strategic Studies, as a discipline is fairly new in Pakistan’s academic milieu. Compared to other social sciences disciplines, strategic or security studies was introduced at a limited scale in public sector universities much later than other disciplines. Similar is the case with research with very few resident and non-resident Pakistanis contributing in this field. The slow growth of this discipline is linked with its limited usage and the peculiar security culture in the country. This discipline is considered primarily the forte of the armed forces with any expert analysis being the responsibility of retired or serving military personnel. In fact, the subject was initially introduced to cater for the needs of the primary end-users: the armed forces. The fact that there are few takers for this discipline has hampered its growth. Furthermore, the peculiar design of the national strategic perception being limited in nature has also lead to restricting development. Moreover, the peculiar civil-military relation’s imbalance has also had an impact on its development. All these factors will be reviewed in the paper.

Considering this limitation, the paper aims at evaluating the teaching of this subject in military colleges/institutes as well. This will be in addition to the analysis of the quality of research
and the nature of the discipline in public sector universities. This study will use both the quantitative and qualitative approach.

**Methodology**
How does one access the worth or performance of a discipline in a given country? The methodology used here would be both quantitative and qualitative. In the first instance, one would examine the quantitative data pertaining to the number of educational and training institutions where this subject is being taught along with the number of books and other publications that have been produced. This would be followed by an analysis of the quality of teaching and research. However, before using such methodology it is essential to determine what does the subject entail, what does the discipline cover in Pakistan and who are the end-users and key interlocutors in the field. These definitions would help in ascertaining the basic direction in which the subject has developed in this country.

2. The Development of Strategic Studies
Compared with other fields of study and research of social sciences, Strategic Studies is a fairly new discipline with limited demand. The total number of published books and articles or the number of people qualified in this discipline is limited. There are just a couple of universities that have introduced the subject as a discipline. Obviously, this state of affairs is linked with the limited demand for the subject. The data provided in the later part of the study will bear out this fact.

The situation, however, also calls for an investigation of the general structure of the strategic community in Pakistan. The questions that need to be asked are: (a) who are the primary users of the research and teaching of the subject, (b) who are the people involved in teaching of the subject and its research, (c) what is the general usage of the subject, and (d) what is the nature of the strategic discourse in the country? In fact, these four issues are inter-linked and would be discussed in the following section of the paper. But before one starts to discuss
The State of Educational Discourse in Pakistan

the end-users of the subject, it is essential to identify what falls in the purview of this subject.

**The Discipline**

Strategic Studies entails the study of military history, grand strategy, military strategy, operational and tactical planning, military psychology and all matters pertaining to the functioning of the armed forces or that assist in decision-making pertaining to national security. Furthermore, it must examine the linkage between society including the social attitudes towards war, conflict and peace. The discipline is inter-connected with others fields as well such as Politics, Economics, History, Sociology, Psychology, Geography and Management. In fact, security or Strategic Studies draws upon all these disciplines to bring out what can be applied on the armed forces or matters of national security. In countries where this subject is taught or has attracted attention of researchers, the information is primarily used to expand the understanding of national security. Hence, Strategic Studies can be termed as a policy science. The dependence on other disciplines is so great that the subject needs to grow in the middle of a cluster of other disciplines mentioned earlier. Thus, it is not surprising to find that in American universities one rarely comes across an independent university department of Strategic Studies. Instead, it is taught as a part of some other discipline. This is different from the British model. The UK is, perhaps, one of the few countries that have established an independent department of War Studies. But the issues and topics taught at the department are diverse and wide-ranging. These vary from strategy, military history, technology and military intelligence to war literature, economics and analysis of various regional military-political dynamics.

As far as teaching of the subject is concerned, there are two available models that one could look at. The first is the American model where strategic or security studies grows amongst a cluster of other disciplines. The other is the European or the British model where the subject has grown independently. This does not mean that expertise from other disciplines is not drawn
upon, but that expertise from other areas is integrated into developing the subject not as a branch of any other discipline.

**The Armed Forces**

In Pakistan’s case, the demand for the subject still remains comparatively limited. The armed forces remain the primary end-users of academic works and materials pertaining to this field of study. Unfortunately, the two other communities: the journalists and civilian policymakers that should have been attracted to the subject did not, mainly because of the nature of defence decision-making in the country and debate on issues of national security. Despite the gradual openness in the media, discussing national security and conducting an in-depth analysis is still considered taboo.

Since the country’s birth in 1947, defence or national security was left to the military. The conditions have not changed dramatically. There has never been a serious effort made to claim greater space from the defence organisation. The academia in Pakistan does not seem to have shown great interest in challenging the military’s authority and have willingly accepted instructions from the latter. For instance, when the issue of recognising National Defence College’s (NDC) qualification as equivalent to Islamabad University surfaced, there was no one to question the quality of instruction at the military institute.\(^1\) Besides other reasons, this can be attributed to the dearth of real expertise in the discipline. The fact that the first generation of academics was people that did not have expertise in the area could be held as an explanation for their lack of engaging the armed forces more aggressively.\(^2\) With the rise in power of the armed forces and their eventual involvement in politics, the civilian leadership was further marginalised. Resultantly, there has been limited development of strategic thought.

**The Interlocutors**

The people engaged in research and teaching of this discipline could be categorised into four: (a) retired military officers and diplomats that are automatically considered as experts on the
subject due to their experience. Such people have no formal training in the subject,2 (b) a limited number of experts that have foreign training, (c) a handful of people trained in the country, and (d) civilian academics not formally qualified in the subject yet commenting on issues falling in the realm of Strategic Studies. Here, it is noteworthy that a formal academic training in the subject is an essential tool. In Pakistan, unfortunately, there are only a limited number of people who have formal expertise. The dearth of experts is understandable because the academic community had initially operated in an environment where it was found itself in a direct but imbalance competition with the armed forces personnel. Interestingly, when the first department of Defence and Strategic Studies was established during the end of the 1970s, it was held that a military officers would automatically qualify to be an instructor even though he did not possess a formal university degree on the basis of his experience. This premise was used to induct military officers in teaching positions at the department. Shireen Mazari formally challenged the decision in the court of law. Although the case was thrown out on technicalities, it formed basis of protest from the academia that then resulted in military personnel being removed from key positions in the department.4 This incident has been narrated to explain the overall environment underscored by a strong bias for non-experts. It is this environment that, in turn, has a bearing on the classifications mentioned above.

These four categories are important because it is these people that have traditionally determined the basic direction of the debate in the field. People falling under each classification indicate their relationship with the state and civil society, their understanding and presentation of strategic issues and the relative influence that these people can exercise on policymaking. The relative influence is what eventually has an impact on the growth of the discipline as well. This is really about setting the pace for the debate on strategic matters. The amount of information produced or made available by the state is directly proportional to the influence exercised by each group.
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

Before going any further, it would be worthwhile describing these groups further. The first group mentioned here comprises people that can be termed as former practitioners. Most of these people act as opinion makers by contributing mainly in local journals/newspapers. However, they are mainly there to present the official perspective. In any case, their analytical ability is clouded due to years of association with the bureaucracy. It is rare to find this category engaging in serious research or producing academic literature on the subject. The second category comprises mainly of civilian academics that are either part of the Diaspora with very few residing in the country. In any case, there is just a handful of formally foreign qualified people. The contributions by this group of people could be found in international and national journals and newspapers. The third category denotes individuals that have been qualified in the country and most of these could be found in teaching institutes. Barring a few exceptions, most do not engage in quality research or produce work of international standards. The final category consists of a few academics that engage in a debate on strategic issues without having the desired qualification. In such cases, contact and information from the establishment is extremely vital for the work done by these people.

The Discourse
Contrary to international standards, the treatment of the subject in Pakistan also suffers from serious limitation with the players or interlocutors engaging in limited issues. Most of the research or opinion formation could be found in the field of civil-military relations and politics of national security. There is some work that one could also find on military policymaking and nuclear proliferation. However, there is no research on strategic thought and very little work on defence economics and management of the defence sector. But such works are really exceptions to the rule. One could also find some work on national security as part of an over-arching discussion on international arms transfers or the policies of some external actors like the US, China and India. The limited discourse has also been a result of the narrowly-based strategic perception. With an over-emphasis on external
threat posed by neighbouring India, the Pakistani State has not managed to provide a greater strategic logic for its existence or the security policy. Traditionally, any debate on security issues is confined to countering India or finding partners that could help Islamabad ward off the Indian threat. This trend is not only obvious in policymaking, but has had an impact on the debate on security issues as well. Resultantly, this has also lead to greater state control of the strategic debate. Hence, it is not surprising for the discourse or the number of interlocutors to be limited.

3. Strategic Studies in Pakistan
The need for setting up an institutional base for imparting training in this subject was felt to be urgent due to the circumstances in which the armed forces started to build themselves after 1947. Besides not receiving its full share of military assets, the government also did not inherit good training institutions for the armed forces at the time of Independence. In 1947, the two military institutions inherited by Pakistan were an Officer’s Training School near Kakul and the Command and Staff College, Quetta. There was nothing that the other two services could boast about. It was later that each service built its own training wing and facilities, but most were aimed at imparting information and training to meet the operational and tactical requirements of each service. Furthermore, training needs in the initial years were fulfilled through sending a limited number of officers to other countries, primarily the United Kingdom.

The US military assistance that started towards the end of the 1950s had an in-built training component as well with officers from the Pakistan Air Force and Army finding opportunities for professional training. However, this did not necessarily fill the gap in strategic planning or training. This shortcoming remains also because expertise in this field was not developed in the civilian sector. Hence, there was no independent thinking that could have lead to the development of strategic thought. The focus on tactical planning also resulted in underdevelopment of
operational planning and lack of a joint-services planning culture.

The first effort was, however, made in the early 1970s when the military established the NDC at Rawalpindi. This was part of the overall exercise to develop skills at strategic planning and furthering an inter-services culture and joint planning. Even this effort failed to reap desired results because the entire effort has manipulated and controlled.

Later, efforts were also made to build linkages with the public sector educational institutions to develop the discipline. This was done through establishing the Department of Defence and Strategic Studies at Islamabad University later called Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad. The University was used to provide legal cover for degrees awarded at the NDC. Similarly, the Department of DSS was used for training military officers. It must be noted that the Department traditionally also uses serving military officers as instructors.

One finds a similar collaboration between the civilian, mainly the public sector research and educational institutions and the armed forces. This is certainly not an anomaly because one of the objectives of developing this discipline in the world is to assist the armed forces and enhance their understanding of the discipline. For the civilian sector to impart any knowledge to the military or for the latter to learn from the former, one of the prerequisites is the presence of a mindset that is prepared to learn and engage in debate. This unfortunately was absent in Pakistan’s case where the armed forces behave like a ‘principal’ rather than an ‘agent.’ Furthermore, one comes across independence of analysis in other countries, primarily developed countries that for obvious reasons seems lacking in Pakistan. Research and analysis, which, in any case, are not the strengths of Pakistan’s educational system, is lacking in this subject as well. What certainly makes the research culture in Pakistan different from the rest of the world, especially in this field, relates to the dearth of data and absence of sharing of
information between the military establishment and the community of researchers. In fact, the first book that ever came out on military’s decision-making and went beyond a discussion of civil-military relations, was Pervaiz Iqbal Cheema’s ‘Pakistan’s Defence Policy, 1947-51.’ What is noticeable is the fact that the book was published in the 1990s based on data pertaining to the first five years after the country’s independence. Furthermore, the book is based on information that was not necessarily made available by the government or the armed forces. The point being made here is that availability of information through official sources is a huge problem that has hampered development of the subject. None of the public sector research institutions have access to military’s data. Information, however, is shared in a limited manner with individuals but that is also to project the state’s perspective. Resultantly, one sees limited research products coming out of Pakistan as compared with India, especially on major events. For instance, while there have been a dozen books written in India on the Kargil issue or the nuclear issue, there is only one publication from Pakistan that also primarily presents the military’s viewpoint.

The development of this discipline is reflective of the general state of political culture in the country. Due to the interest of the armed forces in this subjects and higher stakes in controlling the growth of this discipline, one could not claim any exceptional performance in this area of study. The debate has continued to be limited with no demand for people to expand into the core areas of the subject. However, there are others who feel that the environment is changing with the military developing some acceptability of the civilians’ role as experts. Nevertheless, any greater acceptability is also dependent upon the civilians’ capacity to develop core expertise particularly on issues other than politics. This essentially means that the nature of the Strategic Studies discourse has to change its direction with civilians making efforts to master areas that are deemed as the forte of the armed forces. This also means expanding out from regional geo-politics and civil-military relations to more technical matters. Furthermore, greater acceptability of civilian
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

experts depends on any metamorphosis of civil-military relations.

**Strategic Studies in Civilian Academic Institutions**

As mentioned earlier, there are only two universities where the subject has been introduced as a discipline: the DSS department at Quaid-i-Azam University and the Department of Defence and Diplomatic Studies (DDS) at the Fatima Jinnah Women’s University, Rawalpindi.

The Department at the Quaid-i-Azam University was the first one established to build a formal linkage with a public sector university and to build the military’s capacity. Interestingly, this was done at a time when there was hardly any expertise in the public sector that could have justified the creation of such a department. In fact, there are sources that argue that the entire effort was geared for creating an opportunity for some individuals at the university. While one might disregard this as conspiracy theory, the fact is that the department had to depend on serving military personnel, especially in the initial days, to fill the gap caused due to the absence of civilian experts. At one point, according to one source, the government had also considered the idea of turning the existing Institute for Strategic Studies into a teaching organisation or incorporating Strategic Studies as a branch to be taught at the Department of International Relations. Establishing an independent department was presented as a last option that was readily accepted. The new department was also useful in training military personnel. Out of the 229 students enrolled with the Department from 1999 to 2003, 12% came from the military.

Whatever the objective for establishing the department, the fact remains that when the Department of DSS was set up, it lacked trained faculty. In 1987 there were four teachers in the department, three of them had MA degrees one received it from abroad. In 1994 the number of teachers increased from four to seven. One had PhD from abroad. There was no MPhil. Out of six MAs five were trained locally and one from abroad. By 2001,
with the opening of Department of Defence and Diplomatic Studies at Fatima Jinnah Women University (FJWU), Rawalpindi, the number of departments rose to two and the number of teachers increased from 10 to 15, ten at QAU and five at FJWU. QAU have two PhDs FJWU have one.9

Pervaiz Cheema, who became its first Chairman, was the only person available with some interest in the subject. This naturally left the space for military personnel. It took almost ten years before the department would be fully manned by civilians. This is not to suggest that the Department is currently fully independent. There are still visiting faculty members who are serving officers from the armed forces.

The limited expertise factor, however, has had an impact on the quality of education imparted by the department. The syllabus is outdated and does not respond to the developments in the field that one gets to see in other educational institutions around the world. For instance, the concepts taught in the topic ‘economics of defence’ are obsolete with no real effort being made to bring it up to current and international standards. The problem that one would have with the quality remains despite that newer issues such as non-traditional security have also been included in the syllabus. A glance at the courses contents shows that the entire syllabus is disjointed. So, on the one hand there are subjects like law and strategy incorporated in the syllabus, there is nothing on military sociology or technology. There are smaller segments being taught such as nuclear proliferation. However, unless the segments are contextualised, focussing on one small area would not make a lot of sense. For instance, nuclear proliferation has to be taught in conjunction with nuclear strategy, concept of war fighting, planning and deterrence. This state of affairs can be attributed to the expertise available with the department. The department has not managed, thus far, to produce quality instructors that have a good grasp on the theoretical aspects of the discipline.
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

At present (2003) there are ten teachers in the department. Out of them two have PhD from abroad (both on leave) three hold MPhil degrees, two from local universities and one from abroad. All three are present in the department. The remaining five are MSc. Out of them four have local degrees and one from abroad. Out of the three teachers with foreign degree two have from USA and one from UK.

In fact, most faculty members teaching strategic thought have not completely mastered the knowledge of military strategy or strategic thought to a level where they could provide quality instruction. What is even more worrying is the fact that the staff largely does not engage in research and publications. Moreover, a factor that continues to undermine the quality of the teaching staff is their limited interaction with the policy community.

The quality of the teaching staff, unfortunately, is reflective of the dire straits of the QAU, especially social sciences and the entire system of education in the country. Public sector educational institutions, like other government departments, are treated like employment exchanges offering limited job opportunities. Sadly enough, most of the people who tend to find their way into academia do not have a penchant for academia nor the inclination. Hence, one finds a situation where we often come across substandard teaching quality. This is also due to the fact that a number of people working in the department were drawn from other departments or found their way into DSS as part of some administrative adjustment deal. Since there were slots available in the department, people were adjusted against vacancies without any consideration given to their core expertise. In addition, there is no pressure from within the university system for research or publications. In some cases that people publish, it is primarily in local newspapers and journals instead of journals of international repute. There is also no internal system of academic evaluation or any input from the students that does not force the academic staff to improve their qualifications or enhance their existing expertise. In fact, the lack of research on strategic issues cannot be blamed entirely on the
The State of Educational Discourse in Pakistan

military or the establishment alone. The academia is equally responsible for not taking the lead.

The general lack of expertise in this field does not help in creating quality. The tendency is to depend on retired military personnel or diplomats in a number of areas. This is a dependence that does not benefit the department. For instance, in one case of an MPhil thesis recently awarded by the department, the examiner was a retired diplomat who did not ask the candidate a single question on the contents of the thesis. The thesis, which could not have passed through any international academic standard, was awarded an ‘A’ grade. The problem in this particular case was that the examiner did not have expertise in that particular area, a problem that was conveniently ignored by the department’s management. In any case, there are a limited number of MPhil students with the number varying from three to seven in a semester.

Of course, the department at Fatima Jinnah University is still in its infancy and cannot compare even with its counterpart at the QAU. The Department of DDS suffers from lack of a proper syllabi and head of a department. Currently, the Department is being run by head of the Department of Economics. This is because the department was established without any ‘grand plan’. It was mainly the brainchild of the university’s vice-chancellor, Dr. Najma Najam. The department was conceived without appropriate faculty, thus, leading to a situation where the university had to select courses randomly and fall back on retired military personnel only. Information sought from the university regarding the course outline showed an absence of a structure with the management selecting topics randomly to suit the availability of visiting faculty. This situation at the FJWU can be attributed to its poor management and administrative culture that has not allowed the institution to retain qualified faculty.10

In the past few years, some other universities like Karachi and Peshawar have also included Strategic Studies as part of their
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

departments of International Relations. But this has not necessarily helped in developing core expertise in the field.

Such conditions do not help loosen the hold of the military on a subject that in the rest of the world is not considered the forte of the armed forces. One of the reasons is the lack of information that is generally guarded and kept away from civilians. In some cases, civilian experts tend to shy away from contacting the establishment for information. In any case, the market or the absorption capacity for people qualifying in this area is so limited that the discipline does not offer a solid career path for the youth enrolling in the subject in any of the universities. The limited number of research institutes or universities do not offer sufficient positions. Resultantly, students graduating from the QAU or FJWU are more inclined to study the subject with the primary objective of appearing in the civil service exams later. This is a problem not peculiar to Strategic Studies but relates to other disciplines of social sciences as well. Also, there is no tradition for Strategic Studies graduates to go and work in the military or in positions where they could contribute through their theoretical knowledge. The military has never been open to the idea of including civilians in their organisational research and analysis or any other activity leaving little option for people pursuing this discipline. The Strategic Plans Division (SPD) had offered to finance the PhDs of faculty members of DSS department. However, the promise was not fulfilled. In any case, one would see such a move as military’s further encroachment into the public sector university system.

Military Educational Institutions
Military training institutions, on the other hand, claim to have high standards. This was a plea taken by the NDC in its paper submitted to the special committee of the Islamabad University’s academic council looking into the issue of affiliation between the university and military training institutes. Indeed, the library and other resources available with these institution far exceeds that of any public sector university. This is because the per capita
The State of Educational Discourse in Pakistan

investment in the military institutions is far greater than the budget allocated to the universities.

Despite this relative advantage, one would like to challenge the claim made by military authorities that they maintain high standards of research and instruction at the military colleges. Trainee officers tend to produce results that would please the senior officers, thus, compromising on the quality of research. There was also the problem of trainee officers not finding the time and not having the right attitude towards doing research. This is not surprising because research is something that is lacking in the military’s organisational culture. This military’s preoccupation with external threat has been so immense that the focus is always on finding solutions in the minimum time possible. Such an approach is hardly beneficial for research and analysis.

4. Research in Strategic Studies

Research and analysis is yet another area that contributes towards the growth of a discipline. In fact, the researchers’ community in a politically developed state and society is supposed to work as a force that provides ‘fire alarms’ against any discrepancy between political orders and its compliance by the armed forces. The two elements that carry out such an activity are the experts and journalists. In Pakistan’s case, however, ‘fire-alarms’ by experts and journalists have a limited value. This is primarily due to the information available to these communities and the significance attached to these by the policymaking community.

In Pakistan there are three distinct groups that can be identified for having contributed to research: (a) Pakistani nationals conducting research in the country, (b) Pakistanis expatriates conducting research on Pakistan while living abroad or through affiliation with foreign universities, and (c) non-Pakistanis doing research on strategic issues of relevance to Pakistan. Their contributions would be discussed in the following sections.
What is even more noticeable is the fact that the research on, about and from Pakistan has not contributed towards development of the theoretical framework on any of the topics classified under Strategic Studies. What one finds instead are empirical studies that draw upon a pre-existing framework. Thus far, one cannot site a single contribution to the theory of Strategic Studies. Again, one finds that the bulk of the existing research is on fairly limited topics. Out of 19 books have been written on Pakistan’s strategic issues 11 were on civil-military relations/politics, three on military decision-making and military affairs, two on external security, two on military and one on nuclear issue. Among the 19 writers of these books, six were Pakistanis living in the country, seven Pakistanis living abroad and five were foreigners.

While this could be attributed to the general lack of a strategic culture and strategic sense, one could primarily blame this on the lack of information that is controlled by the establishment. Lack of information is a real issue. As described by one analyst, Pakistan is a ‘data free’ society where seeking information could often become a ‘Herculean’ task. It is particularly problematic to work on military issues or seek information to support, prove or disprove theories. It is rare that academics are given briefings or their opinion sought by policymakers. Indubitably, the relationship between the establishment and academia or the research community is not congenial and unlike what one would find in the US where analysts or think-tanks enjoy greater significance. The academic or researcher in Pakistan is hardly relevant to the decision-making process, thus, reducing the incentive for an individual to examine issues that are considered highly sensitive such as defence. Whenever opinion is sought it rarely deals with technical military matters since such issues are considered the military’s forte.

What needs to be pointed out, however, is that academics have also been less forthcoming in venturing into research on hardcore military issues. For instance, economists have not been very keen on analysing military expenditure or defence
economics. This situation also prevails in India. Again, nothing has been written on military strategy or conduct of war by civilian academics with such areas mainly being left to armed forces personnel.

**Research by Pakistanis**

One would essentially start by highlighting the key features of research produced by Pakistanis in the country. First, the research produced in Pakistan can be characterised as limited touching upon fewer topics. The main concentration is on civil-military relations, geo-political issues and nuclear proliferation. What one could also observe is a tendency not to interpret available information. Researchers tend to follow the official line closely with little that could be termed as independent analysis.

Research conducted in Pakistan could be further sub-divided into two categories. First, relates to pure academic research that is fairly limited both in quantitative and qualitative terms. Here, quantitative refers to the number of people engaged in academic research. Quality, on the other hand, pertains to the topics under consideration. One would be lucky to find more than half a dozen people based in Pakistan who are into research on issues pertaining to national security or military. Most of these people are either attached with a university, a public sector research institute or had some affiliation with an official academic institute in the past. The limited numbers that are not part of the official set-up, in any case, are disregarded by the military establishment. The limited number of research institutes, unfortunately, have not managed to enhance these numbers due to several identifiable reasons. One of the explanations pertains to state’s deliberate control on the output. In fact, the input and output of information and research in the think-tanks is strictly controlled and often monitored by military and other intelligence agencies. Such an environment hampers objective research and analysis. Hence, the main contributions of such think-tanks are journals and periodicals. But the quality of research is not up to the mark. A problem that the institutes share with the universities is the lack of trained expertise. Needless to say that the
management style and official control poses major problems for retention of quality researchers whenever there is any available.

Another reason is that since the military does not depend on any civil society institution for its policymaking, there are no obvious pressures on these research institutes to conduct exciting and meaningful analysis. Unlike the American system, universities and think-tanks in Pakistan are not connected with the policymaking circles. Perhaps, this reason has affected the output of the private sector research institutes as well. Not to mention the fact that the dearth of experts and quality researchers does not allow the quality of work to improve.

The second category pertains to newspaper and journal articles. This is actually the second major category. Here, one could find greater variation in subjects with people commenting on issues such as military technology, defence decision-making, civil-military relations, nuclear technology and command and control and military’s existing operational and tactical planning. The people, who tend to contribute, vary from retired military personnel and diplomats to journalists and academics. Media, particularly the print media, as mentioned earlier on, is one of the most effective tools in Pakistan to disseminate information and analysis and reach out to both public and policy community. One would often find well-written analysis pieces in English newspapers that are supposedly considered as the best channel for disseminating views. However, this mode has its limitations such as being opinion pieces rather than detailed research pieces.

Again, there are three categories of literature being produced in Pakistan. First, the trained academics adhering to international standards have generally kept themselves limited to military and politics or civil-military relations. Second, one can see some work on issues of politico-strategic consequence such as the Kashmir issue or nuclear policies. In most cases, the research product does not seem to meet international or high academic standards. Compared with India next door where one finds a stronger academic and research tradition, one would not be able
to come across, for instance, a single publication (book or a monograph) on nuclear policy or policymaking. The only book available on nuclear issues does not represent quality research and analysis. The research produced by think-tanks, which are the third category, in any case, is not high quality research.

**Research by Pakistani Expatriates or Temporary Visitors in Foreign Countries**

Most of the academic literature that one finds has been contributed by Pakistani living abroad or those that conducted research or are doing so in conjunction with some foreign university or think tank. This category denotes an important segment since people falling under this category have made significant contributions. Even in this case, one does not come across a long list, which raises the question about why there is so little demand for expertise in this discipline.

What is certain is that the establishment’s control of the discipline has had an overall negative impact on its growth. Issues related with the military or national security are dominated by the armed forces leaving little room for others to manoeuvre. What also makes any contribution difficult is the lack of information that becomes even more severe in the case of Pakistanis residing abroad that find it even more difficult to access data. In any case, most of the contributions by Pakistanis living abroad, particularly in case of books and monographs, have been on civil-military relations. A recent addition to the literature from the community of expatriate academics deviated from the pattern by writing on the issue of security sector reforms, especially restructuring the national security paradigm, but the contribution remains an exception and suffering from the problem of dearth of information.

Research work by Pakistanis temporarily living abroad or working through a foreign university or research institute has experienced greater variations in terms of thematic areas. One can find articles on strategic and operational issues such as analysing military’s professionalism, opinions on defence policy
planning, conventional and non-conventional defence and other issues. What is noticeable about contributions falling in this category is that it is dependent upon two factors: (a) agenda of the host institution or foundation in case the research is funded by foreign donors; and (b) the quality of the theoretic component is comparatively better. This is due to the general availability of theoretical literature and other works that Pakistanis usually cannot access in their own country.

**Research by Foreigners on Pakistan**

Compared to researchers and analysts of Pakistani origin, foreigner academics writing on Pakistan have been more lucky in accessing information leading to better quality work and greater variety in terms of topics. Although there is a shortage of books and larger academic pieces on Pakistan, one comes across journal articles and op-ed pieces on issues ranging from an assessment of strategic thought in the country, its nuclear posture, nuclear and conventional weapons capability, conventional and nuclear command and control, military alignments with other states and civil-military relations. In some cases, the academic works have greatly benefited from the access provided to certain researchers by Islamabad. This especially refers to people like Stephen Cohen, Ron Matthew and Brian Cloughly. This is something that normally does not happen in the case of analysts of Pakistani origin. Access to foreign experts is provided to convey a certain point to powerful Western governments or to lobby with these countries particularly the US. The access provided to people such as Stephen Cohen during the Zia regime or even during the Musharraf regime was phenomenal. The basic notion was that providing information would have strategic dividends for the military organisation, advantages that are not necessarily available from providing access to local analysts.

**5. Conclusion**

The development of Strategic Studies as a discipline was fraught with problems due to political and sociological reasons the primary being the military’s domination of the entire politico-

72
The State of Educational Discourse in Pakistan

strategic discourse. The influence of the armed force has dispossessed analysts and academics of the ability to conduct deeper analysis and become stakeholders in the field. Sadly enough, retired diplomats and military officers have emerged as analysts. While one respects their experience, the fact remains that they are devoid of any rigorous training or have no experience of theoretical research that is required for developing the discipline. In any case, their experience is not a fitting replacement for the academic training that is essential.

The lack of information or the prevalence of an environment where the establishment, especially the armed forces do not share information with the community of academics and analysts has not helped in further growth of Strategic Studies. The deprivation of information leads to compromising quality of research. Resultantly, majority of analysts has stuck to limited areas such as civil-military relations or geo-political issues. These are areas where research could be based on official statements or published sources or the analysis could be based on theoretical information drawn from other disciplines. The lack of information and absence of a partnership between the government and the civil society is also one of the explanations that there is hardly any theoretical literature that has come out of Pakistan with the main focus of research being case studies that, in turn, is based on comparatively low quality empirical analysis. The rest of the literature basically comprises memoirs or anecdotal information provided by former practitioners. This, perhaps, is not peculiar to security studies. In fact, the state of this discipline is reflective of the general condition of social sciences in the country, an area that has over the years was allocated lesser financial and other resources. It would, however, be unfair to blame the peculiar growth of Strategic Studies, especially research, on the lack of information or the attitude of the authorities. For a number of reasons, the individual researchers have also been less forthcoming in seeking information or conducting original research. Besides other factors, this could be attributed to comparatively lesser interest in Pakistan’s strategic culture. Due to the linearity of strategic
So, perception, Pakistan’s policymakers have not been able to expand the logic for the country’s strategic significance other than its confrontation with India. Historically, the only time that one notices Pakistan on the international radar screen is during a crisis or as an extension of American security interest in the region. The fight against Communist Soviet Union in the 1950s, 1960s and the 1980s is when Pakistan became prominent as part of the US’s tactical plan to counter the Soviet power. Again, Islamabad received prominence as part of Washington’s war against terrorism after 9/11. However, this must not be mistaken for indigenous logic for role expansion in regional or global geopolitics or geo-strategy. Therefore, the literature produced reflects this bias with analysts reviewing Pakistan’s security and related issues from the prism of arms transfers, US’ South Asian Policy or in relation with India or China. Surely, any improvement in the quality of research in Strategic Studies is not only dependent on greater openness, but also on greater clarity about the country’s strategic perception.
The State of Educational Discourse in Pakistan

Notes

1 According to Prof. Pervaiz Iqbal Cheema, who was made responsible for looking into the syllabus of the NDC and other issues, there was no discussion of the quality of the contents of the course taught at the NDC.
2 For instance when the Department of Strategic Studies (DSS) at Islamabad University (QAU) was started, there was no one in Pakistan qualified to teach the subject.
3 Some would disagree with this argument. Their notion is that through the years the officers are trained in the discipline at various levels within the staff colleges or at universities, or they even attend courses abroad. However, here is an issue of quality versus quantity that would be debated in the later part of the study.
4 Interview with Dr. Shireen Mazari (Islamabad: 24/07/2003).
6 Interview with Dr. Shireen Mazari (Islamabad: 24/07/2003).
7 Interview with Prof. Pervaiz Iqbal Cheema (Islamabad: July 2003).
8 Department of DSS, QAU, Islamabad.
9 In February 2004, there were 10 teachers at QAU, two PhDs from abroad, five MPhils and three MAs, all trained locally. In FJWU, there are five teachers, one foreign PhD and four MAs trained locally.
10 Two people who were to take the positions of Professor and Associate Professor left due to the attitude of the top management.
11 See Peter D. Feaver, Armed Servants (Harvard University Press, Massachusetts, 2003), p. 6. Feaver is of the notion that civilian experts could have better expertise of military subjects than military personnel.
12 Interview with Dr. M. N. Qureshi (Islamabad: July 2003).
13 Peter D. Feaver, Armed Servants, op.cit, pp. 159-160.
14 Discussion with Ejaz Haider. Haider is a news editor of the Friday Times and one of the few people who comments on strategic issues.
16 See Ahmed Faruqui, Rethinking the National Security of Pakistan (Ashgate, Aldershot, 2003).
The State of Educational Discourse in Pakistan

Rubina Saigol

Historical Development of the Discipline

Education, as a field of knowledge and discourse, dates back to the 18th century when the nation-state in its modern form was being established. Mass public schooling, as a means of incorporating the young into the nation building process, was accompanied by new definitions of the child and childhood. In the nineteenth century, the development of the disciplines of sociology and psychology had a major impact upon ideas of childhood, child development, cognitive learning and growth, and behavioural engineering. The social disciplines were called upon to produce the kinds of people required by the new economic and socio-political arrangements. Over a period of time, new branches of psychology such as educational psychology, and social, moral and emotional development, emerged as researchers harnessed their work to the political requirements of a modern, industrial economy, which required the production of industrious and loyal citizens of the state.

Mass schooling, in its modern regimented form, expanded at a rapid rate in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries (so-called Progressive Era) when individuals with ‘new’ values, habits and beliefs had to be produced, since older attitudes no longer suited an economy of mass production and consumption.
New concepts of time, leisure and work were replacing an older ethos in which efficiency, productivity and speed were valued less than in contemporary times. One of the earliest forms of a romantic protest against industrialisation and the distancing of Man from nature, is found in Rousseau’s ‘Emile’ in which he advocated an education that would restore the link between human beings and nature. Public schooling was guided in the main by the ideas of John Locke who advocated a positivist and Baconian view of knowledge and understanding, commensurate with the new form of socially collective work called education.

Subsequently, several competing as well as overlapping schools of thought developed educational theory through debate and reflection. The latter include the structural-functional school of thought based on the ideas developed by Emile Durkheim and Talcott Parsons. This school of thought viewed schooling mainly in terms of its liberal functions in society. This was later followed by the conflict school, which drew heavily from Marxist thought as well as from the theorists of the Frankfurt School of Critical Theory. Educational discourse came to be heavily influenced by the ideas of Habermas, Lukacs, Gramsci, Althusser and Bordieu. In the conflict view, the role of schooling in class conflict and reproduction was emphasised. The conflict school was followed by the Interpretative paradigm, which borrowed from the thinking of Max Weber and Michel Foucault’s post-structuralist understanding of the dispersed nature of social power. This view of schooling looked at the school as one among many institutional sites of the production of power through specific discourses of change, adaptation and control. Subsequently, several other discourses contributed to an understanding of the project of schooling. The latter include feminist theories, which looked at patriarchal practices in schooling, and cultural and literary studies, which examined the way in which specific discourses form the sub-text of educational practices and institutions.

The system of mass public schooling, developed in industrially advanced Europe, was exported to other countries through the
The State of Educational Discourse in Pakistan

colonial project, in which education was considered the prime means of ‘modernization’, secularisation and the economic development of society. The colonised elite groups in India eagerly espoused the new paradigm and vied for the establishment of modern schooling systems. Increasingly, the oriental forms of knowledge and learning (local madrassas and Pathshalas in India) were replaced or de-emphasised by a thoroughly English education as advocated by Lord Macaulay in his Minute of 1835. Anglicist ideas were later elaborated upon and reinforced in the Wood’s Despatch of 1854, which became the basis of educational priorities and expansion for the next century. Occidental learning was given priority over oriental knowledge, and a secular English education was declared to be best suited to the needs of a colonised people. While a highly centralised and homogenising form of education continues to be the basic building block for the construction of nationalism, a number of writers, thinkers, planners and technocrats in the field of education remained largely oblivious to the massive critiques of modern education arising within the countries in which mass public schooling was first established.

Multi-disciplinary Nature of the Subject
Since education historically arose within an interdisciplinary framework, it is by definition a multi-disciplinary discourse, which borrows heavily from Economics, for example, the seminal work of Samuel Bowles and Herbert Gintis, *Schooling in Capitalist America*, as well as from Psychology, for example, the work Jean Piaget on cognitive development, Lawrence Kohlerberg on moral development, B.F. Skinner and Watson on Behaviour Modification, and Sigmund Freud on emotional and social development. Education came to borrow concepts from Sociology, Anthropology, Literary Studies, Philosophy and History. The philosophical and paradigmatic shifts in sociological and philosophical thinking, have affected educational practices as much as they have affected Sociology, Economics or Anthropology. Education cannot be seen in isolation from the other liberal disciplines, which have contributed to its development.
This paper is divided into two main sections: the first deals with educational discourse as it has developed in Pakistan and its connection (or lack thereof) with educational thinking in other countries. The second part of the paper deals with a study of three educational institutions, one private and two public, to understand the level of the development of the subject in Pakistan.

**Educational Discourse in Pakistan**

Despite an extensive and intensive critique of the liberal structural-functional paradigm borrowed from the thought of Emile Durkheim and Talcott Parsons, the majority of educators in Pakistan, whether public or private sector experts, donor specialists or NGO practitioners, remained caught within the structural-functionalist and liberal view of education as a social equaliser, instead of seeing it as one more source of inequality in society. The overriding emphasis in educational thinking has remained on the expansion of schooling (quantitative increase) and the deepening of the effects of education (usually referred to as quality), which means perpetually refining techniques and methods to deeply ingrain the ideologies embedded in what is transmitted as legitimate knowledge.

Most of the curricular content in Pakistan remained hostage to the controversial two nation paradigm, especially in Social Studies, Pakistan Studies, Islamiyat and language teaching. Nonetheless, the most liberal and so-called progressive of educators remained chained to the idea that education, as currently constructed, brings about positive change, progress, modernity, democracy and equality, as well as ushering in a scientific ethos. While educators in India developed sophisticated critiques of how education reproduces the existing social order and class relationships, for example the stimulating work of Krishna Kumar and others at Delhi University, in Pakistan the mainstream educational establishment remained unaware of the worldwide scathing critiques of a liberal and positivist education.
A highly influential book on education produced in 1998 to mark the fifty years of Pakistan’s history, is the book edited by Pervez Hoodbhoy ‘Education and the State’. This book deals with various aspects of education, for example, medical education, science education, teacher education, economics of education, public examinations, the role of NGOs, community-based education, madrassah education, university education and so on. A majority of the papers have been written by authors who are not educationists by training but belong to other disciplines such as Physics, Chemistry or Political Science. Only a few papers have been written by professional educationists who appear to be well versed in the debates within the discipline. The approach is, therefore, by and large not critical of the educational project as the main ideological prop for state formation and nationalism. While there is a detailed critique of the low quality of education and the myriad problems in which it seems to be enmeshed, there is little questioning of the entire project of post-enlightenment rationalism and positivism that underlie most educational practices. There is no reference to the critical approach or conflict paradigm both of which interrogate the entire project of education as the apparatus of social power and domination.

Most of the papers in Hoodbhoy’s edited book would fall within the structuralist-functional approach as the emphasis is on the function of education in creating a modern and scientific society. The book shares with many others the common tendency to confound literacy and education. The attitude towards education is a utilitarian and instrumental one in that education is seen primarily as the means to an end. The end is basically economic development as expressed by the editor in his recommendation that the number of general universities, which offer the usual academic subjects should be reduced and the remaining ones should be extended and converted into ‘modern technical training institutes, offering programmes of study and courses with direct economic utility’. The utilitarian bias is evident from the frequent references to the ‘usefulness’ and ‘relevance’ of education. While usefulness and relevance are certainly
important, too much emphasis on them seems to imply that any knowledge that cannot immediately be put to use for some material or developmental utility is useless, unimportant and not worthy of being taught. This kind of thinking can potentially lead one to believe that all the beauty of literature and poetry, all the profundity of philosophy, and all the richness of history are somehow irrelevant and worthy of being discarded. The emphasis on economic utility, highly reminiscent of the educational policy of the era of Ayub Khan, seems to be at the expense of the other aims of education — philosophical, moral and social development of society. The dearth of references to the philosophical foundations of education, coupled with an overemphasis on education as merely the means of economic growth, limits the otherwise worthy attempt to explore the complex issue of education in Pakistan.

The narrowly economistic view of education falls within the neo-liberal approach, which views education in corporate terms and subordinates all learning to the efficiency/productivity model. Education appears to be some kind of an adjunct to the economy as the stress seems to be on skill production (producing workers for an industrial economy) at the expense of creating critical consciousness. The argument for moving towards a more technical and vocationally-oriented education is that ‘Pakistan’s economy is severely skill starved’.9 While the production of skills may be important, education can never be reduced to a mere ‘how-to’ activity. Vocational and technical education is sterile and meaningless when separated from deeper understandings about the role of skills and technical work in the social relations of production. The latter understanding leads to an awareness of one’s position in society vis-a-vis other social actors. This kind of understanding can only come from the social sciences and humanities provided they are taught with a critical awareness.

Hoodbhoy’s book is a good example of empirical work, but it does not contribute to new knowledge about education. It does not add to theory or propose new ideas in education, nor does it
interrogate existing theory. It is primarily a policy-oriented piece of work, which helps us understand the various problems that beset Pakistani education. It also offers some helpful solutions to these very real problems. However, it does not further the discourse about the role of knowledge in society, of education as an ideological state apparatus, nor does it shed critical light on the class, race, gender and religious biases that seem to characterise education in most modern nation-states. The raging debates between Marxist, post-structuralist, feminist and liberal educators are not represented, or are barely referred to. As a result, the book seems useful for policy planners, donor agencies and NGOs, but its academic value is diminished as it steers clear of the enriching debates that make the field of education exciting and alive.

Louis Hayes book, *The Crisis of Education in Pakistan*, is highly descriptive and primarily quantitative in its approach. While it is an empirically useful piece of work, it also lacks engagement with the development or interrogation of theory. The book contains a great deal of information about Pakistan’s educational policies, curricula, teaching practices and history of educational development. It can potentially be very helpful for those who want to engage in research or policy making, but it does not approach education within a critical and oppositional paradigm. It also falls within a primarily liberal approach that tends to view education as an important social asset and equaliser. However, with its proliferation of statistics, numbers and empirical data, it provides a good descriptive picture of Pakistan’s educational malaise up to 1987 when it was published. In this sense it is very useful for further research of a theoretical nature on education.

Hayes’ book examines issues of women’s education, educational administration and allocation, funding and Islamisation of knowledge, but does not place these within the debates on education. Nevertheless, at the end it does raise some interesting questions that have a critical edge. For example, it brings up the fact that subsistence farmers do not need education to do their work, but if they receive an education, they will not want to
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

remain subsistence farmers. This is an issue of class, mobility and educationally induced aspirations. As a modernist project that is steeped in the ideologies of progress, development and growth, mainstream education often overlooks issues of class and structured inequalities. Similarly, Hayes points out the important fact that in Pakistan the symbolic value of being a degree holder is more than the value of actual learning and knowledge. The testimonial itself replaces what it testifies. The school as a signal of modernity, as Bruce Fuller would call it, seems to do more for state legitimation of equal opportunity than any actual imparting of knowledge.

In spite of some important insights into the process and content of education, Hayes remains focussed on the macro issues of funding, allocation, spread and administration. He does not connect the micro level issues of the school and classroom with larger society, to understand how schools function as forms of social and political legitimisation. The intricate connections between the classroom, knowledge, pedagogy and power are not explored. The lack of engagement with educational debates and theory make this work, like the one discussed above, more of a policy prescription than academic work.

As mentioned above, a great deal of writing on education in Pakistan seems to be by non-educationists. It is also true, however, that some of the best theoretical and historical work on education has been done by thinkers belonging to fields other than education. A notable piece of work in this regard has been done by historian Rehmani Begum. Her book, Sir Syed Ahmad Khan: The Politics of Educational Reform, is one of the most thoroughly researched and analytical pieces of work published in Pakistan. Her’s is a highly well-documented account of the politics of the education of Muslims in 19th century India. Rehmani Begum provides a detailed and analytical understanding of Sir Syed’s educational ideas as they were intertwined with the politics of religion, class and colonial discourses of the time. This book is a rare example of detailed and painstaking research, incisive analysis and a deep
understanding of the many contradictions of class, religion and colonial modernity that characterised the work of Sir Syed Ahmad Khan. Her familiarity with the educational milieu of the 19th century, and the politics of Muslim nationalism as it was reflected in educational debates between those for and against the Aligarh brand of modernity, makes her book a real contribution to knowledge and understanding. Educationists in Pakistan have seldom come up with works of excellence and quality of the kind that one can discern in Rehmani’s book. Most educationists tend to be centred on the present, and on the ‘how-to’ to such an extent that any engagement with history and historical debates seems irrelevant or useless.

Tariq Rahman’s book, Language, Education and Culture, focuses mostly on language, but makes interesting connections between language, education, power and inequality. The book reflects sensitivity to issues of knowledge and power, and underscores the importance of the issues of patriarchy, class and ethnicity in education. Rahman is sensitive to the power of knowledge systems in social domination, and refers to Marxist as well as post-structuralist and feminist theories in his analysis. His book reflects sensitivity to issues of identity in relation to education and knowledge. The approach is sophisticated and the interconnections within social phenomena are perceived.

On account of his familiarity with the main intellectual movements of the last two decades, Rahman is able to express a deeper understanding of theory than most books on education, which tend to be highly descriptive. Since this book also addresses issues of inequality, injustice and social difference, it is engaging and informative. Although Rahman is primarily a linguist, his familiarity with debates in education and in the social sciences, along with his painstaking research, make his work rich and thoughtful. While it is hard to say whether the book adds to educational theorising, it does extend the frontiers of knowledge because of the connections between ethnicity, class, gender and educational practice in Pakistan. Like Rehmani’s book discussed above, Rahman’s work is also not
directly oriented to public policy and this makes it a refreshing contribution to academic understanding.

Critical educational discourse has been missing from Pakistan’s educational landscape almost from the beginning. However, the Sindh Education Foundation has started to bring out a critical magazine called *EDucate*, which carries some of the more thoughtful material, although too many articles in this magazine are by western theorists and educationists. A quarterly on education and development, this magazine pushes at the edges of thought by publishing thought-provoking articles on the hegemonic views of education that proliferate in Pakistan. *EDucate* brings together the competing theories of Marxism, post-modernism, post-development and anti-development thought with an emphasis on their impact on education. The focus of the magazine is ‘education for social change’ and it contains articles, book reviews, interviews of educators and social thinkers, and views of ordinary people about education and development.

The various issues of the magazine deal with globalisation, neo-liberalism in education, community participation, teachers as transformative intellectuals, corporatisation of education and resistance to dominant ideologies through alternative forms of education. It carries articles by world-renowned Marxist thinkers and critical educationists such as Michael Apple, Henry Giroux, Manish Jain, Ivan Illich and Peter Maclaren. There are features on the work of the famous Brazilian educator Paulo Freire and interviews with well-known thinkers such as Noam Chomsky, Tariq Rahman and others.

*EDucate* presents incisive critiques of the notion of banking education, the neo-liberal view of turning each person into a consumer and worker in the capitalist economy, and the corporate values of efficiency, productivity and performance. The magazine takes a broader view of education than mere schooling. Rather, it often faults schooling for the regimentation, regulation, standardisation, conformity and disciplining that
schooling engenders. Instead, it celebrates the creativity that each person expresses independently of institutions of social control and homogenisation. As a part of the broader view of education, one issue is devoted to the media and its role in modern society. The magazine highlights the idea that media and education are not neutral or ‘innocent’ activities and that both can become highly insidious forms of manipulation in the capitalist economy. The magazine takes an alternative view of knowledge, that knowledge does not consist of disconnected bits of information or facts, but the relation between facts that leads to understanding of concepts. Similarly, teaching is not viewed as a set of mechanical pre-determined tasks, but an activity in which the teachers and students should be empowered to create their own knowledge in mutual interaction. The view of teacher as technician is questioned, as is the emphasis on pre-packaged curriculum materials that deskill the teacher. The relationship between education and colonialism is also explored as a nexus of knowledge, power and empire.

While the critiques of the instrumental rationality underlying modern education, of the market orientation of knowledge as a commodity to be consumed, and of the managerial model of efficiency/productivity and speed in education, are valid and extremely refreshing in an environment that does not seem to support theory and idea building, EDucate has a few shortcomings. Two of these are worth mentioning. First, EDucate seems to rely far too heavily on articles and papers by American and European authors. There are very few articles by Pakistani thinkers on education. While the western authors are extremely important in the field and some articles by them are needed, too much reliance can make it appear that the magazine has little to do with Pakistan. This impression may be created despite the fact that many of the issues underlined by these authors are supremely relevant for Pakistani society, which is swiftly moving towards the neo-liberal and corporate paradigms of education. Second, the articles are more like essays that make some important point, but are not researched papers of high academic quality. This is obviously so because EDucate is a
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

magazine rather than a journal. Nevertheless, it is a serious magazine and some researched papers by Pakistani academics would further strengthen the intellectual base of the magazine.

Despite its flaws, *Educate* is an oasis in the desert of Pakistani education where so little theoretical discourse is generated that every effort quenches some of the thirst. It is the first magazine, and that too by a government foundation, which takes a critical look at the discourse of education, modernity and development. It challenges the domination of the liberal and neo-liberal paradigms that inform government policies, which endlessly repeat the same prescriptions — more enrolment, more teachers, more techniques, more training, more schools, more buildings and more money! The overwhelming stress on quantity, spread and deepening of effects, overlooks the demonic underside of educational interventions.

The Pakistan Education Foundation, Islamabad, produces a quarterly *Taleemi Zaaviye* (Educational Perspectives), a journal based on articles and papers on education. This quarterly seems to have a strong religious and nationalist bias. Five out of twenty topics (one fourth) are based on nationalist and religious content. The research referred to in the purely educational articles is mostly western, liberal and/or drawn from the discredited Behavioural Modification theory. An examination of the topics in one issue showed a preponderance of religious and nationalist content, for example, there were papers on the Pakistan Movement, Iqbal, Jinnah, duties of a teacher, role of teacher in ideological institutions, Qura’anic view of education, the Holy Prophet’s influence on Quaid-i-Azam, cooperative learning and learning aids, correct usage of words, school funding, Qura’anic view of education and our schools, problems of school education, effects of education, and higher education in Malaysia in 20th century. The tone of some of the papers is highly moralistic exhorting teachers towards their duties rather than analysing their situation.
By and large there is very little contribution to theory and new knowledge. There is great reliance on Western liberal education theory when it comes to understanding technical issues in education and the purpose is to modernise it, but when ideology is the issue, the theoretical underpinning is drawn from religious and national persons. There are no references to critical theory in education. There are articles and papers on issues related to Pakistan’s policies and curricula, while are purely based on liberal psychology and are of a technical nature not specifically focussed on Pakistan. There is heavy reliance, however, on mainstream liberal theory of education and psychology developed primarily in the United States.

**The Donor-NGO Sector in Education**

The sector, which most strongly embraces the ideologies of quantity, expansion and deepening of educational effects, is that middle sector between public and private — the NGO sector driven by donor agencies and the World Bank. This sector seems to be located squarely within neo-liberal doctrines of privatisation, roll back of the state from the provision of education, the spread of mass literacy without an examination of the content of what is being spread. The focus of this sector is almost entirely on quantitative expansion — more schools, more teachers, more enrolment, fewer dropouts, more techniques, more training. There was lip service to the issue of quality but seldom was there any attempt to ensure quality in the large number of schools run by NGOs under the Prime Minister’s Literacy Commission established by Nawaz Sharif in 1996.

The level of teaching and learning in non-formal schools run by NGOs, is extremely low in spite of the claims of quality education, the use of innovative methods and extensive teacher training. To be sure, some NGOs have developed original and innovative teaching and learning materials that are clearly superior to the government textbooks and materials, but these constitute a drop in the vast ocean of increasing ignorance. A large number of NGOs have sprung up in the education sector, which is highly funded, but the work does not match the amount
of money received by these institutions. Most often, literacy is confused with education and the mere rote memorisation of words, letters and numbers is mistakenly referred to as education. Filling a child’s head with a vast number of unrelated facts and bits of information is passed off as knowledge, and seldom is an attempt made to connect facts with one another through concepts. The overwhelming focus on primary education, at the expense of secondary and higher education, seems to stem from the fact that the multinationals would require a workforce that can count and read simple labels on products (workers/consumers), but would not require critical persons able to think and analyse. Globalisation requires cheaply available workers and eager consumers, but not citizens who can challenge the state or critically conscious people who can engage in dissent.

When the education ‘experts’, drawn to an extent from the NGO sector, finally turned their attention to higher education, they sought to corporatise it rather than empowering the teachers and students. This has led to the mass agitation by teachers against the proposed Reforms in higher education and the formation of the Higher Education Commission. The thrust is not only towards privatisation of higher education, the neo-liberal models of efficiency, productivity and managerialism run through the proposals. The very language of ‘Board of Governors’ or ‘Board of Directors’ is reminiscent of companies rather than educational institutions, which represent a different moral and social universe than companies based exclusively on profit maximisation.

The donor and NGO sector remains committed to a highly technocratic, narrow and information-as-knowledge view of education, as is evident from the reports and materials produced by this sector. A large amount of this material is in the form of training manuals, pamphlets, and booklets, which seem like advertisements and cater to a relatively less educated audience. Additionally, the NGO and donor sector tends to focus on faddish issues and/or a faddish approach to issues of gender or
human rights in education. This approach is not critical or challenging as it tends to de-historicise important concepts and leans towards static views of gender, human rights or any social phenomenon. Since most of the literature produced by NGOs is self-consciously propagandist in nature, it tends to be uncritical of concepts that have been subjected to intellectual scrutiny elsewhere. The general tendency among NGOs is to separate social issues such as those related to class, ethnicity, religion, language or gender, from one another. This kind of fragmentation of knowledge tends to prevent a holistic understanding as each issue gets compartmentalised. Their deep linkages with one another become difficult to perceive as each issue appears to be a separate one. Where social knowledge and an understanding of the social universe is concerned, the social sciences could be drawn upon for a better understanding, but this is generally avoided in the NGO sector, which prefers to focus on technical training, and tends to reduce teachers to mere technicians carrying out pre-determined, repetitive and mechanical tasks.

Although the overall focus of the NGO sector has been on the expansion of primary or at best elementary education, with virtually no addition to the intellectual discourse on education, there are some notable exceptions. The Sustainable Development Policy Institute (SDPI) in Islamabad has carried out empirical educational research in Pakistani villages. These studies were conducted by Haris Gazdar, Lubna Chowdhary, and also by Shahrukh Rafi Khan. The insights from their work are highly useful for theory building, especially as regards the economic issues of access to education and returns from primary level education. The Society for the Advancement of Education (SAHE) has similarly conducted research and surveys and produced material that can enter into theory building. Some of the publications of SAHE focus on the teaching of history\textsuperscript{14}, a critique of the education system in Pakistan\textsuperscript{15}, and a critique of neo-liberalism, mainstream development paradigms and the ideologies packed in the curriculum.\textsuperscript{16} Similarly, ASR, a Lahore-based women’s NGO, has published some work by this author,
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

which is research based and can make a modest contribution to educational discourse.¹⁷

A number of education NGOs such as Anjuman-barai-Taleem (not funded by foreign donors), Bargad, Alif Laila, Savera, Sudhaar, SAHE, Idara-e-Taleem-O-Aghai in the Punjab, and Baahin Beli and NGORC in Sindh, Society and Institute of Development Studies and Practice (IDSP) run by Qurat-ul-Ain Bakhteari in Balochistan, and Khwendo Kor run by Maryam Bibi in NWFP, have attempted to introduce some semblance of critical awareness among students and teachers whom they see as agents of social transformation. These, along with some Community Based Organisations, have made rudimentary attempts to instil critical thinking among their teachers. However, this has been done with many constraints and not very systematically. The impact of these efforts has been limited, especially when donor priorities have entered the equation. While some donors allow limited space to develop alternative and critical models, most prefer highly technocratic forms of training and research. Most donors appear to have a deep aversion to theory building and work representing political thought, theoretical depth or academic discourse. This is the case even when the goal is to teach human rights, a subject essentially and deeply political by nature. The donor aversion tends to discourage NGOs from research representing any great conceptual depth. The result is the proliferation of surveys, descriptive studies and a deep-rooted empiricism that does not go any further than collecting initial data. The work of interpretation and analysis remains weak with the result that new knowledge and new ideas fail to develop.

Quantitative Development of Discipline of Education in Public Universities

The data on departments of Education from 1947 to 1962 became available after the publication of 1963 Handbook.¹⁸ It reported the existence of three Education departments in 1963 having 28 teachers with an average of nine teachers in each department. By the year 2001, the number of departments rose to
The State of Educational Discourse in Pakistan

21 and the number of teachers to 136 with an average of almost six teachers in each department. It means that the number of departments grew by seven times while the number of teachers grew by 15 times.

The 1963 Handbook also shows that out of 28 teachers in Education departments that year, two (7% of all teachers) had PhD degrees, no teacher had MPhil degree and the 24 (86%) teachers had MA degrees. In 2001 out of 136 teachers 37 (27%) were holding PhD degrees, nine (7%) MPhil degrees and 75 (55%) MA degrees. The difference in share percentage of the three degrees in 1963 and 2001 shows an increase of 20% for PhDs, an increase of 7% for MPhils and a decrease of 31% for MA degrees. This shows that by 2001 higher degrees to a certain extent were replacing lower degrees. Such a change possibly may have positive impact on quality of education.

Out of 28 teachers of Education in 1963, 12 (43%) had their degrees from foreign universities. In 2001, out of 136 teachers 17 (13%) had such degrees showing 30% decline in foreign qualified teachers and to that extent a rise in the level of indigenisation of degrees. Taking PhD teachers separately there were two PhD teachers in 1963, and one of them (50%) had PhD degree from a foreign university. In 2001, out of the total 37 PhDs, 11 (30%) had their degrees from foreign Universities, showing a 20% decline in the foreign trained PhDs.

**PhD and MPhil Theses**

For earning a professional degree at the level of PhD and MPhil the completion of a thesis is a necessary requirement for a student. The quality and quantity of theses produced by a department reflect on its academic strength as well as its contribution to the preparation of well qualified researchers who will be teaching or doing research in the discipline.

The first department of Education was established in 1959 in Punjab University. Since then up to 2001 (42 years) Education departments in seven public universities have produced a total
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

of 78 PhD and MPhil theses with an average of two theses per year. Forty eight (61%) were produced before 1987 and 30 (39%) were completed between 1987 to 2001. The share of PhD theses out of total 78 theses is 82% and that of MPhil 18%.

In 42 years, the departments of Education in seven Universities, about which we have data, have produced 64 PhD theses, that is one and half PhD per year. Forty six of them were produced before 1987 (1.2 per year) and 18 from 1987 to 2001 (1.2 per year) suggesting that the rate of production of PhD theses has remained the same in the two periods. From 1959 to 2001, 14 MPhil theses have been produced with an average of 0.33 MPhil per year. Out of these only two MPhil theses were completed before 1987 with an average of 0.05 per year and 12 (86%) from 1987 to 2001 with an average of 0.8 thesis per year. The above data suggests that while average per year of PhD theses remained the same in the two periods, the average per year of MPhil theses jumped up by 16 times.

Out of the total 64 PhD theses produced by seven universities by 2001, University of the Punjab has produced the largest number (47), followed by Karachi University (6), Sindh University (4) and Bahauddin Zakariya University (4). University of Peshawar has produced two while Shah Abdul Latif University has produced one PhD thesis. Balochistan University has yet to produce any PhD thesis. Out of the total 14 MPhil theses produced during the same period, Karachi University has produced the largest number (8), followed by Peshawar University (5) and Balochistan University (1). The remaining four Universities have not yet produced any MPhil thesis.

The decade-wise breakdown of theses shows that one PhD thesis was produced in 50s, 13 in 60s, 16 in 70s, 27 (22 PhDs and five MPhils) in 80s and 21 (12 PhDs and 9 MPhils) during 90s. It may be noted that 48 (61%) of all 78 theses were produced in 80s and 90s.
Out of 78 theses produced by 2001, 69 were written in English and nine in Urdu. Sixty five (83%) writers of these theses were male and remaining 13 (17%) were females.

This extraordinary rise in the departments of Education and the production of educational degrees does not seem to have translated into good quality research and the development of a vibrant discourse on education.

A Study of Three Educational Institutions
In order to understand the state of the discipline of Education in detail, three institutions, the Ali Institute of Education, the Government College of Education and the Institute of Educational Research were examined in some detail. All three institutions are located in Lahore and the latter two are in the public sector, which the former, Ali Institute is a private sector initiative. Visits were made to all three institutions and faculty, students and the managements were interviewed in detail about the various aspects including the levels and kinds of research, availability of journals and materials, qualifications of teachers, the background of students, the degrees or diplomas awarded, funding sources and subjects taught. The pages that follow reflect the findings of the study conducted by the author.

At the Institute of Educational Research (IER) the thesis is compulsory and is usually done in groups of three or four under the supervision of the relevant field head, the adviser or the chairperson. There are mainly four types of theses – comparative, experimental, historical and quantitative (the latter type of research is confined mostly to finding percentages only). The faculty revealed that about 80% theses are related to issues in Pakistan, even if they are of a theoretical nature. There are very few theses based on comparative work, however, comparisons between educational practices and systems between the different regions of Pakistan are carried out. ‘Other countries’ papers are used to get ideas and models for Pakistan in order to borrow experiences from South Asian and other
countries. There are some theses based on comparisons with US, former USSR, India and Thailand.

Most research is highly descriptive in nature and is based on the self-report interview method, which is easy for students to carry out. There are some theses that look at education in the context of the history of the subcontinent but overall there is very little theoretical or academic research of international standards. Most research is of the applied variety and the focus on theory building is almost totally absent. Most of the research is on curriculum, examination of Pakistan’s policies and educational systems.

Some examples of the research topics at IER are the following: causes of educational backwardness in the views of teachers and students, evaluation of computer textbook of Intermediate level, examination of future of girls’ primary education, technical education in Islamic perspective, Islamic basis of teacher training, examination of social studies textbook for class VI, educational causes of the separation of East Pakistan, examination of concept of Tawheed in secondary level textbooks, Educational Reform in the light of the Holy Qura’an, secondary education in the light of educational policies, motivation and attitudes of students towards education, study of teacher role in personality development, Qura’anic view of education, analysis of educational thought of Shah Wali Ullah, importance of education in Islam and its lack in Pakistan, effects of environment on education, Islamic demands of education in modern times, problems of teaching English language, problems of teachers of Maths, preparing instructional models in chemistry, comparison of Islamic and evolutionary views of the origin of the universe, study of emotional needs of children, expectations of teachers from the institution head, causes of student absenteeism in secondary schools, effects of media on education, practical plan for spread of religious education among Muslim women, Islamic concepts of education and their impact on children, comparison of educational systems of Pakistan and India, responsibilities of a Muslim head of school in the light of
The State of Educational Discourse in Pakistan

the Holy Qura’an, level of commitment of secondary teachers to their profession in Khanewal, comparison of science teaching in govt and private schools in Lahore city, examination of the educational system of the Mughals, level of commitment to profession among teachers in Jhang, examination, self esteem and academic achievement between male and female Postgraduate students, satisfaction of primary level school teachers in rural areas, comparison of intermediate results of various cities and between matriculate and intermediate, examination of Pakistan’s educational system in the light of 21st century demands, quality and stress management in schools, role of head teachers in secondary schools, comparison of the educational philosophy of Iqbal and Ashraf Ali Thanvi, problems of private and public school teachers, problems in training science teachers, examination of private and public secondary school management, study of emotionally disturbed children at secondary level, student attitudes, medium of instruction, what do teachers think of teaching through Urdu, internal examination system versus external, studies of specific schools and their activities, study of effects of computers on creativity and academic achievement, problem of elementary level women teachers, role of curriculum in ending sectarianism, comparison of Pakistan’s educational aims with the period of the Holy Prophet, examination of primary level textbooks in the light of the Ideology of Pakistan, utility of computers in education, India Pakistan university education comparison, characteristics of school effectiveness in the eyes of teachers, study of shy students, examination of Sir Syed’s views on education, time management, enriching environment, study of non-formal education projects, study of talented students, Effective teaching in the light of the Holy Qura’an, study of children’s problems in the light of Islam and Psychology, class system of Pakistan’s education, study of educational planning, devising standards for evaluating teachers, Islamisation of Pakistan’s educational policies, what makes women want to teach, examination of technical and vocational education, educational management in the light of the Holy Qura’an and how to do this in modern times, teacher and parent relations
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

effects on education, science teaching in the light of Islam, comparison of education system of Australia and Pakistan, effects of politics on education, gender difference in science achievement in secondary education, learning difficulties, Pakistan’s educational problems and their solutions in the light of Islam, co-curricular activities in the period of the Holy Prophet, Islamisation of education, Qura’an and education, Importance of Islamic education and training for women teachers, self-concept and education, computer literacy, moral attitudes of teachers and their effects on children, parents views of teacher’s morals, elaboration of the Islamic view of education, comparison of educational systems of Pakistan and UK, admin development in Islamic perspective, the method given in Qura’an and by the Holy Prophet in developing student character, problems in English essay writing, role of management in teachers’ decision making, student’s conception of Earth, stress management, conducive environment for learning, student motivation, character building education, effectiveness of computer science curriculum, effectiveness of audio visual aids in teaching Biology, comparison of education system of Pakistan and Japan, problems of teachers, national policies, Urdu language, educational thought of Ahmad Raza Barelvi, causes of dropout, science concept in Islamic perspectives, parental occupation and education effects on learning, educational administration of the Punjab, motivation, science, Islamic concept of women’s rights in education, educational thought of Bulleh Shah, comparison of high and low achievers, effects of Islamiyat teaching on student character at secondary level, role of Islam in the development of science, 21st century demands on education, comparing stress of working and non-working women, comparison of Pakistan’s educational system with Bangladesh, problems of admin of govt schools, factors influencing early childhood education, methods of teaching in the Islamic perspective, effect of economic status of parent on child’s achievement levels, review of industrial education, Kant’s philosophy of education, self concept among students, and intelligence testing.
The IER, which was established during the era of Ayub Khan in 1960 as a modern research institute, came to be dominated heavily by the religious right in the 1970s and 1980s. A large number of students come from the rural areas in search of a professional job-oriented degree and tend to be conservative and traditional in their thinking. The overwhelming focus on Islam in education, along with primarily conservative values, is visible in most departments of IER as well as among some members of the faculty and students.

The Government College of Education (GCE) is the oldest institution of teacher training established in the Subcontinent in 1880. The thesis is compulsory to receive the MA and MEd degrees. Most of the theses are quantitative and of the survey variety, while a few are theoretical in nature. While comparative studies with other countries do take place, there are no theses that deal exclusively with other countries. However, the focus is on issue based, applied and practical research that can be utilised to solve problems.

The following are some examples of the kind of topics selected by students: Correlation between Physics and Mathematics in Teaching and Learning, job satisfaction of Postgraduate teachers, Sir Syed’s Rationalism and Impact on Education, development of semi-standardised objective type test in Biology for O-Level, a survey of problems faced by teachers of exceptional children, a study of job satisfaction among teachers, identification of problems of science education, a study of causes of aggressive behaviour of teachers at secondary school level, an examination of the reasons why students choose science subjects at secondary level in Mandi Bahauddin, a study of the effectiveness of Programmes of Pakistan Television as perceived by secondary school teachers, students and their parents, study of the effects of laboratory activities in Physics on the achievement of secondary school students, problems in computer science, effect of games on learning, causes of failure of secondary school students in English, lack of cooperation among teachers at secondary level, causes of too much tuition among students in Gujranwala,
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

education from Islamic point of view, leadership styles in headmasters and their effects, how to end sectarianism through education, influence of Ahmad Raza Shah Barelvi on students, problems in educational supervision in Narowal, content analysis of Physics textbook for class IX by Punjab Textbook Board, role of NGOs in promoting vocational training in Lahore, level of environmental awareness among students in Punjab Education Colleges, role of administrators in promoting a better psychological environment in schools, views of parents on their children’s schooling.

There are a large number of theses on psychological topics related to child development and learning. The theses are divided into the categories of historical, experimental, applied, basic and qualitative. There are not many theoretical theses and the level of research is not very high as compared with international standards. The research is primarily descriptive in nature consisting of field surveys based on actual problems of Pakistan. There is no systematic theoretical bias. A large number of theses are case studies on various parts of Pakistan while some are historical explorations. There is a tendency towards positivism in science teaching and learning. There are very few theoretical theses that either build on or challenge a theory. The overwhelming thrust seems to be on quantitative and social perception surveys. There was only one thesis on a social issue such as sectarianism, and only one on the views of the Ahmad Raza Barelvi on education, in this sample.

At the Ali Institute of Education (AIE) a final research paper or thesis is required for the diploma. There is an action-research project, which is both quantitative and qualitative. The students choose a topic, which is approved by the Coordinator for Professional Studies. The research sample is provided through the Teaching Practice (TP) which is required of all students. The students collect the data, tabulate and analyse it for presentation before a committee. The theses are occasionally theoretical and do add to new ideas based on their findings. The students are encouraged to explore and discover things on their own. There
are research supervisors and since this is only BEd level, theory building as such is not yet done. They graduate based on the quality of the thesis submitted. They are encouraged to present their findings and defend the positions that they take.

Some examples of the topics include the following: Test anxiety in English, peer work for teaching English, developing critical thinking, effects of art on learning, which is based on the experimental method, reasons for lack of confidence in school children, effects of teachers’ attitudes on student learning, effective ways of encouraging co-operative learning, using games to make English Language Teaching (ELT) interesting, using activities to improve speaking skills, effects of group work on learning, test anxiety in English, effective ways of motivating slow learners, effectiveness of tests as assessment tools for English; effects of positive reinforcement on learning science, motivating shy children through positive reinforcement, controlling behaviour problems, effects of activity based teaching in science, effective use of audio visual aids in mathematics teaching, homework in the teaching of mathematics, pair work effects on learning, cognitive development through art, using worksheets to teach science, assessment of science learning.

There are very few theses on basic questions such as what view to take of science, Mathematics or even knowledge in general. There are also very few on the basic theories or philosophies of education or on state, society, economy and education. There is generally a positivist view of science versus the sociology of knowledge perspective of science as not a neutral mirror of reality but a deeply political ideology. There is no contested or controversial, debate or theory oriented thesis, mainly because it is only BEd level. The focus tends to be on micro-level classroom issues. The broader macro-level issues in education, for example, moral absolutism versus moral relativism, globalisation versus nationalism, political economy of education debates, or knowledge as a contested field type of debates, are absent here as elsewhere.
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

All the theses are on Pakistani school systems and issues, thus there is an overlap of theoretical and Pakistan’s issue based theses. The research site is usually a private school in Lahore and the sample is drawn from primary school level. The students also study teachers, for example, ‘Demotivation of Teachers: Causes and Dynamics’. They observe classes, make checklists, design questionnaires and conduct interviews and then write up the results. Since it is action-oriented research, they make policy recommendations at the end. There is not much comparative work right now. Inter-city comparisons are done but not with other countries.

Students spend twenty-one weeks in the third term doing the research project. A total of twenty-three weeks are spent on research. The emphasis on teaching and research both is 50% each. According to the faculty, they try to maintain a balance between theory and practical problems. Earlier, AIE was focussed on too much practice and no theory. In recent years, the emphasis on theory has increased. An Internal Research Committee evaluates the research before declaring the student successful.

In the above the details of MA theses produced by each institute has been given. If we put all of them together to determine the category in which they fall following conclusion emerges. Out of 180 theses produced by these institutes 121 (67%) are exclusively theoretical, 52 (29%) are related to Pakistan issues and the remaining 7 (4%) are comparative. No thesis dealing with the other countries has been produced.

The great majority of theses tend to be mere quantitative surveys that are reported in ways, which do not contribute to theory development. Most surveys are based on issues derived from cognitive and behavioural theories or concepts developed in Western countries by Jean Piaget, Lawrence Kohlberg, B. F. Skinner or J. B. Watson. The ideas in cognitive, developmental or behavioural psychology developed by these and other
thinkers, are applied to situations in Pakistan and the results reported. Most of these surveys lack the sophistication of theory and seldom challenge a given theory.

The largest number of theses are exclusively theoretical, but this can be a misleading picture since the data is somewhat skewed. The Ali Institute of Education, Lahore ran only diploma courses in the past and has recently started a degree programme. Additionally, the Ali Institute has been focussed on primary and, to some extent, elementary education. There has been an overemphasis on technical training and very little engagement with serious educational theorising in the past. The result is that the theses seem to be theoretical in nature, but actually represent small studies on some aspect of learning or child behaviour. If the 37 theses of the Ali Institute were discarded from the sample, the largest number of theses overall would be based on issues in Pakistani education.

In the above the theses produced by three Institutions have been examined. The discussion below also includes the theses produced in Education departments of University of Balochistan, University of Peshawar, University of Karachi and Bahauddin Zakariya University.

An examination of the topics of theses revealed that there is a preponderance of small quantitative surveys, observations and descriptive studies. Most of these studies look at some aspect of education within theories developed in Europe and North America. There is a severe dearth of the kind of work that would add to existing knowledge or produce a new or innovative idea or theory. There is very little relation of the theses to contemporary debates between Marxist, post-structuralist, post-modernist, Islamist and liberal educationists.

There seems to be some regional variation in the types of theses written and topics chosen. The highest number of purely theoretical theses are found in the Punjab, and more specifically in Lahore, in the two public sector institutions (IER and GCE),
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

as well as at the private sector institute (AIE). On the other hand, in Multan all the four theses were on issues in Pakistani education. The same is the case with the four theses on education in Balochistan. In the NWFP, 89% of the theses were about educational issues in Pakistan and 11% were purely theoretical. In Sindh, the number of purely theoretical theses is higher at 38%, but the theses on issues in Pakistani education were the highest at 62%. It seems that the smaller provinces are more concerned with practical issues that directly affect their lives, while in the Punjab and Sindh there is a greater tendency towards purely theoretical theses as compared with Balochistan and the NWFP. However, even within Punjab, Lahore has more theoretical theses, while a smaller city, Multan, is less concerned with purely theoretical issues.

The reasons for this variation may be many and would require detailed analysis separately. However, for this study one can make some conjectures. The smaller provinces may be more concerned with national issues due to their pressing nature and the relatively lower level of education in Balochistan and NWFP as compared with both Sindh and the Punjab. Secondly, the smaller provinces have experienced deprivation in many ways, and the concern with national issues as opposed to purely theoretical ones could be an indication of remedying the differentials. The theses in the NWFP and Balochistan seem to be concerned with issues such as Madrassah education, educational policy, reform and women’s education and the level of library services available. The theses seem to be about the issues that seem to affect their lives and require reform. There may be many other reasons for regional variation but their analysis would require a separate study.

It must be remembered that most of the theses being referred to as ‘purely theoretical’ are not of a high theoretical or academic level, but small studies on some aspect of education such as the effect of art on learning or the use of games to teach mathematics. They do not represent research of a deeply theoretical or analytical kind, which would connect the micro
issues of schooling with the macro issues of the economy and state. Even as small, micro level studies, they do not represent a high degree of theoretical sophistication.

Very few topics were based on the comparative method, and all of them were found at the IER, Lahore. There can be several reasons for this lack and again a separate study would be required to understand all the reasons. However, one can some informed guesses. One reason may simply be the paucity of data available about educational systems of other countries for a comparative analysis. Since Internet facilities are not easily available either to students or faculty, access to data on other countries is even harder. The second reason may centre around a sheer lack of interest or stimulation to undertake such a study. Since a large number of students join the education department after failing to get admission in the more prestigious departments, educational research may not be their natural interest or first choice. Comparative work requires a deep interest in and commitment to the subject of one’s choice. As reported by some members of the faculty at the government institutions, the students who cannot get admission in Physics, Management or Engineering, turn to education as a practical and job-oriented degree. Another reason may be rooted in the simple feeling that there are so many educational problems within Pakistan that there is no need to focus on other countries, even though this may yield useful ideas for changes in Pakistani education. This may also be the reason that there was only one thesis out of 263, which focussed entirely on another country. While there are few comparative theses with other countries, there is some inter-city or inter-provincial comparative work at all the institutions.

**Absence of a Community of Researchers**

Visits and interviews with the faculties of IER, AIE and GCE revealed that there is no institutionalised and viable community of researchers in education. In most countries, thinkers and analysts belonging to a particular field of study tend to interact with one another through a number of institutionalised means,
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

which include research journals, regular meetings, seminars and conferences as well as direct correspondence. In recent years, the Internet has provided a new highly efficient and fast means of communicating with other academics to exchange views, share ideas and comment on each other’s work. This kind of interaction, extremely helpful in the germination of new ideas through collaborative work, seems to be virtually absent from the educational landscape of Pakistan.

There are very few journals and these are not of international standard. Some members of the faculty write frequently but their essays are based on reflections rather than research. While the three institutions studied get a few journals of international standing, they are not used very often either by the faculty or the students. Owing to a resource crunch, the IER is able to get only 6 out of hundreds of international journals on education and psychology. The IER produces a few journals, in English and Urdu. The English journals *Bulletin of Education* and *Journal of Elementary Education* are used relatively more often than others. The Urdu journals include *Ibtidai Taleem* (Basic Education) and *Taleemat*. Apart from these, there is the bi-annual *Taleem-o-Tehqeeq* (Education and Research).

An issue of the *Journal of Elementary Education* contained the following topics: environmental education and sustainable development, comparison of Urdu and English, importance of leisure activities, effects of multi-media on children, disabilities, teacher education in developing countries, teacher roles, effects of medium of instruction, children’s science and distance education. This journal seems to be of a relatively better academic standard, but all the theories mentioned are Western and there is no debate on issues in Pakistan. However, this journal avoids an overly religious tone and content, which is refreshing given that educational discourse seems overburdened with ideological content rooted in religion and nationalism of an inane and thoughtless variety. This journal reflects familiarity with some of the latest developments in educational and developmental psychology. In this sense, it has a better standard
The State of Educational Discourse in Pakistan

despite the usual weakness that there is no new contribution to theory.

The Bulletin of Education and Research is bi-annual and the issue examined also contains many references to theories developed elsewhere.²⁷ Once again the level of the papers is relatively better and there are overviews and reviews of research done in other countries. Apart from this it contains an examination of national policies, technical education, student motivation, analysis of physics syllabus, teacher education in Pakistan, impact of globalisation on education, quality education delivery, questioning as a tool of instruction, improving learning in elementary schools, Hawthorne effect, improving interaction between vocational/technical education and industry. This journal is not very inclined to subjects rooted in religious or national ideology. It is interesting to note that while the student body of IER is generally conservative with a strong tendency towards religious thinking, the journals do not reflect this very strongly. This may be because it is mostly the English speaking, foreign qualified faculty that tends to contribute to these journals. The latter category tends to be very often liberal in thinking and less inclined to use religious arguments in research that has a positivist bias.

The Government College of Education (GCE) produces a quarterly called Amozish. So far two issues of Amozish have come out and students and teachers both contribute papers to it. Amozish has a good academic level and contains articles, mostly contributed by Professors of GCE and other colleges such as Government College Lahore. However, most of the theories referred to are by Western theorists such as Piaget, Foucault and child development specialists. The papers in Volume I, 2000 vary from explaining certain theories of knowledge, for example, Piaget’s Constructivism to teacher training methods in other countries, techniques of educational assessment, language learning, teacher motivation and educational management theories. These are mostly overviews or review of literature type papers that bring together theories developed in other countries.
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

There is no theory development by the writers themselves. *Amozish* is not very data based and the papers are based on secondary source materials. There is little effort to work on primary source materials, which would lend more credence to the papers.

The *College Chronicle* is a magazine of the GCE that carries varied articles from interviews to poems, to essays on medicine, science, popular feelings about war, Noam Chomsky, review of Foucault’s book, *Discipline and Punish* and lighter articles such as the one on the Zodiac elements. On account of a severe dearth of resources, the GCE does not have access to international journals and the access to the Internet is limited.

The Ali Institute of Education plans to bring out a journal in the near future. According to the faculty, students are constantly encouraged to write and publish. The emphasis is on research for the love of it and not for tenure, which places the faculty in other countries under extreme stress to either publish or lose their jobs. There is a committee at AIE to develop the research skills of the students. The first copy of the AIE journal is expected in the fall of 2003. It is intended to be a scholarly journal with papers representing new ideas in educational philosophy.

AIE subscribes to 27 journals of international repute, which include *Action and Teacher Education, Elementary School Journal, Harvard Educational Tribune, European Journal of Teacher Education, Teachers College Record, Science Education, and Journal of Staff Development*. Since the AIE is a privately funded institute it can afford to subscribe to international journals, while a severe resource crunch is cited by government institutions for the lack of access to international academic developments. The faculty at AIE reported using the journals frequently and greatly benefiting from them.

There is, however, no debate, controversy or exchange through any of the journals produced by the institutions. Any member of the faculty who wants to write a book or a paper in the journal in
his department is isolated. There is no one with whom to exchange his/her ideas or receive feedback. Other members of the faculty hardly ever read papers written by their colleagues. Hence, very little dialogue takes place even within faculty members of the same institution let alone with those of other institutions. One faculty member in a government institution suggested that dialogue and publishing are not very encouraged and the environment and facilities are of such a low level that the inspiration is missing. Whatever does get written or published reflects intense personal commitment and desire on the part of the individual researcher, not the pressure or backing of the institution.

Most academic communities get together at seminars and conferences to present their research findings and exchange ideas. All over the world, annual and sometimes bi-annual conferences take place, which allow researchers to share their work and receive feedback and evaluation. Academic conferences are another way of generating interaction, dialogue and exchange among thinkers within a discipline, which receives a boost from the interchange and collaboration that often takes place as a result of these meetings.

The education community in Pakistan has sorely missed the opportunity for getting together to exchange views. Once again, due to a severe dearth of resources, interest and support from higher authorities, such conferences have been rare. The IER reports that there is no money available for big conferences but small intra-departmental meetings occur from time to time. There has been no collaboration with international colleagues including South Asian educationists. However, the silver lining on this dark cloud of stagnation is that a national conference is planned and will take place in 2003.

The Government College of Education reports refresher courses and several workshops but no academic conferences. The workshops are mostly simply teacher education workshops. No GCE faculty member or student has participated in a national or
international conference on education. However, some interaction is made possible by inviting visiting lecturers to the college. The GCE also reported having no funds for such conferences and the only exchange that exists is some informational exchange with Delhi University, but this is minimal due to border tensions between the two countries.

As a privately funded institution the AIE has a better resource base. Two national conferences have taken place and the third one is due in 2004. However, there were no papers presented at the previous conferences. These were based on a series of workshops and open discussion sessions. The workshops were mostly of a practical nature, such as teaching of Mathematics or science, or making teaching aids. There were panel discussions but no papers. Hence, the conferences did not generate intellectual discourse, which could have potentially furthered the field, which is starved of theoreticians in Pakistan.

The only limited interaction that takes place among education thinkers is within the department or institute at professional association meetings or informal faculty meetings. The IER Alumni Association meets annually and the sessions are devoted to professional exchange. It is usually a faculty based meeting on professional and academic issues. Apart from these, there are department level and institute level meetings, which are not regular but need-based. There are no opportunities for regular exchange at the regional level. The seminar in June of 2003 has been organised by the Alumni Association. The Tanzeem-e-Asatiza meets occasionally, but there are no institutionalised forms of intellectual exchange and interaction.

The GCE faculty members meet other academicians at the All Pakistan Professors and Lecturers Association meetings only. There is seldom any formal contact. But there are no opportunities for collaborative work with educators in other countries.
The State of Educational Discourse in Pakistan

At the AIE there are a number of committees composed of faculty, students and the communities. There are no formalised and institutionalised meetings but informal ones are organised with members on the Council. The Academic Council meets on a quarterly basis to talk about issues in education. The faculty uses the daily tea break for half an hour to make presentations and discuss educational trends and changes. Once a month there is a distinguished visitor who makes a presentation, which is attended by the faculty and students. Additionally, there are meetings between students, faculty and scholars from other fields. Occasionally, outside scholars in education conduct workshops for the faculty and students.

Meetings and interviews with the faculty and students of the three institutions revealed that while there is some notion of an academic community within departments or institutes, there are very few formal and institutionalised contacts either within departments or with those in other institutions. The dearth of funds is the most frequently cited reason for the absence of a community of scholars interacting regularly. However, lethargy, lack of commitment, lack of incentive and an overall uninspiring academic environment are also partially responsible for a stagnant and sterile terrain.

Cross-fertilisation

Owing to its inherently multidisciplinary nature, education is a field in which there is a great deal of cross-fertilisation. Education departments and institutes draw faculty from various academic disciplines, in particular Sociology, Psychology, Economics, Philosophy, Literature, History and Anthropology. As a hybrid discipline, education enjoys the benefit of the various social sciences, even if the interaction with members of other disciplines is limited.

There is very little, if any formalised, regular and institutionalised contact between the IER and the other liberal disciplines. The meetings with those from other disciplines occur only informally during the functions organised by the Academic
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

Staff Association. However, the IER has professors belonging to various disciplines, which makes cross-fertilisation a built-in feature of the institute. At the GCE also, there is a great deal of overlapping and exchange as many of the faculty members belong to other areas including Physics, Chemistry, Philosophy and History. There is an exchange programme with IER, AIE, Institute of Educational Development (IED) of the Aga Khan University, Karachi and Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad.

The AIE has a working relationship with IED on citizenship and human rights education and there is a regular and constant exchange of information with Aga Khan University. There are informal, non-institutionalised linkages with several disciplines in the form of the monthly distinguished visitors and workshops by visiting scholars. There are regular links with IER professors who are involved in the evaluation of the students and projects. AIE has a fairly large outreach programme in the rural areas in the form of TARCs (Teaching and Resource Centers). Through these, the AIE can reach people in distant and remote areas for information and exchange. The Management Committee of AIE comprises professionals from various areas including political science, economics and management. This also leads to some interchange but again this is not a formalised method. There is some contact with psychologists but members of the faculty at AIE feel that they need more institutionalised links with psychologists. The Stockholm Institute of Education (SIE) is a partner of AIE and this relationship is official and formalised, as there are exchange programmes with SIE. The citizenship and human rights education project is being carried out in collaboration with the Canadian Bureau of International Education. It seems that as a private and well-funded institute, the AIE is able to draw upon foreign and national human and material resources more effectively than the resource starved public sector institutions.

In the past decade or so, international donors have poured massive amounts of money in the education NGO sector. There have been conferences of national and even international level
The State of Educational Discourse in Pakistan

held by the NGOs, but the discourse has tended to remain focussed merely on donor-drive priorities such as expansion and deepening of the effects of pedagogy. At most of these conferences, there were seldom papers that interrogated the myriad ideologies that underpin the teaching of languages, history, geography or civics. There were hardly any papers on the aims or goals of a good education and the various philosophies of education that have been advanced. Even papers that make thoughtful recommendations about teaching methods and the curriculum are usually absent. Education NGO conferences seem to centre on the number of schools opened, the problems faced by NGOs in accessing government funds, how to stop the high rate of dropout and increase enrolment and some currently fashionable issues such as gender and human rights. The latter are treated without any depth or multiple perspectives. NGO conferences on education have not generated critical intellectual discourse that is required to underpin the practices that are relentlessly pursued in education.

Public Orientation

In most countries, professors of education and researchers in the field engage in debates on public policy and issues of national concern in relation to education. In Pakistan, most of the people who contribute articles to newspapers and appear on radio and television talk shows on education, come from primarily other fields such as Physics, Chemistry, International Relations, Philosophy, History, Literature, Economics and Political Science. There have been serious and thoughtful contributions to educational debates by Pervez Hoodbhoy (Physics), Abbas Rashid (International Relations), Shahrukh Rafi Khan (economist) and Mubarak Ali (History). On the other hand, very few articles on issues of public debate in education have come from educationists. Some faculty members in the public sector institutes believe that they are not called upon to be on national curriculum committees, educational reform committees or policy committees formed by the government. Instead of them, people belonging to NGOs are selected to serve on national educational
committees because the international donors are guiding public policy through pressure on the government.

Nevertheless, some members of the faculty do contribute to newspapers and media programmes on education. Members of the IER faculty, for example, Munawar Mirza, have contributed to The News, and the dailies Din and Nawa-i-Waqt. The IER faculty have occasionally appeared on both radio and television programmes on education. Most of the contributions by these writers have been policy oriented and related to some issue of current concern. The articles have not been of an academic nature. Some members of the AIE, for example, Hamid Kizilbash (former director) and Saadia Asghar (Coordinator of Professional Studies) have contributed articles to The News and The Nation. However, this has not been a regular feature but an occasional exercise and has been limited to issues of current concern and policy. At the GCE, former Principal Asif Iqbal Khan used to write regularly in national dailies. Professor Baig occasionally writes in the Nawa-i-Waqt but not necessarily on education. Sometimes the articles are of a more general nature and focussed on other concerns of a social or cultural nature. There is virtually no input into public policy or curriculum debates as there is, for example, in the Hindutva debates in India, where educationists like Krishna Kumar and others are fighting tirelessly to save a secular education from falling into the hands of the Hindu nationalists.

In sum it can be said that there is no outstanding contribution by educationists to public debate on policy and curricula as there is in neighbouring countries where educators feel much more vested in public policy. There is general apathy towards public debate because of a feeling of powerlessness to change anything. Most educationists feel that the government is going to do what it is told by the World Bank, IMF, bilateral and multilateral donors. Irrespective of the positions taken by Pakistani intellectuals, the government is not amenable to their ideas or sensitive to their needs. There is thus no point in trying to make interventions. Apart from this feeling of lack of efficacy of one’s
actions, there is also no incentive for writing as newspaper columnists and contributors, especially those who write in Urdu, are paid a pittance for their efforts. There is very little encouragement in the departments and institutes for engagement with public policy. Furthermore, the faculty reported being overburdened with work. The IER has over 1500 students and there are usually upwards of a hundred students in each class. Burnout is clearly visible as the faculty seems overburdened with teaching, marking, administrative duties and meetings. Many members of the faculty felt that there was no time even to think, let alone write in an environment that lacked facilities, for example, old and dilapidated libraries, extremely limited access to computers, and little interaction with others in their field.

**Ideological Orientation**

In many departments of education and the social sciences internationally, there is often a clear bent towards a particular and conscious ideological orientation. There are, for example, departments that are primarily exponents of the Marxist, post-modern, post-structuralist or feminist orientation. This usually depends on the orientation of the majority of professors in the departments. Sometimes, there is a mixture of people in the same department expressing opposing viewpoints, which leads to a rich debate as the many shades of opinion, even within one school of thought, get articulated and elaborated upon. These debates add enormously to the richness and refining of the discipline as new ideas are produced in the course of debating, contesting and formulating positions.

This kind of lively and active debate was found to be generally absent in the departments of Education with the exception of some professors who were deeply steeped in religious thinking. The IER defined itself as very eclectic with no specific orientation. The faculty members are free to follow their own line of thinking, which is usually the reproduction of ideas produced in other countries. However, the large number of religious theses by IER students may be a reflection of the fact
that religion is the dominant ideology within IER, despite there being some professors who work within a secular framework.

The syllabus at the IER has changed since 1985 and keeps being reviewed periodically. Sometimes additions are made and at other times, there are deletions. Even teachers can amend course outlines as long as the change can be defended. Since 1985, the syllabus has been amended three times. There have been two directions of the changes. One, on account of General Zia-ul-Haq’s Islamisation of education and the curriculum in his policy of 1979, religious content of all courses has increased and specific courses on religion have been added. Second, the direction of change has been influenced by the rapidly changing requirements of modernization. The latter concern has led to the addition of courses in computer and Information Technology, Educational Management and courses based on international modern trends in teaching. The faculty reported that more emphasis is now placed on PhDs and research than previously. The changes at IER seem to be in two ideological directions: 1) religious, and 2) technical/skill oriented, practical, modern teaching methods.

The AIE is self-consciously Constructivist and Piagetian in approach. The students are primarily taught Piagetian views of the construction of knowledge by children. While some other, competing theories of cognitive development may also be introduced, Piaget’s cognitive approach is privileged. However, the faculty claimed that the students are encouraged to develop their own thinking and respect other views and ideological orientations. Since AIE deals primarily with BEd level students, independent production of knowledge and theory does not frequently happen.

The AIE faculty reports that in the past the emphasis at the institute was far too heavily on technical training and methodology. There was not enough combination of theory and practice in the course content. There was hardly any reference in the past to psychological and philosophical theories of education.
This has all changed and now there are courses on the philosophy of education and new schools of thought have been introduced so that students can identify, which theories inform their technical practices and pedagogical methods. There has been a change in theory and practice. There are four programmes: Science, Mathematics, Professional Studies and Language Education. All courses of Professional Studies are mandatory to give a holistic perspective to students. Professional Studies are included in all three terms for the full year. Professional Studies include the history and philosophy of education, management, policy making and reform, in particular ESR (Education Sector Reforms). Previously, the students were only taught about Maria Montessori, but now there are courses in Educational Psychology and Child Development, and the work of Erik Erikson, Jean Piaget and other developmental psychologists is also taught. Apart from these basic courses, there are the more specialised courses on Learning Disability, Motivation and Intelligence.

The GCE follows no particular philosophy of education and it is left to the teachers’ preferences and educational background. There is no intellectual bias, although liberal psychological and educational theories get privileged by default. This is probably because liberal social theory most often passes itself as non-ideological. While religion or Marxism are considered ideological, liberalism is often perceived as ‘the truth’, as a neutral and non-ideological viewpoint, and this makes many liberal educators and psychologists believe that they are not pursuing any ideological orientation. A revealing comment by one faculty member at GCE was ‘nothing controversial is taught’. This remark was meant to be taken positively, but reflects the fact that controversial or debatable material is avoided for fear of being labelled or hounded. In fact, it is often the most controversial and debatable ideas that generate new knowledge and make any field exciting. However, fears of reprisal by authorities and peers, lead teachers to steer clear of controversy and oppositional viewpoints.
The GCE syllabus was updated in 2002 and made more ‘modern and liberal’. The new courses that were added include Educational Change, Curriculum Change, Educational Management, Educational Testing and Measurement, Special Education and Educational Psychology. Apart from these, courses on computer education were added. Islam and Pakistan Studies were given more weightage than before. The other courses include philosophies of education, instructional technology, research methods, curriculum development and educational administration. There are three courses from the area of specialisation in MEd and MA. For the MA in Education there are courses on society, school and teacher, student teaching and observation, and the thesis.

The situation at GCE seems to be similar to the one at IER as the direction of change in both cases seems to have been driven by religious and nationalist concerns on the one hand, and the requirements of modern times on the other. The change in both public sector institutions has been towards more religious and nationalist education, along with the latest trends in teacher education and methodology. Some of the students interviewed at GCE said that ‘Ideology of Pakistan’ was the favourite course!

Research methodology courses are taught in all three institutions (IER, AIE and GCE) and these are compulsory courses. In all three institutions, various research methods are introduced including survey, quantitative analysis, statistical analysis, questionnaire development, interviewing techniques, analysing historical documents, observation, measurement, and experimentation. The students are taught to develop hypotheses and then test these through observation and experimentation. They are then taught to report their findings in different ways including using the latest instructional technologies. While research methods are taught as compulsory courses, the students seem to prefer the easy survey methods and calculation of percentages, over more sophisticated research involving the creation of challenging new hypotheses drawn from existing or
new theory, and subjecting these to rigorous experimental testing.

Despite the denial of any ideological orientation of the departments, the public sector education department courses clearly reveal an ideological thrust. With the exception of AIE, a private sector concern, both public sector institutions examined had a fairly high degree of ideological course content. Islamic Studies is a separate department within the IER and at GCE there are courses in ‘Islamic Culture and Ideology of Pakistan’ and ‘Islamic System of Education’, each carrying a hundred marks. Apart from these, there are courses on ‘Education in Pakistan’, which has a clear nationalist bias, and courses in Arabic, which reflect a religious bent. While religious and nationalist ideologies are clearly evident in the two public sector institutions, there are no equivalent courses on European theories of education, and Marxist, post-modernist or feminist theories of education.

**Faculty and Students**

The IER has 48 faculty members who come from varying social and physical sciences including Philosophy, English, Islamic Studies, History and Political Science. A fairly large number of faculty members are foreign qualified PhDs or holders of the Master degree. The GCE has 35 faculty members who also represent various disciplines including Chemistry, Zoology, Physics, Psychology, Languages and Philosophy. However, very little discussion across the boundaries of disciplines takes place in both the public sector institutions. The AIE also has a multi-disciplinary faculty and some members have studied at Teachers College, Columbia University. However, even at AIE very little discussion takes place across disciplines despite spatial proximity.

At the IER, very few students get jobs in research. The great majority of students go into teaching or educational administration. Most of the jobs are in schools, colleges, textbook boards, NGOs, and occasionally the curriculum wing of the Ministry of Education. The more well-to-do students prefer
Business Education and establish their own businesses or join some firm. The GCE students get jobs as lecturers, teachers and researchers. Occasionally, education-based NGOs also hire them for research or teaching in the non-formal schools. The majority of the students of AIE also select teaching as it is considered respectable for women who constitute a majority of the students. Some students get jobs in NGOs like Sudhaar, SAHE or SOS. AIE has a placement committee that finds jobs for students after they graduate. Some graduates find their way into relatively better paid teaching jobs in private schools or community colleges. As a rule, the AIE finds jobs for their students that pay a minimum of Rs. 5000 per month.

At all three institutions, the great majority of students are female from the lower middle class urban areas. For example, the AIE currently has 66 female and two male students. Most of the male students at IER come from the rural areas. At GCE the ratio is about 10 boys to 50 girls and there are between 600 to 700 students at any time.

A large number of students seek the MEd degree in order to get jobs, especially for girls as teaching is considered a respectable job for girls whose conservative families would normally not permit office jobs. In most cases, the girls join the department to be able to earn a living and help the family’s finances or collect money for dowry. There are very few students from the upper middle classes, although at the MEd level the strata from which students come is more varied.

At the IER, most students prefer to go into the elementary or secondary education department. If they fail to get admission to these sought after areas, they join the Islamic department waiting for a seat to be vacant in the Elementary or Secondary Education areas. The financially better off students, which are very few, go into Business Education. The boys from very poor and rural areas tend to be concentrated in the technical education stream, while girls prefer elementary or secondary areas because of their interests in teaching or lecturership. A number of girls prefer the
area of Early Childhood Education as they like to work with children and it is considered respectable. This also enables them to get jobs in pre-schools. They find the courses practical and job-oriented.

Even though the job market is very tight, rural students find it very prestigious to study at Punjab University or Government College of Education. Despite the fact that there is a ban on recruitment and private sector jobs are scarce, the students enter the university to spend time earning a degree until they can enter the job market. However, the value of learning and knowledge for their own sake is very low among the students. Only the value of the testimonial, the symbolic value of a degree, is important. As a result, the motivation to learn is very low and minimum requirements are fulfilled in order to receive the testimonial for entry into the job market. The main motivation for joining an education institute is a teaching job, not research. Most research jobs are either at NGOs or private institutes engaged in research. This involves going to an office and to remote areas in the field, something that parents of girls belonging to the urban lower middle classes dislike. Hence, the overwhelming preference of graduates is school or college level teaching. This is the reason why the students of the GCE generally do not go into textbook boards, the curriculum wing of the ministry or other government jobs that involve some research.

**Conclusions**

It appears from the examination of institutes and departments of education that while research is being carried out, it is not of an international, academically stringent standard. There is purely theoretical research, especially in the Punjab in both the public and private institutions, which is based on small micro level studies, which do not contribute to educational theorising in any significant way. While the Punjab and Sindh do focus on some level of theoretical research on education, Balochistan and NWFP are focussed entirely on national issues and do not contribute to theory building.
There is a great deal of emphasis on religious and nationalist ideologies in the research done in the public sector institutions. As compared to these, the one private sector institution did not focus on either of these ideologies in research. However, there was a significant absence of the study of national and policy level research in the private sector institution. This may be partly due to the fact that it caters currently only to the BEd level and issues of national policy and larger social structures are not as important to the teachers being trained as teaching and learning methods at the classroom level.

The faculty in the public sector institutions engages in some research, which is published in the department journals, but this is mostly based on secondary sources and there is very little primary data based research. The journals brought out by the institutions do not match international standards but are promising initial attempts at enlarging the discourse on education. There are few opportunities, if any, to publish in journals of international repute. Many of the writings of the faculty are more in the nature of essays than research papers.

The main reasons cited for the lack of serious, rigorous and painstaking research in public institutions is the severe dearth of resources. The libraries are old and dilapidated, access to computers and the Internet is severely limited, funding is extremely tight and the workload is immense. With over one hundred students in a classroom, there is very little time or energy left for research. A great deal of time and energy are consumed in marking papers, dealing with student issues, attending mandatory meetings and preparing lectures. The private sector institution (AIE) has a good resource base and excellent facilities including the latest instructional technologies, but the since it has been primarily a technical training institute and not an academic one until recently it has not contributed to new ideas in any significant way. However, it is on its way to becoming a research and teaching institute.
In the public sector institutions, research and the production of knowledge are not very encouraged by the authorities. The environment is generally deadening and not very conducive for intellectual work. The faculty members feel that education is a low priority for the government and there are not enough resources flowing into it to encourage excellence. It is generally felt by faculty members that enormous resources are diverted by the donors and the government to the NGO sector, and private consultants who carry out research for a very high fee. The university staff members are discouraged from doing the same painstaking research in return for a pittance. The ones who do some research, are driven solely by the love of research and their commitment to the discipline. There are no external rewards for research by university professors who would have to conduct it along with enormous workloads and overcrowded classrooms.

There is a lack of a viable community of research. Since there are few academic conferences that bring scholars together for an exchange of ideas, there is not much motivation to write, as colleagues in the field do not bother to read the work and comment on it. The journals, which should ideally provide the space for debates, are not utilised for that purpose. Access of public sector institutions to foreign journals is limited as they can afford just a few out of hundreds of academic journals. There are very few, if any, opportunities to interact with academic educationists in other countries.

There are two sectors, external to the discipline of education, from which some research work has emerged. One, research articles and books by professors and academics belonging to other disciplines, such as Physics or History. Two, educational research by the non-government sector and/or private consultants. The former, researchers belonging primarily to other fields, have produced some works of excellence on education such as that by Rehmani Begum and Tariq Rahman. The latter, the NGO sector and consultants have mostly produced studies that are commissioned by the World Bank or bilateral donors. This research tends to lean heavily towards quantification,
without reference to the debates in the field, and is highly policy oriented. This kind of work often lacks the depth and rigour required of academic work as it tends towards the number-crunching approach to issues. The issues of ideology and content are often ignored in this kind of work. The other material produced by NGOs is propagandist and meant to spread certain ideas, which reflect donor priorities.

The contribution of educationists to public policy is minimal as usually it is the consultants and NGOs who are consulted when making policy, and educators are seldom called upon to provide input. A few professors of education occasionally contribute to national Urdu and English dailies but this is by no means adequate.

It seems that education in Pakistan is primarily conceptualised as a practical, applied and ‘how-to’ discipline. The great majority of students enter the field to become teachers and not researchers or academics. This view is not encouraging towards theoretical research designed to reach new frontiers of knowledge. In most cases, theories of education and psychology produced in other countries, are applied to the situation in Pakistan even though at times they may not be applicable in our context. The overall national context is not very conducive to academic research as it is not a priority. The government and international donors pour vast sums into education, but their interest is in a highly technocratic paradigm, which reduces education to technical training and methods. They do not encourage academic theorising. The other interest of the donors, and because of their pressure the government of Pakistan’s, is gender and human rights issues in education. While this is a defensible position, the view that is taken of either of these issues is narrow, mechanistic and static. It is not a dynamic view of the issues in relation to their connections with the larger issues of the state and global economy. As a result the work becomes sterile and meaningless. The state of education as a discipline in Pakistan is that the discourse is not developed. It is dispersed and tends to occur at very superficial levels. There are very few works of excellence in
The State of Educational Discourse in Pakistan

education, works that can match international or even regional standards. However, as the efforts of the Sindh Education Foundation show, critical educational discourse is just beginning to appear in Pakistan and there is every reason to hope that with increased allocations for education, the debate will mature into the kind of interaction visible in other countries, especially neighbouring countries like India and Sri Lanka.
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

Notes


3 Bowles and Gintis’ seminal work on the political economy of education influenced educational thinking in the late 1970s and 1980s. They argued that in the absence of economic democracy, political democracy was meaningless. In class society, education instills differential values among the children of the ruling and subordinate classes, to socialise children appropriately for their perceived social class position. See Samuel Bowles and Herbert Gintis, *Schooling in Capitalist America* (Basic Books, New York, 1976).

4 Durkheim’s ideas of mechanical versus organic solidarity and the division of labour in society influenced educational thinkers who believed that education produces different skills and recreates the division of labour in society. Durkheim is often regarded as the founder of functionalism and the idea of reciprocal roles and functions leading to equilibrium in a society. Emile Durkheim, *The Division of Labour in Society* (Free Press, New York, 1964). Talcott Parsons applied the functionalist perspective to school systems and viewed the school class as a social system. See Talcott Parsons, *The Social System* (Routledge, London, 1951).

5 Bruce Fuller studied how the First World educates people in Third World Societies. He argued that the overwhelming stress in education in developing societies has been on the quantitative expansion of schooling and the effort to deepen the effects of schooling by developing more effective teaching methods. See Bruce Fuller, *Growing Up Modern: The Western State Builds Third-World Schools* (Routledge, New York, 1991).

6 The Indian educationist Krishna Kumar has done commendable critical work on education in India and the subcontinent. Some of his well-known works include *Learning from Conflict* (Orient Longman, New York, 1996); *Prejudice and Pride: School Histories of the Freedom Struggle in India and Pakistan* (Viking, New Delhi, 2002).


9 Ibid., p. 278.


The State of Educational Discourse in Pakistan

18 For details on seven Handbooks published at different times see footnote 10 in the introductory chapter of this book.
19 They are located at the following Universities: Allama Iqbal Open University, Gomal University, Peshawar University, Sindh University, Balochistan University, Karachi University, Bahauddin Zakariya University, Fatima Jinnah Women University, NWFP Agriculture University and Arid Agriculture University.
20 There was one teacher who was BA and one whose qualification is not known.
21 There were 15 (11%) teachers in 2001 whose qualification is not known.
22 We received the information on theses from the following seven public universities; University of the Punjab, Karachi University, University of Peshawar, Sindh University, B. Z. University, Balochistan University and Shah Abdul Latif University.
23 Punjab University, Sindh University, B. Z. University and Shah Abdul Latif University.
24 Eight (seven MPhil and one PhD thesis) were written in Karachi University and one PhD thesis in Punjab University.
25 The data on the period during which these were written was not available at the time of the study.
28 For example the conference organised by the Department for International Development (DFID) in Karachi, May 1999 at the Pearl Continental, reflected a great deal of glamour with expensive foods and accommodations. However, the atmosphere was more that of an industrial exhibition as most NGOs were displaying their wares – the schools they had opened and the enrolment of girls and buildings and so on. There were hardly any papers representing intellectual depth, theoretical rigour or academic understanding. In contrast, the Delhi University Department of Education also held a South Asian level education conference in November of the same year, and the great majority of papers dealt with serious issues of curriculum, pedagogy, evaluation, education and the state, education and globalisation, and education and the economy. The papers reflected a vast array of theories, concepts and ideas related to educational discourse. The glamour was missing as the conference was held at Delhi University instead of a five-star hotel and the food and arrangements were modest.

127
Development of Philosophy as a Discipline

Mohammad Ashraf Adeel

Introduction
Development of Philosophy in Pakistan is a complex process and has been taking place in a number of areas over the past 55 years. These areas spread from religion and literature to academic departments and politics. The terms ‘philosophy’ and ‘philosophical thought’ are employed equivalently here and mean ‘systematic thought in any area’. In this sense, philosophical thought is obviously deeply connected with the overall Pakistani experience in national life from mid 20th century onward in the context of a world divided by the Cold War till recently. This thought epitomises the variety of ways in which Pakistani society has imbibed and dealt with its historical experience in its local as well as global context. The present article aims at giving a brief overview of this development of philosophical thought in all these areas. The paper is focussed on development of academic Philosophy, which is being taught and researched in major universities of the country. It also takes into account how academic Philosophy and philosophy developing outside academia affect each other.

Academic Philosophy
The departments of Philosophy in some of the major universities of Pakistan can be taken to be the mainstay of most of the work done in the technical areas of Philosophy in the country. These
departments have also provided leadership for Pakistan Philosophical Congress and have trained students for academic positions in the colleges of the country. In this sense their role can be claimed to be central for the philosophical activities.

As an academic discipline, Philosophy started off with only one department at the time of Partition, i.e., the department at Government College, Lahore, which was established, in late 19th century, during the British rule. Between 1947 and 1976 the number of departments grew to five in five major universities - Punjab, Karachi, Sindh, Peshawar, and Islamia University, Bahawalpur. However, by 1987 the number declined to four as Islamia University, Bahawalpur closed its department. In 1994 the University of Balochistan added a Philosophy Department making the number of such departments to five again by year 2001. Comparative rank of Philosophy, which was two in 1963, declined to five in 2001.

As the number of departments increased so did the number of teachers. The number of teachers rose from 11 in 1963 to 27 in 2001. During this period average number of teachers in a department rose from four to five. Out of 11 teachers in 1963, there was only one PhD who has been trained abroad. The remaining ten were MAs. By 2001 the number of PhDs rose to nine. Out of them six were foreign trained and three were local PhDs. If we take the year 1987 as benchmark there were 22 teachers. Out of them eight were foreign PhDs, three local PhDs and 11 MAs. Thus during 1987 to 2001 the number of foreign PhDs teachers decreased from eight to six, a negative growth of 25%. However, the number of local PhDs remained the same. From 11 MAs in 1987 their number rose to 17 in 2001 with one MA trained abroad. Compared with 1987 the overall situation of teachers now is that the number of PhDs and from among them those with PhD from abroad has declined and the share of MAs among the total teachers has increased. Implications of this change for quality of teaching need to be examined.
In addition to these departments, a number of Philosophy teachers work in affiliated colleges of the major universities throughout the country. These teachers play a significant role in offering Bachelor level courses in colleges, functioning as nurseries for university departments.

**Courses**

One of the functions of the departments is to formulate and revise periodically the courses taught at Intermediate, Bachelor and Postgraduate levels. Generally speaking all the departments have performed this function more or less regularly. In the last Annual Meeting of Pakistan Philosophical Congress, held at Lahore in 2002, the need for a comprehensive overhauling of the courses at all levels was re-emphasised. Since 1987, most of the courses at Master, MPhil and PhD levels have been revised by the older departments. In the two newly opened departments at Balochistan and Multan, the need for revision has not yet emerged as they recently started. Some of the trends in the course titles in the Islamic and Western traditions of Philosophy are discussed in the relevant section below.

Philosophy is fundamentally a theoretical discipline but the course work in all the Philosophy departments, as discussed below, does address itself to the Islamic Philosophy, which in turn, relates to the issues in Pakistani culture, its identity, and problems. Philosophical concepts are applied to problems of Pakistani society or its intellectual and cultural underpinnings, especially in some courses at MPhil and PhD level. These departments, one and all, offer courses in logic, which include study of Inductive Logic, the foundation for the Scientific Method or Research Methodology.

**Theses**

Since the start of academic Philosophy in the country, 42 theses have been produced in four Philosophy departments by 2001 out of which 38 are PhD theses and four are MPhil.\(^3\)
Table 1: The Number of MPhil and PhD Theses in the Field of Philosophy Produced During 1948 to 2001 in Four Universities of Pakistan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S. No.</th>
<th>Philosophy</th>
<th>MPhil</th>
<th>PhD</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Bahauddin Zakariya University</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(BZU)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>University of Karachi</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>University of Peshawar</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>University of the Punjab</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>4</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: COSS data. *BZU was giving PhD degrees since 1987 though it opened its Philosophy department in 2003.

Table 1, shows that University of the Punjab has produced the largest number of PhD theses since the emergence of the country followed by Karachi University.

Although it is difficult to exactly categorise the theses on the basis of their topics as the topics do not fully represent the contents. However, a search of the titles of these theses using a number of key words gives the following figures. Eleven of the theses were written on Islam, eight on Tassawaf (Islamic mysticism), six were related to Iqbal and three of the theses were written on theoretical subjects. If we divide all the theses in terms of Muslim and Western traditions half of them are on topics related to Muslim tradition and half of them on theoretical and Western tradition. Out of total 42 theses only one PhD thesis is related to Marxism and one to Zen Buddhism. Most theoretical and West oriented theses were produced by Karachi University while Punjab University concentrated on local and Muslim tradition.

Most of the students of Philosophy in all the departments work for Master degree. They normally join after a Bachelor degree in social sciences or humanities and, sometimes in natural sciences. Most Master level students come to Philosophy because they want to complete a Master degree at the university. There are
some students, however, who join Philosophy out of a genuine interest in its problems and methods. Some students want to develop a better understanding of their religion through a study of Philosophy. It is from this group generally that students ultimately move into doing MPhil and PhD work.

Many of the Philosophy students end up as teachers in schools, colleges and universities. Some join the media, print or electronic, and there are a few who enter the civil service of Pakistan. Recently some Philosophy students have gone to work on social problems in some Non Governmental Organisations (NGO) as well. A few of them are active participants in national or local politics.

Continuation of the Islamic Tradition of Philosophy
Let us now look at the contribution of Philosophy departments towards revival and continuation of Muslim Philosophy in the country. This is an area of critical significance for Pakistani society because Islamic consciousness had played a great role in the demand for the creation of Pakistan for the Muslims of the subcontinent.

The greatest contribution from among the pre-Partition Muslim philosophers in connecting Western Philosophy to Muslim Philosophy was made by Iqbal. But since we are primarily concerned here with contribution of academic departments towards Muslim thinking in the post-Partition period, we need not go into a discussion of Iqbal’s ideas here. This is a separate subject.

Muslim Philosophy has remained a part of the curriculum at Master, MPhil and PhD levels in most of the departments. Traditionally, a course in Muslim Philosophy, covering the classical thinkers of Islam from Al-Kindi to onwards, has been offered for the Master degree students. This, as a required course, has been taken by all students generally. The course has contributed a good deal towards generating an overall sense of the development of Muslim thinking among the philosophically
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

educated community in Pakistan. It deals with major early schools of theology in Islam such as Asha’rism and Mu’tazilism. It also covers all the major thinkers of Islamic Philosophy including the three of its pivots, i.e., Al-Farabi, Ibn-e-Sina, and Ibn-e-Rushd. The Neo-Platonist, Aristotelian and Platonic ideas are brought out and discussed in the course insofar as they shape the views of the Muslim thinkers or as they are understood and interpreted in the Muslim tradition. Al-Ghazzali receives due attention as the typical representative of the orthodoxy. Ibn-e-Khaldun is studied as a great exemplar of original Islamic genius in the areas of Sociology and Philosophy of history.

In addition to the classical thinkers covered in the above-mentioned course, the contemporary thought of the revivalists, traditionalists, and modernists is also covered in various courses or researches at Master, MPhil and PhD levels. Thinkers like Shah Waliullah, Sir Syed Ahmad Khan, Jamal-ud-Din Afghani, Shibli Nomani, Iqbal, Maududi, Ghulam Ahmad Pervez, and Fazl-ur-Rahman, etc., are a part of such courses. In a sense, these courses and researches link modern and contemporary thought in Islam with the classical debates and concerns of Muslim thinkers, which were informed by the Qura’an and Prophetic tradition on the one hand and Neo-Platonism, Aristotelianism, and Platonism on the other. The quality of the course work and researches is somewhat uneven but a sense of historical continuity is, nonetheless, kept alive by this type of work. That, of course, is itself an achievement.

The Philosophy being universal in character and methods requires continuous application of its concepts and analyses to indigenous problems of cultures and civilisations in order to remain relevant. Some limited degree of indigenisation of Philosophy, in this sense, has been made possible by our departments. This process has sometimes led to debates and discussions between proponents of different approaches, particularly those in favour of Westernisation or Islamisation or a synthesis of both.
As noted above, Philosophy departments have been playing an important role in keeping Pakistan in contact with the intellectual life of the West through teaching courses covering all major schools and almost all periods of Western thought. Quite a few teachers in these departments have been either themselves trained in the West or have been trained by Western educated teachers. In addition, the colonial interregnum as well as the modern means of communication and marketing have brought Western intellectual products/ideas to this region. Another reason for ongoing interest in the Western Philosophy has been the continuous cultural challenge that the innovative and dynamic Western culture has continued to present to the rather stagnant Islamic societies for the last many centuries, including the last one. The following are some of the major areas of Western Philosophy that are regularly covered in courses taught in Philosophy departments.

The history of Western Philosophy is the area on which great emphasis is placed in teaching of Philosophy in Pakistan. This is justified and called for because, without a good grounding in the history of Western tradition of ideas, it would be almost impossible for a student to develop any serious understanding of that tradition. Normally the history courses are divided into three or four periods, i.e., Greek, Medieval, Modern (early and later), and sometimes, Twentieth Century Philosophy. This last course covers only the mainstream analytic Philosophy generally and philosophical movements such as Existentialism, Phenomenology, Critical Theory, and Deconstructionism, etc., are taught separately. A lot of emphasis is placed on the Greek period and all its major schools and figures are covered in the course on Greek Philosophy. The course on Medieval period is offered at University of Peshawar only and pays attention to major Islamic and Christian thinkers. Modern Western philosophers, from Descartes to Augustus Comte, are studies with great care in all the departments. Among the 20th century, analytic thinkers Wittgenstein and Russell receive special attention, although Gottlieb Frege, perhaps the greatest of the
founding fathers of analytic Philosophy, has yet to become a part of any course in this area.

Apart from history courses, a number of special areas of Philosophy as they have evolved in the Western tradition, are also studied. Ethics, for example, is a permanent feature of all course work for various degrees, including Bachelor degree in some cases. Courses on Ethics range from elementary to advance levels and cover major moral philosophers of various periods. Ethical theories and ideas of such figures as Socrates, Plato, Aristotle, Spinoza, Hume, Kant, Bentham, J. S. Mill, Bishop Butler and Sidgewick, etc., are studies and discussed in these courses. Existential ethics is also not ignored. However, more recent ethical philosophers of the West and their researches have yet to make their way into the course work. This is not to say that the philosophical community is completely unaware of recent developments and discussions. Interested teachers and researchers read the relevant literature and do make use of it.

Courses are also taught in metaphysics, Philosophy of Science, Philosophy of Education, Philosophy of Law, Philosophy of Religion, and Philosophy of Art, existentialism, critical theory, phenomenology, hermeneutics and deconstructionist movement, etc. In other words, course work covers modernity as well as the trends of thought that form the foundation of post-modernism.

Debates on the nature and possibility of metaphysics, which have been raging in the West recently and in the past, also figure in the courses on metaphysics in Pakistani universities. Pressures exerted by these debates on religious interpretations of life and the universe are a part of the discussions of religious metaphysics in various courses.

The Philosophy of science has been introduced in the curricula in some universities. Contemporary schools of thought in the Western Philosophy of science are the core of these courses, although the ideas of Muslim philosophers also get reflected. Logical positivism has remained a part of general academic
Development of Philosophy as a Discipline

Philosophy for decades but now it is also taught as one of the earliest exemplar of Philosophy of science in twentieth century. In the later case emphasis is on positivists’ characterisation of scientific propositions through testability conditions or verification conditions and their insistence that the procedure of science is inductive in nature. The positivists’ views on science are generally contrasted with the falsificationism of Karl Popper in these courses. In addition Quine’s holistic approach to science and Kuhn’s views of scientific paradigms and paradigm shifts (scientific revolutions) are also discussed generally.

While it is not our intention to rehearse the details of all the courses here, it must be mentioned that existentialist thinkers like Kierhegaard, Sartre and Heidegar, etc., have become part of the local cultural lore in Pakistan. Similarly thinkers such as Hebermas, from the critical theory tradition, are widely discussed as Jacque Derrida of deconstruction and Gadamer of Hermeneutics. Primarily these Post-modernist thinkers have been properly introduced in the country by academic Philosophy courses.

Intellectual and Cultural Issues of Pakistan

Academic Philosophy has also contributed towards raising and debating various critical problems faced by Pakistani society. This has happened mainly through academic writings, conferences, and seminars, etc. In this regard Pakistan Philosophical Congress (PPC), established soon after creation of Pakistan in 1954, has played a very important role. It has been holding national and international conferences more or less regularly throughout these decades. In addition it started and has published Pakistan Philosophical Journal with some degree of regularity. Books on philosophical, religious and national issues have also been published under the auspices of PPC.

Whenever the philosophical community came together for their annual conferences throughout these decades, they made sure to hold a symposium on some issue of national significance or an international issue with implications for national life. This
symposium, indeed, is a permanent feature of the conferences of PPC. It is here that philosophers of Pakistan have usually formed and expressed their views on national issues and engaged in inter-departmental debates and dialogues. Quality of the debates following presentation of papers in the symposia has fluctuated over the years but there is no question about the openness of the debate. The members of PPC have always debated all aspects of even very touchy and sensitive issues with great frankness. In this way the PPC does seem to have added its bit to the formulation and discussion of various intellectual and cultural issues of Pakistan.\(^5\)

The Pakistani experience in nationhood has been a traumatic one. We have yet to fully sort out a political system for the country. Similarly the questions about Islamisation or Westernisation of society, or extent thereof and questions of ethnicities and national identity, etc., have all continued to haunt us all these decades. The trauma of the separation of the Eastern Wing as Bangladesh and the continued failure of the ruling civil and military elite to deal effectively with national issues has also shaken the country badly. Academic philosophers have discussed these issues and trauma from platform of PPC and this way contributed to their understanding throughout the past decades.

Besides the academic departments two research institutes — Iqbal Academy (Lahore), named after the national poet-philosopher of Pakistan, Sir Muhammad Iqbal, and the Islamic Research Institute, Islamabad have made important contributions to philosophical literature. Iqbal Academy publishes its Journal *Iqbal Review* as well as research related to the thought of Iqbal or general philosophical and cultural issues as they reflect on Iqbal’s thinking. The Islamic Research Institute, Islamabad, has continued research on Islamic issues, including Philosophy, over the decades and continues the publication of its research organ *Fikr-o-Nazar*. Its contribution in sorting out matters of Islamic law as well as other cultural issues has been quite significant, though one feels that the Institute requires further expansion and diversification of its research programme.
The amount of philosophical literature produced in Pakistan is sizeable, although its quality remains uneven. Most of the university teachers and many college teachers do write on philosophical topics and contribute articles to the research journals. Only a few have contributed articles to international journals over the past decade or so. But the critical thing is that philosophical articles and books, both in Urdu and English and sometimes in other national languages, continue appearing regularly. We do not have a proper survey available but the number of articles and books written between 1987 and 2002 must run into hundreds. COSS has provided a short list of books written in Philosophy.

It may be added that some of the philosophy people contribute articles to newspapers as well. These articles range from purely philosophical topics to application of philosophical concepts to some of our social, political, and cultural as well as literary issues. From the older generation Prof. Khawaja Masud is the most noteworthy example in this regard. Kazy Javed from Lahore and this writer from Peshawar also contribute articles to newspapers. Prof. Manzoor Ahmad from Karachi writes occasionally for the newspapers.

Besides the philosophical work by academia, non academic thinkers before and after Partition have made significant contributions to dissemination of philosophical thought in Pakistan, which are discussed below with focus on Urdu literature, religious and politics.

**Philosophical Thought in Urdu Literature**

Urdu literature has disseminated philosophical and semi-philosophical thought during both British period and in post-Partition period. In the pre-Partition period the outstanding figures were Asadullah Khan Ghalib, Sir Syed Ahmad Khan, Altaf Hussain Hali, Muhammad Hussain Azad, Abul Kalam Azad, Sibbi Nomani and Dr. Muhammad Iqbal. Their contributions can be placed in three broad categories. They
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

include naturalism of Sir Syed Ahmad Khan, reconstructivism of Hali, Azad and most significantly Muhammad Iqbal, and prominent writers of Progressive Movement in Urdu. Traditionalism in literature advocated that a civilisation and its traditions form the only genuine basis for any authentic literature or criticism that a society may produce. This school of thought lays great emphasis on the role of ‘tradition’ in literature and criticism and its most important exponent is Mohammad Hassan Askari. Askari and his followers believe in a deep concept of tradition, which, according to them, is the fountainhead of all that is good and great in a civilisation.

Naturalism is one of the earliest major philosophical trends in Urdu literature, which Sir Syed introduced in the area of religion. Sir Syed thought that Muslims need to interpret their canonical religious texts and religious, moral and aesthetic/literary values in the light of scientific methodology that natural laws. This will help them to break out of their prevalent intellectual stagnation and meet the demands of modern times. Sir Syed’s writings and movement fostered modernism in various areas of culture and influenced almost all subsequent writers in literature as well as religion, even when they did not follow his naturalism.

Sir Syed’s modernising influence also produced reconstructivism in literature as expressed in the works of Hali, Azad, and Abul Kalam, historical works of Shibli Nomani and Amir Ali, and, finally, in the works of philosophy and poetry by Iqbal, who happens to be among the greatest reconstructivist thinkers of the entire world of Islam in 20th century.

Almost all later writers in Urdu literature have directly or indirectly continued this broad reconstructive project with their special angularities and orientations.

Progressive writers movement in Urdu literature, which started in early 1930s and has continued in various ways after the creation of Pakistan rooted in Marxism has made contributions to non-academic Philosophy. Among its founding fathers were
people like Ahmad Ali, Sajjad Zaheer, Rashid Jehan, Mehmood ul Zafar, and subsequently Dr. Akhtar Hussain Rai Puri. The movement criticised the conservative ideas and customs in order to break their hold on the society. The movement rejected the slogan of ‘Art for the sake of art’ and instead argued for ‘Art for the sake of life’ stressing that literature should be connected to the problems of society and history.

Traditionalists in literature advocated that a civilisation and its traditions form the only genuine basis for any authentic literature or criticism that a society may produce. This school of thought lays great emphasis on the role of ‘tradition’ in literature and criticism and its most important exponent is Mohammad Hassan Askari. Askari and his followers believe in a deep concept of tradition, which, according to them, is the fountainhead of all that is good and great in a civilisation. This concept of tradition is taken by them from Western Gnostic thinkers such Schoun and Rene Genon, etc. Under this view no literary figure can produce anything worthwhile in isolation from the traditions of its own society or language. Only those who are closer to the heart of their cultural traditions can become true and authentic writers. Staying cut off from your tradition and hoping to produce great literature is an impossible dream or an illusion.

This approach squarely places creative literature in the context of the cultural tradition and, therefore, provides an umbrella for all those strains of thought, which underline the need for a ‘Pakistani’ literature or an ‘Islamic’ approach in literature. In fairness, it must be added that Askari is a strong advocate of ‘freedom’ in literature and, for him, being rooted in one's tradition does not mean being shackled by it.

In summary one might add that the trends towards reconstructionism, progressivism, or traditionalism are still at work in the literature being produced in Pakistan. These may not always be working at a philosophically conscious level, as was the case with many earlier writers, but they persist as trends. The reasons lie in the global contexts of modernity, post-modernism
and concomitant socio-economic and political integration or problems of the world. For example, if we just take Ghazal, the most popular form of literary expression in Urdu as well as other Pakistani languages, we shall realise that for the past fifty years it has embodied all the above-mentioned trends. That seems to apply to the other genres of literature in Pakistani languages.

Philosophical Thought in Religion
The predominant focus of philosophical thought in the country is and has remained religion. This is partly because Pakistan society is a deeply religious society. The past five and a half decades of our existence reflect an arduous but failed struggle on the part of the society to achieve the objective of striking a balance between its religious roots and the demands of modernity on its internal and external affairs. The failure of struggle, however, has led to its abandonment and continues in all spheres of our national life.

Four major responses seemed to have emerged over the decades to meet this challenge. They are: neo-revivalism, modernism, semantic reconstructionism, and traditionalism. Neo-revivalism (or modern revivalism as distinguished from pre-modern revivalism of Wahabis and Sanusis) is represented by Abul Ala Maududi and his followers, modernism by Fazl-ur-Rahman, semantic reconstructionism by Ghulam Ahmad Pervez and his followers, and under traditionalism fall all the traditional religious parties of the Sunnis and the Shias as well as Tablighi Jamaat.

1. Neo-Revivalism
Under the influence of the writings of Syed Abul Ala Maududi, who founded Jama’at-i-Islami as a religio-political party, quite a sizeable number of youth from middle and lower middle classes of Pakistani society has acquired revivalist orientation over the past decades. The strength of Maududi’s version of neo-revivalism lies in the large number of books, tracts, and pamphlets in Urdu he has written to address contemporary socio-political, economic, as well as legal issues in the light of the
traditional Islamic positions on them. What has given popularity to his thoughts is that he has presented the traditional Islamic positions in modern Urdu idiom, easily understandable to ordinary educated people.

The basic idea of this revivalist programme is to revive the traditional positions of Islamic scholars and jurists in the context of contemporary societies. Neo-revivalists are a little more forward looking than the strict traditionalists in the sense that they aim at reviving traditions, partly at least, in accordance with the new social conditions. They do not insist on creating the old social conditions in contemporary times. However, their adherence to the traditional positions of the Islamic law is quite consistent. They do leave room open to *Ijtihad* or creative thinking for new laws or revising the old ones, but generally they have not moved away from the traditional interpretations on specific issues. Their overarching aim is to revive the traditional Islamic society with minimum possible adjustments to modernity.

Such a programme obviously requires state power for its implementation. Naturally, therefore, neo-revivalists are politically active and they work for political power with religious motivation.

2. Modernism
Modernist approach of Abduh, Jamal-ud-Din Afghani, and Iqbal, etc., to Islam has been continued and developed by Fazl-ur-Rahman in the post-Partition subcontinent. Indeed, Rahman appears to be the most authentic and authoritative representative of modernism in the entire world of Islam in the later part of 20th century. He worked in the *Islamic Research Institute* in Islamabad during Ayub Khan’s era and was instrumental in modernising the family laws of Islam in Pakistan. Orthodoxy resented his approach and he was forced to resign and leave the country.
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

Fazl-ur-Rahman believes that there is a distinction between the normative Islam and the historical Islam. The first represents the spirit rather than the form of the Qura’anic texts and the Sunnah of the Prophet. The second is the actual form in which Muslims might have interpreted and implemented this spirit historically or the institutions they might have created on its basis. Fazl-ur-Rahman argues that Contemporary Muslim societies should not be captive to the historical Islam and must rebuild their societies on the basis of the norms of the Qura'an and Sunnah through *Ijtihad*, which he equates with creative and critical thinking.

In this regard Fazl-ur-Rahman also recommends a hermeneutics or methodology for interpreting the Qura’an and the Sunnah for the modern times. He believes that we can understand the spirit of the Qura’an by placing its verses in the context of the conditions under which specific verses were revealed to the Prophet. In this way we can aim at discovering the principle behind a set of verses rather than going after the specific form which that principle might have taken in the specific conditions of the time. Once we have recovered the principle behind a verse in this fashion, we may examine the relevant conditions of our own modern society in order to determine the form in which we may apply the same principle in our new situation. According to Fazl-ur-Rahman, it is the principle that matters for the Qura’an. Instead of insisting upon its application in the form in which it might have been applied in the earlier societies, we may apply it in a form suitable for modern times. This way we won’t remain tied to earlier interpretations or history in an imitative way and would allow ourselves genuine room for growth and progress. Ignoring the progress of social thought in history can only stall our own progress as societies. We must embrace the positive aspects of modern thinking, while judging modernity on the basis of the universal values and principles embodied in the Qura’an.

Fazl-ur-Rahman has his own critique of modern Western societies and does not want the Muslims to follow blindly
modernity as practised in the West. However, he insists that the genuine progress of thought in all fields of life and knowledge brought about by modernity can be ignored on at one’s own peril. Under his programme of modernism, or neo-modernism as he sometimes calls it, Muslims need to re-do their law as well as institutions through careful reinterpretations of their heritage for modern times. This is a task that Muslim societies have yet not undertaken and they do not seem to be fully sensitised to its need either.

3. Semantic Reconstructionism
We know that Iqbal called his work about Islam as reconstruction. In a way all those who are busy trying to apply Islam to modern societies are engaged in the same kind of reconstruction of the tradition or heritage of Islam. Here, however, we introduce the term ‘semantic reconstructionism’ to refer to the specific project of Ghulam Ahmad Pervez, which aims at retrieving the meanings of the Qura’an on the basis of linguistic contextualisation of the Qura’an to the times of its revelation. His basic contention is that the Qura’an can be properly understood only if we focus on the Arabic idiom and usage of the times in which it was revealed. He strongly feels that many, if not most, interpreters of the Qura’an, today and in the centuries past, have ignored this idiom and usage to the detriment of our understanding of the true Qura’anic message. He feels that there have been major misunderstandings of the message of the Qura’an due to this one fundamental mistake and, as a result, traditional positions derived from the Qura’an by the orthodoxy are, on many occasions, violate the true purpose and the meaning of the sacred text.

What is needed, according to Pervez, therefore, is a contextualised reconstruction of the Qura’anic message and its universal import. Once that is done, we shall see that the Qura’an is fully alive and relevant to the needs of modern societies and can pull out the Muslims from the quagmire of decadence and stagnation in which they have managed to place themselves.
Here a word may be added about the difference between the methods of Pervez and Fazl-ur-Rahman. Pervez’ emphasis is on effort to understand the Arabic idiom of the time of revelation of the Qur’an to get to its real message. Fazl-ur-Rahman, on the other hand, emphasises identification of the reasons and situations in which particular Qur’anic verses were revealed in order to get their import.

4. Traditionalism

Here the term ‘traditionalism’ is used to refer to the positions of the orthodoxy on matters of Islamic law and all other socio-political and economic matters. One may tend to think that there is hardly anything philosophical about the positions of the religious orthodoxy. That, however, is a mistake. Whether or not the proponents of traditionalism are conscious of it, this position is fundamentally an epistemic position and relates to the nature of knowledge and the methods for having this knowledge. Traditionalists have always understood knowledge to be a privilege of certain ‘authorities’ and insist that we can learn this ‘knowledge’ only by ‘following’ the authorities completely and faithfully. Philosophers from the times of Socrates have understood traditionalism in this sense and it is this sense of the term that underpins all orthodoxies, whether religious or political or otherwise.

Most of our politically and religiously active religious parties and groups, are traditionalists in this sense. They feel that problems of the Muslim societies, such as Pakistan today, arise from the failure of these societies in following the religious traditions of the past authorities closely and completely. These modern societies can solve their problems simply by a ‘return’ to the practices and ways of the authorities of the glorious past. The traditionalist do not really feel any need for adjusting to the requirements of the changed times. That they generally consider to be a deviation. It is this position that is commonly held by people and the religious class in the country.
Politics and Philosophical Approaches
Politics in Pakistan has been a tumultuous affair in the past 55 years or so. A number of outlooks have reflected themselves in this arena during this time. The most obvious division has been that of the Right and the Left. The few liberals that we have had can be placed in the middle with slight tilt towards the Left or the Right. Here we just make a couple of brief remarks about these outlooks.

The Left in Pakistani politics, as elsewhere, has been consciously based on Marxism. It believed in the Marxist interpretation of history, as inexorably passing through the stages of primitive communism, slave society, feudalism, capitalism, socialism, and after successive socialist revolutions finally, classless society of communism. All these stages come out of a class struggle based on economic interests of the proletariat and the bourgeoisie. As hinted above, this view of history takes economic relations, i.e., ownership of the means of production and the distribution relations, etc., as fundamental while the rest of the culture makes the so-called superstructure over them.

The Left based its political analyses as well as struggle on this viewpoint. However, the Communist Party of Pakistan never gained much ground politically in the country. Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto’s Pakistan Peoples Party, with its left leaning manifesto and policies, after it gained power in the seventies, can be said to be the closest that the Left came to power in this country.

The Right in Pakistan has been defined by religion basically. Religious parties like Jama’at-i-Islami, different groups of Jamiat-e-Ulema-e-Pakistan and other Shia and Sunni religious groups and parties all represent various shades of this thinking. They are conservative in their outlook, although with varying degree of openness to change demanded by times. As noted in the section above, they are either revivalists or traditionalists in their approach to religion and the same applies to their politics.
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

Both the Left leaning and the Right leaning liberals have been in short supply in this country. In both cases, however, they are committed to human freedom and equality as fundamental political values and seek the realisation of these values either through a socialist ideology or through Islamic ideas interpreted with an eye to liberal democracy. We find both types of liberals among intellectuals and writers but they do not seem to have succeeded in organising themselves politically.

Conclusions

By bringing out publications and holding symposia on the platform of Pakistan Philosophical Congress, academic Philosophy in the country has played a useful role in reviving and continuing the Islamic tradition of philosophy. Also it is keeping alive the link of Pakistani society with the intellectual life of the West in a comprehensive and systematic fashion through teaching Western thought from ancient to modern periods and by raising and debating philosophically various intellectual and cultural issues that Pakistani nation face. Along with these contributions one needs to point out that most of the literature produced by academics in Pakistan is not of international standard though it does meet basic research requirements in the field.

It should be pointed out also that though academic Philosophy in Pakistan keeps a close contact with the philosophical developments in the West it is not very creative and dynamic currently. Most of what it produces is heavily dependent on the insights of great Western thinkers of the past or the present.

In addition there is a linkage between academic philosophical work and contribution of the non-academic thinkers and writers, literary, political as well as religious. There are three reasons for this: firstly, academic departments of the universities draw their students and teachers from the society at large, which is definitely influenced by the religious, political, and literary figures engaged in developing various schemes and systems of ideas addressing the problems of society; secondly, teachers and
students of Philosophy cannot ignore the issues confronting Pakistani society and, hence, they also engage in finding philosophical ways to address them. This links their work with the work of non-academic writers. Thirdly, there is a certain degree of official sponsorship of the work by the academic departments and professional organisations to academically address the problems faced by the society at large. This has also happened in case of Philosophy. Therefore, academics have on occasions taken it as their national duty to address larger issues of their society, which non-academic writers also addressed.

Because of the above reasons, the academic and non-academic thought in Pakistan has interacted in the same fashion as it does in all other societies. Almost all shades of political, religious, and literary opinion to be found in the society at large are present in Philosophy departments, both among the teachers and students. It must be emphasised though that in certain technical areas of Philosophy, it is the academic departments which have influenced the non-academics (through their courses, seminars and conferences) and not always the other way round. In any case, the non-academic philosophical thought in Pakistan has remained quite relevant for the work of the academics in Philosophy throughout these decades. Research students, particularly at MPhil and PhD levels, have done research on the contributions of religious and literary figures occasionally and some of the significant works of these writers have found their way into the course work for senior students in some universities.12
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

Notes

1 As Government College, Lahore was not a university during the period of this study 1985-2002, and Bahauddin Zakariya University at Multan opened its Philosophy department in 2003, this study includes only five departments.
2 COSS Bulletin No. 2, Summer, 2001, p. 16.
3 Some departments require a thesis at Master level as well, which are not included in this study.
4 Though Iqbal was a lawyer by profession, he also for awhile remained a faculty member of the Philosophy Department at Government College, Lahore (now a university). Therefore, his contributions towards revival of Muslim thought can be credited to the Academia, to some extent, although in the pre-partition days.
5 For topics of papers presented in PPC meetings see Shabbir Ahsen, ‘Professional Association in Philosophy in Pakistan’, in a forthcoming COSS study.
7 However, both Khawaja Masud and Kazy Javed are not associated with any academic department.
8 For details on these issue see early chapters of Fazl-ur-Rahman, Islam and Modernity (Chicago University Press, 1984).
9 For details of his methodology see his Mafhum-ul-Qura’an (Lahore, 1978).
10 The term ‘traditionalist’ is also used to refer to those who assign a special role to the ulema in Islamic society. However, the usage here is broader and refers to orthodoxy and revivalists (such as Wahabi and Sanusi movements) but not neo-revivalists such as Jama’at-i-Islami and Muslim brotherhood. In other words, all those who emphasise a return to the original sources and authorities are referred to as traditionalists by us. Of course, there are many different groups and movements which fit this description and the differences in their approaches should not be ignored. For a helpful reference see John L. Esposito’s book Islam: The Straight Path (Oxford University Press, 1998).
Development of Philosophy as a Discipline

Left in Pakistan produced large amount of political literature. Sibte Hasan is considered to be an important contributor in this regard. His important works are: 1. *Moosa say Marx Tak* 2. *Pakistan mein Tehzeeb ka Irtiqa* 3. *Maazi kay Mazaar* 4. *Naveed-i-Fikr* etc., (these works are printed by Maktaba-e-Daniyal, Lahore). Another significant writer is Dr. Mubashir Hasan. His recent book, *The Mirage of Power: An Inquiry into the Bhutto Years, 1971-1977* (Oxford, 2000), is in the same tradition. Also the literary scene in Pakistan has been greatly influenced by writers with Leftists leanings and their works contain the Marxist message for transformation of society. However, it is not possible to list either the writers or their books for reason of space and focus of this article.

At university of Peshawar, for example, writers such as Maulana Maududi, Fazl-ur-Rahman, and G. A. Pervez are included in the course work on Muslim Philosophy for senior students.
The State of the Discipline of Psychology in Public Universities in Pakistan: A Review

Muhammad Pervez and Kamran Ahmad

A review of the state of Psychology in a country requires four distinct areas of investigation:
(a) The discipline of Psychology as it is developing as a body of scientific knowledge within the socio-cultural context of the country;
(b) Psychology as an academic discipline and as learned, taught and researched within the educational context of the country;
(c) The role of the discipline as a factor, contributing to the intellectual, cultural, social, and economic growth of the country;
(d) The interaction of the discipline with the general body of knowledge in the social sciences and its application by the international community of Psychology and psychologists.

A complete review, covering all the dimensions mentioned above is a tall order and needs a detailed investigation and data collection, requiring time, material and human resources. The present review, with constrained resources, remains a very limited effort.

Psychology, in terms of the number of departments and students, has continued to grow in Pakistan. Whether there is a corresponding qualitative growth in the discipline is debatable. There are many gaps and problem areas that need to be taken into account to get a sense of the state of Psychology in Pakistan.

Four well known narratives exist about Psychology in Pakistan. Aslam’s\(^1\) work is an autobiographical account but covers good
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile
ground with intricate details. Zaidi, while tracing the history of Psychology in Pakistan during last about twenty-seven years, emphasised its roots in Philosophy and its advantages and disadvantages. Psychology in Pakistan remained close to the psychoanalytical orientation. However, it was also not totally oblivious to the needs of the emerging state of Pakistan. While trying to shed traditions from Hindu Psychology, a motivation started to emerge, to develop its bearings in Muslim philosophy. On the applied side, the need to use Psychology for personnel selection, largely in the armed forces and to a lesser degree, in the selection of public civil servants, also developed. Zaidi points out the relevance of Psychology to the stresses of a changing society but does not present any evidence of a significant work undertaken in this direction. Ansari, in a much more comprehensive work, presents a thorough historical outline of the development of Psychology in Pakistan. He shows how Psychology emerged from a philosophical background in the Indian subcontinent. He then outlines the heavy influence of the analytical schools of Psychology including Freudian, Jungian and Adlerian. He reveals his appreciation for the later turn of the discipline towards a more behaviouristic orientation and the gains in becoming an objective, empirical and quantitative science. Psychology in Pakistan may still not have recovered from these ‘gains’.

Ansari divided the period from 1947 to 1986 in three phases. In 1947, Government College, Lahore and Forman Christian College, Lahore were the two major institutions teaching Psychology in the country. After a while it was only the former one that survived. Between 1954 and 1965 Karachi, Sindh, Punjab and Peshawar universities established their Psychology departments. Between 1976 and 1986 the National Institute of Psychology was established in Islamabad and five postgraduate departments were opened in colleges in Lahore, Rawalpindi, Sialkot, Gujranwala and Jhang. Two institutions of Clinical Psychology were also set up during this period.
Only a few of these institutions were offering PhD degrees in Psychology in 1986. Thus, most of the PhDs in Psychology (out of 40 in all) had received their degrees from UK or USA. With not many local PhDs in the field, and with the number of institutions offering degrees in Psychology increasing, Ansari points out how thinly dispersed the trained manpower had become. Other than teaching, psychologists were being employed by the armed forces and the Public Services Commission, while others sought work in Government Hospitals or practised privately.

By the mid-80s, Ansari still saw Psychology as an alien discipline without much relevance to the realities of Pakistani life. He strongly felt that Psychology needed to undergo a process of indigenisation, both in terms of its method and content. On the other hand, Haq reads like a commissioned work with good coverage but lacking details, which could point out any developmental trends. In 2003, the present review began with an ambitious plan to collect empirical data on the state of Psychology in Pakistan. All of the three above-mentioned accounts of Psychology in Pakistan (Aslam, Ansari and Haq), for various reasons, missed any mention of the role of Islamia College, Lahore in contributing into the development of Psychology. Islamia College, Lahore, remained engaged in Master level of education for many years but it was discontinued during late 1970s or early 1980s.

The inability to acquire empirical data and departments’ lack of cooperation in this pursuit is part of the problem of underdevelopment of scientific disciplines in Pakistan. There are hardly any professional forums where psychologists (like most other social scientists) can meet and develop traditions of communication, professional sharing and cooperation. The Pakistan Psychological Association, which is supposed to be the professional body of Pakistani psychologists and is expected to provide such a forum to the psychologists, has not been able to perform effectively. The current elected President of this Association, in a personal communication to one of the authors,
So wrote that ‘no record whatsoever regarding membership, constitution, accounts, academic activities, projects, etc., (of Pakistan Psychological Association) are transferred to us’.

As regards teaching and research at the graduate level, one may expect a lot of documentation. However, no central depository has ever tried to collect such obvious information as research journals published by different departments in different periods, lists of MSc, MPhil and PhD theses produced, curricula and courses taught at various universities and departments at different periods etc. It appears that not only is such information not maintained by many of the departments, but also the chairpersons of these departments are not even interested in wanting to share and make such information available.

**Quantitative Development of Discipline of Psychology (COSS Data)**

Here we first summarise the data provided by COSS, which describe changes in some quantitative aspects of the discipline of psychology from the year 1963 to 2001. After this we give data of our survey, based on information received from eight out of the 15 departments/institutes.

COSS data show that the number of departments which was three in 1963 rose to eight in 2001. Three departments in 1963 had 12 teachers with an average of four teachers in each department. By the year 2001 the total number of teachers rose to 58 with an average of seven teachers in each department. This data suggest that the growth of departments was slower than rise in the number of teachers.

Out of 12 teachers in 3 Psychology departments in 1963, four (33% of all teachers) had PhD degrees, no teacher had MPhil degree and eight (67%) teachers were MA. Out of 58 teachers in 2001, 22 (38%) had PhD degrees, three (5%) had MPhil degrees and 28 (48%) teachers were MA. The difference in share percentage of three degrees in 1963 and 2001 shows an increase of 5% for PhDs and MPhils, and 19% decrease for MA degrees.
The State of the Discipline of Psychology in Public Universities

The increase in the percentages of PhD and MPhil teachers could be a positive factor in improving the quality of education.

Out of 12 teachers of Psychology in 1963, nine (75%) had their degrees from foreign universities. In 2001, out of 58 teachers 11 (19%) had such degrees showing 56% decline in foreign qualified teachers. Out of four PhD teachers in 1963, all (100%) had their degrees from foreign universities. In 2001, out of the 22 PhDs, only nine (41%) had their degrees from foreign universities, showing a 59% decline in the foreign trained PhDs.

Quantitative Development in the Discipline of Psychology (Data from Our Survey)

During the survey for this study, 18 departments and institutes offering postgraduate teaching in Psychology were identified. However, it transpired that three government colleges in Punjab, which started teaching at the postgraduate level during the 1980s and 1990s, have discontinued their programmes and therefore, currently (2003) there are 15 departments/institutes. Out of them only eight responded to our questionnaire. Findings based on information received from eight out of 15 departments/institutes cannot be a good basis for generalisation. However, the authors believe that the responding departments are a fairly good sample of the departments of Psychology in the country. Therefore, it is assumed that more information from all departments/institutes would not drastically change the overall description of the situation presented below.

The eight responding departments/institutes have 61 academic staff members with an average of about eight teachers per department/institute. The Institute of Clinical Psychology, Karachi University has the largest number of teachers equalling 12. The Department of Psychology, Balochistan University has the fewest (four). The National Institute of Psychology, Quaid-i-Azam University has five PhDs. The departments at Peshawar University and Sindh University have four and two PhDs respectively. Balochistan University and Islamabad College for
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

Women have none. It is important to notice that most of these PhDs are products of their own departments.

Postgraduate Students
Table 1 indicates the growth of the number of students since 1985 according to the survey mentioned above. The data is based upon information provided by eight departments. It may be noted here that all the eight departments were not present in all the 19 reported years. Very few of these ever offered MPhil and PhD programme.

Table 1: The Number of MSc Students in Eight Postgraduate Departments of Psychology

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>MSc</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>125</td>
<td>149</td>
<td>192</td>
<td>258</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MPhil</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PhD</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Data collected by the author.

The above table shows only an increase in the number of total students. As this data represents only eight departments/institutes, it will not be incorrect to assume that all the 14 departments/institutes are producing about 500 MSc level psychologists in Pakistan each year.

The trend of growth in the number of students at MSc level is also repeated at MPhil level. The number of 13 in 1985 has increased to 32 at present. However as fewer departments are offering MPhil and PhD programmes, unlike MSc, the number of MPhil and PhD students cannot be doubled to get an estimate of MPhil and PhDs being produced in Pakistan. However, one can observe that only about one out of eight MSc graduates are going for MPhil degree and one out of about 21 are doing PhD. This appears to be adequate enough for producing more qualified teachers to teach Psychology.

Looking from another angle, 12 PhDs a year is a highly inadequate number to cater for about 17 postgraduate departments of Psychology in the country, especially when it is
known that few psychologists with PhDs from abroad, and presently working there, are willing to return to Pakistan and serve in its universities.

Some data obtained by COSS provides an idea of the relative contributions of various universities to the production of PhD and MPhil degrees.¹³

**Libraries and Laboratories**

In order to evaluate the state of teaching institutions, a look at their situation of libraries and laboratories would be in order.

There are a total number of 20,730 books in all the libraries of the eight reporting departments, the average being 2,961 books. The largest collection is at the National Institute of Psychology with 7544 books, while the smallest one is at Balochistan, with only 700 books. Seven hundred is a highly inadequate number of books for a postgraduate teaching department.

The total number of research journals being collectively subscribed to by the entire eight departments is only about 40, the average being about six. The National Institute of Psychology subscribes to the highest number, i.e., 17. Two departments do not subscribe to any journal and one department subscribes to only one journal.

All the departments, except Balochistan University, have teaching experimental laboratories, while only one department, Peshawar University, has claimed the existence of a research experimental laboratory. All the departments, except one, have only manual equipment in their laboratories, which is a highly alarming situation as manual equipment provides extremely poor experimental controls on psychological processes being investigated. Only the National Institute of Psychology uses computers for laboratory experiments.

There are 33 computers for students’ use among all the seven departments. However the National Institute of Psychology alone
has 18 of these computers, which inflates and makes the average number useless. Department of Psychology, University of Balochistan and Islamabad College of Girls do not possess any computer for student use. Only three out of seven departments have internet access on one or two of their computers. The National Institute of Psychology is an exceptional case with local area networking and internet access on all its computers available to all of its students and staff members. For most of the other departments, computers are used only for word-processing and data analysis.

On the average, each department has about 10 experimental tables, which are adequate to cater for, on the average, about 40 students.

**Research in Psychology**

Despite its roots in Philosophy as discussed by Ansari, Psychology developed a strong tradition of teaching scientific methodology with major emphasis on experimentation and quantitative and statistical methods. Producing a research report in the form of a thesis also remained part of the scheme of teaching at the MSc level for most of the departments of Psychology. At the MPhil level, almost half of the work is expected to be a significant research project. The doctoral degree is, of course, a research degree, with total reliance upon the research thesis, as in the case of Government College, Lahore, and partly course work and partly theses, as at the Institute of Clinical Psychology, Karachi. Some universities insist upon getting the PhD work evaluated from international referees (e.g., National Institute of Psychology), while in other cases it varies from being totally internal to partially external. The present review does not make any attempt to assess the quality of Pakistani research degrees in Psychology. Nevertheless, a proper review would be incomplete without an objective evaluation of the quality of research and degrees primarily based upon the quality of this research.
The State of the Discipline of Psychology in Public Universities

Research Topics
A very large portion of research in Psychology is undertaken in the context of university requirements for higher degrees. Most of the MA/MSc, and almost all MPhil and PhD programmes, require research projects by students. There is no central source of even the listings of research topics and projects.

Ansari\textsuperscript{15} developed seven categories to investigate the trends of research topics in Pakistan. His work was based upon published research work. However, a large quantity of research is undertaken by students at all three levels of higher education, i.e., MA/MSc, MPhil and PhD, but this research is seldom published. One cannot really determine trends without also looking into students’ research, which is invariably supervised by the academic staff of the postgraduate departments. Ansari noted that during the 1947-69 period, 19 per cent of the research was theoretical and philosophical. This increased to 27.8 per cent in the 1970-79 period. The present authors decided to use Ansari’s categories to compare the more recent research trends. It would have been more appropriate to undertake analysis of published research by Pakistani psychologists, as Ansari did. However, in order to have a general idea of research topics from the data available to the authors, Table 2 and 3, respectively, present the results derived from the topics of PhD and MPhil theses.
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

Table 2: Research Topics of PhD Theses Produced During 1985-2000 Period

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topics of Research</th>
<th>1985-90</th>
<th>91-95</th>
<th>96-2000</th>
<th>2000-</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Developmental</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experimental</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Testing</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clinical</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>75</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educational</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theoretical &amp; Philosophical</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>43</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Data collected by the author.

Table 3: Research Topics of MPhil Theses Produced During 1985-2000 Period

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Topic of Research</th>
<th>1985-90</th>
<th>91-95</th>
<th>96-2000</th>
<th>2000-</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Developmental</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experimental</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Testing</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clinical</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Educational</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theoretical &amp; Philosophical</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Authors’ survey and tabulation.

The Council of Social Sciences (COSS) also obtained and provided data on research theses in various disciplines of social sciences. However, it was not possible to classify that work in the above adopted framework. Therefore, it has not been presented here.

Interest in Clinical Psychology appears to have been increased markedly at least in doctoral thesis topics, but it can be ascribed to just one institution, the Institute of Clinical Psychology, Karachi, which produced 12 PhD theses, all in Clinical Psychology for obvious reasons. At the MPhil level, Social Psychology seems to be popular with 42 per cent theses in this area. This is followed by 25 per cent in Testing. However, the
most glaring omission is Experimental Psychology in which neither at PhD nor at MPhil level has any research been undertaken. Keeping in view the situation of the experimental laboratories, this is not surprising. Despite a lot of content in the curriculum being related to experimental methods, the practice of research in experimental Psychology is almost non-existent in Pakistan. This does not speak well for the science of Psychology in the country.

**Jobs in Psychology**

The job market for psychologists still remains somewhat limited in Pakistan. Many of the graduates from Psychology programmes do not opt for a job in the field. Out of those who do take on a job, most end up in the profession of teaching. Psychology remains one of the most popular subjects among undergraduate students (FA/FSc and BA/BSc) of the cluster of social sciences or, of what is popularly called Arts.

Besides teaching, the armed forces still continue to hire psychologists, mostly for the purposes of assessment but increasingly for counselling as well. Psychologists are also being used for intelligence and psychological operations by the armed forces. The Public Service Commissions also continue to hire psychologists for assessment purposes in their selection process.

In terms of psychotherapy and counselling, in general, the stigma attached to any kind of psychological treatment still remains strong in the country. Private practice therefore remains an option for only a few psychologists. Some are working in the psychiatric wards in hospitals. The focus of psychological treatment in hospitals however remains through medications and, at times, through the questionable and unethical use of electric shocks. The treatment services and the environment in hospitals are not suited for any serious psychological work of a clinical nature. This becomes more of a problem as some of the institutions offering training in Clinical Psychology send their students for training to hospitals. The level of training therefore remains questionable. And once trained, these psychologists are
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

left to work in a professional environment, which basically follows a medical model rather than a psychological or mental health framework. Moreover, there are almost no binding ethical or professional codes of conduct.

Another job market has opened up for psychologists, both clinical and others, in the form of non-government organisations. Many NGOs are involved in service-providing in areas where psychologists become useful. Others are involved in research related activities where again psychologists can effectively apply their training and expertise. Some psychologists are getting involved, as staff or as freelancers, in working with community groups and in training activities.

Other fields opening up for psychologists include Human Resource departments mostly in major private sector and international organisations. The National Institute of Psychology is trying to strengthen this link by offering courses in areas related to industrial, business, marketing, organisational and NGO settings.

There are some individual psychologists working in the area of marketing research. This is another field that is expected to open up in the future. There is, however, no systematic or organised effort to develop the role of Psychology in such areas. One generally finds a lack of strong research tradition or interest in specific universities or departments of Psychology. A clearly defined research agenda has also not emerged in any quarter. Therefore, it is not possible to discern any specific schools or theoretical orientations of research emerging in Pakistan. Most of the research is individualised. It is initiated by the interest of students or teachers, and often does not lead to a relatively long-term tradition.

Professional Organisations
In the first two decades of Pakistan, psychologists felt content to stay in a national body of philosophers, namely the Pakistan Philosophical Congress, and participated in it accepting
Psychology as a sub-discipline of Philosophy. The Pakistan Psychological Association (PPA) was established in the late sixties at Dhaka (East Pakistan) but with the break-up of Pakistan, it re-emerged in the leftover Pakistan (West Pakistan) in the late seventies. However, the PPA could not attain consistency or continuity. While it was expected to organise annual conferences, in the last three decades it organised only about ten conferences. Not only did the quality of its conferences remain very uneven, it more or less failed to provide a reliable and consistent forum to discuss professional issues of the discipline. The only justification for its existence remained limited to organising conferences. During the periods between the conferences, the organisation became dormant. It could not develop any role for itself, which it could play on a regular basis. It could not formulate any system of proper memberships. Members are enlisted only prior to a forthcoming conference (rather during the conference), and the only role of the members is casting votes in elections of the office bearers during the conferences. This resulted in the conferences being dominated by the preoccupation with lobbying for elections. The scientific sessions – the sessions in which academic papers are presented – generally suffered from poor attendance. The papers read at the scientific sessions were mostly of a poor quality and generally not properly edited. With some honourable exceptions, the proceedings of the conferences were mostly not published.

The constitution, along with the electoral process, has proved incapable of providing continuity and a meaningful professional role to PPA. The elections are dominated by the particular location where a conference is held. Due to lack of proper membership and no tradition of postal ballots, the electoral process is generally dominated by on the spot deliberate enlistment of members, and this provides an instant majority of young graduates and college teachers in that particular locality. Therefore, the local dominant lobby generally wins the elections. Without much consideration of academic standing, the voting pattern runs around local lobbies and culminates in obtaining certain elected positions. However, conferences do provide a
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

good social occasion to many psychologists from different parts of the country to meet each other. Some expatriate psychologists also try to attend these conferences, which provide a pretext to call some of these as being of international level. The PPA generally does not play any other role except occasionally organising conferences and holding elections during those conferences. It does not publish any journal. It does not even publish any newsletter, though with some exceptions and for limited periods. It does not play any effective role in lobbying for professional rights, creating public awareness of the discipline, or making any serious deliberations about professional and academic issues.

The PPA does not have any regular funding source. The basic funding source is membership subscription, which is generally collected just prior to the elections in the conference. Some advertisers are also approached to get funds for the conferences. Some contributions are made by the hosting institution, which is mostly a university or a department of Psychology, and these are for the most part in kind, that is, providing a venue, accommodation and, occasionally, dinners and lunches. One cultural evening, mostly based on a musical rendering is a tradition. The federal government provides funds, which are a pittance, to what the government calls ‘learned bodies,’ and the PPA is one such body. The PPA also suffers from not having any permanent office or secretariat. This results in a total lack of any properly kept records of the Association.

During the last few years, the ineffectiveness of PPA has encouraged the growth of splinter groups of psychologists, but they could not gain ground or make any difference.

Problems and Prospects
Due to lack of jobs in the country for psychologists, there is a general low motivation among Psychology students to take up Psychology as a profession. Most students of Psychology, around 80 to 90 per cent, are girls. Many of them are attracted to Psychology as a discipline, which may give them a better
understanding of interpersonal relations and an edge to play non-
professional and traditional women’s roles. Given the available
job opportunities, one can understand male students not opting
for Psychology. Overall most Psychology students are not
interested in a career in Psychology and many of them are not
really committed to the field.

The graduates being produced in such a non-professional milieu
develop non-professional attitudes and unfortunately, many of
them (majority of those who do get employed) end up becoming
teachers. Therefore, the level of teachers keeps going down as
well. The quality of local MPhil and PhD has not been put to any
evaluation and assessment, and is therefore questionable.

In terms of the level of research, Psychology still has a very low
contribution to the overall understanding of social issues and the
psyche of the nation and its developments. Not many in the
mainstream development fields are working with the most
pressing psychosocial issues in the country. Most of the research
being produced in Psychology is by students in the context of
requirements of degrees. As such, research is almost invariably
not supported by any funds and there is a tendency of adopting
the path of least resistance. Given the very low availability of
books and research journals, and almost non-existing research
laboratories, students look for highly manageable topics. Most of
this can be categorised as replication studies and cross-cultural
comparisons without any significant understanding of any of the
cultures. Plagiarism is not uncommon either and, unfortunately,
goes unnoticed as teachers either do not read the material
carefully or are not really familiar with relevant material in the
field.

This situation does not motivate the scientific community and
the intelligentsia in general to employ Psychology as a potential
discipline for providing insights into the psychosocial and
cultural development of the country.
The Qualitative Development
The present review is basically non-evaluative. The question of quality is quite complex and requires clearly laid down parameters. There is a distinct and often repeated social commentary in Pakistan about the decline in the quality of education. One indication is that for positions where a MSc degree was considered adequate, MPhil degree holders are applying and getting selected. There are many more opportunities now to get into MPhil and PhD teaching programmes, if we consider the opportunity of acquiring higher degrees a qualitative development. More research journals are being published locally than ever before. There is greater variety of research topics for students’ research theses. There is a distinct change, but its qualitative value needs much more detailed exploration than what can be attempted in the present paper.

The Quantitative Development
The question of quantity is much easier to answer. There has been substantial growth in the number of teaching institutions and students in the discipline of Psychology. This is indicated by increase in number of teaching institutions, number of students and also number of research theses produced at various levels of teaching. There are fairly good indications that among the social sciences in Pakistan, Psychology has grown much more than any other discipline. However, it would be difficult to say that we are producing enough psychologists, given the psychological needs in the country, both at the level of services and at the level of deeper understanding of issues. Yet, in the job market most of the qualified psychologists continue to struggle. Opening up job opportunities for practitioners of a certain discipline is also the responsibility of that discipline. Psychologists have not proved to be very effective in this respect. However, in terms of numbers of students, teachers, and the quantity of research (though basically students’ research) being produced, the growth is clear.

One cannot ignore the fact that whatever growth may be indicated here, it may not be the direct result of the development
of the discipline of Psychology in Pakistan. Besides the factor of growth in population, the sector of higher education has developed at a tremendous pace during the last decade.

**The Curricula of Psychology**
The Higher Education Commission (previously University Grants Commission) has a mandate to undertake the exercise of revising university curricula of all disciplines. There has been a regular practice of the revision of curricula in Psychology. However, this practice only carries the value of recommendations for the universities. Revisions in the curriculum though do not always lead to changes in practice. The basic teaching and learning practices continue to rely heavily upon very traditional methods. Keeping in view Western trends, new concepts are generally picked up for inclusion in new syllabi. There has also been a distinct trend, but only marginal, to introduce some socio-cultural relevance in the curriculum. One often finds attempts to shift some focus on local psychological problems and issues. At one time, there was a clear inclination in certain departments of Psychology to provide an Islamic orientation to Psychology but that trend did not take root. Research methodology, especially scientific and objective methods, has been central to the Psychology curricula. There is a healthy blend of theoretical and applied approaches. In fact, at times there is a greater emphasis on the applied nature of Psychology. The application of Psychology has been over emphasised to the extent that some departments offer Master degrees in Applied Psychology, without it really being any different from what is called just Psychology.

There is a general lack of specialisation in teaching and research supervision in Psychology. However, the two Institutes of Clinical Psychology in Lahore and Karachi do specialise in Clinical Psychology and offer post Master diploma and PhD in Clinical Psychology. As specialisation is an outcome of a long career in a particular area of the discipline, most of the teachers, with very few exceptions, are not able to develop much of a specialisation. Many teachers, despite working in specific areas
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

for their PhD degrees, lose interest in their own specialisation because they do not find much to motivate them in terms of research projects with some financial assistance, which would have allowed them to follow the original research interest.

Due to lack of good and formally organised communication between various disciplines of social sciences, there is hardly any tradition of interdisciplinary teaching or research in Pakistan. Within Psychology the only major interaction takes place in the field of mental health, where psychologists and psychiatrists can work together. However, due to a battle of control and supremacy the relationships are, generally far from being cooperative. Social Psychology is also taught in Sociology. Similarly, many psychological courses are part of Education and Management Sciences, but multidisciplinary research is quite rare.

**Publication of Research**

As mentioned earlier, one can count about 20 psychological research journals, which appeared at different times for different durations from various departments of Psychology. However, due to lack of any central organisation, which could keep track of appearance and continuation of these journals, it is not easy to describe the present situation with any certainty. Due to lack of a firm tradition of proper procedure of blind peer review, the absence of a proper editorial board and lack of continuity of regular publications, there is hardly any research journal, which could establish an internationally recognised status or which could be abstracted or indexed in any international abstracting or indexing service. A separate research project is needed to undertake a quantitative and qualitative review of psychological research carried out and published in Pakistan.

There is a distinct tendency where most of the papers being published are of members of the editorial staff, or members of the academic staff of the department that is publishing the research journal. This may not be an essential indication of favouritism as obtaining printable research papers is not an easy
The State of the Discipline of Psychology in Public Universities

task in Pakistan, where few psychologists undertake original research. Pressing the staff of one’s own department for contribution of research papers to their own journal is perhaps easier.

As promotions in academic positions in the universities have been linked with research publications, most of the university teachers are compelled to fulfil a minimum requirement of publications. This is often done by publishing in their own journals. Some Pakistani psychologists, rather rarely, are also published in journals of international repute. Mention some with citations. Also mention the names of some of the journals published by departments.

There are few Pakistani psychologists who are internationally known academicians or researchers. Most of these have been working and living abroad since a very long time and have little contact with the Pakistani scene. Some such psychologists have also published significant original and edited books in their own areas of specialisation. Dr. Anis Sheikh, Dr. Akhtar Ahsan and Dr. Irfan Niaz in the areas of imagery, eidetic psychotherapy and cognitive development can be quoted as such rare examples. Some psychologists also have publications in international journals of repute. However, the number of such authors and their contribution in international journals is comparatively low. Nevertheless, their mention can be found in absolutely first-rate journals. Just to illustrate, journals as reputable as Genetic Psychology Monographs finds S. M. H. Zaidi (1960, volume 62) and Genetic, Social and General Psychology Monographs contains Muhammad Pervez (along with English and Greek co-authors) (1988, volume 114).

Among the community of psychologists in Pakistan, at present, there is no one who is known as a regular contributor to any magazine or newspaper. This again speaks of the relative isolation of the discipline from what could have been its place in the debate of the social, political, cultural and development issues facing the nation.
Quantitative Description of PhD and MPhil Theses Produced by the Departments of Psychology in Five Universities of Pakistan

PhD and MPhil Theses
Since the establishment of the first department of Psychology in 1956 at University of Sindh, Jamshoro up to 2001 (45 years), Psychology departments in five public universities have produced a total of 165 PhD and MPhil theses with an average of four theses per year. Seventeen of these (10%) were produced before 1987 and 148 (90%) were completed between 1987 to 2001.

During these 45 years the departments of Psychology have produced 47 PhD theses, that is one PhD per year. Nine of them were produced before 1987 (0.3 per year) and 38 from 1987 to 2001 (2.5 per year). By the year 2001, 118 MPhil theses, with almost three MPhils per year, have been produced. Out of these 118 MPhil theses eight (7%) were completed before 1987 with an average of 0.3 per year and 110 (93%) from 1987 to 2001 with an average of seven theses per year. This data suggests that the production of both PhD and MPhil theses during 15 years from 1987 to 2001 was significantly greater than during 1956 to 1986.

Out of the total 47 PhD produced by five public universities by 2001, Quaid-i-Azam University has produced the largest number (15), followed by Peshawar University (14) and Karachi University (12). Punjab University and Sindh University have produced three PhD theses each. Out of the total 118 MPhil theses produced during the same period, Quaid-i-Azam University has produced the highest number (89), followed by Peshawar University (27) and Sindh University (2). Punjab University and Karachi University have not produced any MPhil thesis.
The State of the Discipline of Psychology in Public Universities

The decade-wise breakdown of theses shows that out of 165 theses one PhD thesis was produced in 60s, six (five PhD and one MPhil) in 70s, 33 (8 PhD and 25 MPhil) in 80s and 109 (27 PhDs and 82 MPhils) in 90s. It may be noted that 86% of all theses were produced in 80s and 90s which is a very significant number of theses. One possible explanation for increase in the number of theses during 80s and 90s is that National Institute of Psychology at Quaid-i-Azam University after its affiliation with the university in 1983 produced 63% of total thesis. Out of 165 theses produced by 2001, all theses were written in English. Hundred and fifteen of them (70%) were written by the female students while the remaining 50 (30%) were written by male students.
Notes

4 Ibid., p. 97.
5 Ansari, ‘Development of Psychology…’, op.cit.
6 Ibid.
8 COSS data pertain only to departments of Psychology in universities and exclude Postgraduate colleges teaching Psychology. At some point of time there had been seven colleges in Punjab. Out of them four exist at present (2003).
9 There were five (9%) teachers in 2001, whose qualification was not known.
10 They are as follows:
   1. Department of Applied Psychology, University of the Punjab
   2. Department of Psychology, University of Karachi
   3. Department of Psychology, University of Sindh
   4. Department of Psychology, University of Peshawar
   5. Department of Psychology, University of Balochistan
   6. Department of Applied Psychology, Islamia University, Bahawalpur
   7. Institute for Clinical Psychology, University of the Punjab
   8. Institute for Clinical Psychology, University of Karachi
   9. Department of Psychology, Government Postgraduate College for Women, Rawalpindi (affiliated with Punjab University)
  10. Department of Psychology, Federal Government Postgraduate College for Women, F-7/2, Islamabad (affiliated with Punjab University)
  11. Department of Psychology, Islamabad College for Girls, F-6/2, Islamabad (affiliated with Punjab University)
  12. Institute of Management Sciences (offering programme of MSc in Psychology), Bahauddin University, Multan
  13. Department of Psychology, Government Murray College, Sialkot (affiliated with Punjab University)
  14. Department of Psychology, Government College University, Lahore
  15. National Institute of Psychology, Quaid-i-Azam University
11 The departments that responded are listed below:
   1. Department of Psychology, Government College University, Lahore
   2. Department of Psychology, University of Sindh
   3. Institute for Clinical Psychology, University of Karachi

174
4. Department of Psychology, University of Balochistan
5. Department of Psychology, University of Peshawar
6. Department of Psychology, Islamabad College for Girls, F-6/2, Islamabad
7. Department of Applied Psychology, Islamia University, Bahawalpur
8. National Institute of Psychology, Quaid-i-Azam University

From among the eight that did respond one is a ‘college’, though operating on an academic programme of Punjab University, it exits outside of a university. If one is essentially interested in contributions of ‘universities,’ this college may have not been included. However, the ratio of contribution of this college would be so negligible that it can easily be ignored in major indicators.

For description and discussion of COSS data on MPhil and PhD theses see Annex I.

Ansari, ‘Development of Psychology…’, op.cit.

Ibid.

Assigning topic, which essentially refers to a sub-classification within the discipline of Psychology can be a subjective judgement. Therefore, the topics assigned in this table are judgements of the present authors and these may differ from judgement of another reviewer.

For COSS data on theses see Annex I.

We have received the information used in this section from the following five public universities: Quaid-i-Azam University, University of the Punjab, Karachi University, Sindh University and University Peshawar.
7
Development of Economics as a Discipline in Pakistan

Karamat Ali

Introduction
Economics has the unique feature of achieving the status of science from amongst various disciplines related to the study of human society. This is the result of adherence to scientific methodology leading to cumulative growth of knowledge, a tradition of objectivity and creativity, structural integration of social scientific knowledge, a rapidly expanding institutional capability for development. But acceptance and popularity of ‘rational expectations’ models among academics in particular and policy makers in general in the developed as well as developing countries, despite evidence to the contrary, bears testimony to a triumph of ideology over science. The rational expectation models made an important contribution to Economics by imposing rigour on economic thinking but good science should also recognise its limitations, which the advocates of ‘rational expectations’ did not.

The idea that one can test many economic propositions in a laboratory setting has developed into a sub-discipline called experimental economics. Its most significant results relate to altruism and selfishness. These results indicate that at least in experimental situations, subjects are not as selfish as economists have hypothesised. Although there are certain limitations and genuine reservations about conducting controlled experiments in a discipline such as Economics, the results cast doubt on the
validity of the assumptions of rationality, self-interest and free market leading to efficiency.

The Nobel prizes of 2001 and 2002 highlight how important it is to study people and economies as they are, not as we want them to be. Only by understanding human behaviour better we can hope to design policies that will make economies work better as well.\(^1\) Though it has developed more precision and predictability as compared to other social sciences, the Stiglitz criteria is the appropriate criteria to judge the development of Economics as a social science. This enables economists to understand economies in their right perspective so as to come up with suggestions for judicious policies.

While the main focus of the paper will be on development since 1988, earlier development of discipline will also be discussed wherever both quantitative and qualitative data is available. Compared with other social science the evaluation of discipline of Economics is less difficult as a number of economists have made significant contributions in this field.\(^2\)

**Quantitative Development**

Economics is one of the three disciplines that Pakistan inherited from pre-Partition India, the other two being History and Political Science. All three were located in the University of the Punjab. The department of Economics was established in 1919. ‘For formulating a suitable curriculum for the department, the advice of many famous economists including E. C. Gonver, S. G. Champman, Sidney Webb and Mrs. Webb, Alfred Marshal, A. L. Bowley and J. M. Keynes was sought.’\(^3\) A number of objectives that the department was to serve included preparing students for careers in government, commercial and industrial enterprises and undertake research on basic issues in public and private enterprises.\(^4\)

After the first department in Punjab University, four departments of Economics were started in University of Peshawar (1953-54), University of Karachi (1953), University of Sindh (1953), and
the University of Agriculture Lyallpure now Faisalabad. Thus by 1963 the number of such departments rose to five. By 1987, it rose to 16 and by 2001 to 18. Compared with all other social science disciplines, the discipline of Economics grew rapidly and had the highest number of departments with the exception of Education.

Besides the teaching departments in universities there have emerged a number of government bodies that collect data and write reports on issues that they deal with. Then there are institutes that are exclusively devoted to research. Some of them are government funded and under direct or indirect control of it and other are autonomous and located in the private sectors. Except PIDE, which has started a PhD programme no other institute awards degrees.

As this paper studies only Economics departments in universities, the analysis of contribution of research institutes to discipline of Economics and their strength and weaknesses are not discussed here. It may, however, be noted that there is not much research and teaching collaboration between research institutes and departments. Instead, as noted by Haq and Khan ‘... there is unhealthy competition between the two for scarce resources and skills and even mutual resentment and hostility.’

**Student Teacher Ratio**
The number of departments alone does not reflect their capacity to produce high quality teaching and research, which depends on the strength of teachers in a department against the strength of registered students. In their study of eight Economics departments, Naseem and his co-authors found that during the period between 1975 to 1995, the student teacher ratio increased in most universities. They cite the examples of QAU and G. C. University, Lahore. In Quaid-i-Azam University ‘the number rose from 6.2 to 16.7 as a result of a fourfold increase in the number of students and only 50 percent increase in the number of teachers. In the G. C. University, although there has been only a moderate (12.5 percent) increase in the number of students, this
has been accompanied by a 30 percent fall in the number of teachers\(^8\). The increasing student teacher ratio can have several negative consequences for education. The most damaging one could be that the large number of students in classes of a teacher can discourage him to undertake research, improve his stock of knowledge and make it difficult for him to improve his teaching.\(^5\) A lower student teacher ratio is not necessarily an indicator of quality. The calculations in Council of Social Sciences on this issue, based on the number of students registered in nine departments of Economics\(^10\) and the number of their teachers in 1994 and 2001\(^11\) give the following results. In 1994, there were 124 teachers and 588 students enrolled in these departments giving a student teacher ratio of around five. In 2001 in the same departments, there were 802 students and 110 teachers raising the student teacher ratio to over seven.

**Degree Quality of Teachers**

Besides the student teacher ratio, degree quality of teachers also affects their capacity for teaching and research. There are two indicators for determining such quality: first, rise in the percentage of teachers with higher degrees such as PhD and; second, rise in the percentage of teachers who earned their degrees from foreign universities. Using the two indicators, the changes in the degree quality of teachers of Economics that occurred during 1963 to 2001 are examined.

According to the 1963 Handbook, there were 32 teachers in five Economics departments at that time. Out of them five (16%) had PhD degrees, no teacher had MPhil degree and the remaining 26 (81%) teachers were MAs.\(^12\) As reported in 2001 Handbook, the number of teachers in 18 departments rose to 203. Out of them, the degrees of 11 teachers are not known. The remaining 192 teachers had following degrees; 54 (27%) PhD degrees, 11(5%) MPhil degrees and 127 (63%) MA degrees. The difference in percentage points of three degree-holders in 1963 and 2001 shows an increase of 11% and 5% for PhD and MPhils and decrease of 18% for MA degree holders respectively.\(^13\) This
could be considered a positive change for improving the quality of Economics teaching in Pakistani universities.

As stated above, mere increase in the share of higher degrees is a necessary but not sufficient condition for the improvement in the discipline. An important factor in this respect would be the level of advancement of the universities from which the degrees have been acquired. Assuming that the degrees earned from universities in the West generally are of superior quality, as social sciences there are more developed, than those earned from local universities, the change in percentage of foreign degrees in relation to local degrees is examined below.

Out of 32 teachers of Economics in 1963, the source of degrees of 15 (47%) teachers is not known. Out of the remaining 17 teachers 15 (88%) had their degrees from foreign universities. In 2001 out of 203 teachers the source (whether from a local or foreign University) and level of degrees (whether they had PhD, MPhil or MA degree) of 77 is not known. Out of the remaining 126 (62%) teachers 49 (39%) had degrees from foreign universities. This suggests a decline of 49 percentage points in foreign qualified teachers of Economics.

If we examine the source of degrees of PhD teachers separately the result is somewhat different. Among the five PhD teachers in 1963, the source of degree of one (20%) teacher is not known. The remaining four (80%) had foreign degrees. Among the 54 PhD teachers in 2001, the source of degrees of 16(30%) teachers is not known. Among the remaining 38 teachers, 32 (84%) have their degrees from foreign universities and the other six from local universities. This suggests that the share of foreign PhDs did not change much over 38 years. However, given the fact that the source of degrees of a significant number of teachers for the year 2001 is not known, the trend in rise and decline of foreign qualified teachers cannot be stated with certainty. On the basis of number of teachers whose level and source of degree is known one can arrive at two conclusions. First, from 1963 to 2001 there has occurred a substantial decline in the percentage of teachers
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

trained abroad. Second, such a decline is insignificant in case of PhD degrees. Thus the general impression that the share of foreign qualified PhDs among the teachers has declined, is not correct.

With rise in international interest in the issue of women’s participation in public affairs, interest in the level of participation of women in teaching profession has also risen in Pakistan. The data about the share of women among teachers in Economics departments at different times give the following pictures. There was no female teacher among the teachers of Economics in 1963. By 2001, their number rose to 46 (23%); among them six (13%) had PhD degrees, three (6%) had MPhil degrees and 25 (54%) had MA degrees. Out of six women PhDs four had got their degrees from foreign universities. The share of female teachers of Economics in the year 2001 was understandably highest in Fatima Jinnah Women University and the lowest in AIOU and BZU.

The above described statistics show an impressive quantitative growth in the field of Economics. However, one cannot infer from it that increase in PhD and MPhil teachers has brought about a proportionate qualitative improvement in the subject and that the standard of research and education of Economics has improved. Just employing people with PhD and MPhil qualification is not sufficient to raise such standard. In the absence of faculty development programmes in the universities of Pakistan, most of the faculty with higher qualifications such as PhD becomes stale over a period of time. Young staff members with MPhil and MA/MSc do not feel motivated enough to improve their qualifications and enhance their capabilities of teaching and research. In such a situation most of the teachers end up repeating the same lectures over a period of time and do not carry out any creative research. The process makes the students dull and does not inspire them to do creative research, which is an activity that cannot be fostered through ‘carrot and stick’ tactics. Inspiration for creative research comes from the availability of intellectually sound co-researchers; congenial,
Development of Economics as a Discipline in Pakistan

conducive, enabling and inspiring environment and adequate research. Symbolic and financial incentives also play a supportive role.

So far only the supply side of higher education in Economics has been discussed. However, the extent of demand and its nature considerably affects the quality of education. As the number of sectors that employ graduates of Economics is expanding and job opportunities for economists are becoming somewhat better than graduates of other social sciences, a greater number of students seek admission in Economics, which is reflected in teacher student ratio discussed earlier. "A considerable number of these students choose to study Economics to secure jobs. When they find that their degrees do not ensure this, they understandably come to perceive their degrees to be worthless. Such a state of affairs has created alienation from serious pursuit of education by them. In any case the quest for knowledge and interest in adopting teaching and research career is only a peripheral consideration for most of them. Consequently, the pressure for improving standards of education from demand side is almost negligible.

Research Output
Besides teaching an important function of a university and its departments is to promote research and thus upgrade the level of existing knowledge. There are following four sources for finding out the quantum of research and writing on Economics carried out by Pakistani economists:
1. MPhil and PhD theses produced by different departments of universities in Pakistan.
2. Journals published by different organisations and departments of Economics of colleges and universities.
4. Articles published in various newspapers and magazines.
5. Other possible sources include unpublished reports, mimeos and articles presented at various seminars, conferences, workshops and symposia. Though they are significant sources,
but it is difficult to account for them and, therefore, have not been included in this paper.

**PhD and MPhil Theses**

Since the emergence of the country up to 2001 (54 years) Economics departments in 10 public universities have produced a total of 229 PhD and MPhil theses with an average of four theses per year. Thirty eight (17%) were produced before 1987 and 191 (83%) were completed between 1987 to 2001. The share of PhD theses out of total 229 theses is 20% and that of MPhil 80%. In 54 years the departments of Economics have produced 45 PhD theses, that is less than one PhD per year. Fifteen of them were produced before 1987 (0.4 per year) and 30 from 1987 onward (2 per year).

In these 54 years they produced 184 MPhil theses, that is, more than three MPhils per year. Out of these 184 MPhil theses 23 (13%) were completed before 1987 with an average of 0.6 per year and 161 (87%) from 1987 onward with an average of 11 per year. This data suggests that production of both PhD and MPhil theses in first 39 years (counting from 1948 to 1986) was much slower than during 15 years from 1987 to 2001.

Out of the total 45 PhD theses produced by year 2001, Peshawar University produced the largest number (16). Three universities, Islamia University, Shah Abdul Latif University and Quaid-i-Azam University produced one PhD thesis each. The other three universities, Gomal University, D. I. Khan, Balochistan University, Quetta and AIOU, Islamabad have yet to produce an MPhil thesis. Out of the total 184 MPhil theses produced by the year 2001, Quaid-i-Azam University has produced the largest number (138) and Balochistan University the smallest number (1). Punjab University, Islamia University and International Islamic University have yet to produce an MPhil thesis.

It may be significant to note that there is a gap of 24 years between the production of first PhD thesis produced in Punjab University in the year 1948 and the first MPhil theses produced
Development of Economics as a Discipline in Pakistan

in Sindh University in 1972. However after this, the number of MPhil s has risen quickly as a result of several departments of Economics starting MPhil degree programme. A significant contribution to this end has been made by Quaid-i-Azam University, Bahauddin Zakariya University, Applied Economic Research Centre of University of Karachi. They have not only developed the curriculum for MPhil degree but also related the research component of this degree to economic problems of Pakistan. There may be concerns about the methodology usually adopted in the MPhil theses and their quality, but they do help train a large number of students in conducting research and generate information on issues related to economy of Pakistan in particular and the world in general.

To identify the area of interest of 45 PhD theses from their topics, they have been placed in following categories. Eight were written on issues related to agriculture, four each on rural development and banking, three on industry and two each on trade, monetary policy, demography and labour and one each on fiscal policy, poverty, and land reforms. The remaining 13 were written on miscellaneous subjects. Obviously all these titles show a dominant interest in the applied aspect of Economics.

During the 11 years of Gen. Zia-ul-Haq rule there was considerable interest in Islamisation of social sciences particularly Economics. This interest however does not reflect in the titles of PhD theses. There are only four theses whose titles include the word ‘Islam’.17

An examination of the titles of both PhD and MPhil theses suggests that most of them exclusively deal with economic problems of Pakistan and their solutions. The number of theses contributing to economic theory, understanding of economic problems of other countries and using comparative method is very small. This further confirms that most research in the field of Economics is applied in nature.
In 54 years all the departments of Economics have produced 45 PhD theses that is less than one PhD per year. Fifteen of them were produced before 1987 (0.4 per year) and 30 from 1987 onward (2 per year). This number is highly inadequate. From this it can be concluded that the number one source for developing the discipline of Economics in Pakistan has been seriously neglected by the academicians of our country. Creative and imaginative research adding to the stock of knowledge in Economics would have been possible if concrete efforts were made to encourage the teachers of the departments of Economics of various universities to concentrate on research.

Besides the PhD and MPhil theses, books and articles in journals are two other forms of research output. ‘A number of books have been published during the last thirty years by a small number of economists of Pakistan on economic issues facing the country. These books have neither attracted much attention of professional economists nor of public and media. Surprisingly these books have not been included in the syllabi of the universities nor have they exerted much influence on the policy makers of Pakistan.

Journals
In terms of number alone there are many social science journals in Pakistan. However very few of them are outstanding and acknowledged so by international community of social scientists. Zaidi has pointed out a number of their weaknesses. They are not screened by an editorial committee. They are issued irregularly. ‘Many of them have ceased publication. Their contribution in enhancing the knowledge through debating academic issues is not very significant. They… are used to further the careers of scholars located in the host institution (of the journal), ‘ and most of them provide space to their own faculty. Some institutions have made this into an art form where almost all the articles are by the faculty of the same department or institutions.18

The first journal in the field of Economics, The Pakistan Economic Journal, came into existence when the Pakistan
Development of Economics as a Discipline in Pakistan

Economic Association (PEA) emerged in 1950. Its publication stopped when PEA became dormant during the last days of united Pakistan. It was re-started in 1973 with the revival of the Association the same year. After the first issue no other issue was published.

From early 1960s to mid 1990s a number of economic journals came into existence. Some of the better known are the following: the *Pakistan Development Review* by Pakistan Institute of Development Economics, Islamabad (Year started 1961), Pakistan Economic and Social Review by Department of Economics, University of the Punjab (Year started 1963), Pakistan Journal of Applied Economics, by Applied Economics Research Centre, University of Karachi (Year started 1982), and the Lahore Journal of Economics, by Lahore School of Economics, (Year started 1996), Economic Journal by Department of Economics, Government College University, Lahore (Year started 1967). There are a number of other economic journals, which publish material on economic issues but they are of lesser quality.

The journals listed above are of relatively better quality than most of the journals issued by the departments of other social sciences. Yet they are not fully immune from the weaknesses listed by Zaidi. The only significant exception is *Pakistan Development Review* (PDR), which according to Zaidi, is regarded as Pakistan’s best social science journal and has ‘a truly international flavour’.

From the titles of PhD theses and the articles published in PDR in the year 1985 and 2001 some conclusions about the change in issues that have attracted PhD students and professional economists contributing to PDR can be suggested. PhD theses generally were written on traditional economic issues. No shift is discernible over last 55 years. In case of articles in PDR, however, a significant change has occurred. In the four issues of PDR published in 1985 there were no articles on the topics such as debt, gender, governance and economic vision of Quaid-i-
Azam but in 2001 there were six (10 %) articles on debt, four on gender, four (7%) Economic Vision of Quaid-i-Azam and three (5%) on governance.

It was noted earlier that from among the titles of 45 PhD these only four theses contain the word ‘Islam’. They were written in 1988, 1992, 1999, and 2000. Four issues of PDR of 1985 and that of 2001 did not have any article with Islam in their title. This suggests that the interest in Islamic economics that emerged during Zia-ul-Haq’s rule affected the writers of PhD theses only marginally and it had no effect at all on the professional economists writing in PDR.

Naseem and his co-authors have raised the issue of the extent to which economists are contributing toward formal teaching and assisting the state and how much they are directly contributing to the education of intelligentsia and citizens on complex economic issues. For comparative analysis one may state that from among all the practitioners of social science disciplines, the share of economists who regularly contribute articles to newspapers and magazines is the largest.21

**Curriculum and Teaching**

The irrelevance of education to realities of the present global world and local socio-political-economic requirements pose a dilemma. Educational system with conventional curriculum and examination system is producing students who cannot take initiative and develop their capabilities to perform up to the requirements of the modern world. Conventional education produces conventional minds. Innovative ideas and new methods of imparting education and conducting analytical research are the basic requirements of development of any discipline. The curriculum of Economics in Pakistani universities only partly meets these standards. Therefore, for its development as a discipline, Economics needs not only revision of curriculum and methodology of teaching but also a change in the evaluation system of students.
From 1987 onward, curriculum for BA/BSc in Economics and MA/MSc in Economics was revised twice, i.e., once in 1996 and then in 2001. In 1996 the objectives for developing guideline for revision in the courses of BA/BSc in 1996 were: uniformity of syllabus and familiarisation of the students with the latest ideas. By 2001, these objectives remained the same except that emphasis on information technology was added.

The details of topics included in the revised scheme of studies and course outlines of 1996 and 2001 indicate that there is no significant change in marks allocated to different courses. The only exception was that in the 2001 scheme 60 marks allocated in 1996 scheme for Macro Economics and for Economic Development of Pakistan were reduced to 40 marks. There is no difference in the marks allocated to Basic Mathematics and Statistics in schemes of studies of 1996 and 2001.

There are two significant aspects of the recommendations made by the Curriculum Review Committee. First, they have not been implemented. Second most of them were not about the curriculum and its adoption and implementation but related to service structure of teachers, faculty development, medium of instruction and change in the nomenclature of degree of Master in Economics.

Giving due credit to the departments for their efforts to bring change in the improvement of educational curriculum and teaching level, one should point out that Department of Economics, Punjab University and Department of Commerce of Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan started classes of Master in Business Economics, which is a blend of core courses in Economics and other courses of accounting, finance, management, computer application, banking, marketing, etc. Along with the theoretical knowledge of Economics, this programme enables students to get basic knowledge and skills required for working in banking, industry and business. Similarly, the Economics Department of Karachi University has started a Diploma in Transport Economics, which is a subject
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

centered with the problems society is facing with the rapid urbanisation in Pakistan.

Text Books
Along with the structure of curriculum, the contents of textbooks that are used for teaching courses determine what students learn about a discipline. A considerable number of textbooks or reference books used for teaching Economics in Pakistan have been written by economists from the West. They contain theories and models that have no relevance to the socio-economic conditions of Pakistan. This is because not many Pakistani economists have written textbooks of international standards reflecting the context of economy of Pakistan. One may however add that the use of Western textbooks has its advantages too. They keep the students abreast of development of theoretical knowledge and global economy.

Development of Professional Associations
Strong and well-organised professional associations in a discipline contribute to its development by arranging seminars, workshops, lectures and symposia on various issues. Interaction among economists from various academic institutions, research organisations, NGOs, government and private sector creates an environment that can stimulate people to come up with new perspectives by benefiting from the diverse experiences of the participants. Such fora and associations of economists in Pakistan, unfortunately, have been in a most disappointing state. Pakistan Economic Association, the only national association of economists, was established in 1950. It was revived in 1973 after the separation of East Pakistan. The same year it held its annual meeting in which an inconclusive session on the state of Economics teaching in Pakistan was held. Due to lack of resource and other reasons it has not met even once after its revival. There are other associations of economists like alumni association of departments of Economics, Punjab University and Government College, Lahore but they exist on paper only and have never held their annual general meetings or any conferences.
The only association holding its regular annual general meetings and publishing its proceedings for the last seventeen years is the Pakistan Society of Development Economists (PSDE). Since its inception in 1983, PSDE by 2001 has arranged eighteen Annual General Meetings and Conferences, which have been attended by researchers and policy makers from Pakistan and abroad. Its membership includes qualified economists as well as scholars from other disciplines and has grown continuously. In the year of its establishment (1983), its membership stood at 252, which became 571 by 1994. A part of expenses of PSDE meetings are met by foreign and domestic donors.

Since its establishment PSDE is functioning under the patronage of the Pakistan Institute of Development Economics (PIDE), which has played a significant role in sustaining it both financially and professionally. This parental role of PIDE, however, has evoked criticism by a number of economists. Reviewing the history of dormant PEA and active PSDE, Haque and Khan state that ‘Pakistani Economists have been unable to create a forum that would disseminate economic thought and ideas and subject of all shades and hierarchies of the profession to peer opinion and discussion. Indeed this failure has been an important reason for the stunted development of the profession’.

Qualitative Development
Since independence, the number of universities, the number of departments of social sciences including Economics and the number of students enrolled in them has increased sharply. However, such numerical growth in social sciences has not been accompanied by qualitative improvement in them. Naseem and his co-authors find that quantitative expansion has been ‘…at the expense of quality of graduates at the higher level’.

Compared to other social science disciplines, the discipline of Economics has expanded rapidly. In the year 2001 there were 18 departments and 203 teachers in these departments. Pakistani universities have produced more economists than the specialists
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

of other social sciences individually. Economics is far more developed in terms of precision, quantification and research output.

Along with these achievements, the discipline of Economics in Pakistan shares several weaknesses of other social science disciplines in the country. As in other disciplines the interdisciplinary and multidisciplinary approach is almost absent in Economics too. Like them, its original contributions for building the discipline in terms of theory and methodology are negligible. Much of the theory and methodology is borrowed from Western countries. Most research work in Economics is application oriented. Serious research is missing from their agenda. The quality of research and teaching of Economics in universities as well as colleges is not up to international standards. Furthermore teaching and research are not integrated. Due to various reasons, the teachers are unable to engage in research. Consequently, most teachers use text book and use the research of other economists in teaching.

A number of prominent economists writing in late 1990s have confirmed most of the above weaknesses of discipline of Economics. Reviewing the state of discipline of Economics, Naseem and his two co-authors conclude that ‘…the system as a whole has failed to deliver a continuing stream of high quality research in areas of changing relevance to the economy and to provide well-trained economists to users in the government and the private sector’.  

Recently Zaidi has characterised the state of social sciences in Pakistan as dismal. Commenting on the state of Economics he has pointed out that it is hard to find a Pakistani economist ‘who has made a marked impression regionally, leave alone globally, on expansion in ideas, theory and knowledge’.

The author of this paper while writing on the discipline of Economics in mid 1980s commented that title of his paper should not be development of the discipline but non-
development of it. He feels that statement remains true even in 2003.\textsuperscript{34}

**Causes of Underdevelopment of the Discipline of Economics in Pakistan/Conclusion**

The causes of existing state of the discipline of Economics can be placed in two categories; those common to all social sciences and those that are specific to Economics. Among the specific causes the most significant one is the overemphasis on production of applied economists who can contribute to the planned process of economic development of the country and almost indifference towards the production of economists that could contribute to the development of the discipline itself. As a result as noted by Tahir and Gera: ‘Universities and colleges suffered from dire neglect while resources were channelled into building non-academic, bureaucratic institutions’ such as Planning Commission.’ Initial foreign support by several foreign donor organisations reinforced this trend. ‘Engaged in assisting Planning Commission in preparing five year plans, the Harvard Advisory Group in particular relegated theoretical and pioneering research to the back burner as well.’\textsuperscript{35}

While all social science disciplines have been affected by both internal and external drain, its impact was more serious on the discipline of Economics for several reasons. As government organisations and research institution offered better salary packages and other privileges, a considerable number of young economists chose to join them rather than university departments. Even those who joined them left whenever opportunities arose. Some economists who went abroad for training did not return.\textsuperscript{36} Economists with better research record and reputation joined international organisations such as World Bank and International Monetary Funds.
Annex I

The List of Selected Books Produced by Pakistan Economists

18. S. M. Naseem on poverty.
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

Notes

3 From the website of Punjab University http/www.pu.edu.pk/.
4 For details see ibid.
5 Most of the quantitative in this paper is taken from Inter-University Books and University Grant Commission Handbooks. For details information on the Handbooks see footnote 10 to the introductory chapter of this book.
8 Naseem, et.al., ‘Conditions of Teaching…’, op.cit., p. 456.
9 Ibid., p. 458.
10 Gomal University, Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamia University, International Islamic University, Shah Abdul Latif University, Sindh University, Peshawar University, University of the Punjab and Bahauddin Zakariya University.
11 These two years were chosen for the reason that the UGC Handbooks for these years had comparable data on students and teachers.
12 One teacher was BA.
13 Naseem, S. K. Qureshi and Rehana Siddiqui report a similar trend of increase in percentage of PhD teachers during the period 1975 and 1995 in their study. ‘The ratio of PhD staff members to total staff members in all the ten institutions has increased from 20.3 percent to 22.8 percent, indicating that only a little over a fifth of all economists in the profession have PhD degrees.’ Naseem, et.al., ‘Conditions of Teaching…’, op.cit., p. 457.
14 Peshawar University, International Islamic University, Quaid-i-Azam University, Sindh University, Karachi University, University of the Punjab,
Development of Economics as a Discipline in Pakistan

Islamia University, B. Z. University, Shah Abdul Latif University, University of Balochistan.

15 The highest number of theses (2) before 1987 were produced in 1974. During 1987 to 2001 period the highest number of theses (4) were produced each in 1995, 1998 and 1999.

16 The highest number of theses (6) before 1987 were produced in 1982. During 1987 to 2001 period the highest number of theses (22) were produced each in 2001.


19 Tahir and Gera. ‘The State of Economics …’, *op.cit.*

20 Ibid.

21 Prominent among them are Shahid Javed Burki, Pervez Tahir, Mehnaz Fatima, Qaiser Bengali, Shahid Kardar, Akbar Zaidi, Saqib Sheerani, and Ashfaque Hasan Khan.


23 Ibid.


27 Ibid.


31 Haque and Khan, ‘The Economics Profession…’, *op.cit.*


35 Tahir and Gera, ‘The State of Economics…’, *op.cit.*

36 Ibid., p. 78.
Sociology in Pakistan: A Review of Progress∗

Muhamamd Hafeez

Introduction
Sociology as a social science deals with social relations, institutions and human life in-groups. The application of Sociology is important for explaining social phenomena and bringing about positive social change in society. ‘The type of Sociology that prevailed would influence the shape of society itself’ says Crooks.¹

According to Feagin² ‘sociologists should engage in the study of alternative social futures…and aid in building better societies’. In this context, Sociology in Pakistan should have influenced the shape of society, which for various reasons it did not. In a developing country like Pakistan, Sociology has to play an important role towards the progress of society and this discipline must get in the driving seat to steer the society towards emancipation and development. The principle of ‘utopian

∗ The author gratefully acknowledges the benefit of using the framework provided by COSS in preparing this paper. He is also grateful to both Prof. Dr. Muhammad Anwar, Former Chairman, Department of Sociology, University of the Punjab, Lahore and to Dr. Hassan Nawaz Gardezi for reading and commenting on the first draft of this paper. The author also acknowledges his debt to Mr. Amjad Javed, Lecturer, Department of Sociology, Government College University, Lahore for his contribution to the first draft of this paper.
realism must become vibrant to guide the society towards positive social change.

Sociological understanding of issues can help address them in a sustainable way and a country can look forward to long-term approaches to development. In this paper, it is argued that Sociology did not play its envisaged role towards progress in Pakistani society. It is however noted that the number of students taking Sociology in their degree programmes has increased in many parts of the country, but has remained shy of leaving any influence on socio-economic issues or social policy.

The recent literature shows that the social sciences (including Sociology) did not develop adequately in Pakistan, especially during the last three decades. The claim seems valid, as social science disciplines could not meaningfully contribute towards the ‘good’ of society. Sociology seems to have grown to some extent over the last two to three decades, but this quantitative growth had limited influence towards improving society. However, the ‘development of Sociology’ should not be viewed in isolation from the processes of overall socio-economic development. The growth of Sociology must be evaluated within the purview of the country’s overall socio-cultural and economic progress. In other words, the development of the social sciences (including Sociology) depends upon the overall socio-economic conditions in the country.

In a generally constraining context, Sociology did not flourish well (from both the academic and applied perspectives) in Pakistan. In part, the reason for the inadequate growth of social sciences may be found in the ethnocentrism of social sciences in Pakistan. Islamic history presents a particular example in this regard. Similar arguments can be put forward about the theoretical discourse of the other social sciences as well.

**Roots of Sociology**

Auguste Comte first introduced the subject of Sociology in France in 1838, when he coined the word *Sociology*. In Europe, the subject was not recognised as an independent discipline of
Sociology in Pakistan: A Review of Progress

Sociology as an independent subject of study (at postgraduate level) in Pakistan was initiated in 1955 through the establishment of a Sociology Department at the Punjab University, Lahore. Another such department was established at Dacca University, East Pakistan (now Bangladesh) in 1957. These two Sociology departments were established with active help from Washington State University, USA and UNESCO respectively. In 1960, the department of Sociology was established at Karachi University, followed by the opening of another such department in 1961 at the University of Agriculture, Faisalabad. In 1963, Pierre Bessaugnet (the then Director UNESCO Research Centre on Social and Economic Development in South Asia) acknowledged the satisfactory development of Sociology by reporting its progress during its early years in Pakistan. Since then, several departments of Sociology have been established at University of Balochistan, Quetta (1972), Peshawar (1982), Sindh, Jamshoro (1969), Agriculture, Tando Jam (1991), and Bahauddin Zakariya, Multan (2002). The Department of Sociology, Social Work, and Population Studies has also been established at Allama Iqbal Open University, Islamabad in 2001. In the light of the early American role in establishing Sociology departments in Pakistani universities, Sociology was greatly
Influenced by the American academy and this influence persists even today.

Historically, sociological works have not been pursued only by sociologists. Sociological projects have been taken up by philosophers, economists, and thinkers from diverse disciplines. Ibn-e-Khaldun is generally credited for his sociological writings in 14th century, although ‘Sociology’ as an independent discipline of study did not exist at that time. The subject, as it is known today, has developed mainly in the Western world within the context of its indigenous thinking. Unfortunately, in Pakistan, the discipline of Sociology has always been considered a Western subject and appears to have been detached from indigenous intellectual leanings. Pakistani intellectuals, in general, did not have rigorous training in empirical or scientific methodology, and had not contextualised their work within pertinent sociological paradigms. In this context, there is a great need to analyse these indigenous contributions to sociological paradigms, recognise them as sociological works, and acknowledge them accordingly.

Growth of Sociology in Pakistan
In quantitative terms, Sociology has flourished in Pakistani universities between the 1950s and the 1970s. The 1980s and the 1990s witnessed a lull and did not show any significant growth. During the last three years, however, two new departments of Sociology have been established at Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan and Allama Iqbal Open University Islamabad. The total number of students studying Sociology at under-graduate and Postgraduate levels has increased significantly. In essence, Sociology as a discipline of study in Pakistani educational institutions has started growing in the recent past. However, it has remained short of influencing society and social policy positively.

The subject of Sociology has experienced some growth in colleges recently. At the Intermediate level, class-size in some colleges has reached 200, for example at Government College.
Sociology in Pakistan: A Review of Progress

for Women, Samanabad, Lahore and Government College for Men at Sheikhupura. The discipline has been introduced at the BA level in APWA College, Lahore during the year 2002. Only two colleges (one each for men and women) of Lahore offered Sociology at the BA level over the last couple of decades. The College of Home Economics also offered Sociology courses in its academic programmes. In the Department of City and Regional Planning at the University of Engineering and Technology, this subject has been taught at the graduate level. The School of Nursing, School of Physiotherapy, and the National College of Arts (all at Lahore) offer courses in Sociology to their students at different levels of their training. The numbers of students in different tertiary level institutions has increased significantly. Evening or afternoon degree programmes have been launched in various departments of Sociology (Punjab University is an example). Annex I shows the numbers of students and MA theses at the departments of Sociology by selected years at various universities across Pakistan. The data shows that the numbers of students have substantially increased in all the universities for which information was available. It is worth noting that the proportion of female students has increased more than their male counterparts. However, the number of theses has not increased in proportion to the increase in numbers of students due to it being an optional, or because it is a group exercise in certain departments.

Since 1985, the subject has found its way into the curricula of some private educational institutions. A relatively larger number of private colleges are undertaking Sociology at the under and Postgraduate teaching/training programmes. The Punjab College of Business Administration (PCBA), Lahore Grammar School (LGS), Lahore School of Economics (LSE), University College Lahore (UCL), and some other such institutions are offering courses in Sociology. It appears that relatively larger numbers of students are taking Sociology at under-graduate and graduate level programmes.
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

Sociologists are being employed in both public and private organisations. Their proportion of employment in the NGO sector is particularly significant. The National Rural Support Programme (NRSP), Aga Khan Rural Support Programme (AKRSP), and Family Planning Association of Pakistan (FPAP) are the prominent among employers of students of Sociology. The input of sociologists in the areas of human resource development is being recognised increasingly. They serve in several educational and training institutions.

It may, however, be noted that Sociology courses are not being uniformly offered in many institutions. The subject seems to be offered as an optional one and may or may not be available as a ‘choice’ in subsequent years. This is probably due to (i) a lack of commitment to the subject; (ii) non-regularity in the offering of the pertinent education/training programmes; or (iii) the non-availability of appropriately qualified teachers. The prestigious Lahore University of Management Sciences has recently started a Bachelor of Social Sciences Programme and hired a sociologist on its faculty. In other words, the significance of the subject appears to be slowly recognised by the academia, the public, and the job market.

Although it does not relate to Sociology directly but the virtual closing down of the Social Sciences Research Centre (SSRC) at the Punjab University in year 2000 shows a disparaging attitude of the government towards the social sciences. This Centre was established to promote social research in the 1960s and remained functional for about four decades, but was increasingly ignored by the University Administration. It remained ineffective in making a significant contribution towards research except during the initial few years of the Centre. The demise of the Centre shows that the government did not duly value the contribution of social sciences and had tacitly acquiesced in the closing down of the Centre. At one time (year 2000), the merger of Sociology and social work departments was also proposed by the Punjab University, but the work on such a proposal was not encouraged by the faculties. Although the merger did not take place, such a
Sociology in Pakistan: A Review of Progress

proposal indicates the negative attitude of some people in the
government towards Sociology and social science disciplines. Rather than endeavouring to resolve the problems of social science departments, the authorities wished to downsize these important institutions of learning and agents of positive social change.

A part of the reason for the diminished growth of Sociology (between the 1970s and the 1990s) may be attributed to a narrow view about Sociology ‘as a particular perspective’ on human behaviour, rather than a ‘distinct subject area’ of study. The subject remains descriptive in nature and did not duly advance sociological theories/thinking to explain human and social phenomena in Pakistan. The subject in Pakistan seems not to have grown in theoretical terms, and its epistemological contribution has remained limited. Sociology did not become reflexive and self-critical. Sociology claims to have the necessary potential to create awareness about the sources of subjectivity and human action, but could not address various forms of disharmony. The country remains fragmented politically, racially, religiously, and ethnically, but Sociology has not adequately addressed these issues. The divisions on the basis of religious sect and caste have swelled over the last two decades, which shows the little role this subject has played in addressing this important social problem/phenomenon.

Due to a low priority given to developing indigenous sociological explanations about emerging social phenomena by the faculties of Sociology at most universities in Pakistan, which is evident from the fact that very few theoretical research papers or MA/PhD theses had been produced during the last two decades, there was emulation of existing ideas and theories from within the subject or from other allied disciplines. The subject failed to make any meaningful original contribution to the existing body of knowledge. A review of theses written at MPhil/PhD degree level shows that very few of them were theoretical in nature. It appears that a large proportion of them
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

were prepared to acquire basic research skills, rather than towards producing new knowledge.

Thesis writing at the Master level was made optional or compulsory at different times in the different departments of Sociology. It has also become a group exercise. Group thesis is written in some departments, for example Sociology Department at Punjab University. Although these ups and downs in the discipline have partially been politically motivated, such an attitude towards thesis-work has undermined its importance and contribution. In the same context, the departments of Sociology across Pakistan were shy of providing opportunities for specialisation within the subject areas as well. Specialisation in Rural Sociology and Criminology had earlier been available at two or three universities in Pakistan.

Table 1: The Number of Sociology Departments with the Qualifications of Teachers and their Degrees (foreign or local) in Years, 1963, 1987 and 2001 in Public Universities of Pakistan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Departments (Count)</th>
<th>Teachers (Count)</th>
<th>PhD (Foreign)</th>
<th>PhD (Local)</th>
<th>MPhil (Foreign)</th>
<th>MPhil (Local)</th>
<th>MA, MSc (Foreign)</th>
<th>MA, MSc (Local)</th>
<th>MA, MSc (Location not known)</th>
<th>MA, MSc (Location not known)</th>
<th>Degrees not known</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1963</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1987</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>53</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Council of Social Sciences (COSS) unpublished, data.
*The figure includes one teacher whose location of doing PhD was not known.

Table 1 shows the number of Sociology departments by qualifications of teachers and the location of their degrees
Sociology in Pakistan: A Review of Progress

The data show that there were only three university departments of Sociology in 1963. Their number increased to six in 1987 and now there are eight of them functioning in various parts of the country. This may sound impressive, but the proportionate growth of Sociology departments in relation to the overall increase of Sociology teachers remains low. As a result, the number of Sociology teachers saw a modest increase of only 09 (from 44 in 1987 to 53 in 2001). This is cause for concern because for three new departments, only nine teachers were added to the total number. Also, the student-teacher ratio has worsened greatly and has affected the quality of education adversely. The teachers with foreign PhD degrees remained low (three in 1987 and seven in 2001). This is a tiny improvement but for an increased number of departments (i.e., eight), this development loses significance. The increase of local PhDs also remained low (from two to four) between 1987 and 2001. These data suggest that Sociology has grown (to some extent) quantitatively but nonetheless failed to improve qualitatively.

Table 2: Number of MPhil and PhD Degrees in Sociology Awarded by Five Universities in Pakistan by 2001

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>MPhil</th>
<th>PhD</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>University of Karachi</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University of Sindh</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University of the Punjab</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University of Balochistan</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University of Agriculture</td>
<td>—</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>03</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Council of Social Sciences, Islamabad.

The number of theses produced in Sociology has declined between 1985 and 2003 substantially at Punjab University (from 33 theses in 1985 to only 18 theses in 2003). The severity of deterioration intensifies when viewed in the context of growth in the number of students. This has happened due to the provision of group-thesis in recent years. The group-thesis option was necessitated due to individual scholastic weaknesses of students, and partly due to the continuing shortage of faculty in the department. The number of theses at the University of
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

Agriculture, Faisalabad has substantially increased in 2003. This probably has happened due to the students’ individual thesis work and also the launching of a second MA programme in Sociology, in addition to the regular Rural Sociology programmes. The quantitative growth of Sociology is evident from the fact that there were only 11 students in this department of Sociology in 1985 compared with 192 students in 2003.

A quick glance at the thesis topics reported by various universities indicates that out of a total of 28 theses, 16 (approximately 57 per cent) were related to topics covering some aspect of Pakistani society and culture. A total of 10 topics (35 per cent) were of a theoretical nature, and the remaining two (7 per cent) theses were on other countries, one based on Japan and another on the Philippines. There were no theses based on comparative research. The concern within Sociology seems to centre on Pakistani issues such as faith healing, family systems, literacy, urbanisation, health, crime and population growth. A few of the theses were historical, such as the life and work of Shah Wali Ullah. It is hard to determine the quality of the theses from a mere glance at the topics. But it may be said that there does not seem to be any significant addition to knowledge or the creation of new knowledge. In most cases, where a thesis appears to be theoretical, it seems that some existing theory has been applied and its validity tested in the Pakistani context.

Syllabi
The change in syllabi is an important indicator of academic development in any discipline of study. Sociology programmes in various universities in Pakistan have experienced several changes in their respective syllabi. New courses have been incorporated in some Sociology departments and several new programmes, like those in criminology and demography, have also been established. However, the focus of teaching programmes in universities remains on teaching the fundamental topics of the subject. The programmes remained aloof from changes in the field, and also failed to incorporate indigenous problems of society/social inquiry.
Outside the academic world, sociological insights on Pakistani society and culture have been contributed by many indigenous literary writers and intellectuals. Ashfaq Ahmad, Bano Qudsia, Ahmad Nadeem Qasmi, Amjad Islam Amjad, and Ata ul Haq Qasmi are among the prominent scholars who have made significant sociological contributions in the form of books or TV productions. Jamil Jalbi, Muhammad Ahmad Sabzwari, and Syed Muhammad Ikram have also produced literature in the field of Sociology in the Urdu language. No doubt, these sociological works are not generally written with methodological rigour, they nevertheless appear to have influence on our society. In other words, these are examples of sociological contributions through the medium of literature, outside the professional academic institutions in Pakistan. Some of these literary papers or books could become a part of the syllabi in academic institutions.

The Macro-environment and Sociology
Unbridled capitalism, especially in late 1980s, has greatly influenced social values and structures in almost all societies around the globe and Pakistan is no exception. The growing commodification of relationships has devalued traditional ‘social values’ and has weakened social structures. In turn, these influences of capitalism, and the resulting over emphasis on Economics (at least in a transitional society like Pakistan) have lessened the value of the other social sciences. Emerging ‘utilitarian cultures’ have weakened Sociology in Western countries, and Pakistani society has been influenced in the same direction. Accordingly, there is increasing State patronage of Business and Commercial activities, including the support of pertinent academic developments in the areas of commerce, trade, and business. Many business schools have been opened during the last couple of decades all over Pakistan. A cursory look around large cities across the country shows a mushroom growth of business and information technology schools. Due to low commercial importance and market value of training in social sciences/sociology, few private academic institutions offer
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

social sciences/Sociology as a programme of study. For example, the Lahore University of Management Sciences (LUMS) has recently started a BA (Hons.) in Social Sciences as well as a Master degree in Economics. The Lahore School of Economics (LSE) also offers a degree programme in the Social Sciences, with Sociology as a subject of study. There are a few instances where Sociology seems to have grown. On the other hand, there are dozens of other private institutions in Lahore that do not offer Sociology as a subject of study in their programmes.

Role of the Government
The national and provincial governments in Pakistan did not pay due attention to the social sciences because of budgetary constraints. The resources allocated for the promotion of social sciences either did not increase, or proportionately declined over time. This has happened due to the growing economic pressures on different governments to spend more money on current and recurring expenditures, rather than on the promotion of social sciences, like Sociology. In general, social sector development did not receive due attention from the government and partly for this reason, the Human Development Index for Pakistan remains low as compared to that for many regional and other countries comparable in terms of per capita income. It may be mentioned here that soft or social sciences are always developed with the active help from state agencies and governments. Abraham Lincoln, the late President of the USA is credited towards the popularity of Sociology in the United States.13

Education in general had not been a high priority for various governments in this country. Feudalism continues to dominate politics and governance, and higher education is occasionally perceived to be subversive for feudalism. All the governments allocated meagre resources towards education. Accordingly, education has suffered as a whole and the development of social sciences, including Sociology, did not progress adequately.

Sociology as a ‘discipline’ and Sociology departments as ‘entities’ did not seem to have the required professional
interaction with various government departments like the Ministries of Planning and Development, Social Welfare and Women Development, Communication and Education. Sociology could greatly contribute towards their planning for developing Pakistani society. It may be mentioned, however, that some evaluative research projects for these agencies were conducted by sociologists. The collective and synergic contributions of these few projects seem to be insignificant, as the policies of these agencies remain divorced from sociological influence. Similarly, the discipline did not have a significant intellectual and professional liaison with pertinent NGOs. However, several sociologists had been working closely with some of the NGOs towards mobilising and developing local communities.

Growing conservatism and religiosity in Pakistan may have also contributed, although modestly, towards constraining the growth of social sciences/Sociology. It is sometimes mistakenly believed that social sciences promote liberalism and xenocentrism. In this context, the conservative religio-political forces seem to have contributed towards the restrained promotion of social sciences in Pakistan. It is worthy of mention that during the year 2002, the NWFP government abolished the teaching of social science subjects in its institutions. Later on, the Council of Social Sciences (COSS) raised this issue with the concerned government departments and the decision was withdrawn.

Continuing low numbers of faculty members across most of the Sociology departments in various universities, is an important factor of qualitative decline of Sociology in the country. For example, for a student body of over 300 full-time students in 2003, only six full-time faculty members were available at the Department of Sociology, University of the Punjab. The similar lack of properly trained faculty had been the hallmark of this department over the last several decades. There had been shortage of faculty members at some Sociology departments, which contributed towards the low quality of teaching and research. It may however be noted that the proportion of female
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

faculty has been growing, mostly at the cost of male faculty members. The continuing low numbers of faculty members in Sociology departments remain a major concern for Sociology and sociologists.

The departments of Sociology have experienced difficulties in terms of growth and development. Depending upon the attitude of individual faculty members, the discipline either got promoted or declined (due to their individual preferences and contributions). However, the low numbers of the faculty in Sociology departments remained an important reason (at least in the Punjab) for arresting the qualitative improvement of Sociology. Moreover, many foreign qualified faculty members could not stay in their parent Sociology departments and preferred to work in Western countries. This has been due to both ‘push factors’ within Pakistan and ‘pull factors’ prevailing in the Western countries.14

Usefulness of Sociology

It may be acknowledged that Sociology has been extensively used in evaluating the efficacy of various development interventions in the country. This is due to the fact that Sociology emphasises training in the area of social research, and the subject maintains an edge over other social science disciplines regarding rigorous training in research methodology.

The subject of Sociology appears to have been fairly successful in explaining social phenomena in societies around the world. The very subject matter of Sociology focusses on the significance of peoples’ subjective feelings and collective interactions. The only social reality for people is the one in which they believe. Accordingly, perception is more important than reality because peoples’ behaviours are based on perceptions (perceived realities), not merely on ‘sensual realities’. The subject of Sociology has ample potential to apply its principles to explain several phenomena that exist universally, but its strength remains in explaining the subjectivity of people in local cultural systems. This strength of Sociology has not been
properly put to use in Pakistan, except that several NGOs are now using the potentialities of this discipline to mobilise and develop local communities (NRSP, PRSP, Bunyad, CARE, Greenstar, etc., are examples). Another indicator of the development of any social science discipline relates to its active and ongoing interaction with other disciplines. In this context, the subject was not provided opportunities to interact with other disciplines. It may be acknowledged that the ongoing interaction between Sociology and Development Agencies remains an important contribution of Sociology. The dynamic link between Sociology and economic development is good for the country. However, the low contribution of Sociology towards social development of the country is due to the overall low status of social sciences in Pakistan.\(^\text{15}\)

When an intellectual discipline starts contributing towards the development of a society, it becomes relevant for people and the country. The subject of Sociology can be used for development planning. Pakistani society is plagued by socio-economic problems like corruption, inefficiency, poverty, illiteracy, crime, etc., and Sociology can be used to help address such social problems in the country.\(^\text{16}\) The practical utility of Sociology remains weak, and the discipline could be put to good use towards resolving social and economic problems faced by people of Pakistan.\(^\text{17}\) The historical roots of Sociology lie in addressing the issues about social injustice.\(^\text{18}\) In the context of pervasive injustice in the country and around the world, Sociology should play its due role to mitigate injustice from societies. Accordingly, it is the responsibility of sociologists to contribute ‘meaningfully to social policies that can promote social equality’.\(^\text{19}\)

The faculties in different Sociology departments across various universities in the country remain detached and fragmented. There is little contact and virtually no active cooperation among them individually or institutionally. This is a serious factor in the weakness of Sociology and must be addressed through active and ongoing cooperation. It may be noted that in a recent
evaluative research project, the faculties in Sociology departments at Karachi, Peshawar, and Balochistan universities cooperated with the one at the Punjab University and completed the project successfully. In other words, cooperation and support among various departments of Sociology is possible and such opportunities must be created in the future. The Pakistan Sociological Association should provide an effective forum to help collaborate among Sociology departments and also to promote Sociology as a discipline of study. Some Sociology departments have organised seminars and conferences in their respective universities. A population conference was organised at Punjab University in year 2002, and another such conference was organised at the University of Agriculture, Faisalabad in December 2003. The Department of Sociology at Punjab University organised a series of seminars within its premises. Justice A. S. Salam, Ashfaq Ahmad, Aitzaz Ahsan, and Shaheen Attiq-ur-Rehman, Muhammad Nizamuddin were among the invited speakers.

Conclusions
Sociology can have a bright future in this country as it retains the necessary potential to advance appropriate understanding of local and regional social phenomena. The discipline can better explain the complexities of society and help formulate prudent policies to bring about positive social change in the country at the local, regional, and national levels.

It is dissatisfying that Sociology (as an academic subject of teaching) could not play its due role towards the development of society. This is a cause of concern to all sociologists in Pakistan and abroad. Measures need to be taken to address this important issue. It may however be acknowledged that this subject had been contributing towards the good of society by providing sociological training to some students at under-graduate and graduate levels across the country. Thesis work at graduate level has traditionally emphasised imparting research skills only, rather than discovering
Sociology in Pakistan: A Review of Progress

explanations for various social phenomena, which is an important weakness in our Sociology programmes.

Due to a lack of indigenous theorising, the subject continues to retain the image of a Western discipline and has not been able to develop roots in Pakistani culture and politics.

The faculty is overburdened due to an increase in the number of students. Moreover, evening/afternoon replica programmes have also burdened the continuing small-sized faculty across most of the Sociology departments. Such an over-worked faculty is hard pressed for time and, as a result, output suffers. It may be noted that replica programmes were necessitated due to financial constraints on account of the poor salary structure of teachers and staff, and also due to the lack of budgetary allocations to Sociology departments. In other words, lack of funding remains a major issue regarding the improvement of Sociology as an academic discipline, both qualitatively and quantitatively.

Recommendations

Lack of the quality of social research about local and regional social issues had been a major weakness of the discipline. This should be addressed by launching various research programmes across all the departments of Sociology, possibly with the help of the Higher Education Commission, Islamabad. There should be specialised Data Banks (region or specialisation based) located in all the Sociology departments at various universities.

Sociologists should focus on theoretical frameworks that are more relevant to the social and cultural realities of Pakistan. This would have a significant impact on popularising this subject among intellectuals and the public. It will also dispel its image of being a purely Western subject.

Thesis writing for producing knowledge should also be emphasised. The exercise should not focus only on imparting research skills, although these are important, but also attempt to explain various social issues that beset our society.
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

Sociologists across Pakistan should publish analyses of local social issues in national and international publications. Such work would develop understanding of our problems within the country and across international borders.

To promote the significance and contribution of Sociology, a research journal dedicated to the publication of sociological literature should be launched. It should focus on indigenous issues and offer debates from various angles and insights.

The number of faculty members in various Sociology departments has been traditionally low. This has a tremendous impact on teaching and research potential in the discipline. The number of faculty members in respective Sociology departments must increase. Moreover, the quality of training should also improve through the provision of opportunities for learning. There should be intensive collaboration among the departments for research and Pakistani sociologists preparing policy for development.

Several sociologists are studying and/or working in foreign countries. They are a good resource and policies must be formed to provide incentives to work in Pakistani academic institutions.

There should be constant interaction between Sociology departments and various government agencies like the ministries of Planning and Development, Social Welfare and Women Development, Communication, and Education. Sociology can greatly contribute towards their work for the overall development of Pakistan. The discipline could also continue to liaise with NGOs for their developmental work in local communities.

To enhance the share of job market for sociologists, extensive internship programmes must be launched to impart practical training to students, and also to apprise them about the potential of Sociology training. This should be organised with the
cooperation of the government, non-government, and private organisations. It should, however, be emphasised that the Sociology departments should make efforts to improve their training programmes according to the changing social and economic needs of the country. The needs should be analysed from the standpoints of both ‘market’ and ‘social benefit’. It is an important balance that must be kept in mind while modifying education/training programmes.

Thesis writing should be an important means of training in doing sociological research and producing original insights into social phenomena.

The discipline of Sociology renders important services to evaluate and monitor development programmes launched by various government and non-government agencies. Sociology should continue its contribution towards evaluative research and this can be expanded in the future.
Annex I

Number of Students and their MA theses at the Departments of Sociology in selected years at various universities across Pakistan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>University</th>
<th>Number of Students</th>
<th>Total number of MA Theses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>University of the Punjab, Lahore</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University of Agriculture, Faisalabad</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University of Balochistan, Quetta</td>
<td>125</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University of Sindh, Jamshoro</td>
<td>83</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Chairpersons, Respective departments of Sociology at Various Universities. A questionnaire for data collection was sent to all the Sociology departments located at nine universities in Pakistan but only four of them returned the filled questionnaires.

M = Male, F = Female, n/a = Not available
Sociology in Pakistan: A Review of Progress

Notes

7 Inayatullah, ‘Social Sciences in Pakistan…’, op.cit.
8 Funk and Wagnalls, Funk and Wagnalls Encyclopaedia, (Funk and Wagnalls, Chicago, n.d.).
11 About 2-5 students were allowed to write thesis as a joint effort. It was necessitated due to lack of faculty resources and also due to the declining ability of students to produce good quality theses.
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

14 Dr. Hassan Nawaz Gardezi, Dr. Muhammad Fayyaz, S. P. Wakiil, Dr. Abdul Rauf, Dr. C. M. Siddique, and Dr. Riaz Hassan are among several others who chose to emigrate to North America and Australia and continue to work there. These sociologists living in foreign countries had been visiting their alma mater once in a while and have made some contribution towards the growth of their parent Sociology departments, but these contributions had remained insignificant in totality, and their impact on the growth of Sociology had been minimal in Pakistan.
15 Hashmi (ed.), *The State of Social..., op.cit.*
16 Sabeeha Hafeez, ‘Development of Sociology as a Discipline in Pakistan’, in Hashmi (ed.), *The State of Social..., op.cit.*
Anthropology in Pakistan: The State of Discipline

Nadeem Omar Tarar

This paper begins by briefly mapping past and current trends in Western Anthropology, which provides historical and theoretical context to understand the disciplinary formations of Anthropology in Pakistan. It aims to sketch the career of a relatively younger discipline in the field of social sciences in Pakistani universities by charting the history and growth of the Department of Anthropology at the Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad. While describing and analysing the main research trends in Anthropology in Pakistan, with faculty and students of Quaid-i-Azam University at the centre stage, some remarks are offered in the conclusion to the future of the discipline in Pakistan.

Anthropology As a Discipline: A Thumbnail Sketch

Anthropology as an academic discipline begins its career in the Western universities in the early decades of twentieth century.

*‘The first draft of Mr. Omar’s paper was received by the Council of Social Sciences, Pakistan (COSS) on July 16, 2003, exactly five months before the presentation of a paper by Dr. Hafeez-ur-Rehman on December 16, 2003 in a conference on State of Social Sciences and Humanities held in Islamabad on December 15-17, 2003 and its later publication in the Proceedings of the Conference in 2004. The editors are satisfied about the originality of Mr. Omar’s paper.’
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

However, different kinds of historical narratives like traveller’s tales, missionaries’ accounts, and colonial archive formed the empirical basis of nineteenth century Anthropology.\(^1\) In British India, colonial officials, missionaries, and Orientalist scholars developed land revenue histories, district gazetteers, census and surveys of India’s natural resources and social and cultural features, as part of administrative control over unknown territory.\(^2\) Long before a system of Western education in social sciences was put in place in Punjab,\(^3\) the colonial administrators, teachers, like Baden Powell (1841-1901), Denzil Ibbeston (1847-1903), Richard Temple (1826-1902), William Crooke, G. W. Leitner and Lockwood Kipling (1837-1911) represented a crop of colonial anthropologists who were responsible for the production and organisation of knowledge about colonial Punjab, which formed the empirical basis of present Pakistani national identity.\(^4\) However, for them, the official knowledge of Indian social and economic life was a necessary instrument of control and domination as noted by Sir Denzil Ibbeston, first official ethnographer of British Punjab.\(^5\)

Compared with knowledge that colonial administrators gathered, not much research on customs and beliefs of our people has been done by Pakistani scholars. The general ignorance of the customs and beliefs of the people among whom we dwell is surely, in some respects, a reproach to us. This ignorance not only deprives European science of the material it greatly needs to further develop, but it also weakens state’s administrative power to govern intelligently.

The colonial ethnographic knowledge of India, provided nineteenth century Anthropology, ‘the European science’, the raw material for its evolutionary theories, as characterised by British anthropologists, E. B. Taylor (1832-1917) and L. H. Morgan (1818-1881), who attempted to discover an evolutionary theory of human cultures which would have universal appeal. The task of modern Anthropology was ‘to trace the different stages of this development, and to use observations of “savage” and “barbarian” peoples as evidence for what the earlier stages
Anthropology in Pakistan: The State of Discipline

of human history had been’. As a result, non-Western people were constructed as the relics of the past, as living fossils in the museum of evolutionary history of mankind. Baden Powell’s work on *Land Systems of British India*, Risley’s *The People of India*, George Grierson’s work on *Linguistic Survey of India* (1894), Denzil Ibbeston’s work on *Castes and Tribes of Punjab*, were part of late nineteenth century Anthropology discourses that defined the historical essence of Indian society in terms of village community, caste system, and oriental despotism. Every major current in social theory in the nineteenth century, from English political economists, utilitarians, French positivists and philosophers such as Hegel, Marx and Weber located India on the line scale of universal human development.

In the early twentieth century, the quasi-anthropological formulations of the stages of unilinear cultural evolutions were increasingly challenged and superseded by the emergence of the historicist and diffusionist theories. Franz Boaz (1858-1942), an American anthropologist advocated a historical particularistic approach to the study of non-Western societies. In the wake of strong critiques of the diffusionist school on the empirical inadequacy of evolutionary schemes, the emphasis on classifying societies according to their stages of social development dropped out of the Anthropology in the first quarter of twentieth century. From 1930s on, the writing of ethnography was increasingly informed by the functionalism developed in England under Bronislaw Malinowski and Redcliffe Brown. Functionalism was couched in the language of objective investigation, and the role of investigator was eliminated in the production of knowledge. The rise of French post-structuralism in 1960-70 broke the impasse of increasingly rigid scholastic typological debates and gave rise to the interpretative Anthropology. The development of Anthropology as cultural critique has led to the intersections of History, Anthropology and Cultural Studies in the Western academy.
Anthropology at Quaid-i-Azam University (1975-2003)

The discipline of Anthropology that started its career in the Pakistani universities in the late 1970s is heir to the colonial ethnography of the British period, as well as to the modernising narratives of Pakistani state nationalism and is firmly committed to the avowed goal of social change and modernization. Instead of challenging colonial discourses of anthropological essentialisms, the imperatives of the colonial modernity re-emerged as post-colonial narratives of national progress, where the passing of ‘traditional society’ becomes symptomatic to the rise of modern nation state. The adoption of the five year planning model, based on urban and rural development, led to large-scale, state driven transformation of urban and rural societies. This was in keeping with the dominant orientation of 1950s and 1960s in Anthropology; the structural functionalist theories of modernization which continue to inform the contemporary research and teaching in Anthropology in Pakistan. As spelled out in the introductory brochure of the Department of Anthropology, Quaid-i-Azam University (then Islamabad University) the task of the Department is to produce ‘colonial administrator’ of a national order.

The training imparted in the Department, enables the students to contribute effectively towards the planning and implementation of development programmes, and provided them an objective understanding of social problems, problems of national and local administration and all human issues, relating to social and cultural dimensions.

The Department of Anthropology grew from a Postgraduate course on ‘Introduction to Anthropology’ in the faculty of social sciences for the students of history. The course was intended to ‘acquaint the students of history with the theories of Anthropology, particularly the meaning of culture, the relationship of culture and society, social structure, the role of the individual in society, the concepts of progress, integration, diffusion, acculturation, migration, family, tribe, race and nation’.
However, the impetus to establish a Department of Anthropology at the Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad, appears to be the result of an archaeological and ethnological research expeditions in Northern Areas, supported by the University of Heidelberg, Germany in 1970. The Pak-German Study Group for Anthropological Research in the Northern Areas and Culture Area Karakorum were two major programmes supported through German institutions. Karl Jetmar, the Head of the Department of Anthropology at the South Asia Institute of Heidelberg University and Prof. Ahmad Hasan Dani partners in research in Northern Areas collaborated to raise a ‘full fledged Department of Anthropology with a view to doing full justice to the rich ethnological material available in the country’. George Fifer, a German Professor on the team and who would return to teach at the Department again in 1991-1992, was entrusted the task to devise an outline of courses and prepare other pedagogical material, until a Pakistani chair of the Department was identified.

In January 1975, a first batch of five students was admitted and the teaching began in earnest. Meanwhile two American anthropologists, Dr. Douglas Mary and Dr. Karen Mary came to teach at the Department under the Fulbright Scheme. However, the search for appropriate chair of the Department who could ‘design the future goals and objectives of the instructional programme’, was launched. Dr. Muhammad A. Rauf was selected the first chairperson of the Department. Dr. M. A. Rauf, a graduate of University of Lucknow and Ohio State University, also taught at Kent University, and California State University. The orientation of the Department began to take shape under Dr. Rauf as a founding Pakistani chair. He had done fieldwork in Africa and authored an ethnographic study of Indian Society in Guyana.

Under the sixth five-year plan, government of Pakistan initiated large-scale rural development projects and the Department gravitated towards Applied Anthropology. The participation of
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

the Department under Dr. Rauf, in the rural development projects including *Rural Electrification in Pakistan: A socio-economic Impact Study* in 1979, and *Hazara Forestry: Pre-Investment Task Force* strengthened the ties between Sociology and Anthropology in Pakistan. One of the sociological conference was hosted by the Department of Anthropology at QAU in 1982 with Dr. Rauf as the Chairman of the Sociological Association. The participation in international funded development projects brought prosperity to the department. The Ford Foundation, in addition to quarter of million rupees for research in 1977-78, provided a vehicle for fieldwork (which to-date still remains to be the only official vehicle of the Department). In those years, students received remunerations for fieldwork, which were twice the pay of a gazetted officer in grades 17. Asia Foundation denoted books to the department library.

In the first decade of its inauguration, the Department of Anthropology was shaped by the presence of a large number of German and American anthropologists, who have been on the visiting faculty of the Department since its inception. Research collaborations with Western as part of Fulbright Programme ensured that a stream of American Anthropologist continued to trickle in and out of the Department. Notable among them were Dr. George Rich, Dr. Douglas Marry, Dr. James W. Green, Dr. B. E. Griseman. One Dr. Berland Joseph who taught at the Department in 1980-81, set up a fund for the development of Anthropology in Pakistan. These Western anthropologists not only contributed to developing and teaching new courses in Anthropology, but also steered and strengthened student’s careers into academic Anthropology. On the top of the list is Prof. Dr. Karl Jettmar (1918-2002) who was ‘one of the last anthropologists universally trained in the cultural sciences’\(^1\). He wrote his doctoral dissertation on ‘The social position of the blacksmith’ in 1941. In the later years, he became involved in research in Pakistan and in 1955, he was one of the members of the famous Hindukush expedition. His initiation into Northern Areas later developed into a passion, which compelled him to
conduct fieldwork regularly in the Northern Areas of Pakistan. In 1958, he got his habilitation with his work ‘On the Cultural History of the Dards’. His main published oeuvre is his lengthy work *The Religions of the Hindukush* (1975). Since 1979 he has mainly devoted himself to the study of rock-carvings at river Indus in collaboration with Pakistani scholars like Prof. Ahmad Hasan Dani. His approach is grounded in an historical perspective and in the study of local ethnography of Central Asia. Furthermore, he has made significant contribution to the study of arts and archaeology of Central Asia by using Russian sources in his articles and books extensively.

Karl Jettmar inspired a generation of anthropologists in Pakistan with his concerns in History and Archaeology. His main disciples in the field of Pakistani Anthropology are Adam Nayyar, Waseem Frembgen and Azam Chaudhry. Azam Chaudhry did his PhD in Social Anthropology, under the supervision of Prof. Jetmar, from the University of Heidelberg. He had a long-term association with Pak-German research project in the Northern Areas, which led to his position as a visiting scholar at the Heidelberg Academy of Humanities and Sciences between 1989 to 1995. Dr. Jurgen Wasim Frembgen has worked and published on the Northern Areas, Indus Kohistan and Punjab. The topic of his research includes regional ethnography, ethno-history, political anthropology and veneration of saints, material culture, performing arts and popular Islam. Currently, he is the Chief Curator, Oriental Department/Museum of Ethnology, Munich. Waseem Frembgen has been visiting Pakistan since 1981 every year.

In 1980, an MPhil Programme, leading up to a PhD degree in Anthropology was initiated by the department. According to the present chairperson Dr. Hafeez, courses were developed and approved by the Board of Studies of the department and Faculty of the Social Sciences, QAU. Later on, Academic Council and Syndicate of the QAU approved the programme and a few students were enrolled in it. However, due to some administrative problems, the MPhil Programme was suspended
and could only be restored after 20 years. The number of PhDs in the Department has been few. Since the teaching was restricted to Master level, the department has not been able to produce any PhD.

In 1983-84, the department collaborated on the Kalash Valley Project, and a number of graduate theses have explored the rich cultural heritage of the Northern Areas. The graduate students have extensively studied all parts of the country, except for Balochistan. A large number of students have explored the diverse cultural and sociological patterns in various parts of Pakistan.

Notwithstanding the fact that foreign anthropologist in Pakistan rarely have any affiliation with local institutes, their publications have an enormous influence on the main trends in anthropological and sociological researchers in the country. Frederick Barth is one such Swiss anthropologists, who did his pioneering fieldwork in Political Anthropology among Swat Pathans of NWFP, Pakistan. His work has influenced, along with numerous others, the present day scholar administrator, Akbar S. Ahmad, who did number of studies on the tribal society following F. Barth. These researches have explored the connections between religion and politics or mainly in the filed of History and Anthropology.

The book by Zekiye Eglar, *A Punjabi Village in Pakistan* exerted considerable influence over the anthropological studies of rural society. Her description of village society in terms of core values and rituals functioning within a coherent whole, set a paradigm for a large number of village studies by generations of anthropologists in Pakistan. Her analysis of sepi system, which defines the social and occupational relations between a Muslim landlord and a cultivator in a village in Gujrat, has been contrasted with the Jagmani system that guides the social relations between Hindu landlords and cultivators, and indicates the influence of Islam on Hindu society by a noted anthropologist A. H. Dani. Hamza Alavi contributed to
Pakistani Anthropology through his studies of *baradari* in a rural society in Punjab, which he considered ‘the basic institutions of the kinship systems of Muslims of West Punjab’. Translating *baradari* as brotherhood, Alavi, analytically separated it from the caste order prevailing in the Hindu society. Saghir Ahmad developed his class-based analysis of rural society and added to the list of ethnographies of Punjab with his *Class and Power in Punjabi Village*. His studies of rural society in terms of class analysis opened up the way for host of studies, which later explored the connections between kinship and politics in rural society. Dr. Hafeez-ur-Rehman has intensively studied the institutions of shrines and the links between state and social organisation of shrines.

With few exceptions, the researchers in Anthropology at Pakistani universities have largely worked under an evolutionary and structural functionalist paradigm, and most of the studies are restricted to stereotypical concepts of village community, castes, and tribes. The preferred area of research is in a process of social change in Pakistani rural society, especially in small communities and tribal groups. Treating village as a functional whole constituted by different caste, *baradari* or *jati* groups, the ‘peasant society’ is epistemological equivalent to colonial ethnographic construction of independent village communities.

According the S. A. Khan, a former Professor at the Department, a tradition of fieldwork among ‘primitive tribes’, is followed as an obligatory part of the coursework: ‘a village is selected (it must be a village, not a city) and mostly ethnographic study is carried out.’ However, he says, ‘What is evident in these studies is that they are based on synchronic data and the population studies is treated as if they were alone, isolated and independent from the rest of the larger society.’

To-date the structural functionalist perspective formed the basis of academia at the Department of Anthropology at QAU, and provide a framework for graduate research, which explores the *baradari* based social organisation, factionalism, land tenure
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

system, belief systems, marriage systems and patterns, rituals, and ceremonies, kinship, conflicts and conflict resolution, gift exchange as key topics for the study of ‘traditional’ village societies in Pakistan. The impact of industrialisation, migration, social mobility, narcotics and modernization of agriculture, compliment the list of topics under which graduate research is being pursued in the Department.

Changing gender relations and its implications for rural and urban society, honour and shame ideology, sexual violence, reproductive health, are the issues that have drawn interests of women student anthropologists in Pakistan. Attention has also been given to the social and cultural problems of Afghan women.

Since the promotion on the professional ladder is determined principally on the basis of the number of years a teacher has served the Department and the vacancies in it, rather than the quantity and quality of publication of a teacher there is little incentive for doing academic research. However, contract research for NGOs, which in most cases, is of a descriptive and applied variety, draws more income. As a result for an under paid university teacher, supplementing income through contract research gets priority over teaching and research at universities. Moreover, the interpersonal rivalries among the faculty have dried up the moral and intellectual space that is conducive for scholarship. Contributions to newspapers and popular magazines by academic anthropologists have been little, with occasional contributions from anthropologists outside the university. There is no professional organisation or academics journal.

Since Anthropology is not taught at the undergraduate levels in colleges, the candidate to the Department of Anthropology comes from a combination of various subjects in social sciences and humanities. A preference was given to students with majors in Sociology, which was waived off in later years. The motivation varies from ‘scraping a degree’ to a general interest in the social sciences. Since the discipline has not been able to
Anthropology in Pakistan: The State of Discipline

establish itself in the universities and colleges in the country, the motivation for choosing it remains vague and unclear.

Many hundred graduates passed out from the Department of Anthropology at QAU, in which a large number have found employment primarily in government and non-government development organisations such as Literacy and Mass Education Commission (LAMEC), National Centre for Rural Development, (NCRD), Pakistan Agricultural Research Council (PARC), Planning Commission of Pakistan, Allama Iqbal Open University, UNICEF, Atomic Energy Commission, UNFPA, and ILO, among others. All these jobs are claimed to be related to the discipline of Anthropology.\textsuperscript{23} Since 1990s, local and international non-government organisations in Pakistan have become largest recipients of graduates of the Department. National and international organisations, like Aga Khan Rural Support Programme (AKRSP), ActionAid, CIDA etc., are among few recipients of anthropologists. However, very few graduates pursued careers in teaching or anthropological research, largely due to lack of academic research and teaching institutions devoted to Anthropology in the country.

Given the rapid increase in the number of applicants per year, the department is rapidly expanding and has initiated bi-annual admissions for the graduate programme in Anthropology from October 2002. With university’s policy to generate independent resources, the department is running a self-finance programme parallel to the regular program, with equal number of students in both categories. It also began a PhD programme in Anthropology from the fall of 2003, in addition to the current MPhil programme, but it has not produced any MPhil and PhD scholar by February 2004. A total of 17 PhD and 45 MPhil students are currently completing their thesis at the Department.

The HEC Handbook shows that in 1976 there was only one PhD teacher with a degree from a foreign university. The number of teachers rose to four in 1984, of which one PhD and one MPhil had received degrees from foreign universities, and two had
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

Master degrees from local universities. The number increased to seven in 1994 with one PhD, one MPhil and one Master having their degrees from local universities. By 2001, the strength of the faculty rose to eight. Out of them three teachers are PhD and five hold Master degrees. All the three PhDs had degrees from foreign universities, each from UK, Germany and USA. One teacher had a Master degree from abroad and other four did their Masters from local universities. For details see the table given below:

Table No. 1: The Profile of Teachers of Anthropology Department of Quaid-i-Azam University from 1976 to 2001

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Total Dept.</th>
<th>Total No. of Teachers</th>
<th>PhD (F)</th>
<th>PhD (Not Known)</th>
<th>MPhil (F)</th>
<th>MA/ MSc (F)</th>
<th>MA/ MSc (L)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1976</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1987</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1994</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


The Department at QAU has submitted proposals for developing computer and ethnographic laboratories, and other equipment necessary for anthropological research, which will further expand its physical infrastructure. In addition to that, funds for research are also requested. A student research and placement programme is also envisioned. A large number of government and non-government organisations are being contacted for research collaborations at national and international levels.

The number of departments of Anthropology in the country remains static since the formation of Department of Anthropology at QAU in 1975. Peshawar University started Anthropology in combination with Sociology and Social work in 1978-79. Only MA courses were offered at the outset. Presently, MA and MPhil Courses in Anthropology are being offered separately. Other institutions like Fatima Jinnah Women University do not have a separate Anthropology department but offers courses in medical anthropology in a broader programme.
of behavioural sciences. Arid University started its Anthropology department in 1999 and offered courses in 2002. It is now offering evening classes as well.

The Anthropology Department appeared to have benefited from the international collaboration due to the presence of a large number of Western educated/trained anthropologists on the faculty of the Department in the first decade of its inception. Sadly, this trend has been on the decline. There are fewer opportunities for students to get into academic programme in Western universities due to the highly competitive nature of entrance examination for which Pakistani students are far less equipped even in the face of their South Asian competitors. Presently, three faculty members of the Department owe their doctorates to the research collaborations between the Department and overseas institutions. It includes, Naveed-i-Rahat at the University of Sussex, Azam Chaudhry at the University of Heidelberg, and Huma Haque from the Universities of Chicago, USA, were able to earn their PhDs largely as a result of collaboration with overseas institutions.

The present focus of anthropologist research on village studies needs to be broadened to include new areas of research at the forefront of anthropological scholarship, including the relationship between nationalism and religion and impact of profound economic transitions on culture at the local and national level. Courses in symbolic anthropology, ethno-history and aesthetic and political theory needs to be developed further to explore the discourses that constitute history, culture, and politics of the Subcontinent/Pakistan.
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

Notes

1 Bernard Cohn, *An Anthropologist Among Historians and Other Essays* (OUP, Delhi, 1995).
3 At British annexation in 1849, the Punjab stretched from frontier districts of Peshawar, Kohat, Bannu, Dera Ismail Khan and Dera Ghazi Khan to Delhi on the east, comprising of present province of Punjab, and NWFP in Pakistan. However, Punjab proper refers to the five inter-riverine tracts between the Indus and the Sutlej. See O. H. K. Spate, T. A. Learmouth and B. H. H. Fanner, *India, Pakistan and Ceylon: The Regions* (London, 1960).
4 For a pioneering study of governmental knowledge production in British India by anthropologists, see Bernard Cohen, *Colonialisms and its Forms of Knowledge: The British in India* (Princeton, 1996).
9 The all takes pride in claiming to be the ‘first and, as of now, the only separate and independent department of Anthropology in the country’.
10 Introductory Brochure by the Department of Anthropology, Quaid-i-Azam University, (Islamabad, n.d.).
12 The information about the history of the department is based on interviews with the current chairperson, Dr. Hafeez-ur-Rehman and Anwar Shaheen. A separate interview was conducted with Dr. Naveed-i-Rahat, the former chairperson of the department in January 2003.
14 See USEFP NEWS, a bi-monthly newsletter of the United States Education Foundation in Pakistan (n.d.).
15 Email correspondence with Prof. Waseem Frembgen, dated Friday, July 25, 2003 who is one of the disciples of Karl Jetmar.

234
Anthropology in Pakistan: The State of Discipline

20 Hamza Alavi ‘Kinship in West Punjab Villages’, in T. N. Madan (ed.), Muslim Communities of South Asia: Society and Culture (Delhi, 1976).
23 Introductory Brochure of the Department of Anthropology, Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad, n.d.
Development of the Discipline of History in Pakistan

Mubarak Ali

Introduction

When we discuss the state of History as a subject in our educational institutions, people raise a number of questions: what is the use of History in the technological age?, how far is it relevant to our present problems? and if it fails to create any political and social consciousness in society then what is the use of studying it? Some people even go further and raise quite a different set of questions: is it a market-oriented subject? If not, then why should students waste their time and money to study it? These are valid questions, especially at a time when there is unemployment and every young person wants to have a successful career. These questions are also valid because our historians have failed to correct the falsification and distortion of colonial history, and did not offer any effective response to modern challenges. The study of History has neither been constructed objectively, nor has the history of the world and civilisation of humankind been studied with an open mind.

Not a single History department in any university has specialised in any particular aspect of history. Our higher educational institutions do not provide any new interpretation that could lead to the formation of historical ideas and philosophy. If we analyse the discipline of History in the light of the above questions, we reach the conclusion that the history that we teach in our schools,
colleges and universities is distorted to the point of being deformed. Those who are responsible for the History curriculum are not aware that the subject has changed drastically over the last several decades. It no longer remains confined to politics, but has broadened itself to involve the social and cultural aspects of society. There are different schools of historical studies that have enriched the subject, such as ‘History from below’ or the approach of the ‘Annals School’, to construct the history of sensibilities. If the subject is taught in such a broad perspective, only then can it be useful to society.²

**State Ideology and History**

Our state uses the subject for its own political and ideological interests. It is claimed that Pakistan came into being as a result of an ideological struggle. Therefore, the official purpose of History in Pakistan is to legitimise the state’s ideology and write history within a framework that suits the ruling classes. This is manifested especially in History textbooks, in which selective information is imparted to students with an underlying motive to make them chauvinistic, nationalist and religiously conservative. M. Ikram Rabbani, in his textbook, which is prescribed in English medium schools, writes about the Ideology of Pakistan:

Pakistan Ideology is based on the fact that the Muslims are a separate nation, having their own culture, civilisation, customs, literature, religion and way of life. They cannot be merged in any other nation because their philosophy is based on the principles of Islam. As the Muslims of India found it extremely difficult to live according to the Islamic principles of life in the United India, they were forced to demand a separate homeland to safeguard their national and religious identity.³

Because of ideological considerations, the subject has suffered immensely. To date, no decision has been taken as to how to treat the ancient past. Should we ignore ancient history because it is pre-Islamic? How do we deal with the Mediaeval period, when the Muslim dynasties ruled over India and Delhi and Agra were the centres of power, while the present territories of
Pakistan were on the periphery of their kingdoms? Some historians have tried to solve this problem by arguing that the history of Pakistan should start from 711-12 AD — the date of the Arab invasion of Sindh. Another approach suggests that the starting point should be 1947, the year of the birth of Pakistan. One example is Gul Shahzad Sarwar who in his textbook, writes:

Although Pakistan came into being on 14 August 1947, its roots go deep into the remote past. Its establishment was the culmination of the struggle by the Muslims of the South Asian subcontinent for a separate homeland of their own, and its foundation was laid when Muhammad bin Qasim subdued Sindh in 712 AD.4

There are problems regarding how to treat the Sikh rule in the Punjab. Furthermore, there is a vacuum in dealing with the colonial period. The only period that receives emphasis is the era of the Freedom Movement or the Struggle for Pakistan, and this period is also reflective of the official point of view, while completely ignoring alternative interpretations.

We can well understand that such a lopsided and misinformed history cannot create a broad perspective in the minds of our young generation. Nor can such History be useful for finding a job in the market. In its present state the subject is dull, repetitive, and unattractive to students yearning for serious study. It is too much court oriented and is deficient in describing the lake of the people.

The Teaching of History
The quality of teaching of any subject depends on its teachers. In the case of Pakistan, the teachers who undertook the job of teaching in colleges and universities in the early stages after Partition, were so involved in internal politics and intrigues that they did not have the time for academic responsibilities. In Sindh and Karachi Universities, the departments of History were divided into General History and Muslim History just to accommodate two professors as heads of each department. The result was that neither a new or fresh curriculum was made, nor
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

was a new system of examination evolved. No effort was made to train the young teachers in research methodology or the new ideas in the subject. Some of the teachers were able to receive foreign scholarships for higher education. Some of them returned to Pakistan while others preferred to remain abroad. Those who were unable to go abroad remained confined to the hackneyed routine of teaching, finding no opportunity to improve their qualifications.

At the time of Partition, Punjab University was the only institution of higher learning that Pakistan inherited. Sindh, Karachi, Peshawar, and Quaid-i-Azam universities were founded later. As a result of Partition, the non-Muslim teachers migrated and left a vacuum that was filled by the scholars who came to Pakistan as immigrants. In the discipline of History, the historians who took the responsibility of teaching mostly specialised in Mediaeval India or Muslim History. As they were trained in the colonial institutions, they retained the outdated and traditional outlook within history. They adopted the colonial syllabus that dealt with the political history of the successive ruling dynasties. Students of MA were asked to read Rushbrook William, Ishwari Prasad, Beni Prasad, and Jadunath Sarkar. Most of our universities and their affiliated colleges recommended the books, which they themselves had studied as students. Interestingly, famous and internationally known historians from the Aligarh school of History are missing from the list such as Irfan Habib, Athar Ali, Harbans Mukhia, Musaffar Alam, Iqtidar Alam Khan and Khaliq Ahmad Nizami, to name a few.

Many attempts have been made to revise the curriculum but as the teachers are not aware of the latest publications and research works, they recommend retaining the same syllabus with minor changes. The result is that a teacher focuses on the same topics again and again throughout his career without adding anything. Continuous repetition of a subject makes the teacher dull and leads to loss of interest. A significant result of this repetition is that in the annual examination, the examiner repeats the same questions. The students on the basis of this pattern evolve a
Development of the Discipline of History in Pakistan

formula; they take the previous five years’ question papers and select 15 questions out of them to prepare for the examination. They are never disappointed, as they find in the examination papers the questions they have well prepared. For example, in Mediaeval History, the following types of questions keep recurring: who was the real founder of a Muslim state in India: Qutbuddin Aibak or Iltutmish? Or, what was Balban’s theory of kingship? What were the economic reforms of Alauddin? In the case of the Mughal period, the usual questions are: describe the condition of India before the invasion of Babar; explain the blunders of Humayun; explain Akbar’s religious policies; write notes on Nurjahan and her role; describe Shahjahan’s period as the golden period of the Mughals; and explain the war of succession between Aurangzeb and Dara Shikoh. As this period is taught with an ideological perspective, Ahmad Sirhind and Shah Wali Ullah are added and regarded as important personalities from the point of view of examiners.

In the Muslim History group the syllabus is very simple: the life of the Holy Prophet (PBUH), the Pious Caliphs, the Umayyids and the Abbasid dynasties. The same courses are repeated from school through college and university. The same pattern is followed in other histories, whether European, American, or the history of civilisation. It is an easy way for the teacher to do the job and for students to pass the examination. This method encourages teachers and students to use cheap textbooks and guides. For example, there was a time in the 1960s and 1970s when a man named Mukarjee was popular among the History students of Pakistan. His books on the Indian, American, European, Greek and the Roman histories were a sure guarantee to pass the examination. Later, his place is taken over by a Mahajan whose books on all fields of History were very popular in Pakistan as well as in India. Their counterpart in Pakistan is K. Ali whose books on Indian and Muslim History are recommended by the teachers. The students of Muslim History use Dr. A. Hamid’s book on Islamic History on all levels.
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

At higher levels the students are not required to consult original sources. They depend heavily on secondary sources and cheap textbooks, and not on contemporary researches. Moreover, there is no tradition of inter-disciplinary discussions and consultations. Students at college level are not advised on how to write a research paper. There are no requirements for students to make presentations in the classroom for discussion and debate. In the absence of any discussion, students and teachers are not trained to respond to and challenge any criticism.

The reading list that is provided to students is inadequate. There is no training in methodology or in the methods to be used in citation and in developing a bibliography. At times there is no indication of the publisher, year and place of publication, or even the full name of the author. The list is generally short and does not contain recent research works.

Moreover, the overwhelmingly ideological approach further makes the subject dull and uninteresting. As Pakistan is declared to be an ideological state, it has become incumbent upon teachers to teach accordingly. History is used by the state to defend its ideological boundaries rather than to create awareness among students. All the events or individuals that do not fit into the prescribed ideological framework, are excluded from the textbooks. For example, Akbar, as a ruler is condemned while Ahmad Sirhindi is extolled as the champion of Islam.6

The change in the medium of instruction from English to Urdu and Sindhi has rapidly deteriorated the standard of education, apart from creating and strengthening a dual class oriented society. As there are no standard textbooks either in Urdu or Sindhi, students have no alternative except to rely on the low quality guides or cheap textbooks to pass their examinations. There are hardly any good textbooks in Urdu and Sindhi on European, Russian, American or the British History.

The result is obvious. Those who graduate and acquire higher degrees in History find no job other than teaching. As teachers
they reproduce the knowledge that they learned to swallow as students. There is no process of production or creation of new knowledge in the discipline of History in Pakistan. Moreover, there are few opportunities for History graduates to adopt other professions because of their inadequate academic training. Some of them take it as an optional subject in competitive examinations, others use their knowledge of History in the media. The fact is that there is no academic market for History degree holders.

History Teaching at the School Level
History teaching at the school level is even more pathetic. After the Partition of 1947, the old system of education continued in which History and Geography were independent subjects. There were old History textbooks that contained chapters on the ancient Indian History and a brief survey of world civilisations. They provided overall basic knowledge of History. The change came during the period of Ayub Khan when in the 1960s American experts prepared a new Education Report for implementation by the government. In the new Report both History and Geography were excluded from the school syllabus and replaced by the introduction of a new subject called ‘Social Studies’ of which History became a part. History writing in Pakistan further suffered because of bitter and unfriendly relations with India. The anti-India material is not only inculcated in the History textbooks but also in other subjects such as Urdu and English literature.

Provincial Textbook Boards and the Curriculum Wing of the Ministry of Education have the monopoly to prepare and publish textbooks on all subjects. This greatly damages the quality of books. Unqualified writers, who are not well versed in History, write most of them. By ignoring recent research and development and new findings, they repeat the same old versions of History. As Engels points out, ‘he who writes History textbooks writes history’. Keeping this in view, authoritarian and orthodox governments successively monitor the writing of textbooks to propagate their ideology, leaving no option to
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

students to know any alternative version. Most History textbooks give political accounts of different periods and rarely mention social and cultural aspects. By emphasising the role of individuals history writers create more heroes than a small nation requires. There are different categories of heroes: firstly, there are politicians, freedom fighters, and rulers; in the second category there are Sufi Saints, Ulema, and literary persons; thirdly, after the 1965 war with India there are army men who gallantly fought for their country. All History textbooks are now heavily loaded with anti-Indian writings. The logical outcome, as a result of reading these textbooks, is that generation after generation is polluted with hatred, prejudice, and intolerance.

Research
Apart from teaching, research is an important aspect of any discipline. Research works produced suffer from many deficiencies firstly, students and teachers who engage in research work to get MPhil or PhD degrees, are motivated towards getting higher teaching jobs and promotions. Teachers try to get their research papers published in journals, as it is a requisite condition for promotion to higher grades. Though the condition is to get them published in the journals of international repute, this is not strictly observed and publications are accepted even if they are published in magazines and newspapers. In some cases, even letters of acceptance from dubious journals are accepted to consider a case for promotion of candidates. These research papers contribute very little to the sum total knowledge on this subject. As most of these research papers are below accepted standards, the candidates try to get them published in their own university journals.

If we analyse the topics, which are selected for MPhil and PhD research, they are mostly on the Pakistan Movement. The pet themes are the contribution of an area, individuals or groups of people like students, women, ulema, etc., to Pakistan Movement. The choice of topics in some cases might have also been influenced by patriotism. Furthermore, these topics served to strengthen the official version of History for the justification of
Development of the Discipline of History in Pakistan

Partition, and the ideology of Two Nations. The researchers are unable to consult original sources on mediaeval India history on Islamic History due to lack of knowledge of Persian Arabic.

Very few theses have been written on Mediaeval History, as it requires the knowledge of Persian. The same is the case of Islamic History where knowledge of Arabic is needed to consult the original sources. As there is no provision to teach these languages to students of History, they are not well equipped to do any research in these fields. As concerns History itself, no research has been done on this subject.

There are two trends in Pakistani historiography: one is to prove that the existing territories of Pakistan have never been a part of the Indian subcontinent except for 500 years and, therefore, they have a separate identity of their own. This theory was popularised after the separation of East Pakistan and an attempt was made to connect Pakistan with Afghanistan and Central Asia culturally, rather than with India. In the second trend, regional historians are trying to construct a history that could strengthen regional identity. This kind of historiography is essentially a response to a strong centre, and reflects the centralisation of historiography itself. Among the four provinces, this trend is very strong in Sindh, which claims that it has its own separate history. Based on this claim, it asserts its provincial autonomy. In regional histories, regional nationalism plays an important role in historical narratives.

During the period of Ayub Khan an attempt was made to write a comprehensive history of Pakistan. The general editor of the project was I. H. Qureshi and the contributors were the prominent historians of Pakistan. It is a good general narrative but failed to provide any new point of view, interpretation or insight into our history.

There is a new trend in historiography outside the universities. Prominent political families are hiring historians for writing the history of their families or of their ancestors in order to give
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

them a dignified place in history. Such biographies, financed by interested groups, fail to evaluate the role or character of a family or individual correctly and objectively. There is another trend among retired bureaucrats and generals, who write autobiographies to justify their own roles in recent history. In most cases such history is more glorification of individuals than objective and corrective narration of historical facts. As their claims are not challenged, their version of history passes as true. Some of them even take away all the documents and material under their control for writing autobiographies, and in this way deprive future historians from getting access to the materials and sources.

Besides this, there are other serious problems for researchers. No attempt is made to set up libraries containing original and secondary material of different periods and aspects of history. It is well nigh impossible for a scholar to travel from one city to another in search of material in public and private collections. There is no central catalogue to guide the researchers about the material that is lying in different libraries. Material of great importance, which is lying in government departments such as judicial and revenue records, needs to be properly sorted and preserved. Most of the records are kept in bundles and sacks waiting for experts to sift and catalogue them. There is no fellowship or financial assistance available to researchers to go abroad for the collection of material.

Professional Societies

After Partition, some historians who migrated from India formed the Pakistan Historical Society at Karachi whose Secretary was Moin-ul-Haq. It started to publish the Journal of the Pakistan Historical Society that earned respect in the academic community. It also set a tradition of holding History conferences in which historians from different countries participated. However, gradually the activities of the society slowed down. There are a number of reasons for this. First of all, the society has been monopolised by a group, which did not allow others to
Development of the Discipline of History in Pakistan

become its members. The same people were elected repeatedly and no system was evolved to involve more people in its academic activities. Moin-ul-Haq remained its Secretary till his death. After him, the society no longer remained functional. Its library and journal were taken over by the Hamdard Foundation. Presently, the journal is published by the Foundation, but its academic standard is not so high. However, it is commendable that the Foundation is publishing it regularly.

A number of attempts were made to form an association of historians but every time it failed to materialise because of lack of interest and initiative. Some conferences have been organised by different universities but this initiative could not become an annual programme. In the absence of any association or society, historians have no forum where they can assemble and present their researches. They also do not have any opportunity to contact foreign professional associations and participate in international conferences. This drawback further reduces their capacity to take interest in research.

**Research Institutes**

There are some research institutes for historical research set up by the central and provincial governments. The Pakistan Institute of Historical and Cultural Research was set up in Islamabad with the aim of promoting research activities. Initially, its working was quite satisfactory. It published a number of books on different aspects of South Asian history. But later on it could not maintain the quality of its research. It has announced the publication of a comprehensive history of Pakistan several times but the project has remained in doldrums. It irregularly publishes one research journal in English and another in Urdu. Both have a limited circulation.

The Punjab University has set up the Research Society of Pakistan with the purpose of publishing original Persian sources on Mediaeval Indian History. In the early period, 1960s to 1970s, it published a number of edited manuscripts of importance. It also undertook to publish monographs on the
history of the Punjab. However, in 1998 in the absence of funding, the Society was dissolved. It continues to publish a journal intermittently, but its articles have no academic standard.9

In Sindh, just after Partition, the provincial government established the Sindhi Adabi Board for the promotion of history and culture. The Board published the original sources on the history and culture of Sindh. Some of them were translated into Urdu and Sindhi. The Board also planned to publish a comprehensive history of Sindh in nine volumes but only three volumes have been published so far. The prospect of publishing the rest is doubtful for lack of qualified contributions.10

In the Punjab, the former Urdu Markaz and now the Urdu Science Board and Majlis-i-Tarraqi Adab in their early period (1950s and 1960s), published Urdu translations of the Persian sources on Mediaeval Indian history. These were excellent translations. However, now both institutes have abandoned the task due to lack of funding. At Karachi University there is an Institute for Central Asian History, which has published some excellent manuscripts.11

Conclusion
The present analysis shows defects and shortcomings in the teaching and writing of History at educational institutions. As most of the research and teaching institutes are state owned, the researchers and teachers lack freedom to pursue their task freely without state intervention. Scholars belonging to state institutions cannot participate in any conference or seminar abroad without getting a ‘No Objection Certificate’ (NOC) from the government agencies. From time to time there are directives from the government, as well as from the institutions, not to publish any article without prior permission.

History is not a popular subject in the ruling circles. There is an anti-History trend in the elite classes, which discourages research and promotion of the subject. The reason is that they are afraid
of documentation of their misdeeds in History. To counter the ‘History from above’ approach, which excludes common people from the process of history, there is no alternative approach to ‘History from below’ to highlight the role of ordinary people in shaping history. Further, people are also tired of reading and listening to out-dated interpretations, which justify all the acts of the ruling classes and project them as heroes, while ignoring the common man. They are interested in knowing more facts and different points of view to understand ‘real’ history. History needs freedom from a near-total ideological grip to discover and unfold an objective narrative.

There are universities in other countries where scholars are engaged in research work on South Asian history. These universities and their research institutes have their own agenda. They select the topics that are related to their interest, and construct history from their own point of view. In the absence of our own contribution, students and scholars have to study and rely on the work done by foreigners. In this way, we look at our history from their prism. It is said that the one ‘who controls the past controls the future’. We have been liberated from political colonialism but colonised in the field of knowledge. Intellectual colonisation, as is evident from the control over knowledge production, is worse than political domination.
Annex I

The Quantitative Data on Development of the Discipline of History in Pakistan

The Number of Teachers and their Qualifications

Opened in 1932, the Department of History of Punjab University is one of three departments of social sciences that Pakistan inherited from undivided India in 1947. A number of well-known historians, British, Indian and later Pakistanis, participated in its formation and later development.\(^1\) By 1963, the number of History departments in public universities in Pakistan rose to six. They were located at Punjab University, Peshawar University, Karachi University and Sindh University, the latter two having two departments. By 2001, as recorded in 2001 Handbook,\(^2\) the number of History departments rose from 6 to 12. The six new departments were opened in Bahauddin Zakariya University, Balochistan University, Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamia University and Allama Iqbal Open University, the latter having two departments.

In the six departments reported by 1963 mentioned above, there were 36 teachers with an average of six teachers per department. By 2001, the number of teachers rose to 75 but the average per department remained about the same.

By 1963, University of Karachi had the highest number of History teachers (7 General History and 7 Islamic History), followed by University of Sindh (5 General History and 4 Muslim History). By 2001, while University of Karachi retained its first position with 18 teachers, Sindh University lost its second position to Quaid-i-Azam University with 13 teachers. From

---

1. Notable among them are: J. F. Bruce, its first Professor, Dr. A. L. Sirivastava, Prof. J. D. Ward, Dr. Ishtiaq Hussain Qureshi, Prof. Dilawer Hussain, Prof. Sheikh Abdur Rashid, Prof. Dr. Abdul Hamid, Dr. Zafarul Islam, and Dr. Zawar Hussain Zaidi.

2. For details about the UGC Handbooks, see footnote 10 in the introductory chapter of this book.
among the total number of teachers of social sciences in 2001, 8 percent teachers were of History, which is lower than three disciplines\(^3\) and higher than 10 disciplines.\(^4\)

According to the 1963 Handbook, out of the total 36 teachers of History at that time, 16 (44%) had PhD degrees, no teacher had MPhil degree and 19 (53%) teachers were MAs.\(^5\) By 2001, out of 75 total teachers 22 (29%) were holding PhD degrees, nine (12%) with MPhil degrees and the remaining 44 (59%) had MA degrees. The difference in share percentage of three degrees in 1963 and 2001 shows a decrease of 15% for PhDs and an increase of 12% and 6% for MPhil and MA degrees respectively. These figures deviate from the general pattern of rise in PhD teachers in most other social science disciplines.

Out of 36 teachers of History in 1963, 17 (47%) had their degrees from foreign universities. In 2001, out of 75 teachers 13 (17%) had such degrees showing 30% decline in foreign qualified teachers in 38 years. Considering PhD separately, from among the 16 PhD teachers 13 (81%) had foreign degrees. In 2001, out of the total 22 PhD teachers four (18%) had their degrees from foreign universities, thus showing a 63% decline in the foreign trained PhDs. Overall conclusion emerging from the above data is that the share percentage of PhD teachers (total as well as foreign trained) and the total foreign qualified teachers has declined by the year 2001 as compared to 1963.

**PhD and MPhil Theses**

For earning a professional degree at the level of PhD and MPhil the completion of a thesis is a necessary requirement for a student. The quality and quantity of theses produced by a department reflect on its academic strength as well as its

---

\(^3\) Economics (22%), Public Administration/Administrative Science (14%), Education (14%).

\(^4\) International Relations (7%), Political Science (6%), Psychology (6%), Sociology (6%), Pakistan Study (5%), Area Study (3%), Philosophy (3%), Social Work (3%), Defence and Strategic Studies (2%) and Anthropology (1%).

\(^5\) There was one teacher at that time whose qualification was local BA.
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

contribution to the preparation of well qualified researchers who will be teaching or doing research in the discipline.

Since the emergence of the country up to 2001 (54 years) History departments in six public universities\(^6\) have produced a total of 126 PhD and MPhil theses. Out of them 43(34%) are PhD and 83(66%) are MPhil theses. In these 54 years the average for PhD theses is less than one per year and for MPhil theses is over two theses per year. Fifty eight (46%) theses were produced before 1987 and 68 (54%) were completed between 1987 to 2001.

Out of 43 PhDs 25 were produced before 1987 (0.6 per year) and 18 from 1987 to 2001 (1.2 per year). Out of 83 MPhil theses 33 (40%) were completed before 1987 with an average of 0.9 per year and 50 (60%) from 1987 to 2001 with an average of three theses per year. This data suggests that production of both PhD and MPhil theses in first 39 years (counting from 1948 to 1986) was slower than during 15 years from 1987 to 2001.

Out of the total 43 PhD produced by seven universities by 2001, University of the Punjab has produced the largest number (12), followed by Karachi University (9) and Quaid-i-Azam University (6). The remaining four universities\(^7\) together have produced 16 PhD theses. Out of the total 83 MPhil theses produced during the same period, Quaid-i-Azam University has produced the largest number (71), followed by Bahauddin Zakariya University (5). Punjab University and Islamia University have not produced any MPhil thesis. The remaining three universities\(^8\) together have produced seven MPhil theses.

The decade-wise breakdown of PhD theses shows that one thesis was produced in 40s, three theses were produced in 50s, five in

\(^6\) We have received the information about theses from following six public universities; Quaid-i-Azam, University of the Punjab, Karachi University, Bahauddin Zakariya University, Sindh University, University of Peshawar.

\(^7\) Sindh University (5), Bahauddin Zakariya University (5), Islamia University (5) and Peshawar University (1).

\(^8\) Sindh University (3), Peshawar University (2) and Karachi University (2).
Development of the Discipline of History in Pakistan

60s, ten in 70s, 11 in 80s and eight in 90s. The decade-wise breakdown of MPhil theses shows that one MPhil thesis was produced in 60s, 15 theses in 70s, 31 in 80s and 28 in 90s. Eight MPhil theses were completed in the year 2001. It may be noted that there is a consistent increase in the number of MPhil theses from 70s onward. One possible explanation of this increase is the establishment of History department in 1973 at Quaid-i-Azam University, which has contributed 71 (86%) MPhil theses out of total 83 theses.

Out of 126 theses produced by 2001, 118 were written in English, 5 in Urdu, 9 one in Sindhi and two in Arabic. Ninety nine (79%) of the theses writers were males and the remaining 27 (21%) were females.

The number of PhD theses produced by all the three inherited disciplines by 2001 (the other two are Economics and Political Science) shows that History has produced the lowest number of PhD theses (43) while Political Science and Economics have produced 64 and 45 theses respectively. The figure for MPhil theses produced by the three inherited departments shows that by 2001 the departments of Economics produced 184, History 83 and Political Science 18, placing History at second position.

By grouping all the 126 theses into different categories, we find that 25 (20%) theses fall in the category of ‘Politics of Pakistan including political parties, constitution making, elections and Islamisation’, 20 (16%) in the category of ‘Regional History with most of them related to Sindh’, and 17(14%) theses fall in the category of ‘Pakistan Movement and rise of Muslim Consciousness in India’. Fifteen (12%) theses were written on ‘Biographies of prominent personalities’, 13(10%) theses on ‘International Relations’ and Six (5%) on ‘Muslim Rulers in India’. Three (2%) theses were written on each of the following topics: ‘Education and Educational Institutions’, ‘Kashmir’ and ‘Separation of East Pakistan’.

9 Two were written in Islamia University and one each in Karachi University, Punjab University and Sindh University.
Notes

1 At the time the draft of this paper was completed, the author did not have the quantitative data on the development of the discipline of History. This data is now placed in Annex I of the paper.

2 For Annals see Peter Burke, The French Historical Revolution (Stanford University Press, 1990). For an excellent anthology on writing history see Peter Burke (ed.), New Perspective on Historical Writings (Pennsylvania State University, 1986).


4 Gul Shahzad Sarwar, Pakistan Studies (Tahir Sons, Karachi, 1989), p. 44.

5 A. Hamid, Tarikh Islam [Urdu], (Lahore, n.d.).


8 For full discussion see Mubarak Ali, ‘Pakistan’s Search for Identity,’ in Paul Brass and Achin Vanaik (eds.), Competing Nationalisms in South Asia (Orient Longman, Delhi, 2002); for Sindhi point of view of History see G. M. Syed, Sindh Jo Surma (Heroes of Sindh), Hyderabad: Sindhi (n/d) and Abdul Waheed Arisar, Ji Aim Saiyyad (Sindhi), Munzurabad, (n.d.).

9 Some of the publications of the Research Society of Punjab University are: Fatawa-i-Janadari by Ziauddin Barani; Tarikh-i-Iradat Khan by Irdat Khan; Ruqqat-i-Abul Fath Gilani by Abul Fath Gilani and Diwan Dara Shikoh.

10 Some of the publications of the Sindhi Adabi Board are: Tarikh-i-Masumi, Tuhfatul Kiram, Maklinama, Tarikh-i-Mazhar Shahjabani. The Board published the Urdu and Sindhi translations of Chuchnama, Tarikh-i-Masumi and Tuhfatul Kuram.

11 Some of the Urdu translations of the Urdu Markazi Board are: Tarikh-i-Firuzsgahi by Ziauddin Barani; Ma‘thirul Umara by Shahnawaz Khan and Tabaqat-i-Akbari by Bakhshi Nizamuddin. Majlish-i-Tarraqi Adab’s publications are: Tuzuk-i-Jahagiri and Amal-Saleh by Saleh Kambuh. Some of the publications of the Institute of Central and West Asian Studies are: A Calendar of Documents on Indo-Persian Relations (Vols. 1 & 2); Central Asia: History, Politics and Culture by Riazul Islam and Khan-i-Khanan Nama by Debi Prasad.
The Discipline of Public Administration in Pakistan

Zafar Iqbal Jadoon and Nasira Jabeen

Introduction

Public Administration as an academic discipline was first introduced in Pakistan in 1955 when Institute of Public and Business Administration was established in Karachi University under the First Five Year Plan. However, this programme was reviewed in 1959 and it was decided that the Institute should offer postgraduate education only in Business Administration. In 1960, the government of Pakistan and USAID signed an agreement to provide technical assistance for introducing and strengthening programmes of education, training, research and consultation in Public Administration. Under the same agreement various training institutions for civil service and a separate department at University of the Punjab to run Master of Public Administration (MPA) programme were established. A team of American professors from University of Southern California (USC) led this department in its formative phase and infused the spirit of American Public Administration through courses, pedagogical techniques, and system of assessment and evaluation, i.e., semester system. Further, young faculty of this new department who were mostly lecturer of Political Science either in Punjab University or its affiliated colleges were sent to University of Southern California for doctoral studies who on
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

return served this department for over three decades. The present head of this institution is also a USC graduate.

Now eight universities in Pakistan and one in Azad Jammu and Kashmir are offering postgraduate and undergraduate education in Public Administration in addition to University of the Punjab. Almost all of these programmes have benefited from the department of Public Administration, which is now the Institute of Administrative Sciences directly or indirectly through its graduates. Thus, the American flavour of Public Administration was injected to all the programmes, which were established by other universities in Pakistan. Review of courses and other developments in the discipline of Public Administration in Pakistan will reveal that the departments have been incorporating the changing trends in American Public Administration.

It is well documented that Public Administration education at university level was started amidst resistance from bureaucrats and educational administrators. Bureaucracy in Pakistan while accepting the in-service training of civil service failed to digest the very idea of professional education and training at university level, which was mainly due to its British legacy — generalist orientation. Thus, the academic programme of Public Administration was introduced in the university as an experiment but the important aspects pertaining to future of Public Administration in Pakistan such as its relationship with the civil service were left unattended. As a result, the graduates of Public Administration have never received special recognition for jobs in the government and in the competitive examination for central superior services.

Over the years there has been a phenomenal growth in both educational and training institutions in the field of Public Administration in Pakistan. Ten public sector universities are offering Master programmes in Public Administration and over a dozen of training institutions including Pakistan Administrative Staff College and National Institute of Public Administration (NIPA) are running pre-service and in-service training
programmes for civil servants. However, there are no formal linkages between educational institutions of Public Administration operating in universities and training institutions operating under government. The government in Pakistan has generally kept universities away from policy formulation and evaluation. The same has happened in the area of education, training and consultation in the field of Public Administration. While Public Administration education was assigned to universities, training, consultation and research went to training institutions like Pakistan Administrative Staff College and NIPA. In the absence of collaboration among universities, training institutions and the government agencies, Public Administration in Pakistan suffers due to a wide gap between theory and practice. It would not be wrong to say that Public Administration in Pakistan has largely developed in isolation from its practice. Although the university departments have been responding to changing practice of Public Administration through introduction of relevant courses but such a move has never received due consideration. For example, in response to massive nationalisation of 1970s under Z. A. Bhutto regime business oriented courses such as marketing and finance were introduced in Public Administration programmes but even then MPA degree holders were not given any preference for jobs in state-owned enterprises.

This paper attempts to review the developments in the discipline of Public Administration, both quantitative and qualitative, since 1985. Quantitative development includes number of new departments and programmes and qualitative development focusses on quality of research, ideologisation of the discipline, public orientation, types of students and interdisciplinary orientation. While quantitative data has been provided by the Council of Social Sciences, the qualitative assessment is made purely by the authors on the basis of their experience as senior members of one of the oldest institutes offering Public Administration degrees and as member of boards of studies on Public Administration of many other universities of the country.
Public Administration Programmes

Since 1985 there has been almost 100% growth in the postgraduate programmes in Public Administration. In 1985, only four universities were offering MPA degree namely, Punjab University, Quaid-i-Azam University, Gomal University and Peshawar University. Presently ten public sector universities are offering MPA degree. After 1985 University of Sindh, Karachi University, Balochistan University, Allama Iqbal Open University and Fatima Jinnah Women University have launched MPA degree programmes. Besides regular programmes, MPA programmes are also being run on self-supporting basis in the afternoon and evening both for fresh graduates and working professionals. At present various programmes of Public Administration offered by the Pakistani universities are given below in Table 1.

Table 1: The Programmes of Public Administration in Public Universities of Pakistan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>University</th>
<th>Programme(s)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>University of the Punjab</td>
<td>MPA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad</td>
<td>MPA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University of Peshawar</td>
<td>MPA, BPA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gomal University</td>
<td>MPA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University of Karachi</td>
<td>MPA, BPA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University of Sindh</td>
<td>MPA, BPA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University of Balochistan</td>
<td>MPA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Allama Iqbal Open University</td>
<td>MPA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fatima Jinnah Women University</td>
<td>MPA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University of Azad Jammu and Kashmir</td>
<td>MPA</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In the last few years there has been a major breakthrough in Public Administration in Pakistan, which will further improve the status of this discipline in the country. Several universities such as University of Sindh, University of Peshawar and University of Karachi, have started three years Bachelors programmes in Public Administration. Recently the newly established Virtual University has also announced admission for BS in Public Administration. The University Grants Commission, the predecessor of Higher Education Commission (HEC), also approved three years BS (Honors) in Public
Administration proposed by the Public Administration Curriculum Revision Committee consisting of all the heads or their nominees of the departments/institutes of the universities running Public Administration programmes.

Departments/Institutes
As noted above presently ten public universities are offering Public Administration. However, there are only three departments of Public Administration. There are diverse nomenclatures of the departments/institutes offering Public Administration programmes. There are three sets of departments/institutes. First, departments which offer only MPA degree. University of Karachi and Gomal University fall in this category where there are separate departments of Public Administration and business administration. Second, departments/institutes that offer both MBA and MPA degrees. These include the Department of Administrative Sciences, Quaid-i-Azam University, Institute of Management Studies, Peshawar University, Institute of Management Sciences, Balochistan University. Third, the institutes, which were previously the departments of Public Administration, have recently undergone restructuring. Two institutes fall in this category, Institute of Administrative Sciences, University of the Punjab and Institute of Management Sciences, University of Sindh.

New Developments
Several developments have taken place in the field of Public Administration. Good governance, new public management, devolution of power, privatisation of public enterprises, sustainable development, environmentalism, information technology, human development, civil society and poverty alleviation are some of the concepts that reflect major transformation taking place in the field. Recognising these trends, the Institute of Administrative Sciences has taken several steps to make its programmes more relevant to the changing field of Public Administration. It has five departments/centres offering various programmes:
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

1. Department of Governance
2. Human Resources Development Centre
3. Department of Finance
4. Department of Marketing
5. Department of Information Systems

Department of Governance has four Master degree programmes, MPA, MHA (Master of Health Administration), MPPM (Master of Public Policy and Management) and MDM (Master of Development Management). While MPA is the oldest programme, MHA was started in 2002. The remaining two programmes have been approved by the university authorities and plans for launching these programmes are underway.

Human Resources Development Centre of IAS is looking after the Master of Human Resource Management (MHRM) and Postgraduate Diploma (PGD) in HRM besides training and consultancy services to corporate as well as government and NGO sector. Other three departments are offering Master degrees in their respective domains. Public Administration graduates are offered specialisation in all the areas in which Master degree is being offered by IAS. Having in-house Master degree programmes in the specialised disciplines and incorporating all these specialisations in MPA degree programme, the IAS has not only reinvigorated its Public Administration programme but is also contributing to the development of the management disciplines, which have been ignored by the business administration schools in Pakistan. However, other universities have not yet followed these trends.

**Syllabi and Courses**

The Public Administration programmes have been consistently adopting international trends with sensitivity to local realities. In the early programmes the syllabi and courses were more inclined towards public/government sector. The hard core concept of Public Administration such as public finance, comparative administration, administrative law, local and municipal administration, development administration were integral part of...
The Discipline of Public Administration in Pakistan

the curriculum. However, due to lack of acceptability of MPA graduates in the government the general management courses were introduced, which could make the graduates acceptable even for private enterprises. The departments of Public Administration realised early that Public Administration can only survive in Pakistan if it develops itself as a management discipline.

The nationalisation of private enterprises and unprecedented expansion of state enterprise sector under Z. A. Bhutto regime in 1970s provided opportunity for developing Public Administration programmes as a legitimate management discipline. It was understood by the Public Administrationists that if the government has to run manufacturing as a service organisations its administrators/managers must have a blend of public and business management skills. It provided a rationale for introduction of hardcore business courses in MPA programme such marketing, finance, and sales. As a result of introduction of such specialisations in Public Administration programmes MPA graduates stood up a major competitors against MBAs. In certain areas such as human resource management MPA graduates got an edge over MBAs.

Now that governments in the world over are withdrawing themselves not only from production of marketable goods and services rather production of essential public services is also being passed on to the private and non-profit organisations, both education and practice of Public Administration is undergoing major transformation. The paradigm of governance is guiding the intellectual and practical aspects of Public Administration. Under this new paradigm the limited and effective government is expected to provide a policy framework to facilitate and stimulate private and non-profit sector for the production of goods and services to fulfil the collective and individual needs of the citizens. The business organisations and non-profit sector organisations under the paradigm of governance are seen as partners of government rather than competitors. To make this happen the governments are reinventing and restructuring
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

themselves. Devolution of power and privatisation in Pakistan are reflections of the global trends in the field of Public Administration. In view of these trends there is a need for new courses in Public Administration programmes such as urban governance, local government finance, development management, management of non-profit organisations, marketing for non-profit organisations, and environmental management. There is also a need for bringing public policy area into Public Administration programmes. These courses have already been introduced in the curriculum of Public Administration approved by the predecessor of Higher Education Commission (HEC) and the University Grants Commission (UGC).

Research

Unfortunately, like many other social sciences in Pakistan, Public Administration is also devoid of strong research traditions. Whatever notable research exists in the field of Public Administration in Pakistan was conducted during the period when an American team of professors assisted and advised the research programme. Ralph Braibanti’s work on bureaucracy of Pakistan is famous. His book ‘Research on Bureaucracy of Pakistan’ published in 1966 by Duke University Press and his collection of papers edited by Jameel-ur-Rehman under the title ‘Evolution of Administrative System of Pakistan’ are some of the research publications. During this period the single most contribution from indigenous scholars to the literature of Public Administration in Pakistan appeared in 1964, ‘The Civil Servant of Pakistan’ authored by Dr. Muneer Ahmad, which was published by Oxford University Press. Since then very few books have been added to the literature on Pakistan’s Public Administration.

Since research was neither the priority of the government nor the universities, Public Administration remained confined to the postgraduate teaching. Master thesis that was one of the compulsory requirements of MPA degree of the Punjab University was made optional in 1970s under pressure from
The Discipline of Public Administration in Pakistan

Students Union. It is also optional in other universities. The absence of MPhil and PhD programmes in Public Administration further deteriorated the research potential of the faculty of Public Administration. The faculty members of all the departments/institutes have however published research papers in local and foreign journals to meet the promotion requirement but these papers do not add substantially to the indigenisation of Public Administration.

It is very recent that PhD programmes in Public Administration are being launched, of course with a management flavour. For example, Institute of Administrative Sciences has started a regular MPhil leading to PhD programme in Management with emphasis on Public Administration. This programme is first of its kind as it is a blend of British and American doctoral systems. It requires completion of one-year course work, qualifying comprehensive examination and a thesis. Though thesis is the requirement but coursework and comprehensive examinations provide doctoral students ample opportunity to prepare themselves for successful completion of doctoral research.

Under the existing system on British pattern, University of Sindh and University of Karachi have produced PhDs in Public Administration. Annex I provides a list of MPhil and PhD research in Public Administration.

Other Aspects of the Discipline
The main emphasis of departments of Public Administration and other institutions offering Public Administration programmes has been on teaching and employment of their graduates in managerial jobs. It is quite understandable as the students who join these programmes are primarily interested in professional jobs in private sector companies and NGOs while government jobs are their least priority. Therefore, Public Administration departments have been mainly facing competition from other management disciplines for placing their graduates in the market. Other requisites of a discipline such as research, indigenisation of knowledge, dialogue with other disciplines,
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

conferences on theoretical and practical issues, development of professional community and research journals have not so far received attention of scholars and practitioners of Public Administration. Recently, however, the former graduates of the Institute of Administrative Sciences have established Administrative Science Association (ASA), which has been registered as a non-profit organisation. The association has announced two gold medals for toppers in MPA programme, one each for male and female students. One of the objectives of the ASA is to provide a forum for academic exchange between practitioners and academia for development of Public Administration in Pakistan. So far this is the only such forum.

**Future of Public Administration as an Academic Discipline**

Public Administration has survived even without the patronage of government as a discipline of management with strong interdisciplinary orientation. The students with social sciences background are given preference in admission. It is one of the top five popular subjects among students who apply for admission into Master degree programmes in social sciences/management sciences being offered by public sector universities. For example, in Punjab University, MBA and MPA programmes attract students with highest merit as compared to other social sciences subjects. The students feel attracted to even self-supporting programmes of Public Administration.

The acceptability of graduates of Public Administration in private sector, NGOs and even in public sector organisations is increasing. In the areas such as Human Resource Management, Health Administration, and NGOs, Public Administration graduates are getting an edge over other management disciplines. Some of the departments like Institute of Administrative Sciences, Punjab University and Department of Public Administration, Karachi University, are quite aggressive in their marketing and image building, which is paying off in the form of growing acceptability of the graduates of Public Administration in the market.
Annex I

Quantitative Data on the Discipline of Public Administration in Public Universities of Pakistan

The first separate department of Public Administration was opened in 1962 in Punjab University. Since then and up to 1963 no new department was opened as 1963 Handbook shows. However, by the year 2001, the number of departments rose to ten. By 1963, there were five teachers in the department of Punjab University. By 2001, this number rose to 128 giving an average of 13 teachers per department. From among the total number of teachers of social sciences in 2001, 14% were Public Administration teachers. This percentage is equal to Education discipline but it is lower than one discipline and higher than 11 disciplines.

Out of the five teachers of Public Administration in 1963, the degrees of two teachers are not known. Among the remaining three teachers one was PhD and the other two MA. Out of 128 teachers in 2001, the degrees of 13 teachers are not known. The remaining 115 teachers have following degrees: 24 (21%) PhD degrees, one MPhil degree and 90 (78%) MA degrees. The difference in share percentage of all degree-holders in 1963 and 2001 shows a decrease of 12% for PhD teachers, increase of one percent for MPhils and increase of 11% for MA degree.

Out of five teachers of Public Administration in 1963, the source and level of degrees of two teachers is not known. Out of the remaining three teachers no teacher had his/her degree from foreign universities. In 2001, out of 128 teachers the source (whether from a local or foreign University) and level of degrees (whether they had PhD, MPhil or MA degree) of 44 is not known. Out of the remaining 84 teachers 37 (44%) had degrees from foreign universities. This suggests a rise of 44 percentage points in foreign qualified teachers of Public Administration/Administrative Sciences.
From among the three teachers in 1963, information about whose degrees is available, there was only one PhD with local degree. Among the 24 PhD teachers in 2001, the source of degrees of three teachers is not known. Among the remaining 21 teachers, 18 (86%) have their degrees from foreign universities and the other three (14%) from local universities. This shows a 86% rise in the foreign trained PhD teachers over 38 years. On the basis of the number of teachers whose level and source of degree is known it can be concluded that during the period of 1963 to 2001 a substantial increase in the percentage of teachers having training abroad occurred. This is true for the PhD teachers as well.

**PhD and MPhil Theses**
Since the establishment of first separate department of Public Administration in 1962 up to 2001 (39 years), Public Administration/Administrative Science departments in three public universities’ have produced six theses (three PhD & three MPhil) with an average of 0.1 theses per year. All the six theses were written in English and by male students. Out of them one was produced before 1987 (0.04 per year) and five (83%) were completed between 1987 to 2001 (0.3 per year). This data suggests that production of these theses in first 25 years (counting from 1962 to 1986) was slower than during 15 years from 1987 to 2001. The decade-wise breakdown of theses shows that even after the first department was established in Punjab University in 1962 no thesis was produced in 60s. After that one PhD thesis was produced in 70s, two MPhil theses in 80s and three (two PhD & one MPhil) theses in 90s.

From the total six theses produced by year 2001, Sindh University has produced three (one PhD & two MPhil) theses, Peshawar University two (one each of PhD & MPhil) and University of Karachi has produced one PhD thesis.
The Discipline of Public Administration in Pakistan

Notes

2 Ibid.
3 For detailed quantitative information about the discipline, see Annex I.
4 For detailed information on Handbooks see footnote 10 in the introductory chapter of this book.
5 Economics (22%).
6 History (8%), International Relations (7%), Political Science (6%), Psychology (6%), Sociology (6%), Pakistan Study (5%), Area Study Centres (3%), Philosophy (3%), Social Work (3%), Defence and Strategic Studies (2%) and Anthropology (1%)
7 Peshawar University, Karachi University and Sindh University. COSS could collect data only from these three universities.
Journalism and Mass Communication

Mehdi Hasan

Journalism or Mass Communication can be rated as one of the four preferred subjects among social sciences by students. According to the Punjab University figures of candidates who apply for admission to Master degree programmes, Journalism/Mass Communication is number three. Business Administration and Administrative Sciences are above Mass Communication followed by Economics at number four. In terms of the COSS database, the departments of Mass Communication constituted 6.7 per cent of all university departments in 2001, giving the subject the fifth position after Education, Economics, Public/Business Administration and History.

The Mass Communication Department of the Punjab University, known as the Department of Journalism till 1979, was established in 1941, offering a nine months diploma course in the evening. A very small number, mostly working journalists joined the Department that depended on part-time teachers from the press. The number of students was even smaller after Independence.

In 1959, when the Cold War between the United States and the Soviet Union was in full swing, the Department was upgraded to offer a Master degree programme with the help and cooperation of Asia Foundation and other American institutions. In this way
So
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

Punjab University became the pioneer of Master degree
programme in Journalism and the only institution of its kind in
South and South East Asia. Thus, the Department used to have
students from Philippines and Thailand under the SEATO
scholarship programme besides receiving four students every
year from former East Pakistan on the basis of East-West
Exchange programme. The number of students getting admission
in Master of Journalism seldom exceeded 15.

The Karachi University started Master in Journalism and
established its department in 1963, followed in succeeding years
by the Sindh University, Jamshoro; Balochistan University,
Quetta; Peshawar University, Peshawar; Gomal University, D. I.
Khan; Islamia University, Bahawalpur; Bahauddin Zakariya
University, Multan.1 However, teaching of Journalism at
Bachelors’ level was ignored, and is still not offered except in
three boys colleges and four girls colleges in Lahore. By now
almost all universities offer Journalism both as an elective and as
an optional subject at graduate level, and it is one of the most
popular subjects taken by those candidates who appear in BA
examination as ‘private’ or external candidates. Government
College, Lahore, was first to offer Journalism at Bachelor level,
followed by Kinnaird College for Women, Lahore, College for
Women, F. C. College, Lahore, Himayat-i-Islam College for
Women, Lahore, Fatima Jinnah College for Women, Chuna
Mandi, Lahore and Government Science College Wahdat Road,
Lahore. A private institution, Wise College for Women, has also
been offering Journalism at BA level for the past many years.
Thus at the Bachelors’ level the subject is offered in Lahore
institutions only. Since the Directorates of Education in four
provinces have not taken any steps to recruit teachers for
Journalism in colleges so the subject is not offered at college
level, except a few mentioned earlier in Lahore. Therefore,
Journalism in BA is not a prerequisite for admission in MA
Journalism or Mass Communication. The apathy of Education
department towards introduction of the subject at college level is
hard to explain, as the subject is also very popular among
candidates for Central Superior Services Examination, besides
those who appear in BA, as private candidates. If it is introduced as a regular elective and optional subject at college level in BA, job opportunities for a large number of degree holders can be created.

Employment Opportunities
Since those students, seeking education in Pakistan are generally job-oriented, they prefer admission in those faculties, which offer better employment chances. After the establishment of Postgraduate departments of Journalism/Mass Communication in almost all the public sector universities and some colleges in Lahore, it was expected that the press in Pakistan will prefer hiring the services of degree holders as they have at least the theoretical knowledge about the profession, if not the practical training. However, print media remained generally, hostile towards MA in Journalism/Mass Communication. In particular, the vernacular press, where no qualification is required for becoming a journalist, has remained a forbidden territory for graduates trained in Journalism.

A Press Commission was appointed in 1954 but it failed to submit its report for improvement in the newspaper industry even after four years of its establishment. It was reconstituted in September 1958, and was asked to make recommendations on various aspects of the newspaper industry. After the imposition of first martial law in October 1958, the military regime ordered the Commission to submit its report without any further delay. Consequently, the Press Commission submitted its recommendations on March 25, 1959. Major recommendations dealt with the implementation of various press laws and pay structure of the working journalists.

The Commission while suggesting pay scales for various categories of journalists working in Lahore, Karachi and Dhaka also recommended minimum qualifications for them. The Commission had also recommended setting up of Journalism departments in all universities.
According to the recommendations of the Commission, minimum qualification for a journalist was to be a graduate with diploma in Journalism. Till 1961 MA in the subject were not available. When the first Wage Board Award was announced in 1962, the apprenticeship period for non-graduates in Journalism was fixed at one year, and for MA Journalism it was six-months. Non-graduates were required three years experience to qualify for the award.

However, this condition was never implemented even after six Wage Awards. The struggle for the implementation of the seventh award is on, these days by the journalist bodies. Majority of the journalists working in the vernacular language newspapers is without any theoretical knowledge of the role and objectives of the press in a democratic society. During the last 25 years a new trend has emerged in the Pakistani print media. Newspapers have stopped employing professional editors. Instead, the proprietors themselves and their family members are managing the editorial side also. Since an owner’s primary concern is with earning more and more profit, they often compromise on the journalistic standards and codes of ethics. Thus, the position of a ‘gatekeeper’ has been undermined in the newspapers. The criticism by proprietors and senior journalists over the degree holders is justified on the basis that students from Mass Communication departments do not have the practical training, as no university department or college has such facilities. But the Master degree holders definitely possess better theoretical knowledge and are familiar with international trends and know more about the history of the press in South Asia. Similarly, the advertising industry has ignored the degree holders of Mass Communication. Advertising agencies generally go for fine arts graduates though, technically speaking advertising is persuasive communication at its best.

In these circumstances government departments like the Directorate of Public Relation (DPR) in the provinces and the Press Information Department (PID) remain the main employers, besides the government owned Pakistan Broadcasting
Journalism and Mass Communication

Corporation (PBC) and Pakistan Television Corporation (PTV). For instance, at the Federal level, Punjab has employed almost all Public Relation Officers, Assistant Directors and Directors, who have a Master degree in Mass Communication. Despite the lack of interest by print media, Mass Communication falls in the eighth job-oriented disciplines identified by COSS study on quantitative development.

**Curriculum**

When the diploma course was launched at Punjab University in 1941, the courses pertained to print Journalism exclusively. However, after making it a degree programme, subjects of Mass Communication, Public Relations, Comparative Politics and International Relations were also added. Again when television was introduced in Pakistan in 1964, courses of television news writing and radio news writing were further introduced in 1967.

In 1976, the Department of Mass Communication at Punjab University also started two courses in Radio and Television production and an optional course in Photo Journalism. However, Photo Journalism was discarded in 1997 as the teacher interested in photography had left the Department. It will not be out of place to mention here that how the university establishment deals with the requirement of modernising various curricula. In 1972, the Punjab University administration was approached for the allocation of a small amount for establishing a photographic laboratory. The then Registrar’s response was ‘please explain why Journalism Department needs a photographic lab?’ No department of Mass Communication in the country has a photographic lab, or offers a course in photo Journalism and news photography.

The courses of Radio and Television production are also taught theoretically and there is no arrangement for practical work and training. The department of Punjab University has been subscribing to the news service of APP for sub-editing training since 1962. But the service was discontinued in 1974. No other department at any university or college has a news agency
service available to them. UNESCO donated a 12-seated wagon in 1981 for the purpose of students’ reporting assignments, but it has been used since then as a commuter for various chairmen of the Department and their family members.

All universities and three colleges that are offering Master in Mass Communication, have adopted the same pattern of syllabi that Punjab University introduced in 1960. Following courses are offered with very little variations in universities: (1.) Pakistan Studies (2.) Urdu/English Language (3.) Press History of the Sub-Continent/Media History (4.) Mass Communication Theories (5.) Research Methods (6.) Public Relations (7.) Comparative Social Sciences (8.) International Relations (9.) Comparative Economics (10.) Comparative Politics/Sociology (at some universities) (11.) Reporting (12.) Sub-Editing (13.) Feature and Column Writing (14.) Editorial/Opinion Writing (15.) Radio/Television Journalism (16.) Television Production (17.) Radio Production (18.) Advertising (19.) Periodical Journalism (20.) Thesis in lieu of two optional subjects.

An option for MA Journalism in Urdu and English is available since 1969, when Urdu medium was allowed by all universities for Master classes. Separate courses for Urdu and English were designed. However, basic courses like Media History, International Relations, Public Relations, Pakistan Studies, Comparative Economics and Politics and Theory of Mass Communication are common.

After Urdu option was allowed very few students opted for English Journalism. The fact of the matter is that in Punjab University, BZU Multan, Islamia University, Bahawalpur, Peshawar University, Government College University, Lahore, Fatima Jinnah College, Lahore all the teachers have done their Master in Urdu Journalism. All PhD theses produced in all universities have been written in except two, one in Karachi and one in Lahore. The Kinnaird College for Women, Lahore, is the exception that has two permanent staff members, both with
Journalism and Mass Communication

English option. The Department of Mass Communication at this college does not have an Urdu option either.

Evening Course
The Punjab University Department of Mass Communication launched an evening programme of Diploma in Development Communication in 1994. The one-year course, with English language and Urdu language options for examination, has five papers of one hundred marks each. The courses are:

1. Development
   The course consists of various aspects of national and international development with stress on economic development.

2. Development and Social Change
   This course deals with need for social change, innovation diffusion and social marketing.

3. Communication
   The course deals with process and theories of communication and role of communication for supporting development process and change.

4. Communication Strategies and Message Construction:
   The course consists of planning memo and its presentation, research report writing and project presentation.

5. Field Work
   For the completion of this course students are attached with various development projects/programmes of government/semi-government and private organisations.

Encouraged by the popularity of diploma course in development communication, the Mass Communication Department of the Punjab University also launched Master in Development Journalism in the evening classes in 1998-99. However, the Punjab Public Service Commission in June 2003, refused to recognise the degree of MA in Development Communication. The University is fighting for the case with the Commission in this respect.
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

First year of the two-year programme has the same four subjects that are part of diploma course in development communication.
In part II following six more courses are recommended:
1. Rural Sociology
   The course pertains to various sociological concepts; rural-urban contrast and rural family system, and cultural study of rural life.

2. Public Relations
   In this course the theory of public relations and practices in NGOs, government departments and private organisations are discussed.

3. Fundamentals of Advertising and Communication Research
   How advertising works, its channels and influence on target audiences is the theme of this course besides research methods and the writing of research reports.

4. Selection and Use of Communication Channels
   Media strategy and use of various media with its merits and demerits are the objectives of this course.

5. Thesis/Optional Courses
   A thesis or two optional courses are offered. The optional courses are:
   a. Agricultural Journalism
   b. Health Communication
   c. Community Broadcasting
   d. Community Newspaper
   e. News Writing and Reporting
   f. Feature Writing

MPhil and PhD Courses
Department of Mass Communication at Punjab University started registration for PhD programme in 1978-79. Earlier, one female candidate was registered as a PhD candidate in department of Urdu in the University. Up to 1986, four in-service teachers of the Department of Mass Communication had received their PhDs from the same department. Afterwards the Department registered a few students also, and up to 2001 two male and one female teacher with three male student candidates had got their PhD degrees. One female teacher also completed
her degree in 1987 from the Department of Urdu. In 2003, the Punjab University launched a programme for the regular enrolment of PhD candidates, which required course work as well as thesis, abandoning the old thesis alone method. The department of Mass Communication has also adopted this new procedure.

**Karachi University**

The Department of Mass Communication, Karachi University, started registration for PhDs in 1976. Since then 10 candidates, including two females, have received their doctorates. The other three universities that have PhD, programmes in Mass Communication are B. Z. University, Multan (two degrees awarded so far); Islamia University, Bahawalpur and Gomal University, D. I. Khan.

The Punjab University was pioneer in launching MPhil programme in the subject in 1995. On average, about ten candidates are given admission in the two-year programme. During the first three years of the programme a number of teachers from various departments of Mass Communication from Lahore, Peshawar, Multan and Bahawalpur completed their MPhil from here to enhance their qualification.

**Teachers of Mass Communication and their Qualifications**

With the increase in the number of Mass Communication departments and rising number of students seeking admission, the number of faculty members also registered a significant improvement. In 1959, department of the Punjab University started with just two faculty members. In 2003 the total number of permanent staff in Pakistan is around 64. Besides these permanent staff members all departments acquire the services of media persons on part-time basis also. Out of 64 teachers, 19 are female, fourteen teachers at present are PhD degree holders, of which three are PhDs from US, while ten teachers have MPhil degrees. A total number of three teachers have MS degrees from United States.
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

The US Education Foundation in Pakistan gave a large number of fellowships in various faculties in last 25 years. Twelve Journalism/Mass Communication teachers visited various American Universities as Fulbright Scholars during this period. Quite a few MA degree holders in Mass Communication from the Punjab University have got MS and other certificates from abroad but they are not in the profession of teaching.

**Male-Female Student Ratio**
In Punjab University and Karachi University on average, the girl/boy ratio is one-to-one, while at other institutions this ratio is one female student against two male students. Of course, the three women institutes that offer Master courses in Lahore are exclusively for female students.

**Conclusions**
Starting with one department at the time of Independence and two in 1963, the discipline of Mass Communication has witnessed tremendous growth since then. By the year 2001, the number of departments at university and college level has risen to ten. Similarly, the average number of teacher per department, which in 1963 was 2.5 became six in the year 2001. During this period, the percentage of teacher with PhD degrees rose by five. However, during this period there was a decline in the percentage of teachers with foreign degree both among all the teachers as well as among PhD teachers.

The print media generally has remained hostile and advertising agencies indifferent towards graduates of Journalism/Mass Communication. However, most graduates of Journalism/Mass Communication still are able to find jobs in government departments like the Directorate of Public Relation (DPR), the Press Information Department (PID), Pakistan Broadcasting Corporation (PBC) and Pakistan Television Corporation (PTV).

Considered in the general perspective of the state of disciplines of social science, the level of development of the discipline of Mass Communication is not much different from others. The
character of job-oriented education of science and then stereotyped attitude of the younger generation and their parents towards information technology has relegated the status of already downgraded higher education in social sciences and pure arts subjects. Another factor that has reduced the importance of social sciences in the country is the fragility of democratic culture and weak democratic structure. Social science flourish in an environment of freedom of expression, which only a democratic system can ensure.
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

Annex I

The Year Thirteen Universities and Colleges Started Offering Master Degree Programmes in Mass Communication

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>University</th>
<th>Year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>University of the Punjab, Lahore</td>
<td>1959</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>University of Karachi, Karachi</td>
<td>1963</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>University of Sindh, Jamshoro</td>
<td>1978</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Gomal University, D. I. Khan</td>
<td>1975</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>B. Z. University, Multan</td>
<td>1980</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Balochistan University, Quetta</td>
<td>1978</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>Islamia University, Bahawalpur</td>
<td>1980</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>Allama Iqbal Open University, Islamabad</td>
<td>1986</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>Kinnaird College for Women, Lahore</td>
<td>1997</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.</td>
<td>Lahore College for Women University, Lahore</td>
<td>2000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>Fatima Jinnah College, Lahore</td>
<td>2001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13.</td>
<td>Beacon House National University, Lahore</td>
<td>2003</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In Karachi Dr. Feroze Ahmad Institute of Mass Communication is in the process of being established since 2001. The building of the institute is almost complete at the Karachi University Campus. Karachi University, Sindh University, Punjab University and Kinnaird College are also offering BA (Honours) courses.
Annex II

Number of Teachers and their Qualifications
The data from 1963 Handbook\(^2\) shows that the total number of teachers in the two Mass Communication departments existing at that time was five with an average of 2.5 teachers per department. By the year 2001, the total number of teachers in ten Mass Communication departments rose to 63, the average per department becoming six, which is almost thrice the average number of teachers in 1963.

Out of five teachers of Mass Communication in 1963, three had their degrees from foreign universities. In 2001, out of 63 teachers eight (13%) had such degrees showing 47% decline in foreign qualified teachers. In 1963, there was one PhD teacher who had a foreign degree. In 2001, out of the total 16 PhD teachers, eight (50%) had their degrees from foreign universities, showing a 50% decline in the foreign trained PhDs. Overall conclusion that emerges from the above data is that the share percentage of teachers with PhD increased by 2001 but the share percentage of foreign qualified teachers among all teachers as well as PhD teachers declined.

PhD and MPhil Theses
Since the emergence of the country up to 2001 (54 years) Mass Communication departments in five public universities\(^3\) have produced a total of 29 theses (all PhD) with an average of 0.5 theses per year. Six (21%) were produced before 1987 (0.2 per year) and 22 (76%) were completed between 1987 to 2001 (1.5 per year).\(^4\) This data suggests that production of these PhD theses in first 39 years (counting from 1948 to 1986) was much slower than during 15 years from 1987 to 2001.

The decade-wise breakdown of theses shows that no thesis was produced during 40s, 50s and 60s. After that, two PhD theses were produced in 70s, six in 80s and 19 in 90s. Only one PhD thesis was produced in the year 2001.\(^5\) It may be noted that more than half theses were completed in the decade of 90s.
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

Out of 29 theses produced by 2001, 15 were written in Urdu, 12 in English and two in Sindhi. Twenty Four (83%) writers of these theses were male and remaining five (17%) were females. From the total 29 theses produced by 2001, Punjab University produced the highest number of theses (14 PhD theses), followed by University of Karachi (seven PhD theses) and University of Sindh (four PhD theses). The remaining two universities, Bahauddin Zakariya University and Islamia University, produced two theses each.

The topics of 29 PhD theses produced by five public Universities can be placed in the following categories. Seven theses were written on the development of Journalism/Mass Communication, six of them focus on political development/constitution of the country, and five of them examine the impact of Media on different parts of society. Another five theses review the influence and contributions of different personalities on Journalism. The remaining four cannot be grouped together.
Journalism and Mass Communication

Notes

1 See Annex I for a list of institutions.
2 For full information on Handbooks used in the text see footnote 10 in introductory chapter of this book.
3 University of the Punjab, Karachi University, Sindh University, B. Z. University, Islamia University.
4 There is one PhD thesis of Punjab University whose year of completion is not available.
5 The information about the year of completion of one PhD thesis is not available.
6 Ten were produced in Punjab University, three in Karachi University and one each in Sindh University and Islamia University.
7 Four each in Punjab University and Karachi University, two in Bahauddin Zakariya University and one each in Islamia University and Sindh University.
8 Both were produced by Sindh University.
Area Studies in Pakistan: An Assessment

Muhammad Islam

Introduction

The origin of Area Studies, as an interdisciplinary programme of research and study, can be traced to the American academia. Area specialisation existed at few places in the United States before the World War II. However, formal Area Study Centres and institutes grew in number and gained legitimacy only in the post-war period, although not without criticism from conventional. A number of reasons account for the need for area programmes and their rapid growth across the United States in the post-war period. These include: (a) the phenomenal growth of higher education in the United States in the 1950s and 1960s; (b) the rise of the Cold War and the consequent American national need and desire to better understand foreign, especially the non-Western societies; (c) the American scholars’ realisation of the inadequacy of traditional European approaches to capture the richness and diversity of the post-war world; and (d) generous private and federal funding for establishing Area Centres across the United States. Although the growth of knowledge was one of the purposes of Area Centres, it was essentially intended for utilitarian use rather than for theory building, which was understood to be the concern of traditional disciplines. The rapid expansion of area programmes across the United States through massive private institutional and federal funding was bound to encourage similar developments in other
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

parts of the world. Pakistan is no exception, although the rise of Area Centres in that country is rather a belated development.

The Rise of Area Study Centres in Pakistan — Rationale and Scope
In Pakistan, Area Study Centres began to emerge as early as 1973 against the backdrop of the 1971 crisis. In fact, the utter foreign policy failure in the 1971 Indo-Pakistan war and the consequent traumatic break-up of the country expedited the creation of Area Study Centres at various public universities of Pakistan. The failure convinced the then national political leadership of the need to create Area Study Centres that would study foreign societies and provide informed input in the foreign policy making process, helping national decision makers formulate sound foreign policies toward various regions of the world. The National Educational Policy of 1972-1980 designed in the background of the 1971 crisis clearly reflected this line of thinking. It explicitly recognised the ‘vital importance’ of studying foreign societies, especially those, which affect national interests of Pakistan, and envisaged the creation of Area Centres across the country for this purpose. Hence, the basic purpose of the creation of Area Centres in Pakistan in the 1970s was utilitarian rather than scholastic.

In 1975, the national parliament solemnised this line of thinking and the new educational policy together in its Area Study Act No. XLV, which sanctioned the establishment of Area Study Centres across the country. In pursuance of this legislative mandate, the federal government took the responsibility of financing the creation and functioning of six Area Study Centres at various public universities. These Centres included: (a) Area Study Centre for Europe (ASCE), University of Karachi, Karachi (b) Area Study Centre for Far East and South East Asia (ASC FE&SEA), University of Sindh, Jamshoro; (c) Area Study Centre for South Asian Studies (ASCASAS), University of the Punjab, Lahore; (d) Area Study Centre for the Middle East and Arab Countries (ASCME&AC), University of Balochistan, Quetta; (e) Area Study Centre for Russia, China, and Central
Area Studies in Pakistan: An Assessment

Asia (ASCRC&CA), University of Peshawar, Peshawar; and (f) Area Study Centre for Africa, North and South America (ASCAN&SA), Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad.6

The main function of these Area Centres is to promote a thorough understanding of contemporary societies in the world through the study of their history, culture, social structure, economic development, institutional arrangement, geopolitical compulsions, foreign policy orientation, etc. Area study Centres in Pakistan adopted an interdisciplinary approach in line with the requirements of this function. Such approach is manifested, to some extent, in the course offerings, dissertations, faculty hiring, training of area specialists, publications, seminars, etc. As specified in the Act, the Area Study Centres may engage in number of activities to achieve their aim. These activities included: (a) high level teaching and research; (b) training of researchers; (c) cooperative relationship with other teaching and research institutions; (d) organising conferences and seminars; and (e) conducting short and refresher courses. Such activities are thought to serve the purposes of producing adequately trained area specialists, developing national human resource, and promoting a better understanding of foreign societies, an important condition for the formulation of a sound foreign policy. The purpose of providing an informed input in the foreign policy making process presumes a close interaction between Area Study Centres and foreign policy making institutions in the country. Generally speaking, such interaction seldom occurs.

Area Studies — Quantitative and Qualitative Development

As already mentioned, six Area Centres devoted to the study of various regions of the world were created in the 1970s. Out of six Area Study Centres, two are located in Sindh, one in the Punjab, one in NWFP, one in Balochistan, and one in the federal capital. So far there is no change in the number and distribution of Area Centres. Although certain regions are ignored in teaching and research and some area programmes are almost dormant at various Centres, no new Centres are on the horizon.
and little effort is underway to activate dormant area programmes. The shortage of funds and the non-availability of qualified teachers and researchers partly account for this situation. In addition, the federal government appears reluctant to provide additional funds to activate dormant area programmes and set up new Area Study Centres because of the perception that the overall performance of most Area Study Centres has been less than satisfactory over the past two decades. Although some available evidence does support this assessment, it is not true of all Area Study Centres and for all their academic fields and activities.

All Area Study Centres offer degree programmes in their respective areas. Most of them offer MPhil and PhD degree programmes. Since Area Studies is a interdisciplinary programme of study, one may find students with various backgrounds enrolled in MPhil and PhD programmes. Mostly students with a degree in social sciences and English literature are attracted toward Area Study Centres. However, in some cases, Area Study Centres have allowed students of natural sciences to join their programmes and write dissertations on topics related to biochemistry, botany and medicine.

The Area Study Centres at University of Peshawar started its MPhil and PhD degree programmes in 1978 and 1982 respectively. The Area Study Centre at Quaid-i-Azam University launched its MPhil and PhD programmes in 1979. The Area Study Centre at University of Karachi introduced both MPhil and PhD degree programmes in 1990. The Area Study Centre for South Asian Studies at the University of the Punjab is last in the list to have launched MPhil and PhD degree programmes in 2002 and 2003 respectively.

The Area Study Centre at Quaid-i-Azam University is the only Area Study Centre, which is offering MSc programme. The Centre launched its MSc (Political Studies) programme in the spring 2002 semester. The main purpose of this programme is to develop a quality human resource needed in various fields in the
Area Studies in Pakistan: An Assessment

country; however, it will also strengthen MPhil and PhD programmes in American Studies at the Centre through feeding them with properly trained students at the MSc level. MSc students are offered a number of courses related to American Studies. In fact, students who take courses on American foreign policy, politics, political history, electoral behaviour, political parties, political thought, political development, culture and society are adequately prepared to cope with the rigours of interdisciplinary MPhil and PhD programmes at the Centre. Hence, MSc programme is hoped to further raise the standards of MPhil and PhD programmes and facilitate the achievement of desired excellence in these programmes.

MPhil at all Area Study Centres is a two-year (i.e., four-semester) degree programme. It involves 24 to 36 credit hours of course work and a dissertation. MPhil students are required to do eight to twelve courses, including the compulsory course on research methodology, during the first two semesters of their programme. The Area Study Centre at the University of Peshawar offers 12 courses whereas other Centres offer a maximum of eight courses to MPhil students.

MPhil courses at all Area Study Centres are designed in line with the interdisciplinary orientation of their degree programmes. In other words, each Area Study Centre offers diverse courses, which involve the study of society, culture, history, economic development, politics, and foreign policy of the region of its interest. The available information suggests that Area Study Centres regularly revise and update the contents of their syllabi. Such revisions are made to incorporate new developments both in the academic world and the region of interest for each centre. Although complete information is not available and, therefore, it is hard to make a definitive statement, the available data suggest that historical, descriptive, and theoretical approaches are used in the teaching of MPhil courses. The approach a teacher adopts in teaching a course very much depends on his/her own training and educational background. Most teachers trained in the United States show a clear preference for the theoretical approach in
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

their courses. Such preference is also reflected in their own research work and in term papers, assignments and dissertations MPhil students write under their supervision. A number of teachers who follow the theoretical approach in their courses seek to ensure that students are exposed to different theoretical perspectives on issues under study. For example, in a course on American foreign policy, students are familiarised with different theoretical interpretations of the Cold War. In this way, students become familiar with the strengths and weaknesses, including inherent biases, of different scholarly interpretations of the Cold War and can develop comparative analytical skills, which they may use to study other subjects and to produce quality research assignments.

Although at times teachers and students point out biases in the books and other teaching materials of foreign authors, which they use in different courses, these biases mostly involve methodological questions (i.e., research procedures, research designs, and use of specific datasets), interpretations of evidence and theoretical approaches. However, it is rare to hear about the need to indigenise and Islamise the discipline of Area Studies and the approaches to the study of foreign societies in Pakistan. In fact, students of Area Studies understand that the nature of their discipline is different from the nature of other traditional social sciences. Since the discipline of Area Studies in Pakistan focusses on the study of foreign societies, it makes no sense to strive for the indigenisation and Islamisation of this discipline as has been the case with traditional social sciences in the country over the past few decades. As a result, there is no or little debate on the need to ideologise Area Studies in Pakistan, although one hears a lot within and outside the classroom about the need to regularly revise and update MPhil courses, to improve the quality of teaching, and to encourage MPhil and PhD students to write quality dissertations.

After completing the course work in the first two semesters, an MPhil student is required to write a thesis, which he/she is expected to complete within the next two semesters. However, if
he/she is not able to complete his/her thesis within this period for one reason or another, he/she may be granted an extension of two more semesters. Like most other academic institutions in Pakistan, Area Study Centres offer research-based PhD degree programme. In other words, PhD programme does not involve any course work and a PhD candidate just writes his/her dissertation. In fact, the course work at MPhil level is considered adequate training enabling candidates to produce a satisfactory PhD dissertation. In exceptional cases, candidates without MPhil degrees are admitted to PhD programme; however, it is assured that such candidates have adequate teaching and research experience with a sound record of research publications and are often asked to complete MPhil course work.

Area Study Centres show a considerable variation in their performance in different fields, including the output of their academic programmes. The six Area Study Centres combined together have so far produced 126 MPhil students. According to the data available with the Federal Ministry of Education on Area Study Centres (see Annex I), the Area Study Centre at Quaid-i-Azam University leads others with 87 MPhil students to its credit over a period of little more than two decades. The Area Study Centre at University of Peshawar takes the second place with 23 MPhil graduates. The Area Study Centre at the University of Karachi produced seven MPhil graduates. According to the information available with the Ministry of Education, the Area Study Centre at the University of Sindh and Area Study Centre at the University of Balochistan produced six and five MPhil graduates respectively (see Annex I).10 The Area Study Centre at University of the Punjab is an exception: it has so far produced neither MPhil nor PhD scholars. In fact, it started its MPhil and PhD degree programmes in 2002 and 2003 respectively.

According to the available record (see Annex I), Area Study Centres have so far produced 65 PhDs. The Area Study Centre at the University of Peshawar surpasses others for training 54 out of 65 PhDs. The Area Study Centre at the University of Karachi
and Area Study Centre at the University of Sindh each produced four PhDs. The Area Study Centre at the Quaid-i-Azam University produced three PhDs.

MPhil and PhD candidates at each Area Study Centre wrote dissertations on various subjects, including foreign policy, politics, history, economic development, socio-cultural issues, literature, etc., of the area of their interest. However, patterns do emerge out of this variation. In other words, there are dominant trends in the subjects covered in these dissertations. For example, almost 78.5% of MPhil and PhD dissertations produced so far at the Area Study Centre at the Quaid-i-Azam University deal with some aspect of American foreign policy. Almost 37.6% out of 78.5% dissertations that deal with American foreign policy focus on US-Pakistan relations. A small number (i.e., 10.3%) of MPhil dissertations examine social, cultural and political issues such as women movements, racism, crime, religion, child labour, women in American politics, media, civil rights movement, and literature. Most dissertations are descriptive and historical rather than theoretical in approach. Of course, efforts have been made in many dissertations to analyse the problem at hand, although without any elaborate references to relevant theories. Few dissertations do represent a serious effort to examine an issue within a theoretical framework.

Likewise, MPhil and PhD dissertations produced so far at the Area Study Centre, University of Peshawar, exhibit interesting patterns, in spite of variation in the topics covered therein. A vast majority of these dissertations deals with North Western Frontier Province (NWFP) of Pakistan. However, the subjects examined in these dissertations are diverse: economic development, business issues, water resources, political developments, social structure, culture, literature, and important personalities of the province. A small number of these dissertations deal with political developments in Afghanistan, Pakistan-Afghan foreign relations, and Sino-Pakistan relations. Interestingly, some dissertations done on the Central Asian region study problems related to the fields of biochemistry, medicine and botany.
The common thread that runs through all MPhil and PhD dissertations produced at the Area Study Centres, the University of Karachi and University of Balochistan, is the focus on foreign policy issues of their respective areas. The small number of dissertations produced so far at these Centres partly explains the neglect of socio-political issues. It is hoped that as more people join these programmes and more dissertations are produced, socio-political issues and other neglected subjects will also be studied at these Area Centres.

Most MPhil and PhD dissertations produced at the six Area Study Centres are single country studies; only few are comparative studies. Both single country studies and comparative studies do not pretend to yield any theoretical insights. In other words, these are not intended to build social scientific theory. In most cases, MPhil and PhD candidates use secondary sources and conduct library-based research, which may involve the use of primary materials such as official documents; however, few candidates also use primary sources such as survey research and fieldwork to collect data for their dissertations. The lack of adequate training of students in quantitative techniques, language barriers and shortage of funds to conduct fieldwork partly explain their bias toward library-based research.

The variation in the output of six Area Study Centres in terms of number of MPhil and PhD degree holders, research areas covered in MPhil and PhD dissertations and research techniques used in these dissertations is partly the function of the number of teachers and researchers available at each centre and their qualification, training, and research interests. In most cases, due to the lack of funds, there is inadequate faculty at most of the Area Study Centres. Also there is a small number of foreign qualified faculty members at these Centres and there are no institutional arrangements and schemes for training faculty abroad, especially in Europe and North America.
The available information on the Centres suggests that over a period of more than two decades the growth in the size of the teaching and research staff of most Area Study Centres has been insignificant. The Area Study Centre at the University of Peshawar leads other Area Study Centres in terms of the size of faculty. However, by looking at decade-wise strength and change in the size of faculty and research staff, the statistical picture we get is hardly encouraging. The Area Study Centre at the University of the Punjab with its four-member faculty and Area Study Centre in Peshawar University with its 10-member faculty saw no change since their establishment in 1973 and 1975 respectively. Out of four faculty members working with the former, three have a PhD and one has an MA degree. The three PhD faculty members have foreign degrees. As of 2004, three research fellows are associated with the centre. In the case of the Area Study Centre at the University of Peshawar, only two PhD faculty members have foreign degrees; out of the remainder eight faculty members, seven PhD and one MPhil have Pakistani degrees. As of 2004, the centre has two research associates. The Area Study Centre in Karachi University, which was established in 1974, conducted its academic activities with six and eight faculty members in the second and third decades of its existence respectively. No faculty member of the Area Study Centre at the University of Karachi has a foreign degree. Three PhD and three MPhil all have Pakistani degrees. Three research fellows worked at the centre in the first decade, five in the next and eight in the third decade of its existence.

For almost seven years after its establishment in 1978, the Area Study Centre in QAU functioned with one permanent faculty member. In order to run its MPhil programme, especially the course work and supervision of MPhil dissertations, the Centre relied on the services of visiting faculty members. In most cases, other social science departments at Quaid-i-Azam University served as a good reservoir of visiting faculty for the Centre. In the first decade of its establishment, the average faculty strength of Centre has been less than two members per year. In the second and third decades, the strength has been three and five
respectively. As of 2004, the Centre has eight faculty members who teach courses and supervise dissertations. Four research associates worked with the Centre in the first decade and three in the second decade of its existence. As of today, there is no research associate at the Centre. In other words, whatever research work is being produced at the centre is mostly the result of the contribution of the faculty members. Out of eight faculty members, four have PhD, three have MPhil and one has MA degrees. It is important to mention that most of the time one or two faculty members are on long leave for varied reasons, including research and teaching assignments. Although the overall number of the faculty has grown over the years at the Centre, there is no improvement in terms of student-teacher ratio. In fact, the situation has rather deteriorated. The overall increase in the number of faculty members is hardly a source of consolation because with the introduction of MSc programme the size of student body has increased manifold over the past two years. As a result, the Centre still needs visiting faculty members to run its academic programmes.

Area Study Centres are sensitive to the shortage of both faculty and funds for faculty training abroad. As a result, an effort is underway at most Centres to strengthen their PhD programmes. In fact, underlying this effort is the understanding that the cost of faculty training abroad is becoming exorbitant and at the same time it is increasingly becoming difficult to secure adequate funds for this purpose; hence, waiting for the situation to improve automatically is no alternative and there is no better alternative than training local PhDs. It is hoped that the local PhDs will partly make up the shortage of faculty and will also contribute to human resource development in the country.

Hundreds of students have graduated from the six Area Study Centres and scores of teachers and researchers have been associated with them over the past two decades. However, no professional association has so far developed at any of these Centres. The absence of such professional association at the Area Study Centres in Lahore, Karachi, Quetta, and Jamshoro is
understandable because of a small number of MPhil and PhD graduates each has produced so far. However, the fact that such community did not develop at Area Study Centres in Islamabad and Peshawar is intriguing because scores of students have graduated from each of these Centres. In the recent past, a modest effort has been made at the Area Study Centre in Islamabad to set up the Pakistan Association of American Studies (PAAS). The PAAS has a small membership and it is still in the process of getting registered with the local authorities. In fact, the PAAS is a laudable initiative; however, it is at the infancy stage; it has yet to engage in productive academic activities and complement the academic programmes and activities of Area Study Centre at Quaid-i-Azam University. Through coordination, a well-developed and active professional community involved in academic activities could have helped each Area Study Centre (Centres) improve its performance record.

The overall contribution of six Area Study Centres combined together to human resource development through their academic programmes is no mean, although some concerned circles are less than satisfied with their performance. Of course, there is room for improvement in both the quantity and quality of output of these Centres. However, Area Study Centres can legitimately take credit for their contribution to supplying trained manpower to various sectors in the country. The graduates of Area Study Centres have been absorbed in many fields and professions, including teaching, research, journalism, private sector, state bureaucracies, etc. In fact, there are no serious complaints of unemployment from the graduates of most of these Centres.

Area Study Centres also contribute to the national discourse on various issues of national concern through publishing books, research papers, and newspaper articles and through holding seminars, symposia, conferences, workshops, short courses, etc. In addition to researches of MPhil and PhD candidates, researchers and teachers at Area Study Centres have produced a sizeable body of research on various topics. According to the
data available with the Federal Ministry of Education, the six Area Study Centres combined together have produced 281 books, 15 booklets, 925 research papers in national journals, and 98 research articles in foreign journals; they have so far organised 136 conferences, 234 seminars, 20 symposia, and 47 workshops (see Table 1 for details). Each Area Study Centre also brings out its own biannual journal. Both national and international scholars write for these journals. Of course, not all books, book chapters and articles produced by six Area Study Centres and their faculty members and researchers are of the same quality. Some publications of these Centres are of good quality and receive appreciation from eminent national scholars; however, some social scientists are of the view that most of the publications of the six Area Study Centres are of poor quality. In fact, in a race to bring out publications in order to get promotion and to show the productivity of their Centres to the Ministry of Education, some Area Study Centres and their faculty and researchers seem to have paid little attention to the quality which, in turn, exposed them to serious criticism of their peers.

The achievements of Area Study Centres draw quite conflicting responses from concerned circles. Some critics point toward the overall poor performance of Area Study Centres and argue that these Centres have failed to serve the basic purpose for which they were created. In other words, Area Study Centres did not produce quality research, which national decision makers could use to formulate sound foreign policies. Another group of critics does not use such utilitarian perspective to evaluate the performance of these Centres, rather it points out their failure to develop a true interdisciplinary programme of research and study. In other words, they contend that research and teaching programmes of Area Study Centres are biased toward certain disciplines, subjects and specialisations. Supporters of Area Study Centres view such criticism as unjustified, which they believe is the result of misunderstanding about ground realities pertaining to these Centres. In fact, they acknowledge that there is a room for improvement in their performance. However, they
take pride in their achievements that have been secured against many odds, including the lack of adequate funds, trained faculty, research journals, and books.

Conclusion
Area Studies as an interdisciplinary programme of study and research was introduced and Area Study Centres were established at various public universities in Pakistan with the exclusive support of the public sector. In fact, the private sector played no role in the rise of Area Studies in Pakistan. The official support was extended to Area Study Centres for the purpose of studying foreign societies with a view to providing informed input in the foreign policy making process. Such utilitarian purpose of Area Study Centres has been hardly served for several reasons, including the lack of coordination between these Centres and foreign policy making institutions. Still, Area Study Centres managed to survive and grow through shifting their focus to academic and scholastic functions. In this process, scores of qualified individuals have become available for absorption in various fields and professions in both the public and private sectors. Hence, like other educational institutions in the country, Area Study Centres have also been able to contribute to the development of national human resources.

In Pakistan, Area Studies has yet to become a truly interdisciplinary programme of study and research. Although efforts have been made to diversify their teaching and research programmes, the focus of almost all Area Study Centres has so far been on the study of international and domestic politics of foreign societies. In fact, such efforts are unlikely to achieve the desired diversification in teaching and research programmes and consequently Area Studies will not attain a truly interdisciplinary character without adequate manpower (i.e., teachers and researchers) trained in various fields of Area Studies.

The dispersal of Area Study Centres across the country appears to have compounded the problem of inadequate qualified teaching and research staff, hence hindering the
development of Area Studies into a truly interdisciplinary programme of study and research. In fact, each Area Study Centre functioned with limited human and material resources, which curtailed its capacity to engage in an interdisciplinary study of foreign societies, train a sizeable body of teachers and researchers specialising in various fields of Area Studies, and become more productive by engaging in high quality theoretical and/or policy-oriented research. In view of inadequate qualified manpower in the field of Area Studies, the dispersal of Area Study Centres across the country was bound to impair the overall performance of these Centres. Of course, Area Study Centres show considerable variation in their performance, including the output of their teaching and research programmes; some Centres have been more productive than others. However, their overall performance in general and the quality of their teaching and research programmes in particular have not obtained the desired international standard. This situation is by no means irreparable. In fact, appropriate measures such as adequate funds, training opportunities and incentives for teachers and researchers, and close cooperation between Area Study Centres and foreign policy making institutions, especially in undertaking policy-oriented research can help remedy the situation surrounding Area Study Centres. More precisely, such measures can help overcome conditions hindering the growth of Area Studies as a truly interdisciplinary programme of study and research, secure a legitimate place for Area Studies in the country, and enable Area Study Centres to play the assigned role.
## Annex I

Publications and Theses Produced by Six Area Study Centres in Pakistani Universities by the Mid of year 2004

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of Centres</th>
<th>Publications</th>
<th>Theses Produced</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Books</td>
<td>Booklets</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASCRC&amp;CA, University of Peshawar</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASCSAS, University of the Punjab</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASCANS, Quaid-i-Azam University</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASCFE&amp;SEA, University of Sindh</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASCME&amp;A, University of Balochistan</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASCE, University of Karachi</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>281</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Based on the information provided by the Ministry of Education and Area Study Centres.
Area Studies in Pakistan: An Assessment

Notes


2 Carnegie Corporation and Ford Foundation are among the main private donors, which played an important role in funding Area Study Centres in the United States. Although the private funding was critical to the initiation of the area programmes, the stabilisation of such programmes was certainly due to the federal funding. Ibid.

3 Great Britain was the first to follow suit. Ibid.

4 According to University Grants Commission, the first Area Study Centre, Area Study Centre for Far East and South East Asia, at the University of Sindh, Jamshoro, was established in 1973. See University Grants Commission, Handbook of Universities (University Grants Commission, Islamabad, 2001), p. 798. However, the Centre for South Asian Studies at the University of the Punjab claims that it was established in December 1973. The Area Study Centre at the University of Karachi, and Area Study Centre at Quaid-i-Azam University, were established in 1974 and 1978 respectively. There is a discrepancy in the information available about the year when the Area Study Centre for Russia and Central Asia at the University of Peshawar was established. The Area Study Centre at the University of Peshawar and the University Grants Commission’s Handbook of Universities give 1975 and 1978 respectively.

5 The Education Policy of 1972 was encapsulated in two speeches of the President of Pakistan, Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto and A. H. Peerzada, Minister for Education which have been published by the Ministry of Education. See Education Policy (Ministry of Education, 1972). According to the Education Policy of 1972, the ‘Study of various areas and societies, particularly those which affect national interest of our country is of vital importance to us.’ It envisaged the establishment of Area Study Centres, ‘one in each general university for research and advanced study of contemporary societies, particularly those of special interest to Pakistan.’ See the statement of A. H. Peerzada, Education Policy, p. 15.


7 At the Area Study Centre in Peshawar University, MPhil and PhD students have been allowed to write dissertations on topics related to natural sciences.

8 According to the data the Area Study Centre for South Asian Studies furnished, it has so far produced 30 MPhil theses. It is impressive in view of the fact the Centre launched its MPhil degree programme in 2002. However, there
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

is a discrepancy between this figure and the information available with the Ministry of Education. Detailed data on two Area Study Centres, Area Study Centre at University of Sindh, Jamshoro, and Area Study Centre at University of Balochistan, are not available. The two Centres were approached but we received no response from them.


10 In its correspondence with the Council of Social Sciences, Pakistan (COSS), the Area Study Centre at the University of Sindh claims to have launched its MPhil and PhD degree programmes in November 1999. It further claims that its students are busy in writing their dissertations. This claim suggests that no student has so far completed his/her MPhil and PhD degree at the Centre.

11 Survey research and fieldwork are expensive research techniques, students are generally not in a position to bear the cost, and there is little support available to them from other sources, including Area Study Centres.

12 There are contradictions in the available information on publications, conferences, MPhil and PhD graduates, etc. See Annex I, which is adapted from the information available with the Ministry of Education, with the conference paper of Dr. Riaz Ahmad, ‘Research Publications of Pakistan Study Centres, Area Study Centres and Centres of Excellence in Social Sciences in Pakistan,’ which he presented at the Conference on State of Social Sciences and Humanities: Current Scenario and Emerging Trends, held in Islamabad on December 15-17, 2003.

13 This is true of other Centres too.

14 There is a suggestion to merge Area Study Centres with their universities. The reasons for this suggested change include poor performance of Area Centres and optimisation of available resources.

15 Dr. Rasul B. Rais, Director, Area Study Centre, Quaid-i-Azam University, is a regular contributor to the newspaper. Dr. Noman Sattar of the same Centre also writes for the newspapers.

16 A complete list of books and articles published by each Centre and its faculty members cannot be provided here for a number of reasons, including the shortage of space. However, the following books, book chapters, and articles may be treated as the representative sample of the publications of each Centre: Rais Ahmad Khan (ed.), Pakistan-United States Relations, (1983); Itikhar H. Malik, US-South Asian Relations 1784-1940: A Historical Perspective, (1988); Muzaffar Ali Qureshi (ed.), Fifty Years of Pakistan-Canada Relations: Partnership for 21st Century, (1998); Firdous Nilofer, Western Influence on the Status of Women of Japan, (1994); Dr. A. A. Kadeer and Dr. Naveed A. Tahir (eds.), Europe and the Third World, (1985); Dr. Naveed A. Tahir,

Many scholars have expressed their views to this effect in formal interviews as well as in informal discussions. In addition to officials of the Ministry of Education and Foreign Office, some scholars also voice such criticism. Such critics include scholars associated with Area Study Centres who are not satisfied with the focus of centres on the political aspects. In fact, these critics are not satisfied with desire to broaden scope of both teaching and research work at the centres through focusing.
Pakistan Studies: A Subject of the State, and the State of the Subject

Syed Jaffar Ahmed

This paper is a modest attempt in understanding the background and development of Pakistan Studies. Introduced in the mid-1970s in Pakistan, first, at the university level, and later, in 1980s, in the schools and colleges, Pakistan Studies spans a considerable period of over a quarter of a century, a factor that enables it to be taken as a theme of research. As Pakistan Studies has been made a subject for the dissemination of the ideological position, and the socio-economic and political policies and perceptions of the state, it is inevitable to look into these to be able to analyse the contents of the Pakistan Studies courses. This paper is divided into two sections. The first section deals with the rationale of Pakistan Studies, its prospects as a multidisciplinary course and as a new discipline, the ways through, which the syllabus of Pakistan Studies is influenced by the state, and the manner in which the state’s own crisis of legitimacy has come to compound the problems of Pakistan Studies. In the second section Pakistan Studies as taught in the schools and colleges as well as in the centres of higher education and research in the universities of Pakistan, has been explored. This section also looks in detail into the role the Pakistan Studies Centres have played — while making use of whatever space was available to them — in expanding the scope of the subject. This
section not only assesses the research contribution of the Centres but also discusses their shortcomings.

Section 1: Rationale
To talk about the existing Pakistan Studies as an academic discipline seems to be a tall order, as despite almost three decades after its introduction in the educational institutions of Pakistan, it remains a problematic discipline. The introduction of Pakistan Studies encompassed numerous challenges on whose successful resolution rested its acceptance as a distinct genre of academics. These challenges exist even today when the horizons of human knowledge have expanded much further and the old disciplines have become richer while many new disciplines have emerged. The advancement in science and technology has been momentous in the latter half of the twentieth century. The invention and expansion of computer technology has revolutionised the world of knowledge. It would not be wrong to say that the world was never as knowledgeable previously as it is today and disciplines were never as numerous or as exhaustive as they are now.

In this environment of hectic intellectual activity and exemplary growth of knowledge, Pakistan Studies could have been a useful addition and a worthwhile contribution to the social sciences, had it been conceived and developed scientifically and with an open mind as an enlightened area of academic endeavour. (Had it been conceived and developed scientifically and with an open mind as an enlightened area of academic endeavour, Pakistan Studies could have been a useful addition and a worthwhile contribution to the social sciences, in this environment of hectic intellectual activity and exemplary growth of knowledge.) Rationalism and objectivity were essential imperatives for its growth as prejudices can lead to anything but the promotion of knowledge, and curb the advent of an academic discipline. In the case of Pakistan Studies, prejudice and lack of rationalism and objectivity has marred its development. Had the essential conditions in which disciplines develop and grow were kept in
Pakistan Studies: A Subject of the State and the State of the Subject

view while conceiving Pakistan Studies, it would have certainly attained for itself a distinct place among existing disciplines.

In fact, numerous facts and features pertaining to Pakistan entitle it to invite the focus of critical inquiry from divergent perceptions — historical, anthropological, religious, social, political, economic, etc. These perceptions together can merge into a multi-disciplinary framework, which could form the core of Pakistan Studies. Pakistan is the land, which nourished one of the oldest human civilisations. Its geo-political conditions made it a gateway for entering India over the centuries. Pakistani regions enshrine a history of religious harmony as well as of communal strife. Great sufi saints left their lasting imprint on the psychological and emotional make-up of the peoples’ mind here. Pakistan was a victim of colonial onslaught and served as a laboratory for a new form of social engineering. History’s biggest migration took place across its borders in the aftermath of the Partition of India. Its creation was an unprecedented event in the modern history of nation formation. Its break-up in 1971 forms another unusual example of national disintegration. Its contribution over centuries in the domains of literature, arts and architecture has been immense and extraordinary. Its political history, spread over more than five decades, illustrates the gigantic challenges a post-colonial state could encounter in attaining its pre-Independence ideals of democracy and social justice. The resolve of its people to survive despite all social and political odds has been, in itself, an extraordinary phenomenon. In short, Pakistan excels in unique features, which can be addressed from the perspectives of different disciplines converging to give birth to multi-disciplinary and meaningful Pakistan Studies.

What are the conditions in which academic disciplines flourish and enrich themselves and what are the essential criteria, which give credibility to these disciplines at a universal level? The fundamental pre-condition is the availability of an independent environment in which free inquiry can be carried out. Social sciences cannot develop in the absence of freedom of thought
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

and expression. These sciences are nourished on debate, on the testing of existing knowledge, and on discovery and innovation. This is possible only in a democratic society with democratic institutions of governance and justice. Non-democratic societies may contain individuals making useful contributions in different academic domains but these, by and large, remain exceptions. Or, at best, a group of such individuals may form a tradition in a larger sense. Such individual and group efforts, however, do not compensate for organised and institutionalised work. In short, it is only in a democratic milieu that the creative impulse of a society flourishes, the knowledge grows and the academic disciplines expand. In the case of Pakistan, this democratic environment, unfortunately, was never available. This caused the poverty of knowledge, under-development of social sciences and the near obscurity of original theoretical work, emanating from the institutions of higher learning in the country. It was in this environment that the seed of Pakistan Studies was sowed. Needless to say that what it has achieved and what it has come to be is not a source of pride.

The absence of democratic values in Pakistani society can be traced to the Mediaeval times. Throughout this period, authoritarianism and feudalism — though different from its European form — governed society with the result that intellectual stagnation became the hallmark of the society and conformism, religious obscurantism and priesthood, and orthodoxy reigned supreme, governing the lives of the people. These traits, by and large, continued even during the colonial period.

The colonial encounter did expose India to Western knowledge but it was denied the freedom of thought, which had facilitated the enrichment of knowledge in the West. Apprehending a possible reaction from the colonised people, they were deprived the texts of Rousseau, Voltaire, Tom Paine, Marx and even the British Fabians. Only those Western ideas were taught to the Indians who could help create an educated body of slaves designed to serve the colonial administration and its system of
control as pliable functionaries. The mind thus created was subservient and it served the officialdom or at best was self-serving. This mindset could hardly facilitate the realisation of the onerous task of building a democratic culture in the new country. The creation of a new country had provided an opportunity to de-colonise the society but the opportunity could not be made use of given the socio-political realities at the dawn of Independence. The state-society disequilibrium of the colonial period passed into the new country unhindered, with an authoritarian state continuing to control the society through its coercive apparatus as well as non-coercive means, education being one. After over half a century of independence, Pakistan is still anchored to its colonial past. All through these years, the country has been led by an authoritarian system whose political configuration has oscillated between military rule and the so-called civilian dispensation of ‘guided democracy’ — elected governments functioning under the terms laid down by extra-constitutional forces.

The post-colonial state in Pakistan, whose authoritarian character has been consolidated by Western approbation it has almost always succeeded in acquiring, tends to monopolise resources, has its own priorities and perceptions regarding the economy, politics, administration and social welfare. The post-colonial state has developed amidst its integration with the world capitalist system, which makes it submit to the conditionalities (conditions) of the international financial institutions like the IMF, the World Bank and now increasingly the WTO. Pakistan’s dependence on the West and the US dictates it to fulfil the latter’s objectives in the region. Previously, it was a role in the containment of communism and in recent times it is combating terrorism. Domestically, the postcolonial state in Pakistan has evolved into a national security state — a status, which grounded itself, originally, in the conflict between India and Pakistan over Kashmir. Now it has extended its raison d’être to a political economy of defence and the military’s overall dominance over civil society in all major walks of life. The Indo-Pakistan conflict itself has continued despite three wars between the two countries.
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

locked into an arms race and a web of nuclear proliferation. The continued tension between the two countries, which are also nuclear powers now, has had far-reaching domestic implications, distorting national priorities.

In the case of Pakistan, defence gets the highest priority. After the repayment of foreign debt, the biggest chunk of the GDP goes to defence. The social sector is entitled to a meagre sum. In 1998-2000, education received just 1.8 percent of the GDP, and 7.8 percent of the total government expenditure. Moreover, the decision-making mechanism of the country depicts a highly centralised tendency with the military-bureaucratic establishment acting as the custodian of the system. What are the implications of all this for education? Firstly, education is relegated to the lowest rung of the ladder of national priorities, and secondly, it is centrally controlled and made to serve the objectives of the state. The prime objective of the state with respect to education is to use it as a vehicle for promoting its perceptions and legitimising the existing system. Consequently, education is used to indoctrinate the values of conformism, obscurantism and jingoism. Unfortunately, these values have collectively been designated as the ‘Ideology of Pakistan’, a phrase which, no matter when it was first used, was given currency more systematically in the late 1960s.

Since Pakistan Studies has been chosen by the successive governments as the major carrier of the Ideology of Pakistan, it would not be inept to delve into the issue of ideology. It is often claimed that Pakistan is an ideological state, which makes it distinct from other states. This repeated assertion has become a cliché and recurs in the religio-political sermons and resonates in the media. A good part of the intelligentsia has also accepted it uncritically. More importantly, it is the state that takes the lead in voicing it.

A critical look into the issue, however, reveals that the attribute of being ideological is not unique to Pakistan. In fact, the history of states demonstrates that almost all of them have been
‘ideological’. This is so because state and ideology are intertwined and they vitalise each other. As the state seeks to monopolise power, it needs a legitimising means and ideology is the most useful one. So states whether capitalist, liberal, socialist, fascist or others, all rely on legitimising ideologies. Ideologies, in return, earn sanctity by becoming a source of political allegiance for the state. However, the states’ reliance on ideology varies. While some make excessive use of it, others do not feel compelled to drum it up all the time. One could argue that where there is less need of legitimisation there is less talk of ideology, and where legitimacy is weak there is more emphasis on ideology.

In the case of Pakistan, the question is not whether or not it is an ideological state; the question is what have been its ideology and what ideology would have best suited its nation-state character. The phrase — the ‘Ideology of Pakistan’ is generally explained to be Islam, but this is done without the realisation of the fact that religion and ideology are two separate categories. Religion is a universal and trans-territorial reality, which brings into being a community of faith, although articulations of religion vary from country to country. Ideologies are a political construct, more often created by the states themselves, often making use of the idioms and ideas of political thinkers. As a state is a territorial entity, its ideology is confined to its territory, and is meant for the people inhabiting the territory. The people who constitute the nation may have differences of culture, language, religion or belief, but they form one nation by being in a nation-state. The ideology of the Pakistani State would serve its interests best if it succeeds in securing the allegiance of all of its inhabitants irrespective of their differences. By making religion its ideology the state would be compelled to segregate among its people. Religion and state converge only in theocracies where a class of religious leaders or followers of one religion dominate and shape the state to the exclusion of other religious communities. In such cases religion is invoked to construct the ideology of the state.
Applied to Pakistan, this discussion poses the question whether the country should be a nation state allowing all religious groups the same status of citizenship or should it be a theocratic state having the domination of one religion and accepting the others at best as minorities. Opting for the latter would deny the country a nation state character, which at least in principle, and in law, ensures equality of citizens without assuming them as constituting majorities or minorities. However, while dilating on the idea of nation state it should not be forgotten that in order to unify, the nation state in fact also homogenises and erases difference, which may be perceived as wrong.

During the Freedom Movement, the leadership of the Muslim League, particularly the Quaid-i-Azam Mohammad Ali Jinnah, time and again proclaimed that Pakistan would not be a theocracy. Upon the creation of the country, Jinnah very clearly laid down the concept of Pakistani nationhood and his vision of the Ideology of Pakistan. In his address to the inaugural session of the Constituent Assembly of Pakistan on 11 August 1947, he announced that we will have to undo the angularities of the minorities and the majorities, and that everyone belonging to whatever religion would be an equal citizen of the state. He further announced that in the state of Pakistan every citizen would be free to pursue his/her religion without interference of the state. In other words Jinnah was presenting the future Pakistan ideology as the ideology of a nation state rather than that of a theocracy. This ideology of Pakistan unfortunately vanished with the death of Jinnah. And, contrary to this, an ideology was constructed, which instead of uniting the people created divisions in the name of religion. Much later when Pakistan Studies was introduced as a compulsory subject, during the regime of General Zia-ul-Haq, it was made a vehicle for this particular ideology. Whether or not Pakistan Studies fulfilled this purpose is difficult to say but what can be said easily is that Pakistan Studies did not develop its actual possibilities and potential.
The Potential of Pakistan Studies

What possibilities and prospects could Pakistan Studies have in an independent environment? First and foremost, it could have become a discipline on the pattern of Area Studies. A number of Area Studies have now grown into full-fledged disciplines. Study of a particular area and its people has been an intellectual undertaking since centuries. Region-specific studies were common even in the Mediaeval times, but it was in the modern times that Area Studies became popular with a number of social scientists — from Max Weber to Earnest Gellner and Edward Said — who earned their reputation through their profound works on particular regions. Brian Spooner holds that the ‘focussed interdisciplinary study of particular parts of the modern world developed originally out of classical studies in the Western curriculum’. Orientalism is a term whose meaning was transformed overnight in 1978 (for better or worse) by Edward Said’s publication of the same name. This type of academic endeavour had a philological or textual base and did not begin to grow out of that tradition until well into the 19th century. Thus while Orientalism became a distinct subject Asiatic, American and African studies emerged as specific academic fields, even though some of these areas, like the Americas, may not be in a position to claim as rich a history as Pakistan can.

Over time, the context and content of Area Studies have also changed. There was a time when travellers would pen down their observations, which was one form of understanding other regions. With the rise of trade and discovery of new trade routes, an understanding of other societies became a material necessity. Area Studies were further promoted during the colonial era ‘in response to the politico-military needs of the expanding Western influence and domination in the continents of Asia and Africa’. The First and the Second World Wars further advanced the importance of Area Studies. In contemporary times, Area Studies do not merely mean the studies of ‘other societies’. Now one’s own society and country may also constitute an area to be studied. Today in many countries Area Study Centres are
established as multi-disciplinary Centres to conduct research and investigate the various aspects of their own society.

An Area Study attains its true character only if it is developed as a multi-disciplinary field of study. The purpose of an Area Study is not served by focussing on one particular aspect of a society or addressing different aspects in a disjointed manner. A multi-disciplinary character implies that the past and present of a society are analysed with the help of different disciplines bringing about an integrated picture, which may not subscribe solely to one particular discipline. In this context, Area Studies are perhaps more important and, certainly, more challenging than the separate disciplines. An Area Study is a build-up on divergent disciplines. Secondly, a multi-disciplinary Area Study also implies that theories, theoretical models and paradigms, and theoretical debates of different disciplines are applied to a region to test their theoretical validity. Thirdly, a multi-disciplinary Area Study also enables different tools of research and methodologies to be applied to a particular region to discover data, which cannot be found by relying on one particular tool of research and methodology.

**Historical Development of Pakistan Studies**

Pakistan became the subject of inquiry for various writers soon after the creation of the country. As the immediate context of these studies was the creation of the country itself, most of the writers devoted their efforts to the understanding of the Partition of India. Some writers sought to unearth the country’s geopolitical background to ancient times. Mortimer Wheeler’s work traced Pakistan’s history back to 5,000 years. Later the country’s society, politics and economy also drew numerous writers’ attention. These works had different approaches, covered different dimensions of Pakistan and offered divergent explanations. All these studies, whether done in Pakistan or abroad, can be characterised in a loose manner, as establishing an independent tradition in Pakistan Studies. The works falling in this tradition represented perceptions and models of authors hailing from different backgrounds and schools of thought.
Notwithstanding their points of departure from each other, they can all be identified as part of an independent tradition for they were distinct from the official versions being projected in Pakistan.

Up until the early 1970s, the official version of Pakistan’s history and society was disseminated through the existing subjects like History, Social Studies, and Humanities. The state did not feel the need to create a new subject for promoting these perceptions. In the courses of History and Social Studies, a particular concept of Pakistani nationhood was promoted, which negated the regional identities and asserted national unity based on religion and Pakistani nationalism, which were presented as one and the same thing. The official historiography relied heavily on the two-nation theory, which was presented as a pre-conceived and primordial concept rather than as a political doctrine, evolved during the struggle of the Indian Muslims for the realisation of their socio-political rights vis-a-vis the Hindu majority.

After the separation of its eastern wing, Pakistan faced a severe crisis of identity. There arose a question whether Pakistan was a viable idea at all. It was also asked: could the remaining country survive following the secession of one wing of it, which also possessed the majority of the country’s population. Pakistan’s failure in national integration also invited queries about the efficacy of religion in ensuring country’s unity. In response to these issues, at least four types of arguments were offered.

The first point of view was that Pakistan was created in the name of Islam, which alone could claim to be its ideology. The objective of the creation of the country was the establishment of an Islamic state. Islam alone could unite the eastern and Western wings of the country. Since Pakistan could not become a truly Islamic state, internal and external anti-Islamic forces succeeded in conspiring against the country and severed it. The remaining part of the country would also continue to face the threat of
disintegration if Islamic system is not enforced in the country in letter and spirit.6

The second school of thought preferred to identify Pakistan as a Muslim state rather than an Islamic state. Adhering to the pre-Partition two-nation theory and regarding it not only relevant despite Partition of India but also extremely useful in Pakistan, the proponents of this view appeared to hold that Islam was important for Pakistan as it distinguished her from India. They would not subscribe to the extremist Islamic position of the Ulema, but valued Islam as an identity vis-a-vis India and as a legitimising device for the overriding policies and perceptions of centralisation. After the 1971 East Pakistan debacle, the proponents of this view insisted on the two-nation theory with renewed vigour.

Islam as an identity against India became even more pronounced in the 1970s when Pakistan came closer to the Arab world. East Pakistan’s separation had broken the country’s link with South East Asia. Placed now at the extreme west of the subcontinent, bordering Iran, Pakistan could now be viewed as being part of the Middle East. The geopolitical conditions of the 1970s provided a good opportunity to pursue this course. Following the 1973 Arab-Israel war and the emergence of the weapon of oil, the Arab world had emerged stronger both morally and materially. In 1974, Pakistan hosted the Islamic Summit, bringing to its soil a galaxy of the Muslim and particularly Arab leaders. Images of Islamic solidarity emanating from Lahore augmented Pakistan’s own newly cultivated identity as harbinger of pan-Islamism. In Pakistan, the advocates of the above view drew from these developments impetus for their arguments suggesting that Pakistan’s newly established linkages with the Arab world, reassert its difference from India. Z. A. Suleri, a pro-establishment journalist and a strong holder of the view argued thus:

‘Arabs have realised the importance of unity. The influence and power of oil and money was already there, it became a weapon only when the Arabs became united. This unity can
Pakistan Studies: A Subject of the State and the State of the Subject
easily extend and Pakistan can enter into it as the central point.... [Today] Middle East constitutes the most important aspect of Pakistan’s foreign policy.\(^7\)

At another place, while projecting the same theme, Suleri also explained how the point of view of Islamic ideology as propounded by this school of thought differed with the Islamists’ idea of the Islamic State. He wrote:

‘The ideology of Pakistan does not mean that it extends to the entire universe and humanity. Islam does enjoy this position but the ideology of Pakistan represented the struggle of a particular section of the Muslim Ummah. This struggle was led by Mohammad Ali Jinnah, who had a particular mission, different from that of other leaders of the Muslim world.... We are human beings as well as upholders of Islam but we are also Pakistanis with a Muslim nationality, which has emerged at a particular geographical location of Asia and in particular circumstances.’

Building upon this Suleri idealised the newly emerged opportunity of Pakistan-Arab unity. He wrote:

‘We gave up our Indian nationality and accepted Muslim nationality. If the Arabs also give up their ethnic Arab nationalism and accept Muslim nationalism, then Pakistan can become an integral part of the Middle East, and thus the dream of Muslim unity could come true.... Our security demands that we turn our face towards the Middle East on our west, since this region is central to our geographical, religious, and defence conditions; our national existence should have its Centre of gravity in Cairo, rather than in Delhi. If this happens one would realise how important is the Muslim nationalism.’\(^8\)

The idea of identifying Pakistan with the Middle East was further consolidated when in the 1970s and 1980s three million Pakistani expatriates went to the Arab countries in pursuit of a better livelihood. The new proximity between Pakistan and the Middle East was later woven into history to give rise to a
historiography emphasising Pakistan’s association with the region in contrast with its Indo-Islamic past.

The third point of view emphasised neither the Indo-Islamic past, nor was excited by the Middle Eastern romance, but aspired to locate and discover Pakistan’s past within its territorial confines. The proponents of this view suggested that Pakistan had a distinct position conditioned by its geography and physical features. In the early 1970s, Dr. Qudratullah Fatmi came out with his thesis on Pakistani nationalism, justifying it on the distinct features of geography and territory. The Indian nationalist historiography had all along been projecting the oneness of the Indian subcontinent, and for this it relied on, apart from other factors, the physical features of the region. It would suggest that India was demarcated from the rest of the world by the natural boundaries of mountains in the north and the sea in the south. Fatimi denounced this and argued that the Indian subcontinent was a microcosm — a world in itself, with its heartland, and on the east and west of it, its rim lands, which later constituted East and West Pakistan. The two regions of the rim lands (East and West Pakistan) were, on the one hand, distinct from the heartland (which, as a result of 1947 Partition, became the state of India), and on the other, together constituted a united geographical entity.⁹

In the 1970s many other writers took the same line of argument, and suggested that being a nation state Pakistan should create its identity on the merit of its territory. They also sought to construct Pakistan’s history accordingly thereby attempting to realise what Nicos Poulantzas described as the ‘territorialisation of history and historicity of territory’.¹⁰ Notwithstanding the reductionism inherent in this position, it could, perhaps, have the advantage of emphasising the assumed cultural homogeneity within Pakistan thus presenting it as being distinct from the regions around.¹¹

The fourth point of view held that Pakistan was a multi-cultural and a multi-ethnic society, which made it imperative for it to
Pakistan Studies: A Subject of the State and the State of the Subject

have a state system with political institutions reflective of the plurality of the society. The upholders of the view opposed a strong centre and regarded maximum provincial autonomy essential for the integration of Pakistan. They also laid emphasis on social justice and demanded the state to uphold secular values ensuring equality of rights to its citizens. This point of view found its elaboration in the writings of Faiz Ahmed Faiz, Syed Sibte Hasan, Ghaus Bux Bizenjo, Dr. Feroz Ahmed and many others. The point of view was popular among the regional nationalist organisations and a significant section of intelligentsia with secular and leftist leanings.

In the post-1971 era, the state in Pakistan made use of the first three points of view in varying degrees while constructing its ideology. For example, the Islamic identity was invoked by the military regime of General Zia-ul-Haq more than any one else. Completely bereft of legitimacy, the regime relied excessively on Islamic notions and slogans. It undertook the Islamisation project, thereby introducing changes in laws, in internal and external policies including the educational system. Pakistan’s involvement in, and backing of, the Afghan Jihad, added impetus to this Islamic assertion.

The Muslim nationalist perception remained in vogue all along as almost all the regimes had a similar position, defining Pakistan with reference to its distinction against India. The view has historically been the official position of the military and bureaucracy and also of a significant section of the Urdu press. The Middle Eastern aspect, which got appended to this view later, was also emphasised by different regimes in varying degrees depending upon the state of Pakistan’s relations in the Middle East. It was only during the regime of General Musharraf that in pursuance of Pakistan’s renewed alliance with the US, dictating a shift in its Afghan policy, and the adoption on the Iraq issue of a position, which might not embarrass the US, the slogan of ‘Pakistan first’ was raised.
The position of defining Pakistani nationalism independent of external factors was also taken up first, though briefly, during the Z. A. Bhutto regime. In fact, one factor behind the genesis of the Pakistan Studies in the early 1970s was the view of a section of intelligentsia closer to the Bhutto regime, that they should build a Pakistani identity within the premises of the country. During the 1990s, when Benazir Bhutto became Prime Minister for the second time, the government once again strove to materialise the long abandoned project. The National Commission of History and Culture took the initiative to invite writers from across the country to re-write a multi-volume history of the country along these lines. The project aborted with the fall of the Benazir government.

The above discussion may help in realising the fact that though the state ideology has had some persistent features, it was also inconsistent in not having one clearly defined position. This inconsistency may be interpreted as the result of the ideological confusion, which itself may be taken to represent the crisis of the state and its uncertain legitimacy. This ideological confusion permeated the officially designed syllabi particularly in the courses of Pakistan Studies. The courses, therefore, were changed time and again, with shifting thrusts and replacing one set of lessons by another.

With regard to Pakistan Studies, the ideological confusion manifested itself right in the beginning when the Bill for the establishment of Pakistan Study Centres was debated in the National Assembly in 1975-76. Not only that the treasury benches, which piloted the bill, and the opposition were far apart, the former was itself not very clear about the objectives of the Bill. Paradoxically, the ideological position taken by some of the opposition members apprehending the Bill was later, during the Zia-ul-Haq regime, made the dominant ideology and was incorporated in the compulsory Pakistan Studies courses when these were introduced.
Pakistan Studies: A Subject of the State and the State of the Subject

The said Bill was aimed at establishing ‘Pakistan Study Centres in the universities for the study of languages, literature, social structure, customs, attitudes and motivations of the people of various regions of Pakistan’. Explaining the purpose of the Bill, Federal Minister for Information and Broadcasting Muhammad Hanif Khan, informed the House that it was an ‘attempt on the part of the government in the field of integration as it has (had) always been the policy of the People’s Government to learn a lesson from the past wrongs in order to improve and amend that and in order to bring the whole nation belonging to different regions, different provinces, speaking different languages, and having different cultures, to have a unity of thought, unity of action, and unity of feeling’. He further said: ‘… By this Act, government will be able to disseminate the unity in literature, in languages, in culture and in other such fields, which are very important in creating the sense of oneness amongst various regions and various provinces.’

As is obvious, the bill imbued a political project of realising national unity by harmonising different regions of the country and by identifying the common features of their customs, languages and literatures. Though there was no indication of the government’s intention of making Pakistan Studies a multidisciplinary subject, the proclaimed purpose itself could have been a good starting point for Pakistan Studies had it been elevated later to cover the economy, politics, foreign policy, and other aspects and, to make it a truly multidisciplinary subject. But even the limited scope that was conceived for it, was severely criticised by the opposition, which thought that the study of regional literatures and languages would give rise to regionalism, instead of strengthening nationalism. An opposition member, Ahmad Raza Qasuri, suspected in the bill a conspiracy whereby the model of the Soviet Union was being copied in Pakistan. He held that the Soviet Union divided its Muslim republics on the basis of languages, culture and customs ‘to break up their unity and strength and to make them deviate from their focal point of Islam’.

The idea of Pakistan Study Centres was described by him as a subversive idea as ‘Pakistan is
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

primarily an ideological country... [which] never came into being on the basis of legitimacy, on the basis of the modern concept of nationhood. It came into being purely on the Islamic ideology’.  

For the realisation of the objective for which the country was made, according to him, ‘we should be wedded to the idea of Islamic ideology, which should be wedded to the idea of having one national language, one national tradition, one national culture, instead of having four regional cultures, instead of having four regional languages’.  

While Qasuri denounced the bill as it could, to him, ‘bring nothing but disintegration to this country’, Professor Ghafoor Ahmad, an MNA of the Jama’at-i-Islami, opposed it on the ground that it spoke about the regional languages and cultures but did not commit itself to the development of the national language.  

Quite a few other MNAs belonging to the opposition also condemned the bill as they considered the teaching of regional languages and customs harmful for national integration. The opposition’s position apart, (apart from the opposition’s position) the government itself was not much convinced about the level to which it could adjust its political philosophy to the regional aspirations and sentiments. It is interesting to note that at an earlier stage, while explaining the bill, the federal minister of information and broadcasting mentioned that the bill was aimed at integrating various provinces and regions and ‘their cultures’ for national cohesion, but upon being seriously criticised by the Opposition for suggesting that the different provinces and regions had different cultures, the Federal Minister for Education and Provincial Coordination, Abdul Hafeez Pirzada clarified that the bill did not refer to ‘culture’, nor did the word occur in the statement of the bill.  

Curiously, the government was prepared to promote regional languages and encourage the study of the local customs but was shy of accepting the fact that different regions could portray a variance in culture. Notwithstanding the confusion or the lack of clarity on the part of the government, it declined to include the ‘Ideology of Pakistan’ within the framework of the bill. In fact
the House rejected an amendment tabled by an Opposition member, Malik Muhammad Suleman, suggesting the insertion of ‘ideology of Pakistan’ in the objectives of the bill. The federal education minister went to the extent of quoting Prime Minister Z. A. Bhutto, describing ideology as the ‘opium of the people’.  

The fluctuating attitude of the Bhutto regime towards the ideological issue was replaced by a clearer and more consistent ideological position taken by the General Zia-ul-Haq regime. General Zia, who had imposed martial law in July 1977, and had suspended the constitution, was openly opposed to democracy, which he regarded as un-Islamic. He, instead, aspired to make Pakistan an Islamic state for which, as he claimed, he was divinely chosen. During his eleven year rule, General Zia took a number of steps with a view to ‘Islamising’ the economy, administration, judiciary, media and education. It was during his period that Pakistan Studies was adopted by the state to disseminate its perceptions more vigorously. The ‘Ideology of Pakistan’ and ‘Islamic ideology’, hence, became recurrent themes of the syllabi.

**Section II: Reality**

In the last quarter of a century Pakistan Studies has expanded its scope from a subject of higher education and research to a compulsory subject taught at different levels of school and college education. The Pakistan Study Centres were established in five public sector universities of the country while the National Institute of Pakistan Studies was established in the Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad, simultaneously in 1976, with the passage, in the same year, of the Act of the Parliament. A discussion of the Act has already been done in the previous section. Pakistan Studies was made a compulsory subject in 1980 when it was decided that the subject should be introduced in class ninth and should be taught till graduation. Prior to six years compulsory education in Pakistan Studies, a student studies Social Studies from class third to eighth. Generally, Social Studies cover many of the themes and topics, which are later taught in Pakistan Studies. Therefore, one can safely conclude
that the compulsory Pakistan Studies and Social Studies together provide twelve years of education in themes and topics, which are assumed to be necessary — from the point of view of the course designers — for the Pakistani students’ awareness about their country, its history and society. In a later section the area of competence of the Pakistan Study Centres, their academic standards, and their achievements and failures will be discussed in detail. Here the compulsory Pakistan Studies as taught in schools and colleges is examined critically, though briefly, as a detailed analysis of its course contents requires a more thorough treatment, which is beyond the scope of this paper.

Central Sway over Pakistan Studies Syllabus
Before discussing the general trends of the courses of the Pakistan Studies and the related issues, which have lessened the prestige and credibility of the subject, it is important to see how the courses in Pakistan Studies are designed and how the considerations of the successive regimes in power get expression in the courses taught in schools and colleges of the country. As in many other federal constitutions, the constitution of Pakistan has also relied on the list system in order to enumerate separately the subjects on which the federation and provinces respectively can legislate. The constitution of Pakistan, adopted in 1973, provides two legislative lists: the federal list which comprises subjects on which the centre alone has competence, and the concurrent list in which are enumerated the subjects on which both the federal parliament and the provincial assemblies can legislate. The subjects not covered by either of these lists are left to the competence of the provinces. Regarding the concurrent list, the constitution lays it down that if a provincial act pertaining to a subject in the said list is repugnant to an act passed by the federal parliament, then the act of the latter will prevail irrespective of the fact as to which act was passed first (Article 143). This implies that with respect to the subjects in the concurrent list the centre has supremacy over the provinces. According to the constitution, the subject of the planning of education as well as curriculum, syllabus, centres of excellence and standard of education are included in the concurrent list.
Pakistan Studies: A Subject of the State and the State of the Subject

This means that the centre has the actual control over these matters apart from those aspects of education, which are exclusively given to it through the federal list. The latter include federal agencies and institutions for research, professional and technical training, etc. After securing all the crucial educational matters — policy, planning, curriculum etc. — for the centre, the execution of educational policies and its administration are left to the provinces.

In the centre, there exists a Federal Ministry of Education having a Curriculum Wing, besides other divisions and wings with extended areas of influence in educational decision-making and implementation. The Curriculum Wing designs the objectives of various disciplines and subjects to be taught in educational institutions. The Wing also prepares outlines of courses along with the reference books with the help of which books can be written for the students. At the provincial level there exist textbook boards, which are responsible for getting the books written by individual writers or teams of writers, and for producing and marketing these books within their respective provinces. The books produced by the provincial textbook boards are approved by the federal Curriculum Wing before they are printed.

These detail help in suggesting that despite the fact that most of the responsibilities regarding education are shouldered by the provinces, the centre has almost full control over the content of courses taught in the educational institutions. The universities under provincial control are to some extent free in evolving their courses under the supervision and guidance of their statutory bodies particularly the academic councils, even though the Curriculum Wing and the Higher Education Commission (HEC) almost regularly design guidelines of courses at their level — to be transmitted to the universities for their academic bodies’ consideration and adoption. Unlike the federal government and its Curriculum Wing, which can directly influence the writing and production of the books recommended for classes up to the intermediate, the universities are not in a position to have the
same influence on the books written for the graduate classes nor do the universities have a regular practice of producing model textbooks for the graduate students. As a result of this dichotomy even the graduate level books are also written by the writers who, though not hired by the government, try to follow the outlines suggested by the federal government because this makes their books acceptable in other provinces also apart from their own. This shows that from the level of schools to that of graduation the courses of teaching are greatly influenced by the central government, and its perceptions on different matters are reflected in the textbooks at all levels. Pakistan Studies itself has been a highly centralised subject whose contents are decided by the Curriculum Wing.

The Compulsory Pakistan Studies
The above background could facilitate in understanding the thrust and the fundamental claims of the syllabi of Pakistan Studies being taught as a compulsory subject from class nine to the level of graduation. If these courses do not come up to the standards of objectivity, rationalism and enlightenment, the responsibility will solely be with the regimes, which had been in power at the time of the introduction of these courses. Here it will be useful if a cursory glance of the courses of the Pakistan Studies is taken to see what perceptions the ruling classes have held regarding the country’s past and present.

A major part of Pakistan Studies books is devoted to the history of the creation of Pakistan with the post-Independence political history getting a very little representation. The pre-Independence history itself is very limited in its scope as it mainly deals with the political aspects of the history, neglecting other areas. Moreover, the treatment of political history is also extremely uncritical and unbalanced. The history of Pakistan after 1947 is also treated quite selectively with some of the important events, developments and themes almost totally neglected. For example, the civil-military contradiction in Pakistan’s political history does not find place in the courses of Pakistan Studies at all. How Pakistan’s polity has been derailed time and again, what
Pakistan Studies: A Subject of the State and the State of the Subject
difficulties the democratic forces faced in the country in order to
realise the democratic ideals for which the country was
established, what has been the status of the masses over the
years, how the underprivileged sections of the society — women,
minorities, peasants, workers, the destitute etc., — fared since
Independence, what has been the position and place of the
provinces in the overall highly centralised federal scheme of the
country, what distortions have crept into the economy and social
fabric of the country, why national integration has remained an
evasive dream — these and other such aspects of Pakistani reality
do not find place in the courses of Pakistan Studies. To one’s
utter surprise one may find that as big an episode of Pakistan’s
history as the separation of East Pakistan is almost blacked out in
Pakistan Studies. One reference to it occurs in a book written for
the BEd students, which discusses it briefly and that too with
misinterpretation and misrepresentation of facts.27

Regarding the disproportionate treatment of subjects, a case in
point is a book being taught at the graduation level.28 The book
comprises ten chapters of which six deal with the history before
the creation of Pakistan, one chapter deals with the problems
Pakistan faced just after Partition, one chapter is devoted to the
Islamisation of Pakistan, one chapter focusses on the territorial
or physical features of Pakistan, while there is one chapter on
Pakistan’s relations with the Muslim world. The book does not
carry a single chapter on the political development in Pakistan,
the political crises the country faced, or the constitutional
experiments undertaken in the country. In other words, the book
comprises the pre-Partition history or discusses the post-
Independence history only with reference to the introduction of
the Islamic system, which in fact constitutes only one aspect of
Pakistan’s long and checkered political history. To be fair to the
author, the book’s scheme follows the Curriculum Wing’s
outline. Books written by other authors, therefore, do not differ
much from it. For example, another book for graduation level
has spread the themes of the above mentioned book in nine
chapters with the same omissions.29
The history of the creation of Pakistan as presented in Pakistan Studies makes light of the actual complex circumstances in which the country was realised. Dressed in a highly charged ideological garb, this historiography tries to project the creation of Pakistan as pre-ordained and determined by fate rather than as a result of a long political and constitutional contest which culminated in the breakdown of all efforts of keeping India united.

As a direct corollary of the above, the history of Pakistan begins from 712 AD, the year Muhammad Bin Qasim annexed Sindh. Since Mohammad Bin Qasim was not the first Muslim who came to India but was the first Muslim who established his rule in a part of India, the adoption of this event as the starting point of Pakistan history signifies its political bias.

The period of Muslim rule in India and the colonial period are also treated quite uncritically whereby the historical figures — the rulers, dynasties, social reformers, religious leaders, etc. — are not discussed objectively but are seen quite naively as Muslims and non-Muslims. All Muslims and all Hindus are categorised separately with one category shown morally superior, intellectually advanced, victim of conspiracies, tolerant towards others, and promoters of art, poetry and architectural heritage, while the other community portrayed as morally inferior, socially divided and intolerant. This stereotype treatment of history represents a paranoid mindset, which finds excuses for the national failures in others. Moreover, the categorisation of the Muslims and Hindus as superior and inferior is also a perversion of the two-nation theory as expounded by the Quaid-i-Azam Mohammad Ali Jinnah who emphasised at the differences between the two communities and never took a racist stand against the Hindus denouncing them as being inferior. The Two-Nation theory of the founding father was not based on hate of the Hindus but was about the differences of the two — the Muslim and the Hindu communities. On 7 March 1947, Jinnah, while speaking to the Memon Chamber of Commerce, Bombay, had this to say:
‘I assure you that I have respect for the great Hindu community and all that it stands for. They have their faiths, their philosophy, their great culture; so have the Muslims, but the two are different (emphasis added)…. I am fighting for Pakistan because it is the only practical solution for solving the problem, and the other ideal of a united India and a rule based on the parliamentary system of government is a vain dream and an impossibility.’

In the syllabi of Pakistan Studies, the recurrent comparison of the Hindu and the Muslim communities is in fact not a comparison between the two, rather the Hindu society is compared with the principles of Islam instead of comparing it with the Muslim society, which itself had numerous problems, contradictions, social evils and biases.

In the courses of Pakistan Studies, the downfall of the Muslims (which in fact was the downfall of the Muslim rule) in the Subcontinent has been treated in a very subjective manner. Instead of analysing the socio-economic conditions and the militaristic state policies of the so-called ‘Muslim rule’, as well as the vast array of reasons subjecting India to colonialism, the books of Pakistan Studies generally take an essentially communal position, which more often blossoms into racism. For example, one reason given by certain authors of Pakistan Studies, for the downfall of Muslims is the social interaction between the Muslim and the Hindu communities. Unmindful of the fact that India had been a plural society inhabiting different people belonging to different cultural and religious backgrounds, these authors fail to realise that social interaction was inevitable there. Perhaps no wise person will regard social interaction to be a bad thing. It is through interaction that people enrich themselves and influence each other but the writers of some of the Pakistan Studies books regard the Muslims’ interaction with others as a source of their degeneration. In this regard Mughal emperor Akbar is criticised for trying to integrate the Muslims and Hindus and by creating ‘a new religion’, Deen-i-Ilahi, which in fact he never claimed to be a religion. According to one
writer, due to this integrationist policy of some of their rulers, the Muslims were ‘distracted from the right path, and interest in the Qur’aan got weakened with the result that their morals degenerated and they got involved in laxities and were eventually overtaken by the darkness of downfall’.

The social interaction between the Hindus and the Muslims is denounced not only for the latter’s ‘downfall’ but also because this interaction resulted in Hindus becoming influenced by Islam which, to some authors, deprived the Muslims of their exclusive claim of moral supremacy. Therefore, in a book it is claimed that as a result of the expansion of Islam in India the religious ideas of the Hindus were also reformed. Hindu thinkers came closer to Islam and improved their own religious ideas with the result that the Hindu population that was fast converting to Islam remained wedded to its religion. The author laments that the ideals of oneness of God and a classless society, which constituted the characteristics of Islam, were incorporated by the Hindu reformers, who acquired respect for them and for their message by doing this.

Another reason behind the fall of the Muslims in the subcontinent as given in the books of Pakistan Studies has been the so-called conspiracies between Hindus and the British. Without giving the details of such conspiracies, the phrase is used every now and then in a very generalised manner. Therefore, in one book it is written that ‘after the war of Independence 1857, the Muslims were the target of contempt, hatred and evil designs by the Hindus and their pay-masters — the British’. The books of Pakistan Studies are full of such reporting of conspiracies hatched by the Hindu Marhatts, Sikhs and others against the Muslims. These books do not evaluate the real causes of the decline of the Muslim society in India, its socio-economic stagnation, its intellectual poverty, its social inequalities, its peculiar state which was organised along its military power, and the widespread grievances of its people.
While designing the courses of Pakistan Studies, a number of such themes that could be placed in other subjects are incorporated in the Pakistan Studies courses. For example, a number of themes, which can more appropriately be placed in Islamiyat, have been included in Pakistan Studies. For example, the ninth and tenth class Sindh Text Book Board’s book of Pakistan Studies, describes in its first chapter, the ‘Foundation of Pakistan’, the elements of Islam, (…Islam. While another...) while another book meant for the Intermediate and Senior Cambridge classes, describes the objectives of the creation of Pakistan as being the establishment of the sovereignty of Allah, establishment of Islamic democracy and, the restoration of the image of the Muslims. The concept of Islam as presented in the books of Pakistan Studies is itself open to discussion. This concept is mostly supportive of authoritarian rulers, monarchs and military adventurers. As a result of adopting this distorted perception of Islam, some writers openly criticise democracy and the concept of popular sovereignty. These writers describe democracy as a Western concept and insist that it is against the Islamic concept of Shura. One such writer, therefore, suggests that ‘while in the Islamic institution of Shura only wise and virtuous (Muttaqi) persons have the right to give opinion, the Western system accepts the principle of one man one vote without considering the character and the knowledge of these people. It gives equal weight to the opinions of all individuals, which are against the principles of justice. If in a society the illiterate (Juhala) and gangsters (Ghunday) are in majority they will come to dominate the learned and noble people through democracy’. The above are only a few examples of distortions and that too with special reference to the manner in which history has been treated in the books of Pakistan Studies from class ninth to graduation. Apart from the content of the courses, there are numerous other aspects, which affect the credibility of Pakistan Studies. For example, the courses are quite repetitive and the themes recur in the books of different classes, which reduces the interest of the students in these books.
One particular reason why Pakistan Studies does not incite interest among the students is the rule made by the government whereby a student is required to obtain just the passing marks in Pakistan Studies. Moreover in most cases, these marks are not included in the overall aggregate marks of the students and, therefore, have no importance/role whatsoever in qualifying the student for getting a place in a professional or any other career-building institution. The passing marks had earlier been thirty three percent, which later rose to forty percent. Acquiring even forty percent marks is not considered difficult by many students, so they do bother to attend the classes or consult books, and in most cases achieve the required marks. Now that in certain classes Pakistan Studies and Islamiyat have collectively been given a total of hundred marks with Islamiyat given sixty and the Pakistan Studies forty marks, a student is required to get just thirteen marks to pass the exam in Pakistan Studies. With no importance attached to Pakistan Studies, why should the students take it seriously?

The Scope and Role of the Pakistan Study Centres
Notwithstanding the achievements and failures or the overall impact of the compulsory subject of Pakistan Studies, the Pakistan Study Centres and their role can be studied separately as a distinct sphere within the area of Pakistan Studies. This is so because despite being under the direct control of the federal government, exercised through the University Grants Commission (now the Higher Education Commission), and their reliance on the federal government for their financial grants, the very fact that these Centres are part of their respective universities, they are or can be, relatively autonomous. It is not that these Centres can have completely independent policies, yet there has been some space for independent and objective work in these centres. Moreover, as these Centres are looked towards by the society for original research and realising in practice the objectives of their Foundational Act, one could say that these Centres had a leading role and responsibility in establishing the scope and indicating the possible content of the Pakistan Studies
curricula. An analysis of the Centres’ output would therefore be helpful in understanding their utility and contribution.

It seems that the working of the Pakistan Study Centres was marred by numerous problems, which were either the result of the successive governments’ policies (or their absence) towards them, or were the creation of their own actions. These Centres were established, perhaps, in some haste without much planning, as a result of which most of them had had a fairly long period of gestation. For a number of years, they were without buildings and faculty. It was only in the 1980s that after a lapse of five or six years these Centres began to have their own physical infrastructure. The pace of induction of faculty in them was even slower. In many a case, the Centres were even deprived of regular directors, and in a few cases, even a board of governors. Some of the Centres were put under the joint supervision of the directors of other institutions. Therefore, the Centres in the universities of the Punjab and Peshawar remained for a long time under directors who supervised their Pakistan Study Centre as well as the Area Study Centre of that university. The practice of having one director for two Centres in a university is still prevalent at least in the Balochistan University, Quetta.

The Centres also had to face the government’s policy of neglect reflected in the slow flow of funds, which caused hindrance in the work of these Centres. Once the Centres had their buildings and initial staff, they had to look for grants in order to pursue their research programmes. As these grants came very slowly and in inadequate amounts, these Centres could not emerge right away as research institutes of any substance. The problems of inadequate grants is still there but some of the centres have somehow succeeded in finding a way out and are doing relatively better in producing some good research. This they have done through better management of resources and finding additional sources of income, decreasing their reliance on government funding.
If there had been problems with the governments, which affected the proper growth of the Centres, the latter’s own inconsistencies and failure in realising their possible potential to the maximum level cannot be overlooked either. For example, if a Centre did not initiate even a modest research programme, produce MPhils and PhDs, hold conferences, publish books and journals, the responsibility should be shared by the Centres also. Keeping this in view, a brief survey of the achievements of the Pakistan Study Centres can be made.

_Courses_: As laid down in the Act of the Pakistan Study Centres, the Centres and the NIPS make their academic and research programmes in concurrence with the academic council of their respective university. Though there does not exist any formal arrangement for the coordination between various Centres, and the courses adopted by them have been made without mutual consultation, there does exist some similarity in their courses which, perhaps, is the result of the informal contacts between the Centres. The themes/subjects, which recur in most of the MA programmes of the various Centres include the history and ideology of Pakistan, Pakistan’s geography, economy, political and constitutional development, society and culture, literatures and foreign relations. NIPS also offer elective courses apart from the compulsory ones. The lists of elective subjects is quite large and covers quite a few themes, which form part of the compulsory subjects but are treated in detail as elective courses.

The courses of different Centres and their character may show different thrusts, depending upon the credit hours given to any particular subject and the composition and background of the faculty.

Looking into the course plans of the Centres, one thing that strikes most is that these courses encompass various dimensions and aspects of Pakistan’s life. But does this justify Pakistan Studies to be designated as a multi-disciplinary course? Perhaps not. Teaching the economy, politics, history, culture, etc., of Pakistan separately fall short of making Pakistan Studies a truly
multi-disciplinary subject, which requires a synthesis of various disciplines, and a new focal point with converge of all or many disciplines with Pakistan as the context.

**Teaching Programmes:** The NIPS and all Pakistan Studies Centres (PSC), except for the PSC (Lahore) and the PSC (Quetta), started their Master programme right from the beginning. The PSC (Lahore) has yet to start its MA programme. The PSC (Quetta) started with the teaching of languages. Until 1984 it offered the degrees of *Fazil, Alim* and *Adib* in three languages — Balochi, Brahui and Pushto. Between 1985-86 to 1987-88 it offered MA courses in the above-mentioned languages. From 1989 it started functioning properly as a full-fledged centre, producing MAs in Pakistan Studies. According to the figures available in 2002 the number of MAs produced by various centres varied. The NIPS had the highest number of MScs, that is, 594, PSC (Jamshoro) had 220, PSC (Peshawar) had 326, PSC (Karachi) had 373 and PSC (Quetta) had 148 MAs to their credit. It has already been mentioned that the PSC (Lahore) has not yet started its MA programme.

**Research Programme:** The record of the Centres, taken as a whole, in producing MPhils and PhDs is not satisfactory with the PSC (Lahore) and PSC (Peshawar) having produced no MPhil and PhD, while PSC (Jamshoro) and PSC (Quetta) produced only two and three MPhils respectively by 2002. PSC (Karachi) produced six MPhils till 2003. The highest number of MPhils produced by any Centre is 74, by the NIPS, which has a two-year MPhil programme including one year of course work. The National Institute of Pakistan Studies (NIPS) has produced seven PhDs. The PSC (Karachi) comes next with six PhDs to be followed by PSC (Jamshoro) and PSC (Quetta) with four PhDs each.

**Research Activity:** The Centres’ research activities include holding of seminars and conferences, publication of books based on original research and promoting research through bringing out journals, and developing linkages with other research institutes.
The record of the Centres shows that by 2002, the NIPS, and the PSCs in Lahore, Jamshoro, Peshawar, Karachi and Quetta had produced 26, 29, 23, 12, 15 & 2 books respectively. This means that six Centres of higher education and research produced 107 books in a period of 20 years — if 1982 is taken as the take-off point of these Centres rather than 1976 when the Centres were created.

These books are of different standard. Few of them are based on high quality research, while some are poor with most of them being mediocre. The books are primarily of three kinds: original researches, compilations and edited works, and conference papers. Of the eighteen books published by the PSC (Karachi) by 2003, thirteen are based on original research, while two comprise conference papers and three are compilations of historical documents. The original works include books based on PhD, MPhil and Master theses. PSC (Lahore)’s original research works are few but it has produced a number of valuable compilations of documents. PSC (Jamshoro)’s list of publications is quite varied ranging from studies on language and culture of Sindh to education, Kalabagh Dam, Tafsier Ayat-al Kursi, a souvenir on Allama I. I. Kazi, and a book on the environmental effects of depletion of the Ozone layer. Out of twenty-three of its publications, five or six can be categorised as original.

Except for the NIPS, all the Centres bring out their separate research journals. PSC (Lahore)’s Pakistan Vision, PSC (Jamshoro)’s Grassroots, PSC (Peshawar)’s Pakistan, PSC (Karachi)’s Pakistan Perspectives and PSC (Quetta)’s Pakistan Studies are journals of varying quality. Most of these journals have yet to make an impression and establish themselves as quality journals. So far only Pakistan Perspectives, a refereed journal, has made itself noticeable and has come to be regarded as one of the very few social sciences journals of international quality and standard ever brought out in Pakistan. Pakistan Vision is a newcomer but seems to have a good future ensured by the quality of papers included in its initial issues.
The above discussion shows that the overall contribution of the PSCs cannot be described as satisfactory as these Centres have had a bad start with low funding, poor staffing, lack of highly qualified faculty, and above all, a lack of clear cut direction and vision about what could they do and achieve. Despite these obstacles, the Centres could do substantial work availing whatever space was allowed to them, had their leadership and faculty demonstrated at their level, clarity of thought and courage of conviction. The Centres where these were available did better, while others, which lacked these qualities, did not do much.

Apart from the PSCs, a few departments of Pakistan Studies in the public sector universities have also contributed towards making the subject meaningful. Like the PSCs these departments have expanded the scope of Pakistan Studies to include divergent aspects of Pakistan — history, geography, politics, economics, literatures, etc. The contribution of the Department of Pakistan Studies in the Allama Iqbal Open University (AIOU) is important as the university is engaged in distance education since its inception in 1974. Over the years distance education has become a popular mode of learning and has attracted millions of people from across the country. As Pakistan Studies is a compulsory subject at the graduation level, the university, right from the beginning, organised courses for this purpose. Its MSc programme, started in 1985, is aimed at 'producing such minds that can understand the complexities and problems associated with a modern nation state'. AIOU’s scheme of Pakistan Studies includes courses on political and constitutional development in Pakistan, Pakistani languages and literatures, ideological foundations of Pakistan, Pakistani society and culture, Pakistan Movement, economic development of Pakistan, political parties and pressure groups. Like NIPS, PSC (Karachi) and some other centres, AIOU also offers a course on research methods. A unique course of the AIOU’s Pakistan Studies programme is on social theory that helps to locate Pakistan Studies in the wider matrix of social sciences.
Conclusion
This paper has tried to demonstrate the difficulties and challenges confronted by Pakistan Studies in emerging as an independent area of study with a claim to be counted as a credible Area Study. It has shown how despite great potential in the area, Pakistan Studies did not find the right environment in which it could advance. The independent and the liberal environment, which is essentially required for the development of social sciences, was not available in Pakistan since Independence. Instead, the state and the successive governments exercised excessive control over education with the result that education has seized to cultivate the faculties of critical inquiry without, which new ideas cannot generate. Pakistan Studies, soon after its introduction, fell victim to the ideological manipulations of the successive regimes with the result that it was perverted into becoming a career of the ideological perceptions of the regimes in power, denying it its actual potential of becoming a true discipline with multi-disciplinary paradigms, which could be helpful in understanding the past and the present problems of the country and help in finding their solutions for the future. This paper has also attempted to show the shortcomings in the courses of compulsory Pakistan Studies and the reasons thereof. In a later section, the role of the PSCs has been highlighted with both their achievements, despite severe odds in which they had to work, and their failures. It is hoped that through critical studies and concerted and serious efforts by the civil society, Pakistan Studies will one day, come out of its present state of enforced slumber and will become as great a discipline as the people who constitute its subject matter.
Notes

1 Social Policy and Development Centre, Social Development in Pakistan Annual Review 2002-03 (SPDC, Karachi, 2003), p. 3.
2 Jinnah said in his speech: ‘If you change your past and work together in a spirit that every one of you, no matter to what community he belongs, no matter what relations he had with you in the past, no matter what is his colour, caste or creed, is first, second and last a citizen of this state with equal rights, privileges and obligations, there will be no end to the progress you will make.’ Emphasising the principle of equality of citizens, he went on to say: ‘We are starting in the days when there is no discrimination, no distinction between one community and another, no discrimination between one caste or creed or another. We are starting with this fundamental principle that we are all citizens and equal citizens of one state.’ Waheed Ahmad (ed.), The Nation’s Voice [collection of Jinnah’s speeches, statements, interviews and messages/advice], (Quaid-i-Azam Academy, Karachi, 2002), Vol. VI, pp. 363-64.
10 Nicos Poulantzas holds that the ‘state establishes the peculiar relationship between history and territory, between the spatial and temporal matrix’. For the purpose of creating national unity, he explains, the modern nation-state constructs a territorial national tradition wherein ‘the markings of a territory become indicators of history.’ The national unity thus symbolises ‘history of a territory and territorialization of a history.’ See Nicos Poulantzas, State, Power, Socialism (Verso, London, 1980), p. 114.
11 Spooner, ‘Pakistan Studies in the Age…’, op. cit., p.133.
12 Faiz was a poet of international repute. He served as editor of Pakistan Times in the 1950s and Lotus (Beirut). For his views on culture, see Hamari Qaumi Saqafat (Idara-i-Yadgar-i-Ghalib, Karachi, 1976).
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

14 Bizenjo was a Baloch nationalist leader who served as the Governor of Balochistan and as a member of the National Assembly. Bizenjo was a strong advocate of secularism and nationalities’ rights.

15 Dr. Feroz Ahmed lived in the US and Canada apart from Pakistan. He brought out a radical periodical Pakistan Forum from Canada and later published a periodical by the same name in Urdu from Pakistan. The magazine was banned by the military government of General Zia-ul-Haq. A synthesis of Feroz Ahmed’s views on the nationalities issue can be seen in his posthumously published book Ethnicity and Politics in Pakistan (Oxford University Press, Karachi, 1998).

16 Dr. Kaniz Yusuf, former vice chancellor of the Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad, was a strong advocate of the view. She played a leading role in the introduction of Pakistan Studies during the Bhutto regime. Author’s interview with Dr. Yusuf. See also her ‘Objectives of Initiating Pakistan Studies at the University Level’, Pakistan Perspectives, Vol. 7, No. 2, July-December 2002.


18 Ibid., pp. 257-58.

19 Ibid., p. 258.

20 Ibid., pp. 261-62.

21 Ibid., p. 262.

22 Ibid., pp. 262-63.

23 Ibid., p. 264.

24 Ibid., Vol. 1, No. 6, 8 March 1976, p. 293.

25 Ibid., p. 295.


27 Tadrees-i-Mutala-i-Pakistan (Allama Iqbal Open University, Islamabad, 1999), BEd, part 1, unit 1-9, pp. 236-37.


31 Mian Kamaluddin, Mutala-i-Pakistan (Pakistan Book Centre, Karachi, 1998), p. 75.

32 Tadrees-i-Mutala-i-Pakistan, op.cit., p. 22.

33 Zafar, Pakistan Studies, op.cit., p. 308.

34 Mutala-i-Pakistan, for ninth and tenth class (Sindh Text Book Board, Jamshoro, n.d.), p. 11. Also see Rabbani, A Comprehensive Book, op.cit., p. 10-11.

35 Tadrees-i-Mutala-i-Pakistan, op.cit., p. 181.

36 These details were supplied by the Pakistan Study Centre (Quetta) in response to the author’s query.

37 These figures have been acquired from the federal ministry of education. The figure for PSC (Quetta) supplied by this source differs from the one received
through personal communication, according to which the PSC (Quetta) had produced 270 MAs by 2000.

38 Information based on personal communications.

39 Figures received from the Federal Ministry of Education. Data obtained through personal communication is slightly different.

The State of the Discipline of Women’s Studies in Pakistan

Rubina Saigol

Introduction
Women’s Studies, as a social discipline, arose within women’s movements and feminist struggles that raged across the globe over the last two centuries. Although the discipline, as a field of study, has only been established in the last three or four decades, it has a history that goes back much further. Women have been expressing their wants, needs, desires, sorrows, joys, love and hate for centuries, through the oral traditions of storytelling, singing and lullabies, however systematic studies of women in relation to the world go back to the 18th century Enlightenment era. The publication of Mary Wollstonecraft’s book is often taken as a starting point of women’s formal entry into public political and intellectual discourse. In the 19th and 20th centuries, feminism as an intellectual discourse as well as political activism developed rapidly, and various schools of thought emerged, which contributed immensely to an understanding of women and their relationship to social, cultural, economic, political and ideological structures.

As Women’s Studies developed within an interaction of theory and practice, there is a unique and special emphasis in the discipline on the relation between action and reflection. It is generally held that action gives rise to theory, which guides and
limits further action, and in turn the action refines, challenges or changes the theory. Women’s Studies, therefore, is not simply about academic discourse or struggles for rights and justice. It is about both, each contributing to an understanding of the other. It is a dynamic discipline, which has relied fairly heavily on women’s experiences and their everyday lived realities. Ever since the realisation that women experience the world in ways that are sometimes radically different from men’s ways of seeing, knowing, understanding and acting, women’s oral histories, oral testimonies and personal stories have played a central role in the development of the methods that are employed in Women’s Studies.

Intellectually, the origin of Women’s Studies can be traced to the Humanities, that is, to History, Literature and Philosophy. While the liberal social sciences, such as Psychology, Sociology, Anthropology, Economics and Political Science, have played important roles in furthering the discipline, the main methodological and theoretical contributions are traceable to the humanistic disciplines. Feminist historians pointed out the essential absence of women from historical accounts. History has been written traditionally as his-story leaving her out. Historical accounts written from male perspectives, and primarily concerned with celebrating heroic pursuits in war, conquest and the display of brute force, have overlooked the important contributions of women in all fields, particularly agriculture and crafts. Feminist historians have sought to reinsert women into history by highlighting their many contributions to human industry and creativity. Literary Studies have primarily contributed the methods of deconstruction, and taught feminist researchers how to read the social sub-text and the silences that speak beneath the layers of repression in language.

The fields of Philosophy and sociology of knowledge have enormously influenced feminist research methodology, which rejects the strict separation of subject and object in the process of critical inquiry. Feminist researchers and Women’s Studies academics reject the idea of an impersonal and abstract science
that is ethically or morally irresponsible. Women’s Studies academics adhere to the idea that all knowledge is ideological as it depends upon human labour for its production and representation. Knowledge is, therefore, not neutral but always political as it invariably represents a specific vantage point and is dependent upon the methods used in its construction. Knowledge is thus partial and cannot be entirely objective or detached from the object of inquiry. It is the ethical and moral responsibility of the researcher to take the knowledge back to those who were engaged in producing it. Feminists debunk the notions of complete objectivity, impartiality, detachment, and methodological binaries such as subject/object and pure/applied. There is a great deal of emphasis in Women’s Studies on subjectivity and inter-subjectivity as two or more people interact in complex ways. Women’s Studies is about knowledge, about how we view the world, understand it and act upon it in order to change it.

One of the basic guiding principles in Women’s Studies is that all knowledge is deeply inter-related and cannot be compartmentalised into separate subject areas. The fragmentation of knowledge first into science and arts, and further into physical and social sciences is an artificial division. Since the physical, social and moral universe are deeply intertwined, such a separation limits understanding. The emphasis in the discipline is upon a holistic understanding of the world, which would draw upon various disciplines and areas of study. Women’s Studies is by definition a multi-disciplinary subject in which human beings are not compartmentalised. The economic, political, social, cultural and personal activities of human beings are seen as deeply inter-linked and the person is seen as a whole. The work of feminist historians, economists, educationists, scientists, doctors, activists, teachers, thinkers, sociologists, all falls within Women’s Studies, even if the researcher worked within another department such as Political Science or History. Women’s Studies permeates all disciplines and all disciplines permeate Women’s Studies.
Since Women’s Studies is so deeply related to all other social disciplines, there has been a debate about whether it is better to have separate Women’s Studies departments in universities, or to integrate Women’s Studies and feminist understandings into the various areas of knowledge within existing departments. The advantage of separate Women’s Studies departments is that feminist perspectives would not be lost or de-prioritised in relation to other concerns. Rather, such perspectives would inform research and teaching in all the disciplines. On the other hand, the danger of separate Women’s Studies departments is that of ghettoisation. Feminists have feared that by creating separate departments, universities simply appease women and the subsequent treatment of such departments is that of a stepchild. Such departments are often considered superfluous and unnecessary and expenditure on them is regarded as wasteful. Very often, there is miniscule funding for Women’s Studies departments, with the result that they are often cash-strapped and cannot offer lucrative scholarships or funding to eager or deserving students. This in turn reinforces the idea that such departments merely duplicate the work that can best be done within existing departments. Some feminists also believe that since feminism is about holistic and inter-disciplinary perspectives, making separate islands contradicts the very purpose of Women’s Studies. Feminist perspectives should be integrated within existing fields of knowledge instead of creating ghettos that serve no purpose.

Since Women’s Studies as a discipline is so centrally concerned with re-conceptualising and reinterpreting the world from alternative perspectives, it is not only about women as is commonly believed. The work of feminists has ranged all the way from studies of individual women and the family, to analyses of the gendered nature of states, religions, militaries, wars, and political and economic structures. It is a vast area and any issue, structure, idea, movement or event can become the subject matter of Women’s Studies.
The main difference from general social science, which also covers any area of social concern, is that Women’s Studies would look at the gendered nature of the subject being examined. This is because of the fundamental premise on which feminists work, namely that social ‘reality’ and language, and knowledge itself are gendered phenomena. As ‘reality’ is apprehended in language, which is gendered, the very way in which human beings have come to view the universe (knowledge) is gendered to the core. According to a feminist understanding of knowledge, the world is divided by language and knowledge into mutually exclusive categories such as inner/outer, subjective/objective, passive/active, feminine/masculine, irrational/rational or inferior/superior. In each binary division of the world, there is a hierarchisation, in that one category is perceived as higher than, better than or superior to the other. Women, and all that is considered feminine, are relegated to the categories of inner, lesser, passive, inferior, lower, subjective, emotional, irrational, categories, which are considered negative. By contrast, men and all this is deemed to be masculine, are associated with positive categories such as outer, rational, active, objective, better or higher. One category as a whole is privileged over the other and this inequality permeates all thinking, understanding and imagining. Feminists believe that since one of the first divisions that human beings experience is that of gender (we learn that we are male or female), all subsequent divisions and inequalities are experienced within this first sense of ‘otherness’ and alienation. Our minds, our work, our activities and the social structures we construct, whether it is the state, nation or religion, come to be informed at some level by the first distinction and inequality that characterises our lives and being. This, in a nutshell, constitutes a feminist understanding of the world.

Based on a feminist understanding of the world, Sabeeha Hafeez offers the following comprehensive definition of Women’s Studies:

Women’s Studies is concerned both with the examination and restructuring of knowledge itself, the social and historical conditions in which knowledge is generated,
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

produced, legitimised as valid or true, transmitted through formal and informal education and consumed by both women and men of various social class backgrounds, ethnicity and age levels. In this way, its aims are similar to those of sociology of knowledge. But Women’s Studies is further concerned with the radical restructuring of the processes for production, transmission and consumption of knowledge for transforming patriarchal, authoritarian and hierarchical society. In other words, the aim of Women’s Studies is to create and imbibe anti-authority, anti-hierarchy and anti-patriarchy norms in people through innovative changes in the content and process of instruction in the classroom.3

Hafeez contends that the discipline of Women’s Studies contributes to a reinterpretation of the world as an educational mechanism of the women’s movement, however the discipline itself ‘originated from a certain level of awareness of the society about women’s subordination and patriarchy’4. She thus points to the important interplay of action and reflection, which is central to an understanding of feminism and Women’s Studies. As a result of the dialectical relationship between action and reflection, several schools of thought developed including liberal, Marxist, Radical, Socialist and post-modern, and the lively debates between them continue to enrich the discipline.

Feminist Struggles in Pakistan

Although feminist struggles in Pakistan go back a long way,5 the major turning point for current struggles was the era of Zia-ul-Haq’s Islamisation era when a spate of discriminatory laws were passed that affected women directly. In particular, the Hudood Ordinances of 1979, which include the highly controversial Zina Ordinance, the Law of Evidence of 1984, and the Qisas and Diyat Ordinances raised serious questions, not only regarding the status and position of women in society, but about the direction that the state was taking more generally. These measures were accompanied by the Islamisation of the judiciary by creating a parallel religious judicial system, and major changes in
education and the media in the name of Islam. All these steps threatened to create a state dominated by the clergy, and based on a version of Islam highly detrimental for the rights of women and religious minorities. This version of Islam, dictated by one sect, alienated large sections of society and, unwilling or unable to make meaningful changes in the economy or other sectors, the state chose to legitimise an illegal rule by formulating restrictive laws against women.

The state’s resort to such tactics to prove its ‘Islamic’ credentials provided the impetus for a small but strong women’s movement under the umbrella of the Women Action Forum (WAF), formed in 1981. Soon after its formation in Karachi, WAF opened chapters in Lahore, Islamabad and Peshawar. Although WAF was composed primarily of middle class women, who are often the vanguard of most liberation movements, the issues it raised, in particular the Zina Ordinance, strongly affected the women of poor classes and rural areas. Despite its small numbers, WAF had a strong impact in that it was able to place vital issues of concern for women on the national agenda. It gained somewhat of an international recognition for its efforts in fighting against discrimination. WAF was strongly committed to a democratic and secular state where people of all religions and women would be equal citizens of the state. Over time, WAF took up all issues including minority rights, globalisation, militarism, religious domination, creation of peace and the struggle against poverty. The realise that all issues that affect society in general are also women’s issues, made WAF a radically transformative and vibrant, though small, feminist movement that created enormous awareness of issues of justice and rights in Pakistan.

One of the strongest features of the WAF movement was that it was based on the idea of a dialectical relation between theory and practice, action and reflection. Activism was thus a major part of WAF, along with study and understanding. However, the important aspect of activism diminished greatly as foreign donors entered the political arena and poured staggering amounts of money into the development sector, with large sums going to
former activists. Although WAF, as an organisation, had never accepted foreign funds and had been sustained on the contributions of its own members, individual activists began to receive foreign funds for what came to be called Women in Development (WID) and later Gender and Development (GAD).

The Gender and Development discourse transformed the landscape of Pakistani feminism beyond recognition. Narrow, superficial and technocratically conceived notions of both Gender and Development led to a static view of what was earlier a dynamic discourse and an impassioned movement. The World Conference on Women in Nairobi in 1985 had laid stress on what came to be called ‘Gender Mainstreaming’. The focus on so-called mainstreaming, sometimes critically called ‘male-streaming’ gender, distorted the very notions of gender and feminism. Gender, which initially meant the hierarchical division and dichotomising of the world into masculine and feminine, came to be a substitute for the word ‘women’. Understanding and political action came to be substituted by the concept of ‘training’, which implies lower order learning based on repetitive skills and mechanical tasks. Gender was combined with training to create a highly technocratic, mechanical and meaningless notion called ‘gender training’, which aimed to change the way people think and act within a period of three or five or ten days.

Based on faulty premises both in terms of learning theory and gender struggles, ‘gender training’ came to substitute political action by real people on a real and unjust world. Gender training was reduced to a serious of mechanical actions and reactions, and a set of silly, childish and meaningless ‘party games’, which had the effect of deadening the mind and de-politicising thought and action. While the Hudood Ordinances saw hundreds of poor rural women languishing in jails, and women were being beaten, murdered, sold, bought and raped in the name of Karo Kari, Wulwar, Swarah and Vani, gender trainers were busy playing fun games, which involved clapping, dancing, blowing whistles and making awkward gestures with their bodies. This was done in the name of ‘consciousness raising’ a term borrowed
from the 1960s and 1970s style encounter groups and popular psychology. A number of Pakistani men and women became involved in the kind of ‘gender training’ that relies on party games and exercises called ‘ice breakers’ or ‘energisers’, since a great deal of money was poured into this form of conservative and a-political pedagogy.

Apart from the gender training strand based on pop-psychology, another strand, which may be called the integrationist view, was also observed. This view was also based on a static notion of gender and meant the integration of gender concerns, ideas practices into all policies, programmes and practices. While one has no quarrel with integration in theory, in practice it reproduced the adage: ‘add women and stir’. There was a rush to insert so-called gender concerns or gender ideas into every policy and programme of the government and non-government sector. Whether it was sanitation, health, education, drainage or elections, gender issues had to be integrated or the project would not be funded. This led to a great deal of tokenism, in that the nominal presence of women or the ineffective inclusion of women in local bodies, government or committees, came to be seen as gender integration and empowerment. Oftentimes, mere numbers became indicators of women’s empowerment, when on the ground no change could be discerned in women’s status, power or position.

This phenomenon also created a market for technocrats, experts and consultants on gender who became a part of the global political economy of gender. Often without any experience on the ground, ideological clarity, or involvement in serious political struggles, experts and technocratic consultants produced superficial technical reports on the issues of gender equality. The Harvard Analytical Framework, which in reality is hardly analytical or even a comprehensive framework, became the dominant form of knowledge used by these experts in their work. A highly de-contextualised form of knowledge, and abstract in the extreme, the Harvard Analytical Framework could be used without regard to time and space — any place, anywhere,
anytime. As a result, its categories were sterile and its concepts a-historical and useless. It is also highly static with a number of concepts fixed and frozen in time, and its dichotomous notions do not reflect ‘reality’. The dichotomies between practical and strategic needs, between sex and gender, and between the condition and position of women are, in the final analysis, false. Needs, conditions and positions are not static, and far too complex to be reduced to binary notions.

What suffered most as a result of the report producing culture in the area of gender and development, was activism and political critique for change. International donors openly and vigorously discouraged activism, which had been regarded by feminists as the very basis of reflection and theory building. Consultants and experts refused to acknowledge the heavy debt they owed to activists who had initially raised the issues. Over a period of time, the women’s movement as a passionate, spontaneous and political movement died out. In its place, came the straitjacket of gender and gender training. Saturated in alienating terminology, suffused with ideas of game playing and manipulation, and overlaid with the notion of change as technique and method, gender training rapidly overtook all other concepts of development. Development was now devoid of politics and stripped of meaning. Development, in this view, no longer referred to structural change, a transformation of the economic and social structures and in systems of ideology. It became a pastime in which individuals, rather than the social collective, came to be associated with patriarchy. Oppression was now a matter of individual behaviour and action, rather than a systemic feature of the fundamental structures of society. Issues such as land reforms, the redistribution of wealth, a change in the productive and reproductive systems of society, which used to form the core of feminist critique and action, fell prey to the ubiquitous presence of gender training. The latter had nothing at all to do with social transformation and material change. It focussed on a change in the behaviour and attitude of individuals in their relations with each other. According to Sabeeha Hafeez, ‘the problem with these training programmes is that rather than
targeting the source of patriarchy, they mostly taught the victims.  

It must be mentioned here that not all feminists and non-governmental organisations fell prey to the technocratic ideology of gender training and integration. Some NGOs and individuals remained mainly committed to the political approach, characterised by the WAF movement and continued to be engaged in serious research, academic work combined with a vigorous activism. Although such approaches diminished, they exerted their influence in the direction of political and structural change. However, the international donors by and large remain committed to the narrow and technicist approach, combined with a serious discouragement of political activism. This constrains the work of some organisations that take a more overtly political line, yet they continue their own ideological struggles independently of the donors.

**Institutional Arrangements for Gender Integration**  
The Government of Pakistan generally remains committed to an integrationist, liberal approach rather than a radical transformation of social structure. Governments tend to be much more cautious and conservative than movements, and therefore, tend to remain far behind the demands of the movements. Nevertheless, movements can compel governments to turn attention to the issues they raise. Although governments may often engage in lip service, tokenism or window dressing, they are forced to accede to some of the more urgent demands by social movements. In compliance with one of the demands of the women’s movement, the government created the Ministry of Women’s Development (MoWD) at the Federal level, coupled with Women’s Development Departments at the provincial levels as the basic institutional framework for women’s development. At the District level, no separate EDO was created to serve women’s needs. The main purpose of the federal and provincial structure is to ensure that gender concerns are integrated in all policies, programmes and projects of the other ministries such as finance, agriculture, health or education. One
of the key policy measures of the MoWD is thus ‘mainstreaming gender issues through integration into all sectors of national development’. The vision of the MoWD includes the achievement of gender equity and equality, the social, political and economic empowerment of all Pakistani women at all levels, the creation of a just, humane and democratic society, and economic prosperity through sustainable development. The goal has been defined as ‘the empowerment of Pakistani women, irrespective of caste, creed, religion, or other consideration for the realisation of their full potential in all spheres of life, especially social, economic, personal and political and in keeping with our Islamic way of life’. There is a clear contradiction in this statement as the empowerment of women cannot be simultaneously ‘irrespective of caste, creed or religion’ and ‘in keeping with our Islamic way of life’. This contradiction seems to have crept in because of the tension within the official gender and development discourse. This tension arises from the state having acceded to the Convention for the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW) with the reservation that anything in conflict with the constitution of Pakistan would not be accepted. The Islamic character of the constitution allows the state to take recourse to cultural and moral relativism in applying the principles contained within CEDAW. Since cultural and moral relativism are often used to deny rights, this has been a problem for many states, including Pakistan.

It is also important to note that while the state is responsible for creating the environment for women’s development, as the state has acceded to CEDAW and is answerable to the UN for its actions, the women’s movement is much larger than the state. It has to constantly exert itself to influence the state to ensure that it keeps its commitments. However, UN-oriented official feminism is liberal in its basic assumptions and limited by its focus on access and numbers. The work of ‘femocrats’ has its usefulness in changing policy up to a point, but beyond that struggles on the ground are needed as the problem is social,
The State of the Discipline of Women’s Studies in Pakistan

structural and cultural, and the state’s actions are circumscribed by a number of political considerations. Nevertheless, in 1998 the government of Nawaz Sharif endorsed the National Plan of Action (NPA) prepared by the MoWD, thus committing the state to the actions suggested by the NPA regarding various areas including law, human rights, the media, the environment, the girl child, education, violence against women and health.

A long-standing demand of the women’s movement was the establishment of an independent commission on the status of women. In 2000, the National Commission on the Status of Women (NCSW) was created through an Ordinance. Its purpose is primarily to examine, review and monitor progress in women’s empowerment and rights, in accordance with obligations under CEDAW and NPA, and in the light of the recommendations of the reports on the status of women, especially the report produced in 1997. The aim of the commission to review and suggest changes in any law, policy, project or procedure that does not conform to women’s empowerment and development, or violates any of the norms and principles enshrined in CEDAW and included in the NPA. The NCSW reviewed the Hudood laws in 2003 and made useful recommendations, however to date no change has been made. Since the role of the NCSW is that of a watchdog, some tension between the role of the MoWD and the NCSW is bound to arise. The MoWD is the implementing agency, while the NCSW monitors and evaluates the progress and implementation of policy. Therefore some conflict is likely, especially because there is some overlap of functions and roles. Nevertheless, the two institutions are expected to work in tandem for women’s development.

Although the reservation with which Pakistan acceded to CEDAW, places constraints on the MoWD, there is nonetheless a commitment to the overall development of women, including education. Among the ministry’s aims and objectives is included the following: “to expeditiously and substantially enhance women's literacy rates, improve attainment levels of girls and
women at all levels of education (both academic and professional) to reduce the gender gap, and to reorient existing curricula by making them gender sensitive’. Thus, there is a policy commitment to higher and academic education under which Women’s Studies Centres would fall. The commitment to research and analysis is also included among the roles and functions of the NCSW, which states: ‘to encourage and sponsor research to generate information, analysis and studies relating to women and gender issues to provide knowledge and awareness for rational policy and strategic action’. Both institutions created for the development of women are thus integrally related to the state of Women’s Studies as a discipline in Pakistan, especially since it is not a ‘purely’ academic discipline and has a strong base in activism and implementation. The National Plan of Action (NPA), endorsed by the government in 1998, also recommends the promotion of the ‘inter-disciplinary field of Women’s Studies in public and private educational/training institutions’ and the strengthening of ‘action-based, policy directed research on women’s issues’.

The action recommended was that the funding of Women’s Studies Centres at five universities throughout Pakistan, should be ensured through the Ministry of Education and the UGC (now Higher Education Commission). It was also recommended that there should be ‘linkages and exchange of information and expertise between public and private Women’s Studies initiatives, including the Women’s Studies curriculum of the Allama Iqbal Open University (AIOU). There is thus a commitment at the state level to promote and encourage the discipline through ensured funding and support.

**Women’s Studies Centres**

The Women’s Studies Centres in Pakistan can be divided into public, (those funded by the government and/or international donors, and established at state universities), and those in the non-government sector funded primarily or only by international donors. In 1989, the Women’s Development Division (now Ministry of Women’s Development) established Women’s
Studies Centres in five universities, initially as a five-year project. The major objectives of these centres were: (1) critical examination of concepts, theories, models and methodologies that have been responsible for excluding or rendering women invisible in scientific investigation and development; (2) redefinition of curricula at the university, colleges and high schools with a view to incorporating knowledge on women and contributions by women scholars; (3) creation of awareness and generating a debate on women’s issues; (4) development of introductory foundation courses in Women’s Studies for the university students; (5) promotion of academic and action-oriented research on women in development; (6) identification, replication and translation of relevant materials from other languages into the national language. The initial funding for the creation of the centres came from the Women’s Development Division (now MoWD) and, subsequently, some centres were able to raise independent funding through tuition fees and donations by foreign donors. The following is a brief overview of the state of the public sector Women’s Studies Centres.

The aims and objectives of the Women’s Studies department of the Allama Iqbal Open University, established in 1997 with funding from the Ministry of Women’s Development, include among others; to introduce Women’s Studies as an academic discipline through the distance learning system, create awareness and sensitisation to gender issues at the community level through seminars and workshops, and to launch media programmes to emphasise women’s role and their contributions in national and international development.

The aims and objectives of the Women Research and Resource Centre (WRRC) of the Fatima Jinnah Women University (FJWU), Rawalpindi, are ‘to sensitise women on Gender issues and to focus on Fatima Jinnah Women University students for enhancement of education and employment opportunities in all disciplines’. It was established in 1999 emphasises ‘research in various gender and social issues, which reflect on the academic
and professional development of women by focussing on providing support services for women students of FJWU’.

The Institute of Women Development Studies (IWDS) was established in 1994 by the University of Sindh, Jamshoro. The aim of the Institute is ‘to replace the outmoded value system with one that emphasises equality and mutual respect and dignity among members of both sexes and to help to remove disparities in the provision of educational facilities’. The report by the IWDS indicates that the institute seems to conflate Women’s Studies with Home Economics, which is a major problem as the discipline of Women’s Studies challenges some of the basic assumptions of the ideology of Home Economics as a knowledge form that is meant to re-create and reinforce the gender division of labour. The focus on the ‘uplift of rural women and enhancing the literacy rate, and installing better health practices’, reflects a social welfare approach, which conflicts with a radical approach based on the transformation of material and ideological structures of patriarchy.

Courses and Training Programmes
There seems to be fairly wide variation in the kinds and levels of courses being taught at the Women’s Studies Centres and departments in the public sector. The courses vary from highly theoretical and historical ones to courses based on practical community work. In some cases, there seems to be immense confusion regarding Women’s Studies as a discipline as courses in Home Economics, dietetics, flower making or embroidery are defined as Women’s Studies courses. Whether a course is a Women’s Studies course depends on how a subject matter is treated. Courses in Home Economics, embroidery and flower making are generally not considered Women’s Studies courses. Occasionally, such courses contain conservative issues, and in most cases the content of such courses is not transformative or the kind that challenges existing structures of inequality and oppression. The basis of such courses in some public sector centres comes from the erroneous assumption that Women’s Studies pertains to anything that deals with women, irrespective
The State of the Discipline of Women’s Studies in Pakistan

of how conservative it might be. Although the subjects of art, crafts, literature, poetry, dance, music and drama certainly form a part of the Women’s Studies approach, the difference lies in the manner in which they are addressed. Arts, crafts and literature and poetry that contain the potential for transformation are normally considered a part of Women’s Studies, but not when arts and crafts are designed to reinforce patriarchal and dominant values that define what a ‘good housewife and mother’ must know. Some centres, such as the one run by Karachi University, reflect a serious and rigorous Women’s Studies approach in their course contents, while others, such as the centre in Jamshoro, Sindh or the Punjab University, are not based on a clear conceptual understanding of Women’s Studies.

The Women’s Studies Centre, Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad, has offered three certificate courses attended by 64 participants. The courses were interdisciplinary in nature and content. Currently, the Centre offers a six-week introductory course in Women’s Studies, which is constrained due to a severe shortage of funds. However, 24 students have enrolled for the course. The Centre has proposed to integrate Women’s Studies into the other social science departments of the University. It has sought to integrate women and development into Economics, feminism and anthropology into Anthropology, the history of the women’s movement in Pakistan in the History department, women and peace in the Department of Strategic Studies and Defence, gendered international relations within the International Relations department, the role of women in the Pakistan Movement at the Institute of Pakistan Studies and gender issues in management within the Department of Management and Business. However, only the Department of Anthropology responded with a list of course contents and interest in integration was expressed only by the Department of Economics. There was general indifference by the other departments, which were not responsive to the idea of integration.

The Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies programme at Karachi University reflects a comprehensive and holistic
approach in its course contents. There are introductory courses in Women’s Studies along with courses on feminist theories, feminist research methods, women’s history in South Asia, the social construction of gender and gender and development. Additionally, there are courses on the women’s movement globally and in Pakistan, as well as courses on women in Islam, reproductive health, women and media, women and the environment, women and law, women in technology and entrepreneurship, gender and development and women and work. A brief overview of the course contents indicates that the feminist perspectives underlies the courses, which have a global, national, local and cross-sectoral approach.

There has so far been no teaching activity at the Women’s Studies Centre, University of Balochistan in Quetta. A few certificate courses were conducted earlier but the space for teaching has been given to the Islamiyat and Persian departments, with the result that all teaching activity has been suspended. The approach of the Centre seems to be currently based on gender sensitisation workshops and seminars. The short seminar courses are focussed on issues such as the social empowerment of women, Islamic, legal and constitutional rights of women, women and work, women and education, and women and decision-making.

The courses offered at the AIOU include a course on the psychology of women, the role of women writers in Pakistani literature, research methods in women’s studies and feminist theories. Apart from these, the Open University requires students to attend courses in the departments of Sociology, Social Work and Population Studies. The latter include a course in social statistics and the sociology of gender. There is thus an attempt to follow an interdisciplinary orientation. The department has also prepared two TV programmes as a part of its distance learning initiative. Additionally, there are visiting lecturers by eminent scholars in the government, private and non-government sectors. In the future, the AIOU plans the following courses at the Postgraduate levels: gender and development, perspectives on
women’s studies, the changing role of urban women in Pakistan, the economic contribution of rural women, women’s health issues, the contribution of women in education, arts and science, and technology, and women and Islam.

The WRRC of the Fatima Jinnah Women University offers various courses in gender oriented development issues, which include a course on women and development, women in management, and self-esteem and mental health. Apart from these, a Women’s Studies course called ‘Status of Women in Pakistan’ is offered for PhD candidates of the University. Training and sensitisation workshops on issues such as ‘women in higher education’, ‘managerial skills’ and ‘Gender and Governance’ are held at regular intervals. In November 2002, an international workshop on ‘Women in Higher Education Management’ was held in collaboration with the British Council and the Association of Commonwealth Universities. The University has an eminent lecture series in which internationally renowned scholars and practitioners make presentations for students and faculty.

The only courses mentioned by the IWDS at the University of Sindh, Jamshoro, are those based on Home Economics and community development, as well as short courses in income generation activities such as fabric painting, pot painting, tie and dye, fancy arts and crafts. The latter are designed to enhance income generation and do not fall within a Women’s Studies paradigm. There are courses on social research methods, nutrition and dietetics, diet therapy, physiological chemistry, health and diseases, economic problems of Pakistan, women’s health and mental illness and gender. The courses reflect a relatively vague notion of gender and how it is related to the economy and health, but the critical edge of Women’s Studies courses is lacking. However, the Institute has organised workshops and seminars including one on ‘Gender and Governance’ and one on ‘gender sensitisation’ in collaboration with the MoWD. It has also held lectures on “women and the
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

media’ and women’s economic development by prominent scholars and members of the government.

Degrees Awarded
The Women’s Studies Centre at Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad, has prepared the curriculum for the MA programme in Women’s Studies after a great deal of consultation with feminists, activists, academics and consultants working in the field. However, due to various reasons, the MA programme has not been started. In 1992 and 1994, the Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies (CEWS) at Karachi University offered two certificate courses in preparation for the degree programme in Women’s Studies. In 1996, the first batch of students was admitted for the full two year MA course. In 2002, CEWS launched the MPhil and PhD programmes in Women’s Studies.

The interdisciplinary nature of the courses is evident from an examination of the structure of the courses. The Centre for Women’s Studies, University of the Punjab, was made a department at the initiative of the University in 2001, and offers an MA in Women’s Studies. The Women’s Studies Centre at Peshawar University, has now become a full-fledged department of Gender and Women’s Studies, which has offered certificate courses and is now ready to launch a diploma programme. The AIOU currently offers courses at two levels: a one-year Postgraduate Diploma (PGD) and certificate courses. There are plans underway to introduce the MSc programme. In the future, Open University plans to launch the MPhil and PhD programmes in Women’s Studies. In the future, the WRRC of the Fatima Jinnah Women University plans to develop an MA in Gender Studies in coordination with the University of Glasgow. The Institute of Women Development Studies at the University of Sindh, Jamshoro, offers an MA in Women’s Studies, it appears that so far there has not been enrolment in the degree programme.

Research and Publications
The Women’s Studies Centre at the Quaid-i-Azam University has prepared a directory of theses on gender issues produced in various departments of the university and this will be published
upon the availability of funds. The Centre has contributed research articles to two books published in the USA and Canada. Currently, the Director is involved in a research project on ‘Continuity and Discontinuity of Women’s Movement in Pakistan’, and has co-authored a book on ‘Women’s Contribution in the Cotton Industry’, due to be published soon. The director and staff, in their individual capacities, have contributed research papers in various national and international publications and have presented a large number of papers at international conferences.

The CEWS at Karachi University has completed about 100 major and minor studies on socio-economic, legal, health and environment issues. These include studies by both the faculty and students on home-based workers since Karachi is a major industrial and commercial Centre, while others are on child trafficking, legal and health issues. However, publication seems to be a relatively less developed area as no books or periodicals of any significance have yet been produced. The Department of Women’s Studies, Punjab University has conducted a study of women’s development NGOs in the Punjab, a study on the gender differentials in academic achievement from primary to higher education in Pakistan, and a review of theses related to women’s issues at the MA level at the Punjab University. All three studies have been published by the University.

The Peshawar University, Department of Women’s Studies has published a study on the ‘UN Conventions on the Rights of the Child, Islamic Law and Pakistan Legislation’ by Shaheen Sardar Ali and Baela Jamil, a comparative study of CEDAW (UN Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women), Islamic laws and Pakistan legislation by Shaheen Sardar Ali, a study on violence against women and honour killing in N.W.F.P. by Amirzada Asad, and a case study of Bahrain, District Swat on women and economic empowerment by Basharat Hussain. The centre staff contributed to the formation of the Gender Reform Action Plan of the MoWD. The Women’s Studies Centre at the Balochistan
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

University has conducted research studies on communities, rural women’s access to health facilities, a survey of women in jails and their needs assessments, the economic contribution of women in development, a profile of women in Katchi abadis (squatter settlements), violence against women, employment of women in the public and private sectors (sponsored by the NCSW) and the Asian Development Bank, and has contributed to the development of the Gender Reform Action Plan of the MoWD funded by the Asian Development Bank. The Centre has also been deeply involved in the Beijing +5 and +10 processes as a facilitator in organising consultative meetings at the provincial, national and local levels.

The Allama Iqbal Open University has published two research studies, ‘Voiceless Melodies’, and ‘The Case Studies of Successful Women in Pakistan’. Currently, the AIOU is in the process of carrying out the following studies based on the priorities within the NPA and in collaboration with the MoWD: needs assessment of both rural and urban women in income-generating skills development, impact of electronic and print media in changing the image of women in rural areas of Pakistan, evaluation of credit schemes and linkages with First Women Bank and entrepreneurs, analysis of gender gaps in access to education and training, international armed conflicts and impact of refugees on Pakistani women, the impact of the structural adjustment package on women in Pakistan, women in politics in the past and present, and women and decision-making in Pakistan.

The WRRC of the Fatima Jinnah Women University has supervised the writing of 16 theses on gender issues at the MA levels. A monograph serious is being published, which includes ‘A Critical Analysis of Government Policies, Plans and Funding of Education for Women from 1971-2001’, and ‘Status of Women in the Light of Four Major Religions (Hinduism, Buddhism, Christianity and Islam) in the Subcontinent with Special Reference to Pakistan’. Institutional research studies in
The State of the Discipline of Women’s Studies in Pakistan

socio-cultural and economic areas are regular feature of the centre’s activities.

The faculty of Institute of Women Development Studies at the University of Sindh, Jamshoro, has published two studies both by Professor Parveen Shah.14

Journals
The Women’s Studies Centre at the Quaid-i-Azam University brought out the first issue of the Journal of Women’s Studies based on the theme ‘Women and the Family’ in 1994. The second issue has not been published due to lack of funds for honoraria for writers, although papers for the second issue have been collected. Similarly, the Centre has published a quarterly newsletter, which was discontinued in 1997 due to lack of funds. The feminist and Women’s Studies periodicals to which the CEWS at Karachi subscribes include Women’s Studies International Forum, Feminist Review, SIGN, Studies on Women, Abstracts, and Women’s Studies Quarterly.

The AIOU plans to publish a Women’s Studies Journal, which will focus on contemporary gender issues within a national and international perspective. The work of the students of the Open University will be recommended for publication in social research journals of repute.

Professional Associations
The idea of setting up a Pakistan Women’s Studies Association (PWSA) was first conceived by Sabeeka Hafeez in 1987. The main aim of PWSA was ‘to introduce and promote the discipline of Women’s Studies in Pakistan by providing a forum for exchange of ideas among experts, policy makers, programmers, NGOs, teachers, other concerned organisations and the general public’.15 However, on account of the pressing previous commitments of various members, the association could not be established. Five years later, in March 1992, Pakistan Women’s Studies Association (PAWS) was set up by Tahira Aftab, Professor of History and Director of the Women’s Study Centre
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

at Karachi University. It was intended to provide ‘a forum of interaction and coordination for those engaged in teaching, research or action forewoman’s development, national and internationally’. The Association has organised national seminars on ‘Women’s Struggle for Survival’, ‘Human Rights Abuse in the Family’ and ‘Women’s Work Experiences’. The journal *Alam-e-Niswan* (Pakistan Journal of Women’s Studies) is brought out by the Association. It also brings out a quarterly newsletter called *Panghat*. The latter is distributed free of cost to non-government organisations, grass roots workers, and concerned people working on women’s issues in rural and semi-urban Sindh. PAWS has 72 members and has developed close links with women at the grassroots level, in particular with self-employed women. It has also published other works.16

**Affiliations and Linkages**

The Women’s Studies Centre at the Quaid-i-Azam University has not reported any formal linkages with other institutes, however a large number of eminent scholars and practitioners in the field of Women’s Studies, such as Maria Mies, the well-known German feminist, have lectured at the Centre. However, the Centre has worked in collaboration with the Sustainable Development Policy Institute (SDPI), the Human Rights Commission of Pakistan (HRCP), and Pattan Development Organisation (PDO). There are informal links with women’s NGOs and institutes, which are not currently institutionalised.

The Centre of Excellence for Women’s Studies at Karachi University runs collaborative ventures with both International organisations and Pakistani non-government organisations. It also works closely with government and semi-government institutions. It had academic linkages with the University of East London between 1975 and 1997. Additionally, CEWS has linkages with Memorial University of Newfoundland, Canada and the University of Jakarta, Indonesia. These linkages involved an exchange of students, faculty as well as the collaborative holding of workshops, training programmes along with formal and informal visits. CEWS worked with the legal organisation,
Lawyers for Human Rights and Legal Aid (LHRLA) on a study on trafficking of female children and this was launched in 2002. Other research and training linkages include a collaborative study of female home-based workers with the International Labour Organisation (ILO), workshops on reproductive health issues with Shirkat Gah and documentary preparation with Pakistan Women Lawyers’ Association (PAWLA). The Women’s Studies Centre at the University of Balochistan maintains regular liaison with other Women’s Studies Centres as well as government departments in order to keep abreast of intellectual or policy level developments.

The WRRC of the Fatima Jinnah Women University is linked with Glasgow University, UK with help from the British Council under the Department for International Development (DFID) programme.

Funding Sources
The Women’s Studies Centre at the Quaid-i-Azam University has received a total of Rs. 2,896,345 since 1989 from the government. The full budget was never disbursed and as a result the activities of the Centre were severely affected. Teaching, research, publication and acquisition of materials have all been hampered by the excessively low allocation of funds.

The CEWS at Karachi University was set up by the government in 1989 as a research centre. While its initial funding came from the University Grants Commission through the Women’s Ministry (earlier Women’s Division), it subsequently received funds from the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP), ILO, Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA) and United Nations International Children’s Fund (UNICEF). The source of funding for the Department of Women’s Studies, Punjab University, is the government and the funding is channelled through the Higher Education Commission and the University. The University of Peshawar has taken up the recurring budget of the Department of Gender and Women’s Studies. The Women’s Studies Centre at Balochistan University
social sciences in pakistan: a profile

is federally funded through the ministry of women’s development and the higher education commission.

the wrrc of the fatima jinnah women university, has been funded for its capacity building programmes by cida, usis, the british council and dfid. these donors have funded the higher study of faculty abroad as well as the organising of workshops, seminars and conferences.

the iwds of the university of sindh, jamshoro, is funded primarily by the university of sindh, however funding for specific programmes was supplied by the modw.

faculty
the faculty of the cews at karachi university consists of a director, a research associate, two cooperative lecturers and part-time visiting external lecturers. the faculty is diverse in its interests, and interdisciplinary in orientation as it belongs to various branches of the social sciences including social work, geography, and history. one faculty member has an ma in women’s studies. one faculty member, the director, holds a phd in social work. the department of women’s studies, punjab university has two permanent staff members, one a phd from the usa and the other an ma from punjab university. most of the adjunct faculty hold doctorates from pakistan and the us. the department of gender and women’s studies at peshawar university has four full-time faculty members, a full-time director and two lecturers have been sanctioned. the usual qualification for faculty members is ma in the social sciences, however there is one mphil faculty member who has qualified from the university of manchester, england. the women’s studies centre at the university of balochistan currently has one director along with support and technical staff. the aious department of women’s studies has one associate professor, and one lecturer, apart from technical and support staff. the associate professor has an mphil in history from quaid-i-azam university and a phd in women’s studies from the university of new south wales, sydney, australia. the lecturer holds an
MSc in Anthropology from Quaid-i-Azam University and an MSc in Women’s Studies from the University of London. Currently, she is pursuing a PhD from Victoria University, Wellington, New Zealand. Most of the faculty member of the IWDS of the University of Sindh, Jamshoro, are economists, while one member holds a degree in food and nutrition. Currently, the Institute has a director, two lecturers and two research associates apart from technical staff.

**Students**
The majority of the students of CEWS, Karachi, are now placed in various administrative positions in NGOs, international welfare organisations, research organisations, Planning and Development, and government and semi-government and private teaching institutions at the local and national levels. The MA at the Punjab University is a two-year course in which the third batch of students has been enrolled in 2004. The number has doubled from 37 students in 2001 to 74 in the batch enrolled in 2003. About 35 students are enrolled each year in the short arts and crafts courses of the IWDS of the University of Sindh, Jamshoro. In most cases, Women’s Studies students find employment in the non-government sector, research institutes, government social sector departments, and welfare organisations.

**Books and Teaching Materials**
The Women’s Studies Centre at the Quaid-i-Azam University regularly maintains newspaper clippings and its library has approximately 200 books. However, most of the books lack any relevance to Women’s Studies and the Centre is unable to expand the library once again due to financial constraints. However, various international donors including UNICEF, UNIFEM and the Asia Foundation have donated books for the Centre.

CEWS, Karachi has over 3000 books in the fields of Women and Development, Women’s Status Law, Work, Education, History, Cross-cultural works, Health, Technology, Media, Economics and Feminism. Apart from these, there is a collection of
encyclopaedias, rare books, reports of NGOs and research institutes, bibliographies and official documents of relevance. There is a significant collection of rare books in Urdu so that a larger number of women can gain access to the materials. Apart from books, reports and documents, the centre regularly keeps newspaper clippings from major dailies. The Centre is in the process of developing a documentation centre, which would contain audio-visual materials for use in seminars and workshops. The Centre also has a student advisory service, which addresses their intellectual guidance needs as well as conducting personal and vocational counselling. The students of the Punjab University Department of Women’s Studies use the library of the University for their studies. The Peshawar University Department of Women’s Studies has a well-stocked library for the use of the students. The Women’s Studies Centre at the University of Balochistan, Quetta, has its own resource centre/library equipped with the available material on gender. The AIOU is in the process of preparing textbooks and readers as well as support material for teaching.

The Allama Iqbal Open University is currently establishing a resource centre within the University’s central library. The resource centre is being equipped with books, journals and internet facilities for which both students and faculty may benefit.

Summary and Reflections on Women’s Studies in the Public Sector
The overall picture that emerges from the above account of the Women’s Studies Centres in the public sector is bleak, although it must be kept in mind that the information provided by some of them is sketchy and incomplete. There is an immense variation in course design and content, which stems from the incoherence, which plagues the subject in Pakistan. Some departments offer a course in feminist theory and feminist research methods, while others do not run courses at all. One or two departments focus on history and literature, especially the history of women’s movements, while others are concerned purely with development
The State of the Discipline of Women’s Studies in Pakistan

issues and women’s integration into development. Instead of full degree courses, which are few, there is emphasis on short training workshops based on the problematic notions of ‘gender training’ and ‘gender sensitisation’. There are very few publications that may be called genuine contributions to the discipline and this may again be due to a shortage of funds and lack of support. However, some members of the faculty in various Centres have published papers as individuals in their own capacity.

There is only one professional association, which is mainly focussed on Sindh. This means that there is very little formal interaction and exchange among academics, researchers, activists and scholars. However, a large number of conferences and workshops do take place, which are not generally organised by professional Women’s Studies associations. Most often, they are held by NGOs working on feminist or women’s issues. Outside of Alam-e-Niswan, there does not currently appear to be a significant journal of women’s studies in Pakistan, and once again the severe resource crunch can be cited for this failure. The majority of faculty members do not hold degrees in Women’s Studies but in the social sciences such as Economics or Psychology. The absence of a minimum number of professionals trained in the subject is also one reason for the lack of a coherent approach. Most of the students find employment in women’s or social sector NGOs, while some become academics. The great majority of students of the centres that do hold classes, are female as the subject is not considered one that has a strong market, and male students prefer subjects that can more easily lead to jobs.

Some of the significant findings from the available information must be discussed. First, there seems to be a severe dearth of funding for Women’s Studies, as it has not been an area of high priority. The funding has been so meagre that some Institutes were never able to begin classes or institute worthwhile programmes. The space and materials provided for the teaching of Women’s Studies was either highly inadequate or taken away,
So cial Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

as in the case of the University of Balochistan. While some centres, such as the CEWS at Karachi, were able to tap other resources from international donors, the centres, which relied entirely on funding from the ministry, were not able to become vibrant and active Centres. Second, not only was material support extremely inadequate, intellectual support was also lacking as is clear from the experience of the Quaid-i-Azam University, where some of the social science departments did not respond to requests for course contents or for the integration of Women’s Studies into their courses.

Third, and this is a crucial aspect, there seems to be an absence of any clear or coherent understanding or framework of Women’s Studies. A considerable amount of confusion seems to persist about what constitutes the discipline of Women’s Studies. In the first place, there is a great deal of lack of clarity about gender studies and women’s studies. The two are often confused and the terms are used interchangeably, whereas gender studies as a field of knowledge has a different focus. The concept of gender may form a part of women’s studies, but does not by itself constitute women’s studies. Furthermore, gender is a theoretical construct and not a substitute word for ‘women’. This understanding seems to be absent in most cases with the clear exception of the CEWS, Karachi University, which has a very clear focus on women’s studies and an underlying feminist perspective. In some instances, as in the case of the University of Sindh, even a conservative subject like Home Economics is lumped together with Women’s Studies. A common error that seems to characterise most Centres is that any study on women or on gender is defined as a contribution to Women’s Studies. In reality, a study on or about women or gender can be done from a very conservative or patriarchal point of view, in which case it would not be a contribution to Women’s Studies. The discipline is based on feminist theory and struggles, and without a feminist perspective underlying the study, it does not fall into the subject of Women’s Studies.
The State of the Discipline of Women’s Studies in Pakistan

Women’s Studies is a political subject with a definite ideological bent. Studies with underlying patriarchal assumptions would not fall within the discipline, as they would contradict the basic premises of feminism. This is not to suggest that a debate is not possible within Women’s Studies. On the contrary, feminism and Women’s Studies have produced some of the most vibrant and lively debates on the issues of patriarchy, militarism, peace, war, culture, globalisation and the state. The point here is that studies from one feminist perspective do lead to a debate with another — for example, the last two decades saw extremely energising debates between Socialist and post-modern feminists. But a study done in order to further a patriarchal enterprise, or to discredit feminism, or to reinforce a traditional cultural norm would be a study on or about women, but not a part of Women’s Studies. The latter means deconstructing existing knowledge categories and ways of conceptualising the world, and creating alternatives. Since the subject developed as much out of activism as out of theoretical debate, Women’s Studies can never be reduced to studies about women or gender. Therefore, whether some research study is a part of Women’s Studies or not is determined not by the subject matter, but the manner in which it is addressed. From the overview of public sector institutions above, it is hard to make this judgement since the details are not available to find out how a particular subject matter was treated. However, there is some reason to suspect that not all studies are strictly speaking feminist or within the rigour of the discipline known as Women’s Studies.

By and large, there seems to be a combination of liberal, integrationist, developmental, psychological and gender training approaches. There is generally very little critical work that seems to have emerged from the relatively new discipline in Pakistan. The CEWS at Karachi is a notable exception as there is a clear notion of feminism underlying Women’s Studies, and an alternative view of knowledge as the basis of the subject. In general a great deal of ideological confusion exists regarding the theory and practice of Women’s Studies.
Women’s Studies in the Non-government Sector
The non-government sector in Pakistan has played a significant role in introducing the concept of Women’s Studies as well as its ideological base in feminism. Although the only teaching institute is the Institute of Women’s Studies, Lahore run by Nighat Said Khan, women’s NGOs have made important contributions to feminist debates and analysis. The development of Women’s Studies and feminism in Pakistan may be very slow and insignificant compared with the levels attained in other countries in the region, in particular India and Sri Lanka. Nevertheless, in comparison with the public sector initiatives, the non-government sector has been much more dynamic.

The most outstanding and path breaking work in the introduction of feminism and Women’s Studies in Pakistan, has been that of the Institute of Women’s Studies Lahore (IWSL), which developed out of the ASR Resource Centre. Established in the mid-1990s, the IWSL began its annual certificate course in 1998. The course, which reflects sound feminist theory and practice based on a socialist feminist position, is taught by an international faculty drawn from the South Asian region as well as Europe, North America, Africa and Canada. The students are also drawn from several different countries in Asia and elsewhere. The IWSL has highly qualified, respected and acclaimed feminist academics and activists such as Uma Chakravarti, Neloufer de Mel and Jasodhra Bagchi on its faculty. The library has several thousand books on feminist theory, history, literature, sociology, education, research methodology and works in related disciplines. The Institute is equipped with the latest teaching technology and up to date teaching space. It can easily be described as the best Women’s Studies Institute in Pakistan and is highly regarded throughout the South Asian region.

The course contents reflect a deep familiarity with feminist debates and issues. The course is designed in a holistic manner and covers a wide range of topics that are dealt with critically. Some of the contents include women’s movements globally and
locally, identity and ideology, political economy, a version of history that does not exclude women as historical actors, English and Urdu literature, and the performing and visual arts. The entire course content and methodology are designed to inculcate feminist consciousness and understanding, as well as creating activists in the field.

Apart from teaching activity, which includes the annual certificate course and short workshops and conferences, the IWSL carries out research and publication within a feminist perspective. ASR/IWSL has published the largest number of books and papers on women’s issues from feminist and critical perspectives. Additionally, the Institute has reprinted well-known works by Egyptian feminist Nawal-al-Saadawi, Sri Lankan feminist Kumari Jayawardena, and Moroccan feminist, Fatima Mernissi. Some of the publications include Jayawardena’s *Feminism and Nationalism in the Third World*, Hidden from History: Forgotten Queens of Islam, *The Heart Divided* and Sa’adawi’s famous novel *Woman at Point Zero*. The Institute has also published works by Pakistani feminists, academics and activists including Saba Gul Khattak, Neelam Hussain, Ayesha Khan, Durre Ahmad, Najma Sadeque, Samina Rahman and this author. Some of these include Ayesha Khan’s *Rhetoric and Reform*, *Nighat Said Khan’s Voices Within* and *Up Against the State*, Fareeha Zafar’s *Finding Our Way* (edited volume), Durre Ahmad’s *Masculinity, Rationality and Religion*, Afiya Zia’s *Sex Crime in the Islamic Context* and *Watching Them, Watching Us*, Rubina Saigol’s *Knowledge and Identity* and, *In Her Own Write*, a book of translations of short stories by famous Urdu writers, edited by Samina Rahman. Apart from these books, ASR/IWSL has published co-edited books, which include *Locating the Self*, *Unveiling the Issues*, *A Celebration of Women* and *Aspects of Women and Development*. Apart of these, a number of books of Urdu literature by women writers, and collections of poems have been produced by IWSL. The Institute also has to its credit the publication of a number of reports based on issues raised at the Fourth World Conference on Women in Beijing, 1995, and
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

reports from other international conferences including the World Summit on Social Development.

In the books mentioned above, IWSL has covered a wide range of topics including the State, nationalism, militarism, globalisation, education, the media, law, political economy and the environment. Almost all of the work reflects feminist consciousness and a commitment to social change. A large part of the work is critical and geared towards the vision of an alternative world. The IWSL as an institution keeps abreast of the latest developments in feminist and social theory, and incorporates these into its courses and workshops. An annual lecture series by highly regarded feminist scholars is a well-attended event, which allows interaction and exchange to take place. Moreover, activism is an essential part of the thinking at IWSL and academic activities are combined with activism against militarism, war, discriminatory laws and all forms of social and economic injustice. The work reflects clarity on feminist issues and a deep understanding of Women’s Studies. Overall, it can safely be said that the Institute of Women’s Studies, Lahore is one of the best institutions promoting the discipline in Pakistan, and even in the South Asian region.

The other non-government organisations that have contributed significantly to the development of feminist thought in Pakistan are Shirkat Gah, Simorgh Women’s Resource and Publication Centre, and the Sustainable Development Policy Institute. Although these organisations do not conduct courses in Women’s Studies, they hold workshops and conferences that allow for critical feminist exchange on the issues of globalisation, militarisation, legal structures and systems, customary practices, the media and education. Additionally, they publish material nationally and internationally, which is critical in orientation and has feminist underpinning. Shirkat Gah has done extensive work on informal legal systems and customary law in all the provinces of Pakistan. Their publications on the subject have shed new light on the issues of non-state parallel systems of ‘justice’ and their impact upon
The State of the Discipline of Women’s Studies in Pakistan

society. Shirkat Gah has also produced a great deal of critical literature on globalisation and its impact upon women. The members of this organisation, Khawar Mumtaz and Farida Shaheed produced the seminal work on the women’s movement in Pakistan.\(^{33}\) No Women’s Studies course in Pakistan would be complete without studying this work. In addition to this, Shirkat Gah has also completed a comprehensive study on women’s perceptions of, and expectations from, the state. This has been published as a major study on Citizenship in South Asia and is a critical examination of the state in the region. A large amount of informational material on various issues of feminist concern has been produced for NGOs, CBOs and activists. This material is available usually in both English and Urdu for wider consumption.

Simorgh Women’s Resource and Publication Centre is primarily concerned with publications but has also engaged in workshops and training programmes from a feminist perspective. Simorgh has done highly commendable, and difficult, work with the higher judiciary and police in sensitising them to the issues of women. This organisation has produced supplementary books for children at the primary level with human rights content. This material is lively, enjoyable and fun to use so that young readers can enjoy as they learn. As regards the contribution to feminist thought, Simorgh has produced a study of the media’s portrayal of women during the Zia years.\(^{34}\) This study shows how the media operates to disseminate a particular brand of conservative, state ideology meant to control the mind, spread a particular kind of morality, and to manipulate public behaviour. The co-ordinator, Neelam Hussain, has translated Khadija Mastoor’s famous novel, *Aangan* (Inner Courtyard) into English thus providing a glimpse into the thinking of women writers involved in the Progressive Writers’s Movement.\(^{35}\) A number of works by Fatima Mernissi and other feminists have been re-printed by Simorgh and some have been translated into Urdu. Simorgh’s publication\(^{36}\) reflects a feminist understanding of the state, economy, education, media, performing arts, visual arts, literature, militarism and health. This work focusses on the
manner is which the state is produced, re-produced and inscribed on the minds of the population through the written word, in art forms and public monuments. Currently, Simorgh is in the process of publishing booklets on violence against women, patriarchal language and a number of other issues within feminism. Simorgh is also the first women’s organisation to bring out a journal, *Bayaan*, a socio-legal journal, which bridges feminist and social theory with legal thought in an effort to provide critical perspectives on legal structures. The first issue of this bi-annual journal has been published while the second is due in the summer of 2004.

The Sustainable Development Policy Institute (SDPI) is primarily a research institution and a policy-oriented organisation, but it has a strong dimension of feminist thought mainly due to the presence of Saba Gul Khattak. Khattak’s work on the military, and the ideologies of war and militarism, has become seminal, in that it was the first work of its kind to be produced in Pakistan. Khattak has also worked on the gendered nature of the state and nation and this work is indispensable for any course on Women’s Studies. SDPI has carried out research studies on conflict, displacement and refugees from a feminist perspective and this work has been published as a part of the Working Paper series. Conflict studies constitute another area in which Saba Khattak has taken the lead in Pakistan. Additionally, SDPI in collaboration with the Pakistan Institute of Labour Education and Research (PILER) has conducted one of the most comprehensive studies on the impact of liberalisation and globalisation on home based workers in Pakistan. The findings of this study are startling and it is essential reading for the political economy section of a Women’s Studies course because of being critical in its perspective.

Although Shirkat Gah, Simorgh and SDPI do not engage in formal Women’s Studies courses, they contribute to them by producing the kind of materials that can be used for courses in the public and non-government sectors. Apart from written materials, these organisations produce audio-visual materials
such as short films or documentaries for academic purposes. The other women’s NGOs like Aurat Foundation produce materials that are informative, but since most of the material is in the form of pamphlets, leaflets and brochures or reports, it has limited utility for Women’s Studies. This kind of material is more useful for activism and in that sense very important, but it does not necessarily have a feminist orientation.

**Issues for the Future**

One of the biggest problems that Women’s Studies, as a discipline, faces is related to sources of funding. The public and non-government sectors are both dependent on external funding. While the public sector institutes might ultimately be able to raise funds from tuition fee, in the near future the chances of this are bleak as it is not a subject that leads to lucrative jobs. With history, philosophy and social science departments closing or scaling down due to shortage of students and funds, Women’s Studies is unlikely to flourish against the onslaught of Information Technology and Management courses, which lead to jobs in the multinational and private sectors. The discipline is being kept alive by sheer will and a commitment to a more just and humane world by academics, scholars and activists.

In the past, international donors have been generous with funds for ‘gender’, which became a faddish issue rather than a serious political one. However, a large part of this funding was consumed either by consultants making technocratic adjustments in the system, or by the dubious world of ‘gender training and sensitisation’. Anyone with a rudimentary knowledge of the Harvard Analytical Framework, with its static and dichotomous categories, was able to obtain funding and use it on workshops. This approach was uncritical as the assumptions underlying it were that categories like ‘gender issue’, ‘gender gap’ or ‘practical need’ are fixed, immutable and static categories instead of dynamic discourses and subject to change and development, and ultimately even rejection. An overwhelming focus on this kind of work led to a steady de-politicisation of the issues and concerns of women. The ‘integration of gender’
approach was also static and based on false premises. Here the assumption was that ‘gender’ is like an object that can simply, mechanically and automatically be plugged into anything, be it the environment, education, health, sanitation or drainage. Project after project was launched on integrating gender into drainage or other ‘community development’ schemes. Everything just went down the drain, including gender, because of the crass inanity exemplified by this approach. It was assumed that once ‘gender’ (whatever that meant, and it meant different things to different people) was duly integrated into the scheme, all would be well. Underlying this approach were liberal assumptions about the state and socio-economic structures being all right and acceptable, but lacking only in gender. Once that was integrated, no problems would arise.

Approaches like this did more harm than good to the cause of feminism. They led to the faulty premise that simply providing access to women within the existing social structures was adequate. The structures themselves were not challenged and the patriarchy underlying state structures and policy was not questioned. Based on this kind of thinking, women were given enhanced seats in parliament, the provincial assemblies and local bodies. Since it was done without sound feminist and intellectual thought, no attention was paid to the way in which entrenched social power would ensure that the women who enter law-making bodies represent the interests of particular classes, either feudal or capitalist. The women, often given no voice in the debates and decisions, ended up rubber stamping decisions made elsewhere. The increased number of seats for women came to mean the reinforcement of feudal power and of the existing social structure. Instead of providing feminist critiques of governance and devolution, a number of non-government organisations became the partners of a military regime creating local constituencies for itself by bypassing the provinces and centralising power from the federal government directly to the districts. Instead of the decentralisation of service delivery, the military-dictated devolution became a ‘decentralisation of repression’ and a means of extracting taxes at the local level.
Therein lies the deep contradiction. International donors, especially those that represent foreign governments, increasingly fund only those organisations that are willing to work on the agenda of global governance (which is the political face of economic globalisation), and do not fund activities, which are critical of the exercise. Since knowledge and understanding have become fragmented, through intentional or unintentional donor fixation, there is increasingly an inability to see military governments or ‘controlled democracies’ as antithetical to human rights and justice. A number of donors, including for example CIDA and the UNDP (both of which lay claims to promoting human rights — a UN agenda), find themselves unable or unwilling to perceive the contradiction between their support for a militarised regime, and their commitment to human rights, of which women’s rights form a part. Their arguments run along the lines that as long as the military delivers on gender (which is also questionable) it does not matter that it has systematically eroded the independence of the judiciary, the supremacy of parliament or the importance of free speech and expression.

Since issues are perceived as divorced from one another, and kept in separate compartments of the mind, rights are not seen as a whole, as interconnected. It becomes difficult in this kind of straitjacket thinking to understand how the erosion of democracy can lead to greater injustices for women as well. Even within liberal feminist thought, justice for women is inseparable from democracy and human rights, and cannot be achieved by cancelling the latter. An example of the intense ideological confusion resulting from compartmentalisation is that some consultants working on gender happened to be staunch supporters of the Taliban regime, which cancelled all rights for women, and enamoured of Adolf Hitler’s racist militarism. However, a political thinking promotes precisely this kind of fragmentation, but it is ‘safe’ from the donors’ point of view as it promises that the change will not be too great and will be firmly controlled and directed. Donors generally fear change, especially
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

one that they cannot control or direct. Thus we find democracy and ‘good governance’ increasingly promoting private and market interests instead of the interests of citizens. Nonetheless, ‘good governance’ and ‘global governance’ are consistently promoted by the IFI’s and international donors, as the new panacea for all ills affecting society, while no change in socio-economic structures is envisaged.

For feminists the dilemma is that ideologies that need to be deconstructed and subjected to critical scrutiny are the ones being promoted by donors. Yet, feminist organisations are dependent upon them for support and the MoWD’s support also comes from them. If the trend persists, there is the danger that the critical edge of feminism will be lost to the liberal practices of ‘gender integration and training’ for good. If feminism remains caught within the paradigms of ‘development’ as conceived by foreign donors, it is increasingly likely to become a-political and ‘safe’. Its potential for transformation will be reduced to the extent to which it succumbs to the pressures of mainstreaming. As feminism becomes co-opted and reduced to ‘gender mainstreaming’, ‘safe’ and ‘manageable’, Women’s Studies will suffer as a discipline. Women’s Studies is threatened with becoming ‘just a study about women’.

Finally, Women’s Studies as a discipline, is also threatened from other sources. Since feminism is the ideological and intellectual base of Women’s Studies, the organisations and centres that promote the subject need to reflect the feminist principles of non-hierarchical functioning, and fair play and justice in the workplace. However, neither the public sector departments, nor the organisations in the non-government sector are organised non-hierarchically or develop well-established rules and Standard Operating Procedures. Excessive ad hocism is the norm with the result that decisions and actions become entirely arbitrary and dependent upon the whims and fancies of directors and heads. This means that rules are also often contradictory and not applied evenly across the board. On account of excessively hierarchical functioning, top-down power structures, absence of
The State of the Discipline of Women’s Studies in Pakistan

systems and standards of operating, lack of tolerance for dissent and disagreement, and inconsistent application of rules (the latter is more evident in the non-government sector as the public sector has certain standard procedures), feminist principles of inclusion, justice, equality and fair play are often violated. There is usually no recourse to an independent authority for the redress of grievances and employees are often at the mercy of their seniors. This kind of managerial authoritarianism, combined with the fact that most directors in the non-government sector are permanent, lifelong heads with no procedure for transfer of authority, the entire organisation is at the mercy of their whims and passing fancies. This problem seriously plagues the non-government sector and needs to be urgently addressed if feminist and non-feudal, non-personalised forms of the organisation of work are to be established.
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

Notes

2 Mary Wollstonecraft, A Vindication of the Rights of Woman (W. Scott, London, 1891), with an introduction by Elizabeth Robins Pennell. First published in 1792 and has been published several times since.
4 Hafeez, ‘Towards Developing a Women’s Studies…’, op. cit., p. 81.
6 A large number of ‘Gender Training Manuals’ produced by UNIFEM and other donors, reflect the game-playing, pop-psychology approach that is extensively used by expert gender trainers. The very notion of a ‘manual’ is problematic as manuals were typically designed for how-to purposes to enable people to quickly fix something or assemble something. Applying this notion to political issues reflects the quick fix mechanical approach that dominates the world of gender training. Manuals are typically fixed in time present knowledge as fixed, static and not as contained within a debate. They are designed to freeze issues in time instead of presenting debates as ongoing and knowledge as incomplete and open-ended. Additionally, manuals are based on the assumption that ‘gender’ problems can be solved by applying a given set of tricks and techniques.
7 Hafeez, ‘Towards Developing a Women’s Studies…’, op. cit., p. 86.
8 Ministry of Women’s Development, Key Policy Measures, No. 3.
9 Vision and Goal statement of the Ministry of Women’s Development, Social Welfare and Special Education.
10 Ministry of Women’s Development, Aims and Objectives. No. 6.
11 National Commission on the Status of Women, Role and Functions, part d.
12 National Plan of Action, p. 68.
13 The information in this section is based on the reports and materials provided by the Centres. This information may contain gaps since the author did not have direct access to the Centres. Additionally, the information provided here is highly uneven with some Centres given more detailed and comprehensive reports than others.
16 Ibid.
17 Kumari Jayawardena, Feminism and Nationalism in the Third World (ASR, Lahore, 1994).
The State of the Discipline of Women’s Studies in Pakistan

22 Nighat Said Khan (ed.), *Up Against the State* (ASR, Lahore, 2004).
28 Samina Rehman (edit and translation), *In Her Own Write: Short Stories by Women Writers in Pakistan* (ASR Publications, Lahore, 1994).
33 Mumtaz and Shaheed (eds.), *Women of Pakistan…*, op.cit.
34 Malik, Maha & Neelam Hussain (eds.), *Re-inventing Women: The Portrayal of Women in the Media in the Zia Years* (Simorgh, Lahore, 1985).
36 Hussain, Neelam, Samiya Mumtaz & Rubina Saigol (eds.), *Engendering the Nation State* (Simorgh, Lahore, 1997), Vol. I & II.
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

38 For example see her paper ‘Violence and the Centrality of Home: Women’s Experience of Insecurity in the Karachi Conflict’, Working Paper Series No. 73, 2002. Apart from this, Saba Khattak has worked extensively on Afghan women refugees on which there are several published working papers available at the SDPI.


41 For example see Masooda Bano’s article ‘Striking power balance’ in The News, February 27, 2004. Bano reveals how false are the pretences of democracy of the present government. A seminar on the ‘17th Amendment and its Implications for Federalism’ organised by the Pakistan Oppressed Nations Movement (PONM) was forcefully stopped by the police. This is a blatant violation of people’s constitutional right to freedom of speech, expression and debate, but no debate on the Legal Framework Order and its insertion into the constitution was permitted by the ‘democratic government’.

42 Taylor, Marketization of Governance…, op.cit.
Introduction
This chapter attempts to examine the development of field of Peace and Conflict Resolution in the context of Pakistan. It examines two questions. The first question is that while Peace and Conflict Resolution Studies have emerged as separate disciplines in different parts of the world, why have they not developed in Pakistan and what factors explain this lack of development and finally what can be done to foster it. But before examining these questions we attempt to discuss the paradigm shifts in this field and the context in which this field developed in the West.

Paradigm Shift
There occurred two major shifts in the paradigms of world order in the twentieth century. First after the end of the Second World War there was a shift to inter-state conflicts, primarily at the superpower level and the second after the end of the Cold War there was a move from inter-state to intra-state conflicts. Conflicts, which were primarily of inter-state nature, also underwent structural change because of the rise of intra-state conflicts. In the post-Cold War era, security, which for a long period focussed on the military dimension, came to be examined in a broader framework including its relations with human nature. Similarly, peace which was primarily examined in the
context of the absence of war began to be viewed in its positive aspects of non-violence and mutual coexistence.

With the change in the approach and concepts of conflict, security and peace the field of International Relations as an academic discipline also underwent a major shift. International Relations, which had emerged from the fields of Political Science and History, witnessed the growth and rise of conflict resolution, peace and security studies because of significant changes in the realm of international politics. The intricate nature of various unresolved conflicts, particularly in the developing world, generated a new debate on the methodology and approach to deal with the causes, which tend to promote such conflicts and endanger local, national, regional and international peace.

Peace and Conflict Resolution Studies are relatively new disciplines in the social sciences. Initially, it was the peace research movement, which caught the imagination of scholars dissatisfied with the historical, war theorising of the realist school of thought in International Relations and its overt emphasis on Machiavellianism. In the 1950s, however, a change occurred when an increasing number of social scientists in the United States and Scandinavian countries got interested in providing a normative philosophical orientation for a peaceful global order. The change was stimulated partly by their apprehension that power struggle between the two superpowers having nuclear weapons may produce a holocaust.

Along with the above changes emerged the field of Conflict Resolution, which is apparently distinct from peace research, although one does find reference to conflict theory in the literature of peace research. The field of conflict studies is still in its early stage of development and less developed than the field of peace research. A debate is going on among the scholars whether the two should be considered one discipline or two disciplines.² Some times distinction between the two is made on the basis of micro and macro conflicts; Peace Studies dealing with macro conflicts and Conflict Resolution dealing with micro
conflicts. It may be stated that such a distinction is not of much utility considering the interdisciplinary as well as the inter-methodological nature of most social science disciplines today.

As discussed above the scope of Peace and Conflict Resolution has expanded. These do not concentrate solely on elimination of wars and conflicts in the world at large but also study domestic issues such as ethnic violence, state repression and social conditions, which influence the growth of crime, inequalities, etc. Reportedly a shift has occurred in Peace and Conflict Resolution Studies and these have acquired fresh nuances and insights in the 80s and 90s, following changes in the manner in which security was beginning to be perceived in mainstream International Relations theory. With the end of the Cold War, Peace Studies now also include other themes like environment, gender and an end to nuclear testing.

The Emergence of Peace and Conflict Resolution Studies in the West

Peace and Conflict Resolution studies as an academic discipline picked up momentum in the West during 1960s though some significant institutional developments had occurred earlier during 1950s. In 1956, the Centre for Research on Conflict Resolution was set up in Ann Arbor, Michigan, which published the Journal of Conflict Resolution in 1957. The journal remained the only one in the field for several years. Similarly, the Peace Research Institute Oslo (PRIO) was established in 1959 and it started publishing the Journal of Peace Research (JPR) in 1964. Since its establishment, PRIO has served as a training ground for the first generation of peace researchers in Nordic countries as well as for visiting young researchers from several other countries.

Rise of Peace and Conflict Resolution Studies was connected to international political developments at the time of their emergence. The world was heavily divided between the two power blocs on ideological grounds. Movement against the Vietnam War and the nuclear arms race resulted in the emergence of various peace groups and movements particularly
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

in Europe indirectly contributed to the development of Peace and Conflict Studies.6

Peace and Conflict Resolution Studies in Pakistan

It is paradoxically significant that most of the Peace and Conflict Resolution Studies, the formulation of theories and concepts and finding out solutions to such conflicts are done in the Western countries, particularly in the United States with hundreds of centres and institutes both in academic institutions and in the corporate sector. In contrast in South Asia, which is hub of several conflicts and where problems of conflict prevention, management and resolution are rampant there are only a few centres and institutes doing research on these problems. In this regard Peace and Conflict Studies are repeating the pattern, the field of International Relations has set earlier.7

This is particularly true for Pakistan. It has and is suffering from several inter and intra-state conflicts and therefore can benefit most from Peace and Conflict Resolution Studies. Such studies can particularly help its policy makers to understand why conflicts take place and how they could be prevented, managed and resolved. But paradoxically the discipline of Peace and Conflict Resolution has not been institutionalised in the form of separate departments and research institutes in any university of Pakistan.

The lack of peace studies in Pakistan is in sharp contrast with a number of countries in South Asia suffering from internal conflicts. In Bangladesh, the Dhaka University opened such a department in the year 2000. In India the Madurai Kamaraj University has the Department of Gandhian Studies and in Banaras University there is Peace Research Centre. In the private sector in India there are: International Centre for Peace Initiatives, Mumbai headed by Sundeep Waslekar; Institute of Peace and Conflict Studies led by P. R. Chari (Delhi) International Centre for Peace Studies, Delhi headed by Riaz Punjabi and Institute of Conflict Management, Delhi led by K. P. S. Gill. In Sri Lanka the Centre for Policy Research and
Analyses (CEPRA) placed in Faculty of Law of the Colombo University and led by Dr. Jayadeva Uyangoda does research on Peace and Conflict Resolution issues.

In Pakistan a limited change occurred in the status of Peace and Conflict Resolution during 1980s and 1990s when a number of International Departments in some general universities of Pakistan introduced certain courses related to this field. Data collected from different sources including some faculty members of selected universities suggests that such courses are taught in Departments of International Relations of Karachi University, Quaid-i-Azam University, Bahauddin Zakariya University and the Department of Defence and Strategic Studies of Quaid-i-Azam University. However, not all courses are directly related to peace. The courses directly related to peace are offered only at two Departments of International Relations of the University of Karachi and Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad. From among all the peace related courses only two courses are compulsory, which are offered in the Department of International Relations, University of Karachi and in the Department of Defence and Strategic Studies at Quaid-i-Azam University. As all other courses are optional, not all students in a department take them. The departments of International Relations at three universities, Peshawar University, Balochistan University and Sindh University offer no course on peace or related to peace.

Whatever courses are taught in the departments of International Relations they are situated in the security paradigm and are dominated by teachings of the realist school. This school glorifies war, balance of power scenarios and the utility rather than the futility of nuclear weapons. Every new undergraduate student is given a dose of Hans Morgenthau’s *Politics Among Nations*, which is considered to be the Bible of International Relations in Pakistan. From the above one may conclude that only a small number of students studying International Relations get exposed to peace literature and peace paradigm.
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

Following the pattern of International Relations and Defence and Strategic Studies in Pakistani universities, Western sources and books are heavily used in teaching courses on Peace and Conflict Resolution despite the fact that some regional material is available. Only two books produced in the region are being used as textbook in some courses.10

Research on Peace and Conflict Resolution
Not much research has been produced on Peace and Conflict Resolution in Pakistan. Whatever limited research is being produced is in departments of International Relations, departments of Defence and Strategic Studies and a few governmental and non-governmental research institutes.

Peace Research in Pakistani Universities
As papers in this volume on different disciplines show Pakistani universities have produced very limited research of high quality in terms of writing new books, articles publishable in international journals and PhD and MPhil theses. With few exceptions, this observation is true for departments of International Relations as well. One cannot give a list of the books and articles on peace produced by Pakistani scholars due to the absence of data. However, some data collected by COSS gives information about the theses that contain the keyword 'peace.'

It shows that out of six departments of International Relations that existed in 2003, five have produced 12 PhD and 60 MPhil theses. The Department of Defence and Strategic Studies of Quaid-i-Azam University has added another 14 MPhil theses making the total 86. From looking at their titles one gets the impression that most of them have been written following the security paradigm and realist school. When the titles of these theses were searched to find out, which of them contained the terms ‘peace’, ‘war’, ‘conflict’, ‘nuclear’, ‘SAARC’ and ‘strategy’ the search gave the following result. Five of them contained the word ‘war’, five the word ‘nuclear’, four the word ‘strategy’ four the word ‘SAARC’ and two ‘regional conflicts’

392
Several factors explain the lack of research on Peace Studies in Pakistani universities. The first is obviously the absence of peace studies and conflict resolution discipline in the form of separate departments in Pakistani universities. Second, the discipline of International Relations, which is the mother of this discipline, has developed slowly. The only department of International Relations inherited by Pakistan was in University of Dacca. First department of International Relations in the present Pakistan emerged in 1958 followed by one in the University of Islamabad (renamed as Quaid-i-Azam University) in 1972/3 and then in the University of Sindh, Jamshoro, University of Peshawar and University of Balochistan, Quetta and Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan. Some of them emerged during 80s and some during 90s. With such a limited number of International Relations departments in Pakistan, the scope of Peace Studies and Conflict Resolution, which heavily depended on the expansion of International Relations as a field of study, remained limited. Third, the lack of adequate number of qualified people who can teach and do research in this nascent field is also a limiting factor.

Some other factors affecting research in social sciences in general and in the field of Peace and Conflict Resolution in particular need mentioning. They include the unconductive research environment at Pakistani universities, low level of funding to them for research and lack of financial rewards for social science researchers particularly for those who study subjects like Peace and Conflict Resolution Studies.
So cial Scien ces in Paki stan: A Profile

Research in Non-Academic Institutes
While there is no peace institute in any university of Pakistan there are a number of research institutes outside universities that conduct research on peace and conflict related issues some sponsored by the government and some established in private sectors. Three well-known government sponsored institutes are Institute of Regional Studies (IRS), Institute of Strategic Studies (ISS), Islamabad Policy Research Institute (IPRI). All three are located in Islamabad. ISS and IPRI are headed by academics and IRS by a retired General. All three have specific mandates defined for them by their sponsoring ministries. The Ministry of Information supports IRS and IPRI and Ministry of Foreign Affairs funds ISS. The research orientation of government sponsored institutes is considerably influenced by the perceptions of sponsors concerning peace and war issues. Most of research is often centred on issues involving Pakistan and have an explicit or implicit emphasis on research work, which are complementary to the accepted and established thoughts and views of the state functionaries.

There are four institutes in the private sectors; Foundation for Research on International Environment National Development & Security (FRIENDS),11 the Institute of Policy Studies (IPS)12 and Sustainable Development Policy Institute (SDPI).13 The first one is located in Rawalpindi and remaining three are in Islamabad. There is also the Regional Institute of Peace and Security Studies (RIPPS) in Karachi.14

With the possible exception of SDPI most of what privately funded institutes produce is not rooted in academic theories and methodologies or international concepts of peace reflected in documents of UNESCO. Most of them again with the exception of SDPI represent the conventional thinking on peace, arms, armaments and national security.

While examining why Peace and Conflict Resolution has not emerged as a separate discipline in Pakistani universities some factors internal to universities were identified earlier. Below this
question is examined in broad political, social, and cultural environment of the country.

**The Role of the State**
The State is the most important actor in shaping and re-shaping not only the concrete material existence of society but also in configuring the agenda and mindset of the nation. It is not a value-neutral actor and its proclamations and actions are often made to promote one specific discourse on issues of war and peace at the expense of others. Generally contemporary states have remained mired in the realist discourse. Even the relatively peace oriented North Atlantic states, according to Hakan Wiberg, generally have followed security paradigm. The Boards of several Nordic institutes at early stage of their development avoided the word ‘Peace’ in naming their institutes and journals or combined it with the term Conflict Resolution. They gradually dropped the latter as peace research became more respectable. Most of the German institutes still combine the two.\(^{15}\)

Cold War further strengthened the security paradigm. Most states during this period remained caught in the web of realist discourse of war, national security and on nuclear weapons. This prevented the emergence of an alternative discourse of Peace and Conflict Resolution. It is only in the post-Cold War era that elements of Peace and Conflict Resolution discourse are emerging and gaining some prominence as reflected in the emphasis on confidence building measures, track II diplomacy, and people-to-people contacts.

**State of Pakistan and Peace Studies**
The state of Pakistan emerged in conditions that constrained it to follow realist school. Somewhat violent separation from India, fear of re-absorption by India, Kashmir and other disputes with it did not permit it to adopt and internalise peace discourse. Emergence of a similar realist discourse in India and three wars between the two countries further reinforced this discourse. Long direct and indirect military rule that existed for 25 years out of 56 years of the life of Pakistan the realist discourse got further
So cemented as militaries all over the world are conditioned to the security discourse. Even during the civilian rule of 31 years this discourse prevailed as army shaped significant political developments and in such a situation the civilian governments could not develop and adopt a paradigm other than set of by military rulers. Given these facts, the state of Pakistan remained fixed in the security paradigm.

The state’s security paradigm gained further support from a particular interpretation of Islam, the religion of majority of citizens of Islamic Republic of Pakistan. In this religion suffused discourse enemy India came to be perceived as 'Hindu India' and liberating Kashmir from the control of India became both a religious and national duty. To convince international community that there was total national consensus on Pakistan's security policy the state, part of media and some religious groups disapproved and suppressed discussion on this policy particularly on nuclear issue. The demands for reducing defence expenditures and initiating the process of dialogue with New Delhi on resolving contentious issues virtually became blasphemous. Those holding alternative views on these issues were branded Indophile, anti-national elements willing to kneel down before India, which they believed wanted to establish hegemony over Pakistan. The very concepts of Peace and Conflict Resolution were looked with suspicion. Some right wing circles of Pakistan argued that these concepts were primarily Western in nature and branded peace advocates and activist using them as American/Western agents.\(^6\)

To fortify its security paradigm military dominated state also tried to promote ‘intellectuals’ who propagated their undemocratic and jingoistic point of view about democracy, war, peace and conflict studies. Nexus between the military and clergy on the one hand and bureaucracy and hawkish academic elements on the other hand projected an exaggerated external threat to the country in order to justify Militarisation of society. Under these circumstances Pakistani academic institutions were
incapable of producing conflict resolution analysts, mediators and professionals in Peace Studies.

Religious components of security paradigm gained further strength after the introduction of Islamisation in Pakistan by General Zia-ul-Haq and Pakistan's participation in Afghan war with support from the US. During Afghan war both military establishment and religious group joined hands to promote Jehadi culture in the country. In such a milieu advocacy of peace came to be regarded an anathema and threat to the country’s Islamic character as well as to its national security.

The prevalence of security paradigm supported by military and religious groups prevented the growth of culture of debate and discussion in the absence of which peace paradigm could not take root and Peace and Conflict Resolution Studies and discipline could not emerge.

While security paradigm has dominated the discourse in Pakistan on peace and war for long time, the peace paradigm has been struggling to born from mid 90s onwards. The advocates of peace paradigm in Pakistan have raised serious questions about the cost of following security paradigm and huge expenditure on conventional and nuclear means of defence that flow from it. They argue that perception of ‘national security’ by elite is hurting the overall development of the country and is ignoring human security.

Several developments internal and external to Pakistan have created some limited space for the development of peace paradigm. The internal change to Pakistan is the emergence of a number of civil society organisations (generally known as NGOs) and research institutes. Some of them do research on peace issues and publish it; some organise meetings, conferences and seminars to spread peace consciousness. Prominent among them are the Human Rights Commission of Pakistan (HRCP), Amnesty International (AI), Women Action Forum (WAF), Pakistan India Forum for Peace and Democracy, Edhi Trust and
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

Campaign for Nuclear Sanity (now moribund).\(^{18}\) A number of newspapers particularly in English have also played a significant role in creating this space by publishing articles critical to security paradigm by their own staff and peace advocates.

Among the changes external to Pakistan the most important one is softening of its strained relations with which have consolidated the security paradigm prevalent in Pakistan since its emergence. The process of change started with the visit of Indian Prime Minister to Pakistan and signing of Lahore declaration. Information revolution and globalisation of knowledge on peace paradigm has also facilitated the change.

This change is manifest in several developments. The International Relations departments of a number of universities in Pakistan have introduced in their curriculum peace courses. The Department of International Relations, University of Karachi besides introducing a compulsory course on Peace and Conflict Resolution at the graduate level has also created a programme on Peace Studies and Conflict Resolution on April 13, 2000.\(^{19}\) Since its establishment, the Programme has organised several seminars and workshops on the issues related to Peace and Conflict Resolution and has also published materials related to this field.\(^{20}\) Under this Programme the premises underlying security paradigm are fully debated and scrutinised and alternative thinking based on peace paradigm is presented.

For the first time in the history of Pakistan a university, National University of Science and Technology (NUST) in Rawalpindi has established an International Institute of Peace and Stability/Conflict Resolution supported by the Higher Education Commission (HEC). Reportedly it will be patronised by the state. In the private sector, a Trust for Global Peace has been registered on March 6, 2004 with its central office in Islamabad.\(^{21}\)
Conclusions and Recommendations
The field of Peace Studies and Conflict Resolution in Pakistan has bright prospects because of two reasons. First, economic, political, social and religious contradictions at the societal level resulting into growing instability and insecurity among different segments of society. Second the need to do path-breaking research on understanding the nature of different conflicts and strategies for their resolution. Peace is an end in itself and the process of conflict prevention, management and resolution tend to create conditions for a society, which is stable and where people are conscious enough to protect their rights.

As our above analysis shows the state of Pakistan working in security paradigm and universities controlled by it are unlikely to initiate and sustain Peace and Conflict Resolution programmes and studies on the long-term basis. Our analysis also shows that if space for peace studies have developed in the country it is for considerable extent due to the efforts of organisation located in private sector. The public officials representing the state do make statements and speeches on various public platforms on the desirability of peace between the India and Pakistan through instituting confidence building measures. But these are just proclamations designed to appease the pressures emanating from abroad. If Peace and Conflict Resolution is to be established as a concrete form with academic foundation, then the process should start from the bottom, that is, from academia and civil society the academics developing a solid and stable peace agenda counteracting the influence of state managers. However changing the attitude of managers of state will not be easy as their interests are closely linked with defence and military spending.22

In spite of the above mentioned difficulties we conclude this chapter with some recommendations hoping their implementation eventually will improve the prospects for developing a genuine peace paradigm in Pakistan:
1. Universities must establish a few separate departments of Peace and Conflict Studies. All departments of International Relations must have a few courses on peace, which are taught by well-qualified teachers.

2. A crash programme for training peace teachers must be started to manage the new departments and teach peace courses. For this purpose a certain number of scholarships should be created enabling some teachers to study abroad in universities that have good peace programmes.

3. A national Peace and Conflict Centre or Institute is created for conducting research and publishing material for use in teaching of peace courses. Such a Centre should issue a major research journal initially on a biannual basis and later on a quarterly basis.

4. The Centre should promote interaction between Pakistani peace scholars and their counterparts in the South Asian region as well as collaborative research.

5. The part of corporate sector in Pakistan whose material interests are connected to lasting peace should be persuaded to fund similar centres inside and outside of universities.

Given the problems identified in this paper it will take couple of years for the field of Peace Studies and Conflict Resolution to gain proper recognition and take roots in the academia of Pakistan. However, with more and more coordination among those who are working on the issues of Peace and Conflict Resolution, proper networking between them, publications of indigenous literature, offering of more courses, one can expect that some headway will be made to solve these problems.
Notes

1 Although occasionally we use the term ‘Peace and Conflict Resolution’ as plural, in general we prefer to use it as singular.
3 Ibid., p. 10.
4 See the background paper ‘WISCOMP Symposium on Conflict Resolution: Trends and Prospects’, held from October 2-7, 2001 in New Delhi, India.
8 For a discussion of development of International Relations see Rasul Bakhsh Rais, ‘Teaching of International Relations in Pakistani Universities’, in this volume.
9 Their titles are ‘Conflict Resolution and Crisis Management’ taught at graduate level and ‘Security and Conflict Analysis’ taught at the MPhil level.
10 Sundeepr Wesleker, A Handbook of Conflict Resolution in South Asia (International Centre for Peace Studies, Mumbai, 1996) and Moonis Ahmar, The Challenges of Conflict Resolution and Security in 21st Century (Programme on Peace Studies and Conflict Resolution, Department of International Relations, University of Karachi, Karachi, 2001). These books provide a good source material and are easy to understand by the students studying a course of Conflict Resolution.
11 Established and led by retired General and former Chief of Army Staff, Mirza Aslam Beg who heads a political party also.
12 Created and funded by Jama’at-i-Islami and headed by Professor Khurshid Ahmad.
14 Established and headed by Brig. (Retd.) Abdur Rahman Siddiqi.
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

16 The most common and hurting charge against the scholars in Pakistan advocating such a new approach is accusation of being an Indophile.

17 According to Akbar Zaidi, ‘Pakistan in the post-Zia period is still much affected by the major changes brought about by the military government between 1977-88 and change since then has been noticeable but slow’. See *The Dismal State of the Social Sciences in Pakistan* (Council of Social Sciences, Islamabad, 2002), p. 12.

18 This organisation came into existence sometime during 1994 and published the first book in Pakistan questioning the need for nuclear weapons. It was edited by Zia Mian, with the title *Pakistan’s Atom Bomb: Search for Security* (Gautam press, Lahore, 1995). In year 2000 it was translated in Urdu and was edited by Dr. Inayatullah with the title ‘Pakistan Ka Atom Bomb Magar Kis Liye (Atom Bomb of Pakistan but for what)’. It was published by Pakistan India Forum for Peace and Democracy and distributed in the Conference on Qalam Baray Aman (Pen for Peace) held in Karachi on November 24-26, 2000.

19 For details of the Programme visit its website www.ppscr.org.

20 Following are the publications under the Programme on Peace Studies and Conflict Resolution:


21 The Trust has been established by Dr. Inayatullah, currently President of Council for Social Sciences with the support of several peace thinkers and activists.

22 It may be mentioned here that this is not something specific to the Pakistani State, as it is also prevalent in other states.
Introduction
Linguistics is the scientific study of language. Like any other social or natural science, it involves using the scientific methodology to make propositions about language. Testable hypotheses are proposed and accepted or rejected on the basis of empirical data. Theories are constructed and, as in any other science, they may be revised when they lose their explanatory power.

When the present author published his previous survey of the state of Linguistics in Pakistan he began it by saying that ‘Pakistan does not have a university department or institute of higher education and research in Linguistics’.

After five years in 2003, the country still does not have departments of Linguistics of the kind, which exist in the major universities of the world. However, we do have many more courses in Linguistics and applied Linguistics in several departments of English and other languages than before.

Objective
The aim of this paper is to find out the state of the discipline of Linguistics in Pakistan. The specific questions to be answered are as to how many departments of Linguistics exist in the
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

country? What degrees are being given by the universities? What courses are being offered? How many academics employed in universities have PhD degrees in fields related to language? And, how many language-related PhD degrees have been offered by Pakistani universities since 1947? As in other disciplines, changes since 1985 have been given in a separate section.

As Linguistics is not being offered as an autonomous discipline in the universities of Pakistan, it is difficult to focus attention only on universities. Instead, the field of inquiry will have to be broadened to include work on languages being done by local and Western linguists. Even more important is to understand to what extent the modern tradition of linguistic research is being used in this country. For this reason a larger historical portion, that may not be necessary in other subjects, will be given in this paper.

Whereas modern Linguistics is descriptive, the pre-modern linguistic tradition in South Asia — and for that matter elsewhere — was prescriptive. This meant that the linguist was supposed to prescribe norms of acceptable ‘correct’ writing and speaking. Within the descriptive tradition, the nineteenth century was dominated by the comparison of words between languages (philological-comparative tradition). Since Ferdinand de Saussure (1857-1913), established modern Linguistics, a number of linguists, including Noam Chomsky (b. 1928), the world’s most famous linguist, have contributed to this modern tradition. This paper looks at the extent to which these traditions are being used, and have been used in the past, by linguists in Pakistan (or those writing on Pakistani languages).

It is not surprising to find that the first concern of the people who wrote about the languages now used in Pakistan was about norms of ‘correctness’. Most of these people were poets writing in India much before Pakistan was created. To understand the force of prescriptivism in the public mind, it is important to refer to their attitudes, however summarily. Such attitudes became really noticeable between the period beginning in 1702 and continuing for the most part of the early nineteenth century.
was in this period that Persian words were substituted instead of familiar words (such as *prem* for love, *naen* for eyes, etc.) from the local North Indian languages (called Hindi) by Muslim poets. This attempt at renovation serves non-linguistic functions although it is seen as a purely linguistic phenomenon by the renovators and their supporters. The purpose Persianised Urdu served was that it became a marker of elitist identity for upper class *(sharif)* Muslims who felt politically impotent and threatened by the overwhelming majority of Hindus around them.

Although in his grammar of Urdu, Abdul Haq pointed out that ‘Urdu is a purely Indian language of the Indo-Aryan family. Arabic, on the other hand, is from the Semitic family. Thus it is not at all appropriate for the grammarians of Urdu to follow the rules of Arabic’. Even so, this prescriptive tradition influences Pakistani teachers of languages even today. School grammars, based upon Mediaeval Persian models, specialise in taxonomy. Parts of speech are divided into sub-classes, which have Persian and Arabic names, which must be memorised. Pluralisation follows Arabic or Persian rules leading to absurdities. While this is an irritant for school children, the urge for prescriptivism in Urdu and English can sometimes be offensive. Josh, the famous Urdu poet, often objected to people not pronouncing *qaf* (the uvular stop /q/) correctly.

Whatever support Orientalism — the scholarly study of the East by Westerners — might have given to nineteenth century European domination of India, individual Orientalists have left behind invaluable studies of the languages of South Asia. In India the work of Sir William Jones (1746-94) laid the foundations for the comparative-philological tradition, which dominates the work of many Pakistani linguists even now.

The vernacular languages were studied by the missionary William Carey who, with Ward and Marshman, surveyed 33 of them in 1816. Among the languages used in Pakistan they
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

translated the ‘Lord’s Prayer’ in Sindhi, Gujarati, Punjabi, Balochi, and Pushto among other languages.  

Apart from British linguists, there were many German-speaking scholars who also helped to describe Pakistani languages in philological terms. The achievements of these scholars have been given in detail by Annemarie Schimmel. Unfortunately, despite Schimmel’s book, the works of German-speaking linguists — even those which are written in English — are not well known in Pakistan. Apart from isolated scholars like Ikram Chughtai, they have been unjustly ignored.

The works of English philologists, especially Grierson’s *Linguistic Survey of India* (1901-21), has dominated, and still dominates, the philological tradition in Pakistan. It has been reprinted in five volumes as the *Linguistic Survey of Pakistan* (n.d.) in Lahore and has been referred to by everyone working in the comparative-philological tradition — and most people still work in it — in Pakistan. This is a landmark in the study of the languages of South Asia. It was the work of a lifetime ‘extending over thirty years’ from 1891 to 1921 and covering 290 million people speaking ‘872 different languages and dialects’. Grierson gives an introductory section on every language followed by a vocabulary and a grammar.

Even now, fifty-seven years after the establishment of Pakistan, most of the best descriptions of Pakistani languages — in the light of contemporary linguistic theories — continue to be written by Western linguists. This survey, however, cannot list them or describe them because its focus is on the development of linguistic studies in Pakistan.

However, some Western linguists who are still working on Pakistani languages deserve to be mentioned here. The most illuminating works of foreigners are about the lesser known languages of Pakistan. An extensive bibliography came out as recently as in 2001. It lists work on the languages of Chitral, the Northern Areas, Baltistan and little known languages of the
Linguistics in Pakistan: A Survey of the Contemporary Situation

NWFP. Works of other Western linguists who have recently written on Pakistani languages are given in Annex III. But the culmination of the work of decades of Western scholars has appeared only towards the end of the last century. It is a sociolinguistic survey of these lesser known languages — the languages of Northern Pakistan.

Preventive Linguistics
The term ‘preventive linguistics’ has been used by David Crystal, a distinguished linguist, for the preservation of languages so as to prevent them from becoming extinct. Some identity-conscious local linguists, especially from remote areas with small languages, have been writing primers and scripts for their languages. These are too numerous to describe and the reader is referred to chapters on minor languages in the present writer’s previous books. Most of these people are inspired by ideological concerns — that their language should not die. In this, they have the sympathy of believers in linguistic diversity and the right of people to maintain their languages.

Foreigners are also contributing to the preservation of Pakistan’s linguistic diversity, which is in danger because of globalisation and the privileging of English and Urdu in Pakistan. At the moment Joan Baart is working with Khwaja Rehman to produce a word list and description of a language called Kundal Shahi, which is spoken in the Neelam Valley about 75 kilometers from Muzafarabad. There are other languages, which are in danger of becoming extinct and are being noticed. If this effort succeeds, some of Pakistan’s rich linguistic heritage will be saved, which will be a great service to this country.

Historical Linguistics in the Comparative-Philological Tradition
The major question in Urdu Linguistics has been the origin of Urdu. That the question of the roots of Urdu continues to absorb the minds of Pakistanis writing in the philological-comparative tradition is evident from the large number of studies still being undertaken in it. Moreover, as university teachers of
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

Urdu assure the present author, it is taught in the MA course of Urdu and is often the only question about ‘linguistics’ which is asked. It is also in this tradition that other well known studies — Mehr Abdul Haq’s thesis on Multani (now called Siraiki), Yusuf Bukhari’s comparative study of Urdu and Kashmiri and Razzak Sabir’s thesis on the relationship between Balochi and Brahvi have been written. Basically all these writers compare words of one language with another without taking into account contemporary theories, especially those dealing with phonology. However, Sabir has made efforts to refer to morphology, grammar, and phonology though his sources are dated and inadequate.

In the same philological-comparative tradition is Ali Nawaz Jatoi’s claim that Sindhi is a Semitic language. Indeed, there are some people in Pakistan who argue that all languages came out of Arabic but their arguments are almost always based on comparisons of a few words.

Other Pakistanis interested in linguistic matters focus on history. The investigations on the history of Urdu and other languages have been mentioned. Among the more scholarly works in other fields are the proto-historical works of A. H. Dani on the Kharoshthi script, the languages of ‘Sindh and Sauvira’ and archaeological research shedding light on the undeciphered script of the Indus Valley civilisation. F. A. Durrani, for instance, suggests that the symbols on Kot Dijian artifacts may be the beginning of writing in the Indus Valley. But on this subject too Western scholars, with their immense resources, have written more detailed studies while Rashid Akhtar Nadvi, the only Pakistani writer who has written a book on this subject in Urdu, shows neither any awareness of the state of contemporary research on the subject nor of modern techniques on this field.

Language Planning and Language Politics
Language Planning (LP) refers to status planning (whether a language will be a national language, official language, etc.);
corpus planning (choice of script, making new terms, purging words and adding new ones) and acquisition planning (spreading the use of a language through education and media).

Thus Mehr Abdul Haq who has been mentioned before in another context, is a pioneer of the Siraiki language identity. His major concern is ideological — to prove that Siraiki and Punjabi are different languages. It is this difference which enables Siraiki to function as an identity symbol of the people of the southern Punjab. Other Siraiki linguists, such as Ahsan Wagha, have also tried to advance similar arguments.

Such theses appear to be based upon arguments, which the writers are emotionally committed to on non-linguistic grounds. For the same reason most of the interest in the old indigenous languages of the country has come from the activists of the language movements. It is also for this that research related to script and modernising the vocabulary of languages is undertaken. But orthography and neologism are both related with identity and thus with ethnic politics. Thus, those who emphasise the Pakistani-Islamic identity insist upon the use of Arabic-based scripts and the creation of new terms based upon Persian-Arabic roots whereas ethnic nationalists sometimes reject this script and coin words from the roots of their own languages.

Unfortunately, these language planners too are mostly unaware of the contemporary developments in the theories of language planning. The only exception is Atash Durrani whose book on neologism called *Urdu Istilahat Sazi* shows awareness of some of the developments in this field. Works by Raj Wali Khattak on Pushto orthography, by Syed Hashmi on Balochi technical terms, by Khair Muhammad Baloch on the parts of a vehicle in Sindhi and by Qais Faridi in Siraiki do not refer to the theoretical basis of similar work elsewhere in the world.

This brings one to the relationship between language and politics; the way language policy can make one language more
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

pragmatically useful, and therefore of higher status, than another language. An example of this is the increase in the social status of English with the corresponding decline in that of Persian because of British language policies. Another aspect of this relationship is the way language becomes a symbol of ethnicity and may be used to mobilise people against the ruling elite. The present writer has produced a book discussing these issues.41

The book of Afia Dil on the Muslim variety of Bengali is highly relevant for Pakistanis,42 who used to think that Bengali was only a ‘Hindu’ language.43 Her latest achievement together with her husband Anwar Dil is the monumental The Bengali Language Movement44 (2000), which is an excellent history of the Bengali language movement though it does not deal with Linguistics or even language policy.

The Modern Tradition in Theoretical Linguistics and Socio-linguistics

It has been mentioned earlier that Linguistics is not taught as an autonomous discipline in Pakistan. Among those who tried to establish it as a university subject is Anwar Dil, presently living in the United States. Dil could not establish either a department or an institute of Linguistics but he did manage to establish the Linguistic Research Group of Pakistan in 1961, which published a number of monographs containing scholarly articles and papers read out at linguistic conferences in Pakistan.45 Some of the articles in the series are of a high standard but there is shoddy, ideologically inspired pieces too, which mar most Pakistani publications. Such writings are published because there is no anonymous reviewing nor, indeed, the means to do good research. Moreover, most publications are supported by the state, which influences the ideological content of the publications. Dil contributed to the field of Socio-linguistics by editing a large, and highly significant, collection of the works of distinguished scholars. He is active in editing, compiling, and generally trying to get Linguistics recognised as an autonomous discipline in Pakistan.
Most work on Pakistani languages is of very questionable quality indeed. Moreover, it is not in the modern tradition. However, G. A. Allana’s book on Sindhi orthography is an exception since the author is quite aware of the concepts of modern Linguistics and has created terms, which can be used to describe Sindhi in the light of modern concepts. But Allana’s work falls in the modern linguistic tradition to which we turn now.

There are some studies on Urdu by Baber S. Khan and Anjum Saleemi in the Chomskyan tradition. There are dissertations by Raja Naseem on Punjabi morphology and subsequent articles on the syntax and tones of Punjabi in this tradition. However, a study of ‘word-form’ in Urdu and the phonology of the verbal phrase in Hindko are not in this tradition. Most of the works in modern Linguistics were completed in Western universities and the authors confess that they find it difficult to be as productive in this field of research as they were when they were living abroad.

As mentioned earlier, there is very little work on Linguistics in Pakistani languages. It must, however, be mentioned that the students of Foundation for Advancement of Science and Technology (FAST) in Lahore, under the guidance of Dr. Sarmad Hussain, are producing work, which has the potential of becoming the first linguistic study of Urdu along modern lines.

In Pakistan there are only a few recent works written in Pakistani languages, which show some awareness of contemporary terminology and concepts. Most of these works are written in Urdu and Sindhi. There is, G. A. Allana’s book on the phonetics of Sindhi mentioned earlier and his study of the dialects and spread of the language. Also worth mentioning are Nabi Baksh Baloch’s historical studies of Sindhi and Hidayat Ullah Akhund’s thesis on the same subject. N. A. Baloch is active even now having produced a book on Jatki as well as occasional papers. He is highly respected in Pakistan in general and Sindh in particular. His contribution to the history of Sindh is enormous. However, his methodology is historical and
philological and not that which contemporary linguists use in the West. Qasim Bughio, however, is aware of contemporary methods and his study of the dialects of Sindhi is in the tradition of modern sociolinguists. In the MA course in Sindhi some general Linguistics, phonetics and the history of Sindhi language is taught. However, as Sindhi is taught at all levels in Sindh there is much more linguistic writing on Sindhi than on any Pakistani language except Urdu.

In Urdu, apart from the work of the FAST students mentioned above, there are studies by Suhail Bukhari and Abdul Salam’s Urdu book on general Linguistics. Although of a rudimentary level, Abdul Salam provides technical terms in Urdu, which can help linguists, describe modern linguistic concepts. After Mohiuddin Qadri Zor’s similar introductory work entitled Hindustani Lisaniat, this is the most adequate attempt to provide an introductory book giving equivalents of the terminology of basic Linguistics in Urdu. The FAST students, however, introduce us to the terminology of advanced phonetics and phonology.

A brief study of Pushto where the terminology of Linguistics is introduced in that language is by Khial Bukhari. Bukhari touches upon dialectology and phonetics, which are generally ignored by Pakistani linguists. His grammar of Pushto, also written in Pushto, is worth mentioning though it does not touch upon recent grammatical theories.

Most Pakistani works ignore theoretical complexities. Indeed, for Pakistani linguists it is difficult not to do so, because the sources and the level of training available is not conducive to the study of more technical aspects of contemporary phonetics, phonology, morphology, syntax, and semantics. What then is left for a Pakistani linguist is language planning and lexicology of which examples have been given earlier or some aspects of Sociolinguistics. There are, for instance, studies of politeness in Shina and Urdu and so on. The former work describes verbal politeness patterns in Shina while the latter argues that the norms
of verbal politeness in English-speaking cultures — such as the use of the first name without honorifics irrespective of the age differentials of the interlocutors — are influencing English-using Pakistanis. Another kind of work is that of surveying the attitude of people towards different languages. Sociolinguists have done this work in great details.

Which has already been mentioned. Even more relevant from the point of view of education is the survey of student’s attitudes towards Urdu, English, and Punjabi by Sabiha Mansoor in Lahore. The point made in this survey is that students respond pragmatically to the apparent social prestige of a language and evaluate it positively if it increases chances of upward social mobility. In 2002, Sabiha Mansoor also completed her doctoral thesis on the role of English in the higher education system of Pakistan and confirmed the finding that students and others do consider English necessary for social mobility. The present writer too found this in his survey but, along with this, he also found an aspiration for the use of the mother-tongue in Sindh, the Frontier and among madrasa students who were not positive towards English. Sabiha Mansoor’s thesis, like her previous work, is in the domain of language policy, especially as it pertains to education.

Changes Since 1985: The Focus on English Language Teaching

In the seventies and eighties the British Council and the educational agencies of the United States started emphasising the teaching of English as a second or other language — TESOL/TESL/ELT were among the acronyms to describe the phenomenon. Up to this time the departments of English focussed almost exclusively on English literature, which generally meant only British literature up to T. S. Eliot. However, when the University Grants Commission (now the Higher Education Commission) and the Allama Iqbal Open University started offering diploma courses in TESOL in 1985, a number of young lecturers with vested interests and knowledge of English language teaching formed a pressure group, which
brought about changes in the English departments. The present writer, when appointed to the Chair of English at the University of Azad Jammu and Kashmir (Muzaffarabad) in 1987, started the first MA in English Language Teaching and Linguistics. This MA was unique in that it had courses on general Linguistics, Socio and Psycholinguistics as well as English language teaching. However, upon the present writer’s relocation to the Quaid-i-Azam University in Islamabad in 1990, courses in the second year of the MA course were replaced with literature courses. At Quaid-i-Azam University, however, courses in Anthropological Linguistics and on language planning and language problems in Pakistan have been added by the present writer. Unfortunately, an MA in Linguistics has still not been established.

Apart from the efforts of the British Council, etc. ELT also got a boost from the activities of the Society of Pakistani English Language Teachers (SPELT), which was established in 1984 by Zakia Sarwar. SPELT holds lectures, workshops, and conferences on a regular basis — the last conference was held in Karachi, Lahore and Islamabad in October 2002 — which promotes awareness about the teaching of English. In the year 2003 an English Language Committee was established by the Higher Education Commission of Pakistan. Among other things, it intends to look at language policy and ELT. Although SPELT and other ELT programmes do not focus on Linguistics as such, they do contribute indirectly to the teaching of the rudiments of phonetics, varieties of language, and stylistics. However, their focus is the teaching of English and not theoretical analysis. Books produced by SPELT or by those involved in ELT are concerned with English, and that too with its teaching. A survey of English language teaching, for instance, has been produced by Farida Malik. Also, it is because of this increased concern with English as a language that some scholars have written about its role in Pakistan.

There is, moreover, at least one Pakistani academic in the United States, who has written his doctoral thesis on the status of the
non-native speakers of English as teachers of the language in America.72 People like Ahmar Mahboob question the exonormative ideology, i.e., that only native speakers can teach English. Ahmar is a product of the linguistic iconoclasm, which set in into the field of English language teaching as a consequence of the new ideas disseminated by the applied linguists who taught ELT.

Even more significant is the questioning of the traditional prescriptivist notion that only British Standard English writing and pronunciation should be considered ‘correct’ and should be the pedagogical norm. The notion that there could be a non-native variety of English called Pakistani English was first introduced in Pakistan by Robert J. Baumgardner who later explored the grammatical and lexical features of Pakistani English (PE) in more detail.73 The first detailed description of PE — including its phonetic and phonological features and sub-varieties, which Baumgardner had not touched upon — was published by the present author.74 The notion of ‘Pakistani Urdu’, advanced by the present author in a newspaper article, has still not been described in detail.75 In Pakistan, however, there is not much advance upon this earlier work while elsewhere in the world there is much debate about the concept and features of non-native varieties of a language. To this debate Anjum Saleemi has already contributed and Ahmar Mahboob tells the present author that he too is working in this field and will publish his results soon.76

But Ahmar Mahboob, like Saleemi, lives abroad and works in the mainstream tradition of Sociolinguistics. Saleemi works in the Chomskyan theoretical linguistic tradition, which is hardly understood in Pakistan. That is why his study of language learnability,77 which should have been discussed by linguists, has gone unnoticed. In the only review of the book in Pakistan, the present writer confessed his own ignorance of some of the theories used by Saleemi because research journals and books are not available in such a highly technical subject.78 Similarly, the work of Ruqaiya Hasan, who collaborated with Halliday —
and is married to him — in a well known book *Cohesion in English* is unknown in Pakistan. Indeed, discourse analysis and systemic grammar — the linguistic tradition associated with Halliday in which Raqaiya Hasan worked, is even less known in Pakistan than the Chomskyan one.

**Contemporary Linguists of Pakistani Origin**

In short, then, most linguists working in Pakistan actually work on the peripheries of the field of Linguistics. Since they do not find material on linguistic theory they wander off into History, Political Science, and Sociology or stop producing research work altogether. Thus, there is very little theoretical (or micro) Linguistic work going on in Pakistan. Some of the best linguists from Pakistan — such as Anjum Saleemi, Ruqaiya Hasan and Miriam Butt do not live and work in Pakistan.

There are, however, two exceptions, which have been mentioned already but need somewhat more specific mention. These are Sarmad Hussain and Raja Naseem Akhtar. The former is Associate Professor and Head, Centre for Research in Urdu Language Processing (CRULP), FAST at Lahore. He conducts research on computer speech processing, Computational Linguistics and computer script processing. Among his achievements are creating a software development programme for Urdu. During the process he has enabled his students to produce two excellent collections of research articles on Urdu phonetics and phonology published by the National Language Authority mentioned earlier.

Raja Naseem Akhtar’s work is mainly on Punjabi, though he has published a couple of papers on Urdu as well. The most important part of his work is related to Aspectual Complex Predicates of Punjabi. This is a complex subject, which is also the focus of research of Miriam Butt who though brought up in Pakistan lives and works in Western universities.
Professional Associations of Linguists in Pakistan

Apart from Anwar Dil’s attempt to create an association for linguists, no other attempt for creating such an association has succeeded so far. The English language does, however, have two associations: SPELT and the recently (June 2003) established Committee on English Language at the Higher Education Commission. Both these organisations do have applied linguists and linguists who are involved in teaching or doing research on English. Similarly, other linguists are involved in the organisations of languages they are associated with.

In the absence of departments of Linguistics and linguistic associations, conferences on Micro-Linguistics are not held. Linguists working in related areas, however, present papers in conferences on literature, language-teaching and the social sciences.

The few students who take courses on Linguistics go into language teaching or in the social sciences. The only students who are using their knowledge in creating computer programmes in Urdu are from FAST and are being absorbed in the corporate sector. Some linguists, mostly local informants, collaborate with foreign linguists when they come to do research on Pakistan’s languages. As mentioned earlier, these people, especially the language activists among them, want to preserve their languages. So far no trained Pakistani linguist working in the modern tradition has ever contributed to this. Perhaps future linguists, if we have many of them, will turn their attention to the preservation of their rich linguistic heritage.

Apart from this there are no vocations open for linguists. However, all the language-planning academies — the National Language Authority for Urdu, the Pushto Academy, the Balochi Academy, the Brahvi Academy, the Punjabi Adabi Board and the Sindhi Language Authority — do create new words and decide on matters of script, etc. As yet they do not have linguists as their members. If there are trained linguists they will help in
more informed language planning projects than are taking place now.

Linguists trained in Neurolinguistics, Computational-Linguistics and Biological Linguistics can help in research on artificial intelligence, robotics and computer studies. In addition to that, insights in semiotics — the study of communication systems — can gain from research in Linguistics. The present boom in information technology does not look to linguists yet in Pakistan but this is only because there are so few of them in the country.

Neurolinguists and Psycholinguists may also give their insights to help understand pathologies of speech, damages to the brain centres controlling language, and animal communication. With the present interest in biology it is distressful to find that Pakistan has nobody who specialises in the biological foundations of language. More than any other area, future graduates will be absorbed in schools, colleges and universities if Linguistics is introduced there. It is, after all, a subject, which is considered of crucial importance in modern scholarship. Not to have any proper department or research institution in Linguistics means that Pakistanis will never be able to contribute to the development of Linguistics in their own country and in the world.

**Conclusion**

Pakistan is perhaps the most backward country of South Asia in the field of Linguistics. This is not because there is a dearth of talent but because the subject is not taught adequately along modern lines. The few courses, which departments of English do offer are meant to help in teaching English and not to equip the student to undertake research in Linguistics proper. In any case they do not touch upon Pakistani languages. Worst of all, very few books and not a single journal of Linguistics is published in the country. Since only few, generally dated, books and hardly one or two journals are available in the country, it is only when one goes abroad that one learns what is happening in the field.
Those who are interested in languages either write in the nineteenth century philological tradition ignoring all recent advances in Linguistics or produce prescriptive manuals of ‘good usage’. Activists of language movements also write works of an amateur and tendentious quality either to air their views or to promote their languages. Those who write in this field are virtually isolated. That is why, as in the case of the present writer, linguists turn away from Linguistics proper to interdisciplinary areas in which the resources of the established social sciences — such as Politics, History, or Sociology — are available.
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

Annex I

PhD Degrees Awarded in Languages by Pakistani Universities (1957-2003)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of University</th>
<th>Number of Degrees Awarded</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sindh University</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University of Karachi (Dept. of Philosophy)</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peshawar University</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NUML*</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Balochistan University</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Data collected by the author
* National University of Modern Languages, Islamabad

Annex II

Doctoral Degree Holders in Linguistics/Applied Linguistics/Language-related Studies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of Institution</th>
<th>Number of Degree Holders</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AJKU</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Punjab University</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aga Khan University</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Institute of Sindhology Hyderabad</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NUML</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peshawar University</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FAST, National University of Comp. &amp; Emerging Sciences</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Karachi University</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fatima Jinnah Women's University</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>University of Balochistan Quetta</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ghulam Ishaq Khan Institute</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Information collected by the author.
Linguistics in Pakistan: A Survey of the Contemporary Situation

Annex III

Recent or Ongoing Research Work by Foreigners on Pakistani Languages:
1. Gregory D. S. Anderson, ‘Burushaski Papers’, Unpublished papers in the possession of the SIL Library, Islamabad, 2001. (Some of these papers might have been published by now).
2. Elena Bashir, Dictionary of Khowar (ongoing research).

NB: The work by the members of the Summer School of Linguistics and other scholars has been referred to in the text or the references.
Tariq Rahman, ‘Pakistan: Indo-European’, in The Yearbook of South Asian Languages and Linguistics (Sage Publications, New Delhi and London, n.d.), pp. 184-196. They are taught at the following universities and colleges: AJKU, Bahauddin Zakariya University (Multan), Frontier Language Institute (Peshawar), International Islamic University (Dept. of English), National University of Modern Languages (NUML), Karachi University (Dept. of English), Kinnaird College University, Peshawar University (Dept. of Urdu), Peshawar University (Dept. of English), Punjab University (Dept. of English).

However, some information about the PhD Degrees Awarded in Languages by Pakistani Universities during 1957-2003 and about the teachers holding PhD degrees is provided in Annex I and Annex II respectively.

This article draws upon the present author’s previous research for its historical aspect. ‘Linguistics in Pakistan’, in Language, Education and Culture (Oxford University Press, Karachi, 1999), Chapter-1. The empirical data about the specific questions raised above, comes from replies to 36 questionnaires sent to all language departments (Arabic, English, Persian, Urdu) in nine universities (see Annex I). The author also visited some universities and conducted unstructured interviews with linguists or academics in language departments. The data collected from this exercise is referred to in the text and it is presented in the four annexes which are part of this survey (Annex I, II, III, IV).


Joan L. G. Baart and Esther L. Baart-Bremer, Bibliography of the Languages of Northern Pakistan (National Institute of Pakistan Studies, Quaid-i-Azam University and the Summer Institute of Linguistics, Islamabad, 2001).

Linguistics in Pakistan: A Survey of the Contemporary Situation

18 Personal communication with Khwaja Rehman and Joan Baart in July 2003.
20 For a list see Saleem Akhtar, *Urdu Zaban Ki Mukhtasar Tareen Tareekh* (National Language Authority, Islamabad, 1995), pp. 86-89.
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

35 Ibid.
42 She is a pioneer of Linguistics in Pakistan, although she is counted among Bangladeshi linguists.
44 Anwar Dil and Afia Dil, *Bengali Language Movement to Bangladesh* (Ferozsons- Intercultural Forum, Lahore, 2000).
51 *Akbar-e-Urdu* (National Language Authority, Islamabad, 2002 and 2003). There are competent studies on languages shared between Pakistan and India both in India and abroad but they are outside the domain of this study.
Linguistics in Pakistan: A Survey of the Contemporary Situation

58 Bukhari, *Lisani Muqalat*, op.cit.
68 Interview of Zakia Sarwar in April 2003 at Lahore.
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

84 An introductory study, now a classic in the field is by Eric H. Lenneberg, Biological Foundations of Language (John Wiley and Sons, New York, 1967).
Contribution of the NGOs to Social Science Research in Pakistan

Anwar Shaheen

Introduction
Voluntary organisations have been working in Pakistan well before Independence. Their number grew gradually in the first three decades after Independence, but in the later half of seventies, an NGO boom happened. The eighties were the time when the growth of the NGO sector was amazing. Their areas of operation and activities were also diversified during this expansion. The major activities of the NGOs can be categorised as: service provision, advocacy and research. This paper deals with their research activities in particular and the relationship with other activities in general. The first section outlines the objectives, rationale, scope and methodology of the study. The second section reviews the related literature. The third section introduces individual NGO’s activities including research, priority areas of research, number and type of publications, and the link between an NGO’s overall activities and research. The selected items of research are introduced in this section briefly. The last section discusses the findings and draws some conclusions about the subject.

I. Non-Governmental Organisations in Pakistan: The Scenario
There being several shades of meaning of the term ‘NGO’ this study takes an NGO as, ‘a private, citizen-led organisation having a social mission and development purpose, and working
with a voluntary spirit, which may vary in degree from one NGO to another’.\(^1\)

These organisations, popularly called Non-Government Organisations, have impacted the development scene of the Pakistani society in many ways. Nowadays, these are declared as ‘partners in development’, and development planning lays great emphasis upon the active involvement of the NGO sector. Apart from development, effecting policy changes is an important role of the NGOs, which they perform through advocacy.

Since the 1970s, voluntary sector organisations have shifted their priorities from mainly welfare to the development approach. Theoretical and descriptive research helps understand social reality, while applied research helps to improve the social conditions. In this way, research can be an ingredient of development activity of the NGOs, as well as other agencies of development. At the turn of the century, the NGOs are growing in number, taking up multiple new functions, and becoming more visible in the media. Their activities and impact likewise is growing, though this is not properly documented and assessed so far.

**Research and Advocacy by the NGO Sector:** In Pakistan, there have been about 44,625 NGOs, working in various fields.\(^2\) The proportion of the NGOs engaged in education and research is reported as the highest (46.4%) as compared to other fields of activities, followed by advocacy. Considering the fact that the figure combines both education and research activities, one should be careful about the proportion of the NGOs engaged in research, because education is a concern of a large number of the NGOs, while research\(^3\) cannot be expected from a majority of them, because their capacity is limited on this count. Since the NGOs are mainly an urban phenomenon, it is more likely that rural based NGOs would have less interest in research owing to limited capability, and different priorities as is found in the data on rural-urban lines in the source mentioned above.\(^4\) This is despite the fact that NGOs are found working at the grassroots
The two major activities of the NGOs — advocacy and research — are both regarded as developmental activities because ‘the two help in building peoples’ participation, support and democratic tradition’. These two are inter-related too, and many NGOs engage in them simultaneously. The NGOs take up research due to multiple reasons, the foremost being a paucity of quality research output from the public sector institutions. Advocacy involves fact-finding through research, formulation and projection of recommendations and then mobilising public opinion on some particular issue, and finally demanding policy reform or formulation of new policies to achieve the end. It is realised that the need for advocacy is heightened by mal-administration, corruption, ineffective or bad laws, poor performance of the judiciary, environmental degradation and incompetence of the state institutions to deliver. In Pakistan, issues of gender discrimination, forced labour, environmental protection, and honour killing, among others, have been successfully pursued by the NGOs. Many NGOs selected in the sample of the study are actively engaged in advocacy work.

Research or research-like activities go hand in hand with other activities of the NGOs, such as service provision, advocacy, participatory development, training, evaluation, etc. Though research data is, and can be, generated by the NGOs in their other activities, many NGOs take up the task of research to fulfil many organisational objectives, while others take it up occasionally to record their activities. In this sense, the NGOs’ work can be classified as being research only, research and
advocacy, research and service provision, and the rest have other combinations of functions."

**Objectives**
The general objective of the paper is to get an insight about the research work carried out by the NGOs. The paper aims at accomplishing the following specific tasks:
1. Identification and classification of research material produced by the NGOs in the field of social sciences;
2. to judge the material in terms of its themes and priority areas of concern;
3. to compare the research output of the NGOs with reference to the organisational objectives; and
4. a critical assessment of the NGOs’ research material.

**Concepts, Scope and Methodology**
The foremost concept relevant in this paper is ‘research’. It is defined as a ‘careful critical inquiry or examination in seeking facts or principles’. The second important concept is ‘social sciences’. In the context of Pakistan, these include Anthropology, Demography, Economics, History, International Relations, Pakistan Studies, Political Science, Sociology, Social Work, Women’s Studies and different Area Studies. This list includes many interdisciplinary subjects as well, and this aspect is quite relevant for the current study, since research by the NGOs is usually issue-specific and of an applied nature, which may cover many aspects. As the social sciences are interwoven, so compartmentalisation of the NGOs’ research in various disciplines is difficult. For example, some common topics of the NGOs’ research — poverty, women’s status, human rights, etc., — can be dealt with only through an interdisciplinary approach.

The selection of material for this study has been difficult due to numerous reasons, mostly linked with the NGOs’ management practices. Selection of the NGOs and their work for critical review was a difficult job, facilitated by the decision to select a small sample of works by a limited number of NGOs. Among the available material, however, the items are selected to reflect
the existing diversity in topics, formats, approaches, and methodologies to provide an introductory overview on the variegated nature and multiple dimensions of the NGOs’ research work.

**Rationale**
The present paper particularly deals with the research activity of the NGOs, which is valuable in the context of dearth of knowledge, primary data and analytical material on, and with, an indigenous approach towards the social ‘reality’ of Pakistan. The absence of a culture of research, dialogue and minimal participatory norms at the family, community and the state levels, and threats perceived and experienced from oppressive social and political structures, are the realities further highlighting the need for evaluating and appreciating the role of the NGOs regarding research.

**Classification of the NGOs Research**
The NGOs produce a variety of material. Not everything published by the NGOs is in the format what academia defines and accepts as research. Nevertheless, being free of jargons and still carrying a good amount of scientific information, it serves the purpose of the NGO audiences. It is made simple intentionally in order to facilitate its comprehension. Examples are magazines, newsletters, digests, bulletins, handouts, booklets, guidebooks, manuals, and a host of material produced for awareness and training. NGOs’ output, which can be classified as ‘research’ includes: baseline/benchmark studies, pilot studies, exploratory research, action research, theoretical/conceptual research, evaluation reports, participatory research, media research and market research, though this list cannot be taken as exhaustive.

**II. Review of Related Literature**
Very little academic writings are available about the NGOs in Pakistan. Those addressing the subject of research by NGOs are rare. Islam⁹ has compiled a good study on the NGO movement and has mentioned only four organisations under the research
So, he does not consider research as a major component of the NGO activity, and hence mentions it very casually.

Zaidi, writing about the state of social sciences, has observed that among the thousands of NGOs operating in Pakistan, very few are doing research in social sciences. Though these organisations report their activities and prepare reports of the projects, ‘this would probably be informative documentation rather than researched output’. The scope and amount of information is also expected to be limited. About the quality of the NGOs’ reports, Zaidi observes that it is mainly determined by the audience — the NGO itself or the donor. Furthermore, ‘if research or output is to be widely disseminated, then it is probable that the issues, themes and characteristics of the study/research will be broader and could be included in the category of social science research’. He further points out that the output is likely to be highly varied in methodology, contents, style, or scope, since some NGOs can hire well-educated social scientists as well. He asserts that mostly NGOs’ research output is project-specific and provides only information or documentation.

A working paper, ‘Social Science Research Capacity in South Asia’, while reviewing the research scenario in Pakistan has mentioned the decline of institutions of the public sector and the growth of institutions in the donor sector, as the latest trend of the nineties. Various reasons for this process are also highlighted. The private sector institutions and the NGOs are filling the gap. This working paper has listed ten Pakistani NGOs with some worth-mentioning output regarding research, but does not mention the nature or quality of the NGOs research.

The following section gives details of the NGOs’ research work. An alphabetical sequence is followed here to maintain objectivity.
III. Review of Research Output of the NGOs

1. Applied Socioeconomic Research (ASR)
ASR is an NGO working very specifically for improving the women’s status in the society. Its publications deal with the subjects of feminism, women’s movement, development, agrarian reforms, women in quarries and construction industry, feminist research, participatory research, labour, income generation, cottage industries, women’s poetry, gender aspect of education, militarism and peace. ASR projects women’s point of view on critical issues of national import. It believes in the promotion and use of women's artistic activities to put forward a message of liberation and a sense of self-realisation. A good number of books published by ASR are based on reports of seminars, workshops, consultations, conferences, and training activities.

A report ‘Solid Foundations, Solid Contributions, Women in the Brick Kiln Industry’ describes the findings of the study conducted by the Women’s Division in 1982 but, like dozens of other researches, was dumped on shelves to gather dust. ASR was allowed to translate and publish it in two volumes in 1988, and the funding for translation was provided by the Ministry of Women’s Development.

Major contribution of ASR has been in the field of Women’s Studies. To give an indigenous approach to Women’s Studies, ASR organised a women’s studies conference in 1994. It aimed at bringing together women from different disciplines including academics, writers, artists, performers and activists together to share their work in order to dispel fragmentation and isolation among the social disciplines. Moreover, it was expected to support the active women’s movement with theoretical and academic understanding. The papers presented at the conference were aimed at undoing the misconceptions about Women’s Studies and ‘feminism’. The essays also analysed failures, successes, weaknesses and strengths of the women’s movement in Pakistan. The proceedings of the conference were presented in
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

different volumes. The essays presented under the title ‘Celebration of Women’ cover various aspects of women’s lives. Though, these essays are not found to meet the criteria of scholarly writings, rather they are written in a journalistic style, however, some of the other collections, such as *Locating the Self: Reflections on Women and Multiple Identity*, and *Up Against the State*, do contain papers that reflect a scholarly and academic style.

2. Aurat Publication and Information Service Foundation
Since 1986, Aurat Foundation has been working with great commitment and vigour on its three strategic programmes including: information to build capacity for decision-making and action; capacity building of civil society organisations for participation in governance; and advocacy to influence policy, legislation and programmes for women’s greater economic and political empowerment. It has developed a network of civil society organisations in 50 districts to work on citizen’s participation in good governance. There is enormous amount of material produced by the Foundation. Its regular monthly publications includes, *Legislative Watch, Itla, Mashal, Hamjoli*, and the quarterly newsletter *Aurat*. So far, it has produced books, reports, articles, booklet, pamphlets, posters, calendars, and similar items, which do not fall within research, but these are based on research to some extent.

All these are deemed essential to raise awareness and to meet the organisational objectives outlined above. One of its reports, *Women’s Participation in Local Government Elections 2000-2001*, summarises the process and documents and analyses the main feature of women’s participation, with the help of data mainly provided by the Election Commission of Pakistan and Citizens’ Campaign for Women’s Representation. The report is a celebration of women’s successful entry into the leadership role, refuting the myth of their non-availability or incompetence.
3. Awaz Foundation: Community Development Services
This NGO is based in Multan. It has published four reports focussing on the issue related to: parliamentary democracy versus the parliamentary system, youth awareness campaign for the promotion of peace and harmony conducted by itself (January–July 2002), the general election 2002, and women’s exploitation under feudalism.

Awaz has been working in a region with a strong feudal influence. It realises that heinous crimes against women perpetrated by the feudal system cannot be stopped unless feudalism is challenged effectively. Therefore, the case of gang rape of Mukhtar Mai was investigated by two fact-finding missions of Awaz. The purpose was to highlight factors behind the increase in such incidents and the loss of people’s confidence in the state adjudication process. The study assesses psychological and sociological factors, which culminated in the victimisation of women for wrongs they never committed. Awaz has also produced three baseline studies and two action research reports on political issues: ‘Constitutional Amendments versus Parliamentary System’ and ‘Political Parties Manifesto’s’. It has also conducted training and capacity assessment studies of NGOs and the CBOs.

4. Family Planning Association of Pakistan (FPAP)
FPAP has been among the veteran organisations in the field of reproductive health and family planning. It has produced a good number of research reports. However, the precise number of these was not reported by the organisation. One of its reports, *Unsafe Abortion: Magnitude and Perceptions*, deals with a critical and highly under-researched issue of abortion, which has been undermining the health of women in great numbers but the menace goes on unnoticed due to the misconceptions prevalent in the society about the issue and the adverse environment in which it has to be addressed. The report aims at assessing the magnitude of unsafe abortion and the development of a profile of women seeking abortion to develop a client-responsive approach to tackle the problem. FPAP has selected the topic for action
research and also had tried to break the silence on the issue. Due to its highly deleterious effect on women’s health, and also due to the largely unmet need of safe abortion, FPAP has collected reliable data from a sample of 550 women from six hospitals and 32 abortion clinics from Lahore, Karachi and Peshawar. Clients, professionals and administrators were also included. The major reasons for women resorting to unsafe abortion have been identified. Nine research studies on the subject conducted so far (1968-1996) in Pakistan have been reviewed. The profiles of the abortion clinics are prepared in terms of their professionals, facilities, procedures, fees, etc. The analysis and discussion centre on issues like the reasons behind opting for abortion, comparison with other countries and the socio-cultural context of various respondents. The recommendations are meant for FPAP itself, the health sector, service providers and also for the state and society towards an effort to liberalise abortion laws.

Apart from research, FPAP publishes a variety of materials on health, education and to propagate its message for promoting small family norms in the country.

5. Human Rights Commission of Pakistan (HRCP)
HRCP is a broad-spectrum countrywide human rights organisation engaged in the promotion of this cause since 1986. Its objectives include spreading awareness, exposing violations of human rights, motivating people for collective action and intervention for redress of injustices, actual or potential. These objectives are achieved through various activities including daily monitoring, fact-finding, seminars, workshops, surveys, studies, publications, public demonstrations, lobbying, legal assistance and networking. HRCP is concerned about the rule of law, democratic development, bonded labour, women, children, minorities, religious intolerance, freedom of press, and the general situation of human rights. Two task forces in Multan and Hyderabad and a network of 43 correspondents in remote areas supply news and views for HRCP reports.
Since 1981, it has been publishing an annual status report, *State of Human Rights*. Its Urdu version is also published since 1995. The report covers twenty dimensions of human rights extensively, with the help of news in the media, and its own sources. The monthly Urdu newsletter *Jahd-e-Haq* and quarterly *HRCP Newsletter* in English, also report the same data periodically. Moreover, HRCP has also published a large number of reports based on research, surveys, training, seminars, workshops, correspondence, fact-finding missions, along with some training and awareness material. It is difficult to draw a clear line between research and non-research items, because the rigorous style of research cannot be followed in all such activities. Yet one has to realise the value of data collected and its possible use for research. There are over 65 such items according to the list provided by HRCP, in addition to the annual reports and newsletters. Regardless of the form of the final product, research process is involved at some stage in preparation of the material of every kind. Moreover, local core groups are organised on different issues for collective action. In this way research, activism and advocacy are intertwined at HRCP, and are pursued as essential components of its activities.

6. **Lawyers for Human Rights and Legal Aid (LHRLA)**

This is basically a service delivery NGO set up for legal aid. It describes both research and advocacy as its objectives based on its experience of legal aid. It has produced five research reports, and some seminar reports. It has so far conducted research on street children, AIDS among hospital staff members, and AIDS among migrant and domestic workers. The organisation has plans to conduct research on the causes and trends of child abuse. It publishes a quarterly newsletter *Link*, which also reports on the research findings briefly. LHRLA has produced three comprehensive reports and a national research study on trafficking.

7. **National Commission for Justice and Peace (NCJP)**

NCJP has produced a research report on working conditions of the agricultural labour in the Punjab. It emphasises the need for
land reforms and explains how the agricultural labour is exploited by the feudal system. It also explodes the myth that the Punjab is the prosperous province of Pakistan. In this professionally produced report, three separate questionnaires were used for agricultural labour, the landlords, and to prepare the village profile. The survey included 2112 agricultural labourers in 10 districts living in 180 villages and seven union councils. It also interviewed 461 landlords, and prepared 152 village profiles. Data was tabulated in the annex, and the chapters are rich with data analysis. The report is divided in four parts. It provides a broader perspective on the issue of agricultural labour, i.e., one, which includes their family circumstances, mortality rates, living and social conditions, political participation, as integral part of the working conditions of the labour. The report highlights the issue of poverty, debt, low wages, wage abuse, and the need for effective laws governing agricultural labourers’ relationship with the employer. It also demands implementation of the existing laws, new legislation, and poverty alleviation programmes especially for agricultural labour.

8. Orangi Pilot Project (OPP)
This is a leading organisation involved in community development in squatter settlements. Its approach is to encourage and strengthen community initiatives and to evolve partnership with the government for development based on local resources, for which it adopts the methodology of ‘analysing, outstanding problems of the area, people’s initiatives, the bottlenecks in the initiatives then through a process of action research and extension education, evolve viable solutions promoting participatory action’. In this way, OPP has been providing models and setting trends for its successors working in Karachi and elsewhere. It was established in 1980, working in five basic areas of low cost sanitation, housing, health, education, and credit for micro-enterprise. In 1988, OPP was upgraded into three autonomous institutions:
1. OPP-Research and Training Institute, which manages the low-cost sanitation, housing, education, research and training programmes;
2. OPP-Orangi Charitable Trust; and

Based on the above three areas of concentration, OPP has been publishing its experience in community development, findings of its surveys, with the major objective of self-assessment and guidance for other such groups. An example is *Baahimmat Loag* (Urdu), which is a series of stories of individuals, both small businessmen and social workers, who are earning their living in a more confident way or doing community work successfully because of the help of the OPP. Other topics of research and publications include urban planning, sewerage, drainage, micro-credit programme, health, informal sector activities, community development, and sanitation. The OPP institutions have fostered links with other NGOs/CBOs in Karachi — especially with the Urban Resource Centre, and in other cities for training and replication of its programmes. To that end OPP’s research and publications prove very helpful.

The future research plans of OPP include continuing documentation of katchi abadis and drains in the city, recording construction features of new houses in the periphery of Orangi to foresee their problems, and action research with the NGOs/CBOs.

9. Pattan Development Organisation

This organisation works to reduce the vulnerability of communities in the riverain areas in central and southern Punjab, which are exposed to periodic destructive floods. Its community development programmes focus on health, education, agriculture, livestock, savings, credit, and income generation. Pattan also works on advocacy, training and research issues related to governance, disaster and development throughout the country. Pattan embarks upon action research to inform its field programme and advocacy components. ‘Pre and Exit Poll Survey
Research Election 2002’, is the title of a study conducted by Pattan, which provides an independent observation on the election process. It analyses voter behaviour and perceptions, institutional arrangements, capacity and conduct, analysing political trends and different stakeholders’ role and participation. The findings of the pre-election and post-election surveys are presented in two different summary reports. The details are expected to be published in a multi-volume report on the General Elections of 2002.

10. Pakistan Voluntary Health and Nutrition Association (PAVHNA)
PAVHNA has been engaged in service delivery since 1979. It has assumed a national profile by having its network in three provinces of Balochistan, Sindh and NWFP, in collaboration with 17 partner NGOs, serving 2.1 million people. Currently, it has a Community Based Reproductive Health Project. PAVHNA prepares profiles of the area and main NGOs before launching its community work. So far 17 such area profiles and an equal number of NGOs profiles have been prepared. It embarked upon research a few years back when it realised the research value of the data collected by its staff in their routine work. PAVHNA works with partner NGOs of selected areas to run its programme at the start of which it conducts a baseline survey of the households focussing on their health status, and prepares a socio-economic profile. Clinic-based and home-based information is collected during and after the intervention to evaluate its impact. This recorded information is research data of a high quality. Case studies have been compiled from this record, selecting facts about socio-economic aspects of communities changed by intervention of PAVHNA and the partner organisations. Moreover, about 300 reports based on workshop/seminar have been published. Training material is also produced extensively, since PAVHNA has an established training programme through which financial and technical help is provided to the partner NGOs for capacity building. Future plans of PAVHNA include research on reproductive tract information, sexually transmitted
diseases, emergency contraceptives, and provision of injectable contraceptives at the doorsteps.

11. Pakistan Association of Women’s Studies (PAWS)
PAWS has been working since 1992 with the objectives of conducting and disseminating research on gender issues and acting as a forum for Women’s Studies teachers, students, and researchers, to develop the discipline, which was in the nascent stage in the early nineties in Pakistan. It held seminars, workshops, exhibitions, and conferences. There are four books published by the PAWS. Those worth mentioning include the publication of a biannual Alam-e-Niswan: Pakistan Journal of Women’s Studies, which is the first such journal and unique in being the only refereed journal in women’s studies in Pakistan. PAWS is a member of International Network of Feminist Journals. Founded in 1993, so far it has completed ten years and 16 issues have been published. Apart from articles, it publishes news, views, reviews, a chronology of events significant for Pakistani women, and important documents on the issues.

12. Pakistan Institute of Labour Education and Research (PILER)
PILER has devoted itself to the uplift of the working people since 1982, by promoting labour rights through education, research, campaigning and advocacy. It works in collaboration with the trade union movement, research community and other civil society groups working for peace, disarmament, de-nuclearisation, democracy, human rights, and social justice. Some major research studies of the PILER have motivated the organisation itself to establish Women Workers Centre and Centres for Working Children. PILER has produced 14 research reports, five working/discussion papers, nine policy notes, and two economic profiles, along with many pamphlets, newsletters and similar communication material. At present, a research on labour history is underway, mainly using the oral history method for interviews with activists of the labour movement. The documentation component of the project is based on collection of archival records available from public or
private sources and collection of newspaper reports on labour since 1947. Recently PILER, in collaboration with the Pakistan Study Centre, University of Karachi, has launched a publication series titled ‘Labour Archives Project’. PILER has so far produced studies on labour laws, labour rights, labour policy, child labour, bonded labour, social security, women issues, governance, democracy, structural adjustment, social justice, and education. The most recent addition to the PILER’s publications is a collection of Omar Asghar Khan’s articles under the title, ‘Riyasat, Samaji Tabdeeli Aur Awam’, which deals with political economy, civil society, role of public interest organisations, governance, peace and de-nuclearisation.

13. Roots for Equity
This organisation has specially focussed on the issues of globalisation and food security in its advocacy and research activities. It has been publishing a biannual newsletter Resistance since 2000 and a quarterly Urdu newsletter Challenge since 2001. Apart from this, Roots has been working for women’s development in the low-income localities of Karachi. Roots has prepared a country study of Pakistan, on the issue of the impact of the Agreement on Agriculture (AoA) and trade liberalisation on food security. The study is based on quantitative and qualitative data to assess women’s ability to ensure food security for themselves and their families. The districts of Multan and Hyderabad were selected from which 12 villages were chosen to get a sample of 47 households and 39 farmers. The study paints a dismal picture of women from families having small pieces of agricultural land or doing farming under a sharecropping or contract farming system. Many reasons posing threats to food security of the rural folk are discussed here. It also elucidates the implications of neo-liberal policies for the most disadvantaged section of the population.

14. Sustainable Development Policy Institute (SDPI)
SDPI is a leading non-governmental research institute with special focus on multi-disciplinary approach to sustainable development. It was established to provide advice to various
organisations of the public, private and voluntary sectors and ensure greater policy effectiveness of research. It also undertakes policy-oriented research and advocacy on issues of public interest. Training is another component of the SDPI to strengthen public and civil society institutions and build capacity for sustainable development.

The amount of research done by the SDPI in the field of human development, social sector development, environment, governance and economy, since its establishment in 1992, is unmatched by any other independent organisation in the country. It has lately established a Population and Environment Communication Centre to produce quality research on the population and environment interface, along with other purposes of capacity building, raising awareness and training. Until October 7, 2002, SDPI had produced over 81 working papers, 26 research reports, 19 monographs, 29 policy papers, 16 policy briefs, three distinguished lectures, 14 books, reports and conference proceedings in English. In Urdu 29 books, 47 working papers, and 58 off-prints have been printed. There are many more in process. Periodical publications, produced at the institute, are nine in number and include among others Campaigner, Dhart, and Paidar Taraqi. Those very helpful in research on the key environmental issues are Pakistan Environmental Digest, Abadi aur Mahol Digest and Abadi aur Mahol Bulletin. It publishes an English and an Urdu newsletter, along with ‘SDPI Research and News Bulletin’.

SDPI has published many such monographs based on consultancy reports. Review of Pakistan Poverty Data is one such monograph aimed at informing the public debate on poverty in Pakistan in order to make policy interventions.

15. Shehri: Citizens for Better Environment
Named as Shehri: CBE, the NGO was formed in 1988 to fight the deterioration of the urban environment. It believes that only through raising public consciousness and effectively articulating public pressure one can hope of stemming the process of
deterioration and bringing about an improvement in the environment. Shehri operates as a pressure group and acts as a catalyst for generating debates and searching solutions for major urban problems.

Shehri publishes handouts and other such material produced for awareness and advocacy based on findings of research. For example, a handout on *Environmental Impact of Power Plants on Karachi*, summarises the facts about the project, its potential environmental hazards, and strategy to resist implementation of such a plan. It advocates ‘green options’ such as energy efficient technologies, cogeneration, combined cycle plants, energy conservation practices, renewable energy sources and opting for small-scale hydro power plants. Shehri tries to assess the causes of institutional decay and proposes recommendations for a change in the urban environment. It has conducted a survey on ‘Neighbourhood Level Solid Waste Management in Karachi: Issues and Solutions’.

The second study on this major issue was conducted on the management practices at the local government level. This brief report includes an organisational chart, details on equipment and vehicles, and a logical diagram of the expert system for solid waste management proposed for the city.

16. Shirkat Gah Women’s Resource Centre
Shirkat Gah is one of the leading women organisations in terms of its work for awareness, training, advocacy, research and publications. Established in 1975, this women’s collective has been working to increase women’s autonomy and gender equality by enhancing women’s access to information, resources and skills. It has specially focussed on critical areas of law and status, sustainable development, health, education and women’s economic independence. It has contributed quality research material on topics related to women lives in Pakistan. Furthermore, it has compiled and published bibliographies, information kits, training manuals, action manual for the NGOs, handy readers, handbook and manual on family laws, resource directory, functional literacy books, awareness booklets, special
bullets, and a simplified version of the 1997 Commission of Inquiry Report. Some of Shirkat Gah’s publications are available in both English and Urdu languages. Recently, Sindhi has also been adopted for communication and production of translations. Moreover, translations from local and foreign languages are also published. In total Shirkat Gah’s own publications number over 44.35

Shirkat Gah has also published material in collaboration with an international network of solidarity and support, Women Living Under Muslim Laws (WLUM). Twenty-two dossiers produced under this partnership contain information about the lives and struggle of women living in various Muslim societies, extracted from a wide range of resources. WLUM Newsheet focusses on law, religion, customs, and women’s rights. Seventeen books, working papers, special bulletins, occasional papers, kit or compilations are also published through this collaboration.

17. Society for the Protection of Rights of Child (SPARC)
SPARC has exclusively focussed on children issues. It has produced many pamphlets for promotion of practices useful for children and raising awareness about children’s rights. Some pamphlets are entitled The Magic a Mother can do, The International Child Labour Elimination Act, and The Sanders Amendment. SPARC also produces research reports and an annual report on the situation of children in Pakistan. For instance Lengthening Shadows: Poverty Affected Children36 is a compilation of 17 articles. SPARC’s newsletter, Discourse, covers a variety of topics concerning children. Other reports/books deal with children, their rights in Pakistan, the legal aspects of child labour and the state of Pakistan’s children.

18. Social Policy Development Centre (SPDC)
SPDC is an organisation in the private sector engaged in research. Since its inception in 1995, it has been giving policy advice to the public sector. Its research is focussed on analysis of policies, pilot project monitoring and evaluation. It also serves as a database for the social sector, and disseminates information
through conferences, seminars, and publications. So far, it has produced research reports, policy papers, conference papers, conference proceedings, three data-base reports, and five books, which include three annual reviews of social development in Pakistan. It has launched a study of the non-profit sector (known as voluntary or NGO sector as well), with the help of the Aga Khan Foundation and John Hopkins University.

**19. Sungi Development Foundation**

Sungi is one of the leading organisations working on the issues of forest management and preservation, rural development, local government, women’s development, food security, large dams, governance, etc. Its major aims are advocacy, development and action. It has produced many survey and research reports, informative booklets, training modules, and workshops and PRA reports. Its bimonthly newsletter *Khabarnama* has been published since 1995.

The organisation has produced many pamphlets/booklets for raising awareness, reporting field activities, PRA reports, for legal literacy and participatory research. A booklet on the role of the NGOs in social and political change in Pakistan, translated in Urdu, gives a comprehensive picture and an in-depth analysis of the subject. One of the research reports by Sungi is aimed at a critical evaluation of Gomal Zam Dam Project proposal in terms of its social impact. It has been the first project of the government of Pakistan in connection with ‘Vision 2025’. The report points out many negative implications of the design of the project. It also calls for publicising the details about the project in full because the anomaly arises out of hiding the details. Sungi had also conducted another survey study on Chashma Right Bank Irrigation Project and Ghazi Brotha Hydro Power Project.

**20. Thardeep Rural Development Programme (TRDP)**

Thardeep Rural Development Programme is among the many rural support and rural development programmes introduced after the success of Aga Khan Rural Support Programme
Contribution of the NGOs to Social Science Research in Pakistan

(AKRSP) in the Northern areas of Pakistan. Thardeep is working in 686 villages of Tharparker for social mobilisation and capacity building. TRDP has learnt much from its predecessor AKRSP. Among the 20 reports/documents prepared by TRDP include a quarterly newsletter (Sindhi), 10 annual reports since 1990, two external evaluation reports of TRDP, self-assessment report, TRDP management review, and strategy paper along with research reports on issues of carpet industry, health, micro-credit, rainwater harvesting, drought, land use and social development. Training reports and case studies have also been produced.

One of its research reports, entitled *Gender Situation Analysis in Tharparkar* brings forth the ground situation of the gender issue in Thar. The publication highlights the gender field-based situation analysis and the assessment of an existing gender component in TRDP’s activities. The study explores the position of women within the context of the household, family and community. The assessment covers TRDP’s credit programme, Women Para Development Committee, and Gender Networking. It also presents some practical models. The study serves the dual purpose of analysis and assessment of TRDP’s own programmes for developing a comprehensive gender policy and gender strategies, as well as providing some useful data on the subject.

**21. Uks**

‘Uks’ means ‘reflection’, and the NGO named Uks has declared its objectives to serve as a research, publication and resource centre on women and the media. It has produced five diaries on women in Pakistan, on the topics of politics, violence, print media, women’s achievements in the past and a vision for the future. Three research reports have been prepared on the integrated themes of women, media and AIDS. A resource book is also prepared about HIV/AIDS, which Uks takes as a development issue.
An exploratory national study on monitoring and sensitisation of the print media on the portrayal of women, entitled *Changing Images* is produced by Uks. It is based on content analysis of 14 daily newspapers, three weekly and five monthly magazines in both English and Urdu languages. The findings are very interesting, shocking, and startling in some respects. The report is a comprehensive research document, enlightening and informative in its contents and highly objective in its approach.

**22. Urban Resource Centre (URC)**

This Centre was established in 1989 ‘to create a space for interaction between poor communities, formal and informal sectors interest groups, academic institutions and government agencies’. The URC has been working actively on major urban issues as a watchdog in collaboration with other NGOs. These issues include forced evictions and housing rights, mass transit project, Lyari Expressway, and transporters’ relations with state organisations. The URC holds forums to encourage interaction between different development sectors of the city to promote collective thinking, decision-making and action. Proceedings of these forums are documented regularly. City development forums for institutional developments of the CBOs are organised to facilitate the latter’s understanding of urban issues. The URC also has a youth training programme for urban development.

The URC has been publishing monthly *Facts & Figures* in Urdu and English since January 1993. This news-sheet is prepared from the news clippings, reports of the government agencies and NGOs, and the URC’s own studies. It is a useful source of information for research on urban issues. Most of the URC’s publications are based on research done by its staff. Guidebooks for community work have been produced here. *Urban Resource Centre City Watch Series* include booklets in English and Urdu, on the issues of the Karachi circular railway, northern bypass, Lyari Express Way, and solid waste management. A study is underway on the foreign funded projects in Karachi, which could not achieve their objectives.
A good number of books of the URC are published by the City Press, and this sets a good example of joining hands of the NGOs and publishing firms, which proves synergic for both. The URC also works in collaboration with the OPP in many of its activities.

**IV. Analysis and Conclusion**

The research by the NGOs is a wide topic to be justified in a single research paper. This is due to the variety found in the type of material produced, subjects, methodology, audience, size, format, approach, objectives, and above all the quality. Mostly, the NGOs engaged in research do not consider research as their sole or prime objective. However, a number of their reports and publications reflect their standing in the field of research. The data presented in the preceding sections does not cover the whole range of organisations engaged in research, since the purpose was to give an idea of what sort of work the NGOs are doing, which can be taken as research work. Some other types of material — magazines, seminar reports, digests, bulletins — and awareness items are not covered here, but they help disseminate the research findings. Some NGOs’ activities have different implications for the social sciences as they conduct research as consultancy firms and have specialised in social sciences research, such as Raasta, in Karachi. It is not registered as an NGO, but takes up research and training assignments from the NGOs, as well as other clients.

Most of the NGOs engaged in research mentioned in the above pages can be classified as ‘research cum publishing NGOs’. In this group NGOs like SDPI, SPDC, Shirkat Gah and ASR can be counted. It must be noted that other non-governmental organisations with no full-fledged component of research and no proper facilities for publishing utilise market facilities. There are many NGOs, working on specified areas like service delivery and advocacy. They hold seminars and workshops and present the findings in summary or detailed reports.47
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

The research-only NGOs, and policy-research NGOs are the only ones found keen to conduct research fulfilling the standards of academic research. Others may deviate from the required standards. Anyhow, in view of poor and low quantity of research produced in social sciences at the universities, whatever the NGOs are contributing needs to be appreciated. Their shortcomings, however, need to be compensated through further research by the public or private sector institutions, but the foremost responsibility goes to the social sciences departments of the universities. Collaboration between the universities and the NGOs can prove beneficial by utilising grassroots linkages and vigour of the NGOs and scientific approach and expertise of the academic community. Furthermore, social sciences departments in the universities are also not in a satisfactory state regarding their research capacity. They need to be upgraded and developed in terms of research capacities.

There are hundreds of other organisations working in the country, which occasionally may produce some good piece of research. There are organisations for which necessary steps involved in research are a part of routine work. This is true for NGOs, which are very keen to document (e.g., OPP, PAVHNA). Some others find their own data, proceedings, or record valuable for research purposes. There are some who initiate their own research projects while many NGOs take up consultancy assignments as well. Some compile, reproduce, translate, and disseminate research done by other individuals or organisations. Only one organisation was found to have a research journal. Publication of a newsletter in one, two or sometimes three languages is common for almost all the NGOs, even for those who do not have any other publishing activity. Areas of research usually coincide their development/advocacy activities, but sometimes these seem to be adopted only because funding was available and the NGOs, known for being flexible, took up the research job. The local bodies election in 2002 was one such event, for which huge amounts of funding was provided by the national and international donors. Some NGOs took to that subject as well. The hiring of personnel for research, therefore, is
inevitable for those organisations that usually do not have regular researchers on their staff or their competence is not be suitable for the assignments taken.

The findings of this study show that some topics — women’s issues, human rights, environment, poverty, and political participation — dominate the selection. This may be due to the fact that on the whole these have been more popular topics in the last two or three decades. This is again due to a number of reasons: donor funding on some specific issues, such as women development since mid-seventies, environment since mid-eighties and human rights education since mid-nineties has guided the choices of NGOs. Poverty alleviation, good governance, and women’s participation in political process are the themes emerging out of the specific politico-economic situation of Pakistan. The NGOs working on other issues such as health, education, economic empowerment, etc., might be facing problems in securing funds, when their areas of research do not match with the donors’ priorities. The donor-driven research agenda itself is taken as problematic for it overemphasises some themes, yet it does bring issues into the limelight one after another. In the context of a developing society this factor tends to fragment the issues and distort the priorities, too. Since the volume of research on some issues (e.g. ageing, child development, family dynamics, disability, mental health, etc.) is miserably low, some strategies can and ought to be devised to address this shortage. Another reason for more literature on women and human rights issues is the need for creating awareness and using it as a tool in advocacy drives. Not denying the power of electronic media, publication at this stage is being used by the NGOs as the most effective tool of raising awareness. There are NGOs (PAWLA for instance), using audio-video material as well for its awareness component. One deficiency of this paper, apparently due to limited scope and space, has been its exclusion of any piece of evaluation research. Such reports need to be studied separately. These are reported to be available mostly either with the registration/controlling
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

authorities or the NGOs themselves, and both hesitate to reveal this type of material.

There seems to exist a misleading dichotomy of theoretical and applied research in the thinking of a number of NGOs. Very few NGOs are concerned with theoretical research; fewer still relate their work with the practical and applied aspects. On the other hand an awful lot of NGOs have confined themselves to the practical work without relating it to theory or a well thought of theoretical paradigms. Without clear thinking and conceptual clarity, action can be misguided and can do more harm than good. The NGOs that have adopted a process of documentation and recording their work (e.g., OPP, PAVHNA) in the context of an overall theoretical framework deserve appreciation, since they are generating valuable data, which is socially relevant.

Theoretical underpinning and references are missing in a large number of research items reviewed in this paper. This is mainly due to more emphasis upon action-orientation of the study. Some other descriptive reports exploring facts, very often do not establish their link with theories, neither do they discuss the bearing of their findings on the existing theoretical formulations. Data collected, however, can serve as a source in the theorising process. Ascertaining the proportion of theoretical research in total volume of research is difficult. Categorisation of research in terms of scientific value is also difficult.

There also exists a false distinction between the NGOs’ work and that of the academic institutions. It is assumed that the NGOs’ work is essentially applied in nature while the academic institutions do pure as well as applied research. It is also wrongly assumed that the two set of institutions are far apart and that they cooperate and support each other’s work by their own respective area of expertise, i.e., theoretical and analytical by the academic community and applied and somewhat analytical by the NGO community. In fact the NGOs and the academic institutions are both parts of the civil society and both should work for the improvement of the social conditions. Therefore, their
cooperation and correlation is extremely important. There can be some division of work between the NGOs and the academic institutions given the state of available expertise in them as well as the financial and personnel resources at their respective disposal. Their responsibilities should be worked out on the principle of division of labour rather than on the differentiation of theoretical and applied aspects of the work.

Rigid research procedures and approaches, paradigms and theoretical emphasis, operationalisation and conceptualisation, statistical analysis, etc., may be taken as burdensome by those not compelled by any means save their own objectives. It is also a fact that the critique of conventional research methodologies has come from those working with communities and they have felt the need for improvising, or revising the existing procedures. Feminist research methodology is a case in point. In an environment where the NGOs have become very active in community work, social scientists must recognise the value of their experiences, and help them record it better. This is the job URC and OPP are found doing with partner NGOs/CBOs. Many programmes of umbrella NGOs and the NGO networks are also meant for the same purpose. Internship programmes of NGOs are also useful for those with academic knowledge to be able to apply it.

The quality of research output of the NGOs varies due to their limitations in expertise, funding or lesser attention to quality. Not all, but some of the items produced by professional staff discuss theoretical underpinning of their research. Being social science items, most of the research output relevant for this paper has an interdisciplinary approach. The extent of scientific methods being used varies from ‘very much’ to ‘not much’. There is found to be less concern about choosing representative communities or samples in field surveys, yet mostly the selection seems fairly scientific. Documenting the reports is another weak area. The research by the NGOs is low in terms of creativity because they are mostly using the conventional research techniques. There is ample scope for being innovative and
flexible in participatory methods, but at this stage these are mostly used in training and less so in research. The NGOs can benefit from the training experience of their own community in this regard.

The social utility of the research is no doubt very high in that it is used extensively by the academia, policy makers and the administrators, and by the NGO community itself. Its ‘applied’ nature makes it easily comprehensible. Perhaps its utility can be increased through adopting better means of dissemination (through media, for instance), by emphasising the use of findings by the state agencies, and also by strengthening the advocacy campaigns of the civil society organisations based on greater input from existing research.

An essential component of social science research, that is, methodology, has been used in a variegated manner by the NGOs. Some adhered to the rigid criteria of scientific methods while others tried innovative methodologies. Since experimenting with methods is found essential for difficult topics, and changing field conditions, the validity of such new techniques remains questionable. Yet, experimentation is inevitable, otherwise only little or defective information can be expected. In consonance with the tradition of feminist research methodology, such research by NGOs needs to be evaluated carefully without compromising objectivity. The efficacy of non-conventional techniques needs to be appreciated, though the debate on the issue seemingly has to go on. This study ends with the happy note that the NGOs are contributing a good volume of research to the various fields of social sciences, despite many limitations, and are contributing to the development of social sciences in a noticeable manner.

Further research can be carried out on specific items produced by the NGOs, such as newsletters, training material, advocacy material and material produced for raising awareness such as posters, handouts, pamphlets, guidebooks, etc. Data on the
NGOs’ research capacity can be collected and used to enhance this capacity.
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

Notes

1 Devised by the author.
3 It means not merely reporting and documenting the project activities but looking for the facts following the scientific procedure and standards.
5 Ibid., p. 45.
6 Examples are Social Policy Development Centre (research only), Sustainable Development Policy Institute (research, advocacy, training), Shirkat Gah, PILER, Aurat Foundation (research, development, advocacy, training, etc.).
8 For this paper, only those NGOs are selected which have an indigenous base and identity and those having bilateral/multilateral character, or belonging to the UN group of organisations, are excluded. Immense variety of subjects taken up by the NGOs for their research and development activities suggests a broad scope of the paper. Ascertaining the number of NGOs involved in research is impossible task due to unorganised nature of the sector and due to the fact that research is not taken up by a large number of NGOs. Neither such information is available in a scientific manner. Only the material produced in English or Urdu is reviewed. Another study is needed to review research in regional languages. Research produced by NGOs is often for their own use only and is not accessible to the public. This is true for the kind of evaluation and assessment reports or the ones prepared for the management purpose. Limited production and circulation of the resource material also restrains any research on the subject. There seems no compulsion on the NGOs to supply their copies to any department, not even the registration and regulating authority, who may keep the record. The fact puts a check on availability of research items hence limits the scope of this paper. A questionnaire was used to collect data from 30 organisations from the country regarding their research activities, but only 17 could reply. Some big research NGOs could not respond. Therefore, the information received is incorporated in the paper but not discussed at length, as was planned before starting the study. Moreover a uniform style for describing each NGO could not be adopted due to variance in the nature of sources of information, such as the questionnaire, annual reports, newsletters, list of publications, annotated bibliography, etc.
10 These include: Sustainable Development Policy Institute (SDPI), Social Policy Development Centre (SPDC), LRF and Literacy, Education and Development (LEAD). The first two are covered in this paper while the third have ceased to exist. The fourth, LEAD, perhaps does not qualify to be listed.
under research organisations as it is reported to train leaders of environmental and development programmes.


12 Ibid., p.18.

13 Ibid.


15 Out of these ten, two are of bilateral character, one does not have an NGO status as per definition of this study and five others are included in sample of this paper.

16 According to the persons associated with ASR, instead of adopting a welfare approach, ASR has been working for effecting structural changes in the institutions that oppress women.


18 Nighat Said Khan, Rubina Saigol and Afiya Shaberbano Zia (eds.), *Celebration of Women* (ASR, Lahore, 1995), Vol. VI.

19 The Foundation has a national profile, with an outreach to 85 districts and 17 stations in tribal and northern areas. Its information network links about 1000 rural and urban communities in Pakistan.


24 A database is being developed by Human Rights Commission of Pakistan based on news from daily press, published court reports, governments’ gazettes, statistical and other surveys and books.


30 This data is quoted from the PILER files, covering the period of 1982-2002. The actual number is higher.
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

33 Haris Gazdar, Review of Pakistan Poverty Data (Social Policy Development Institute, Monograph Series No. 9, Islamabad, 1999).
35 According to the publication catalogue of Shirkat Gah, up to 2000.
37 This data is taken from the SPDC publications catalogue dated April 2003.
39 Khadim Hussain, Gomal Zam Dam Project Survey Report (Sungi Development Foundation, Islamabad, 2002).
40 Khadim Hussain, Chashma Right Bank Irrigation Project (CRBIP), (Sungi Development Foundation, Islamabad, 2000).
41 As reported by the website of Thardeep Rural Development Programme (TRDP). The organisation did not respond to the survey questionnaire and letters by the author.
42 Thardeep Rural Development Programme, Gender Situation Analysis in Tharparkar (TRDP, Mithi, 2002).
43 Para means a set of houses situated adjacent to each other, and forming a neighbourhood, which may be apart of big village, or a small village itself.
44 Uks, Changing Images (Uks, Islamabad, 2001).
46 For example, see A. P. Cotton, M. Sohail & W. K. Taylor, Bunyadi Sshoolatoon kay Hussol Mein Shehrion ka Kirdar (City Press, Karachi, 1999).
47 An example is the Pakistan Association for Mental Health, which has produced a seminar report Criminal Abuse of Women and Children (Karachi, 1992).
48 For instance, the Samaji Tanzeem Johi, Dadu, a relatively unknown NGO. It has produced a good report, Research on Violence against Women in District Dadu, which uses an innovative methodology to investigate a sensitive issue in the rural area under strong tribal hold.
Quantitative Development of Social Sciences

Pervez Tahir

The development of social sciences in Pakistan was measured in a 1989 study using both qualitative and quantitative criteria. The Council of Social Sciences (COSS) is currently engaged in another study using more or less the same criteria. This paper presents some tentative findings based on quantitative data derived from this study.

To ensure qualitative development there must first be an adequate infrastructure and institutional capability. Fortunately, such adequacy and capabilities can be measured by collecting and interpreting information on four pre-conditions that must be satisfied. In the first place, there must exist specialised institutions such as departments, institutes and centres, which foster and sustain a social science discipline. Second, there must be adequate number of specialists capable of creative and inspiring teaching and doing innovative research and they have adequate facilities for their work such as well-equipped libraries. They also receive appropriate material and symbolic rewards. Third, in recruitment of staff the policy of cross-breeding is generally followed, that is, without violating the criterion of merit the products of other departments are given equal chance. Fourth, a community of practitioners of the discipline exists enabling them to remain in continuous contact with one another,
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

as well as with regional and international organisations in the discipline. This paper does not discuss all these conditions focussing mainly on development of departments and institutes and the number of teachers in them.

Quantitative Development
Since Independence, there has been a significant quantitative growth of social sciences and social scientists in the country. A rough count carried out in November 2003 indicated that there were an estimated 17,300 local and foreign trained social scientists. The estimate included those trained but not working as social scientists, the social scientists who are no more active and those working in the universities, training centres, research institutions, colleges, government departments and ministries, private sector and the non-profit sector.

From less than half a dozen in the early years, the number of social science departments, institutes and centres rose significantly to 149 in 2001. COSS has obtained reliable data between 1963 and 2001. This data has been analysed here for three indicators of growth — change in the number of social sciences departments, number of teachers and their qualifications. The analysis, it must not be forgotten, is dealing with a very small population. While there has been growth over time, as Table No. 1 indicates, one is basically talking about 150 odd departments, 300 PhDs and under 1200 practitioners.
Table No. 1: Number of Departments, Teachers and their Qualifications in Pakistani Universities from 1963 to 2001

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Departments</th>
<th>Teachers</th>
<th>PhDs (F&amp;L)</th>
<th>MPhils (F&amp;L)</th>
<th>Master (F&amp;L)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1963</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1968</td>
<td>42</td>
<td>308</td>
<td>84</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>207</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1976</td>
<td>78</td>
<td>579</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>398</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1987</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>751</td>
<td>161</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>535</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1994</td>
<td>128</td>
<td>1046</td>
<td>179</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>642</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001</td>
<td>149</td>
<td>1168</td>
<td>299</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>751</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: COSS database
F&L = Foreign and Local

Since 1963 up to 2001 the number of social sciences departments has grown from 39 to 149. During the five-year period 1963-68, the number of departments increased only by 3. This was the time of the military rule of Ayub Khan. Any definite conclusions can be drawn only if data since 1958 become available. In the following 8 years, 1968-76, 36 departments were added at the rate of 4.5 departments per annum. This high rate of departmental growth coincided with the period when liberal discourse flourished, both under the military regime of Yahya Khan and the political regime of Zulfikar Ali Bhutto. With the ascendancy of obscurantism under the military regime of Zia-ul-Haq, the departmental growth slowed down to 1.5 per annum during 1976-87. It revived to 4.6 per annum again when the political rule returned in 1987-1994. The period 1994-2001, a mixture of political and military rule, brought the rate of departmental growth down to 3.1. As a whole the rate of departmental growth during the entire 1963-2001 period was about 3 per annum. Thus the first criterion of quantitative development, i.e., institutional growth, was reasonably satisfied.
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

Table No. 2: Changes in Composition of Five Social Sciences Departments 1963-2001

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>History</th>
<th>Economics</th>
<th>Political Science</th>
<th>Sociology</th>
<th>Philosophy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1963</td>
<td>15.4</td>
<td>12.8</td>
<td>10.3</td>
<td>7.7</td>
<td>7.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1968</td>
<td>14.2</td>
<td>11.9</td>
<td>9.5</td>
<td>9.5</td>
<td>9.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1976</td>
<td>10.3</td>
<td>14.1</td>
<td>9.0</td>
<td>7.7</td>
<td>6.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1987</td>
<td>10.5</td>
<td>16.8</td>
<td>8.4</td>
<td>5.3</td>
<td>4.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1994</td>
<td>10.2</td>
<td>14.1</td>
<td>7.0</td>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>3.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2001</td>
<td>8.1</td>
<td>12.1</td>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>5.4</td>
<td>3.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: COSS database

A look at the composition of the departments indicates the relative importance of various disciplines, and informs about the content of institutional growth. This is reflected in Table No. 2, which picks up the five most important disciplines in 1963. History, the most important discipline in 1963 lost out to Economics, while Political Science became less significant than Sociology. Philosophy maintained its position of least importance.
Quantitative Development of Social Sciences

Figure 1

A graphic view of the data in Table No. 2, presented in Figure 1, reveals that all of these disciplines have been long past their peaks. History has witnessed steady decline. Economics left history behind in 1976, peaked in 1987 but has been on the downhill since then. Political Science, Philosophy and Sociology were equally important in 1968. Since then, Political Science has seen consistent decline, while Sociology shows some signs of revival, though the level remains lower than in 1963.

Indeed all of these five disciplines are a smaller percentage of the total in 2001 than in 1963. What it means is that some new disciplines have emerged to claim not only their share, but have also become more important than these traditional disciplines. Table No. 3 brings out this relative change.
It will be seen from Table No. 3 that by 2001, only Economics retained its second position of 1963. From its first position in 1963, History moved to the fourth position in 2001, thus giving way to Education. Political Science, placed third in 1963, had moved way down, as had Sociology and Philosophy, their places taken by Public/Business Administration and Mass Communication. In fact by 2001, the scene was dominated by disciplines with greater perceived job prospects: Education, Economics, Public/Business Administration, Mass Communication, Library Science, Home Economics, Social Work and Geography share 55 per cent of the departments. All these departments had existed in 1963 and, therefore, the higher growth is not the result of a lower or non-existent base. In fact, the other 12 departments include five disciplines that did not exist in the base year, 1963, viz. Anthropology, Area Study Centres, Defence and Strategic Studies, Development Studies and Pakistan Studies. The remaining 7 departments, together with Anthropology, can be described as the core social science departments while the other four are multidisciplinary in nature. The core disciplines contained 3.3 per cent of the total
Quantitative Development of Social Sciences

departments compared to 55 per cent in 1963. From nil in 1963, the multidisciplinary departments claimed a share of 12 per cent in 2001. In sum, while the overall quantitative institutional growth was satisfactory, the relative quantitative strength of the core social science departments declined.

The second criterion of quantitative development related to the supply of practitioners. There was an increase of teachers in the social science departments from 210 in 1963 to 1168 in 2001, a more than 5-fold increase. The teacher/department ratio rose significantly from 5.4 to 7.8, implying that the teachers’ growth was higher than the departmental growth. However, it is instructive to look at the distribution of teachers over the three categories of departments identified earlier. Table No. 4 presents this information. It indicates that the employment oriented departments increased their share of teachers from 55.2 per cent in 1963 to 59 per cent in 1987 and maintained it in 2001. Core departments witnessed a continued decline in their share. In 2001, increase in the share of multidisciplinary departments was at the cost of core departments.

Table No. 4: Changes in the Distribution of Teachers of Social Sciences during 1963-2001 by Categories of Disciplines

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>(%) of total</th>
<th>1963</th>
<th>1987</th>
<th>2001</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Employment oriented departments</td>
<td>55.2</td>
<td>59.0</td>
<td>59.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Core departments</td>
<td>44.8</td>
<td>37.3</td>
<td>30.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multidisciplinary departments</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>10.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: COSS database.

There is a presumption that foreign qualifications, particularly PhDs, suggest better quality of the teachers. According to Zaidi:

‘A huge percentage of academics in the past in almost all disciplines, were mainly foreign trained, as grants and scholarships from USAID, the Ford Foundation and other
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

sources allowed many academics to go abroad to study. Now, with grants fewer than in the past and with more potential recipients chasing them, it is becoming difficult to go abroad for a few years to study. Many students go for a year or so, to do another Master degree after having done their Master locally…²

It will be seen in Table No. 5 that the eight employment oriented disciplines, out of a total of 20 disciplines falling under the rubric of social sciences, also claim the greatest proportion of foreign qualifications and, within these, an even greater proportion of foreign MPhils/Masters. Other disciplines have a greater proportion of foreign as well as local PhDs.

Table No. 5: Teachers’ Qualifications of Employment Oriented Disciplines Compared with Qualifications of Other Disciplines, 2001

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>% Share</th>
<th>Employment oriented disciplines</th>
<th>Others</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Teachers</td>
<td>59.0</td>
<td>41.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foreign qualifications</td>
<td>57.4</td>
<td>42.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foreign PhDs</td>
<td>45.4</td>
<td>54.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foreign MPhils/Masters</td>
<td>69.4</td>
<td>30.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All PhDs</td>
<td>48.5</td>
<td>51.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: COSS database.

A more meaningful picture emerges when the ratio of foreign PhDs and MPhils/Masters is compared over time and across the three categories of disciplines. Table No. 6 gives this information. It will be noticed that the core social sciences started out with the highest teachers/departments ratio in respect of foreign PhDs, all foreign qualifications, local PhDs and all PhDs. Employment oriented disciplines had an edge only in regard to foreign MPhils, Masters/departments ratio. By 2001 the position changed radically. The core social sciences now had an
Quantitative Development of Social Sciences

development only in local PhDs. This reversal was contributed mainly but not entirely by the accelerated expansion of the employment oriented disciplines. Another major development was the emergence of multidisciplinary departments, which competed with core social sciences departments. In 2001, these new departments had a higher density of foreign PhDs, all foreign qualifications and all PhDs than the core social sciences departments. In fact, the density of all PhDs in these departments (39.1 per cent) was higher than both employment oriented departments (37.8 per cent) and core social science departments (20.4 per cent). Structural integration through interdisciplinary studies was noted above as an important evaluation criterion for social sciences. In this regard, the emergence of multidisciplinary departments provided opportunities for holistic social science.

The third quantitative precondition related to cross-breeding allowed by nondiscriminatory recruitment from other departments. Data are not available to pursue the analysis in quantitative terms, but the general impression is that most local Master, MPhils and PhDs work in the department of their origins. This low mobility is not always the outcome of personal preferences, as provincial and other quotas play a significant role in restraining movement between universities. In theory, the federal universities should be the main cross-breeding grounds because the quotas in their case work as an encouragement rather than a hindrance. In practice, the high location cost in Islamabad and differential academic competencies have had the opposite effect.
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

Table No. 6: Degrees of Teachers in Three Categories of Disciplines in Different Years

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Employment oriented disciplines</th>
<th>Core social sciences</th>
<th>Multidisciplinary departments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1963</td>
<td>1963</td>
<td>1963</td>
<td>1963</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foreign PhDs</td>
<td>8.6</td>
<td>26.0</td>
<td>26.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2001</td>
<td>11.7</td>
<td>7.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1987*</td>
<td>12.5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foreign MPhils/Masters</td>
<td>29.3</td>
<td>5.8</td>
<td>20.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2001</td>
<td>5.6</td>
<td>0.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1987*</td>
<td>1.7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other foreign qualifications</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>0.0</td>
<td>0.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2001</td>
<td>28.6</td>
<td>3.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All foreign qualification</td>
<td>40.5</td>
<td>31.8</td>
<td>46.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2001</td>
<td>17.3</td>
<td>35.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1987*</td>
<td>17.5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Local PhDs</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>1.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2001</td>
<td>9.2</td>
<td>0.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>1987*</td>
<td>5.8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All PhDs**</td>
<td>12.1</td>
<td>37.8</td>
<td>34.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2001</td>
<td>20.4</td>
<td>7.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>39.1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: COSS database. *1987 was chosen because multidisciplinary departments did not exist in 1963. **Includes PhDs the origin of which is not known.

A correlation matrix was also computed. For the period as a whole, i.e., 1963-2001, the correlation coefficients for all departments and MScs, MPhils and PhDs work out at 0.991, 0.965 and 0.944, indicating the predominance of MA/MScs followed by MPhils and PhDs. Not only the number of practitioners is inadequate, the level of their academic training is also skewed towards locally obtained Master.

A reasonably adequate number of teachers, a good many of whom hold PhDs, is only a partial indicator of quality. In addition to being capable, the quality criterion requires them to be actually involved in research. Hence the fourth precondition translates into the existence of journals maintaining appropriate standards and published with predictable regularity. Publication
Quantitative Development of Social Sciences

of research in international journals of repute is a generally acceptable measure of quality. For peer pressure and critical debate, the role of independently working professional associations and learned bodies, holding regular annual conferences and frequent symposia and seminars and workshops is considered crucial. This is a subject meriting a detailed separate study and is not pursued any further for reasons of space.

To recapitulate, the country experienced a reasonable growth of social science departments during the period under consideration. However, the growth has been significantly higher in the employment-oriented disciplines than in the core social sciences. The growth of teachers has been higher than the departmental growth, indicating larger availability of teachers. In terms of qualifications, core disciplines no more have an edge in foreign PhDs, losing out to multidisciplinary as well as employment-oriented disciplines. Crossbreeding between departments has been limited and the fora for cross-fertilisation and peer review, such as professional associations and journals, have either become dormant or lack quality.
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

Notes

1 The coverage is limited to UGC/HEC data and would exclude, for example, the training institutions under the purview of the Establishment Division of the Government of Pakistan. Notably, it also excludes NGOs. In the words of Zaidi, ‘It is not easy to estimate the number of social scientists working with NGOs in Pakistan. If one was to make a guesstimate about the size of this community, then perhaps the number would be no more than one hundred. While there are say, well qualified Master-level political scientists or anthropologists working in NGOs, they are not really working as ‘social scientists’ and may be doing no research.’ S. Akbar Zaidi, The Dismal State of the Social Sciences in Pakistan (Council of Social Sciences, Islamabad, 2002), p. 20.
2 Ibid., p. 28.
Conclusions

Rubina Saigol

Viewed against the backdrop of what has been discussed so far, the study of the development in social sciences in Pakistan yields disappointing results. In spite of a phenomenal increase in the actual number of departments and teachers, the quality of academic output has been mainly from low to average. Pervez Tahir reports that since Independence there has been a significant increase in the number of departments of social sciences, from 39 to 149, a more than threefold rise. Similarly, there has been a phenomenal rise in the number of teachers of social sciences from 210 in 1963 to 1168 in 2001 representing a fivefold increase. However, this quantitative increase has not translated into a vibrant academic environment reverberating with debate and development of new ideas and theories.

History, Philosophy and Political Science all important subjects for an understanding of state, society, culture and institutions, have seen a fall, and in their place, there has been a rise in business and administrative education. This change appears to be in keeping with the rise of neo-liberal thinking and increasing state authoritarianism and control, even as the state withdraws from the provision of basic needs. The encouragement of business, private enterprise and management tends to underscore the importance of management sciences, business and administrative education at the expense of critical social sciences that engender thoughtfulness and a tendency toward reflection.
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

The pressure towards employment-oriented education, as noted by Pervez Tahir, indicates the growing relationship between education and the market along with the commodification of knowledge.

The fact that centrally important subjects like History and Philosophy do not lead to gainful employment signals a deeper malaise. Governments and the private sector are unwilling to invest in subjects that would generate social critique or nurture an alternative vision of national identity. ‘National Identity’ seems to have become a monopoly of the State, which uses and abuses History in specific ways to create a narrow and homogenised sense of identity. History as a critical social subject engendering thoughtfulness and alternatives has virtually ceased to exist. As a result the only view of History that is currently available is that its subject matter deals with a dead and useless past. While the subject is one of the most alive and vibrant in neighbouring India where intense debates rage between competing schools of thought, in Pakistan it seems to have atrophied to the point of non-existence. A few lone scholars have become voices in the wilderness. Teachers of Philosophy have become absorbed in other departments such as Education or Sociology with the closing down of the departments of Philosophy. The basic subject that generated new ideas about all aspects of human existence seems to have become redundant in a world dominated by the need to earn a living or make a profit.

Economics appears to be the one subject that has managed to retain its position, perhaps because it is directly connected with the economy, and governments and the private sector require the services of economists in their attempts to control markets and consumers. There is no dearth of technocratic and neo-liberal economists who work as advisors and consultants for the government, international financial institutions and private businesses. Economists who espouse alternative views of the human activity of producing a living, such as those who oppose globalisation, neo-liberalism, privatisation and liberalisation, either end up in the non-government sector or work
Conclusions

independently. As a discipline that is related closely to activities of the market, politics and commerce and industry, Economics has a chance to survive in a context in which other disciplines have fallen prey to socio-political and historical forces.

One of the possible effects of the re-organisation and re-orientation of knowledge in the contemporary context could be that technical knowledge and expertise would lead to job opportunities. The multinationals and other businesses will be able to absorb the technical workforce skilled in Information Technology and management techniques. However, the modern workforce will most likely not be much aware of the rights of workers, the relations of production and exploitation or the hierarchical ordering of society. In other words, a highly efficient, productive and competent workforce will generate wealth for the elite classes and receive a part of it for itself, but it will not be politically or socially educated. Such a workforce is more likely to be passive and quiescent in relation to political and economic authoritarianism.

The current scenario is clearly not conducive for the development of original thinking, new ideas or innovative concepts, except in the area of economic development and that too within a particular paradigm. With little monetary reward, large class sizes and a heavy load of work, low level of facilities and virtually no encouragement for teachers or students, it is unlikely that they would generate original theses and stimulating ideas. Where the environment encourages the idea of a quick degree with minimum exertion to lead to a job, the curiosity and desire needed to do thorough research for its own sake or for the pleasure of producing new knowledge, is hardly expected to emerge. For the great number of university teachers, teaching is merely a job and research simply the means to fulfil the requirement for promotion. The publication of surveys and descriptive research in relatively unknown journals enables the faculty to meet the requirements. There are, of course, significant exceptions where individual professors have produced quality work that is internationally recognised, but they remain the odd
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

exception. They manage to produce thoughtful research mostly in spite of their departments, not because of them.

Their loneliness can be gauged from the fact that most of them feel isolated. In the absence of a community of researchers to read and provide feedback, and to engage in debate, their work usually just gets lost in a vacuum. Only a few committed and avid readers are familiar with their work and it never becomes part of a debate. Such scholars are occasionally tempted to publish their work in other countries where it is likely to be more read than in Pakistan. As a result their work is lost to the people in the country. The absence of good quality regular journals through which scholars generally engage in debates and become familiar with the work in their fields, is another factor that discourages the generation of ideas. While there are some significant exceptions, for example, the journal Pakistan Perspectives brought out by the Pakistan Studies Centre of Karachi University, which is struggling to maintain a good standard, most journals reflect a very low standard. The papers in most journals are at a descriptive level or repeat theories developed in Western countries, and are more often than not based on secondary sources. There is very little research that is based on primary data coupled with sophisticated conceptual analysis.

Another factor that contributes to isolation and the absence of a community of the discipline is that there are very few conferences, seminars or symposia of an international quality. At best the departments hold their own small seminars, but seldom do the faculty or students get an opportunity to interact with faculty and students of other departments, let alone those in the South Asian region or the wider world. The lack of interaction with others in the field creates a narrow mind-set and inwardness. There is no one to comment upon one’s ideas or perspectives. As a consequence, very little cross-fertilisation or interdisciplinary work takes place. Students and teachers seldom interact with colleagues even in their own discipline (or department), the notion of interacting with those in other
Conclusions

departments or disciplines does not seem to exist. This can create narrow and bounded identities that become deeply and defensively tied to a narrow version of a discipline. Increased compartmentalisation results from a fear of boundary crossing and dilution from outside.

The trend towards multidisciplinary work has been introduced to most faculty members as an idea, but the manner in which it is understood is a ‘sprinkling of a bit of everything’. The prevalent notion of interdisciplinary methods appears to be based on an ‘add-on’ approach. Most researchers, though not all, seem to think that multidisciplinary means simply adding on material from another discipline or providing some perspective from another subject. Instead of a genuine cross-fertilisation and cross-germination of ideas and concepts, one finds theses and papers such as ‘the political, economic, social and cultural causes of crime’. In most such papers, each of the causes is discussed in a separate section or paragraph without mentioning the interrelationship of the social, economic and political. This kind of thinking obviates the development of the notion that any phenomenon, aspect or feature of society can simultaneously be political, social, economic and cultural, and that these are not necessarily distinct aspects of the phenomenon being studied. What often passes for interdisciplinary work is in fact a collection of causes, results and features rather than truly interdisciplinary analysis. One reason for this failure to cross boundaries in research might simply be the lack of familiarity with other disciplines and the developments in them because of the dearth of journals and conferences where work is shared. However, the fear of dilution leading to ‘impurity’ also underlies the failure to dissolve hardened borders as professional identities are bounded in the discipline.

It is important, therefore, to dissolve the dichotomy of core versus multidisciplinary departments/disciplines. In contemporary times, there is no such thing as a pure core discipline in the social sciences. Disciplines like Education and Women’s Studies openly declare themselves to be
multidisciplinary. Even those disciplines that do not openly regard themselves as multidisciplinary, such as History or Sociology, draw heavily and constantly upon other disciplines and are in fact interdisciplinary to the core. Their serious practitioners do recognise and even uphold this relationship with other disciplines.

Another binary that also needs to be dissolved is the false division between employment-oriented versus ‘purely academic’ subjects. This phenomenon has resulted from factors in economic and political structures, in particular the growing dominance of the market. However, social scientists need to underline the importance of their disciplines in a manner that leads to greater investment in them by governments as well as private and non-government sectors. The centrality of these disciplines for social, moral and economic development of society needs to be underscored so that they are not allowed to disappear from the knowledge system. The idea is not to highlight their importance in enabling the manipulation of the population by governments and the private sector (the social sciences do lend themselves to manipulation for nefarious purposes, as do the ‘hard’ sciences), but to stress the importance of the understanding of the social and moral universe in the creation of a more just and humane world. This would be an investment in strengthening the values associated with democracy, human rights, pluralism, peace, equality, justice, diversity, freedom and humanitarianism. The investment in the disciplines of History, Philosophy, Literature, Sociology, Anthropology or Political Science would generate employment for those who pursue these subjects and provide dividends to society in the form of enhanced efforts to create a just world. Such an investment would be a counter balancing force vis-a-vis the encroaching and intrusive market based principally on profit making. It must be remembered that a good piece of research need not be either pure or applied — it can be both if it is sophisticated and elegant in its approach.
Conclusions

The overwhelming ideological orientation of teachers across the disciplinary spectrum revolves around religious and nationalist thinking. Most departments have courses in the Ideology of Pakistan and some form of religious teaching. These subjects are usually taught uncritically and from a single dominant viewpoint. Competing or alternative viewpoints on the subject are not entertained and there is seldom any debate over issues such as what is the Ideology of Pakistan, who expounds it and why. Even the suggestion that there may be competing versions of ideology, or alternative views about religion (say between the different sects and classes of people), arouses hostility and defensiveness. So deeply rooted are the teachers and students in the hegemonic versions of state and society that even the social sciences, which are tasked to produce alternative visions, fail to do so. As a result one finds hardly any exponents of other schools of thought — say Marxist, socialist, feminist, subaltern or post-modernist. Very few faculty members are aware of other schools of thought so that there is seldom any ideological debate that could potentially generate new ideas. The number of professors who have propounded new theories, analyses or ways of understanding can be counted on one’s fingertips. The absence of debate and controversy, discussion and contention, makes most of the universities very dull and insipid places where received knowledge from old books is transmitted from generation to generation in the same unchanging way. To some extent, the problem is also a consequence of a lack of basic research facilities, in particular in the public sector institutions.

With the exception of a few departments in some universities, such as the Quaid-i-Azam University in Islamabad and Karachi University, the level of facilities in the social disciplines is extremely low. The libraries are dilapidated, uncomfortable and located in areas where there is little light or air. The books are usually old, dusty and decaying with few, if any, new and latest books on the subjects. Most departments can afford only a few international journals of repute, while their own journals can hardly make a claim to being journals, resembling magazine or newspaper articles more than scholarly journals. A number of the
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

departments of social sciences do not have adequate computer and internet facilities. A few computers may be available for hundreds of students and faculty. Even the faculty members do not have constant access to computers and the internet. As a result, students and teachers do not have the means to access the enormous amount of material and new ideas that can be reached through the internet, and they cannot make easy contact with students and professors in their field in other countries and the region. The absence of modern research facilities and equipment, such as multi-media and e-mail, leads to apathy, indifference, lack of interest and boredom with teaching old materials and using outdated books year after year.

In some departments the student teacher ratio is such that teachers barely have enough time to check assignments or manage the classroom, let alone teach or do creative work. In some cases, there were a hundred students per class and it is not hard to see that it would be impossible to either do creative teaching or research in a classroom that the teacher can barely manage, let alone know each student individually. Overburdened and underpaid teachers have little time for research or reflection and report that they can barely get through their daily chores and deal with the workload. This means that many more teachers need to be hired in the social science departments and the criteria for student entry need to be made more stringent so that only serious students are allowed to pursue their studies. Those who join classes merely to waste time, create problems or engage in violence, and do not plan to pursue any serious study, need to be recognised at the screening stage. While merit cannot be made the sole criterion of admission, as it is unevenly distributed in the population and tends to favour those who have the wherewithal to pay for private education, student seriousness can be gauged by discerning faculty during interviews.

The absence of modern facilities and access, coupled with a high student to teacher ratio, seriously affects the kind and level of research that is possible. However, apart from the low facilities and high workload, training in research methods is outdated and
inadequate. Although nearly all the social science departments have courses in research methods, they teach outdated ideas and theories of what constitutes good research. The students are seldom familiarised with new, innovative and exciting research techniques. One of the biggest surprises was the finding that the great majority of students do not even seem to know what basic research is, for example, many students did not know what is a research question, how does one ask a research question, from which sources to draw a research question, how to collect data based on the question, how to interpret the data or to connect it with some theoretical or analytical framework to reach conclusions. Despite courses in research methods, most students seemed unaware of the simple concept of drawing hypotheses from a theory and testing it by collecting data and analysing it. The great majority of them seem to rely on surveys, questionnaires, calculation of percentages and/or describing the views of some great historical thinker or scholar, for example, Ahmad Shah Barelvi.

While traditional research methods are taught, though seldom used creatively by students, new research techniques and methods are not even taught in most departments. For example, deconstruction and reading the sub-text, methods that have become common due to developments in literary theory and cultural studies, are seldom ever used. Even participant observation, an established method in Anthropology, is not often used except within Anthropology. Similarly, ethnographic studies are not carried out as often as they could, especially in Sociology. In historical research, archives are seldom accessed and secondary sources are used to obtain a degree in Master of Arts.

Quick statistical analyses by using the Analysis of Variance, Chi Square or Regression and correlation, reflect an easy way out but render the conclusions mechanical and lacking in qualitative detail. Statistical techniques encourage the tendency to generalise rather than observe the uniqueness of each case. The statistical studies often have small sample sizes and the samples
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

are not collected in any systematic way, that is, either as random samples or representative ones, so that the conclusions are not of much worth. Even case study methods or using stories, the oral tradition and tales are seldom used for research. There is little evidence of longitudinal research, which requires patience as well as funding as it covers a longer time period than most researchers are prepared to invest. Similarly, cross-cultural, cross-regional or comparative studies constitute a very small number of the total research studies carried out. The main reasons for this lack of interest in using or devising creative methods are: one, students are not taught or well-versed in the methodology, and two, the hurry to get a degree and find a job encourages intellectual laziness. There seems to be distinct lack of interest in studying the systems of other countries or cultures, mainly due to lack of access to information, the internet and travelling. Meagre funding for research activities seems to be the major impediment for doing thoughtful and analytical research that requires time, resources, interest and training.

Most students of social sciences do not find jobs easily. Some are absorbed back into the university system as teachers or research assistants. The non-government sector employs social science students mainly at the middle or lower levels to collect data and tabulate it. A few find lower level jobs in the private sector such as banks, companies or institutes. Those with better marks apply for the CSS examination hoping to enter the civil services. Many remain unemployed mainly because the government does not invest significantly in the social development sectors where they could be absorbed as researchers, advisors or assistants. At the higher government levels, and at higher positions in the donor, non-government and private sectors, foreign qualified people are preferred for policy input based on research. Foreign qualified social scientists receive substantial salaries and perks as consultants and experts in social development fields. Locally qualified social scientists, even if they have greater insight and intelligence or first hand knowledge of the local situation, fail to compete with foreign qualified individuals owing to the lack of respect for the degrees
Conclusions

awarded by Pakistani universities. The digital and the knowledge divide hence reproduces class power at all levels.

While female enrolment has substantially increased since Independence, and the rate of success of women in the social sciences is high, lack of mobility and traditional views prevent women from diversifying the areas in which they work. A large number of women go into teaching or join women’s organisations, as working in an office is still not considered respectable among lower middle class urban families. Empirical work involving data collection is hard for women due to lesser mobility and parental discomfort with going into remote areas, hence research is not a field preferred by a large number of women from the urban middle classes. Teaching, which involves working with children in a heavily female-dominated environment at the primary or middle levels, is considered the most respectable profession for a significant number of women, especially those who come from smaller cities or rural backgrounds.

The rural/urban divide in terms of access to education and jobs is still fairly wide. Although a large number of the students at universities come from rural backgrounds, they are severely underrepresented in jobs and professions since their language and other skills reflect an even lower level than students from urban or peri-urban areas. Class, gender and rural/urban divides are as much reflected in how social knowledge is used and distributed as in any other area of Pakistani society.

A number of non-government organisations are engaged in social sciences research. However, most of this research is policy-oriented and limited to the mandate given by the donors. While a certain level of intellectual freedom is allowed, donors generally do not support research they consider academic, theoretical or political. There are two reasons why this happens: one, donors are typically interested in quick results and immediate relevance to pressing problems, and two, governments of donor countries have a fear of alternative
knowledge systems that can potentially challenge their favourite paradigms and create counter consciousness. Policy-oriented, problem-solving research is often sterile and tends towards the mechanical and the simplistic. Donors usually want answers to problems so that they can then devise tailor-made kinds of mechanical solutions to problems that are often infinitely more complex than donors imagine them to be. However, donor funding that comes from international NGOs and not governments of powerful countries, is often more amenable to complexity and nuance. This kind of research is often a genuine contribution to knowledge, albeit in a small way.

However, NGOs are ultimately tied to the priorities and goals of the donors and the research questions come to be framed in ways that donors require. The research questions do not necessarily arise from the unique local situation or some theory, but from donor priorities. As a result a large number of people concerned with the non-government sector end up doing research on faddish issues such as sustainable development, environmental degradation, good governance, gender integration, human rights, civil society, devolution and global governance. The argument here is not that these issues are not important; the point, instead, is that the subject matter is usually not approached critically and the researcher may not have a genuine or deep-rooted interest in these issues. In fact if a critical piece of work is presented, donors do not hesitate to reject it. On the other hand, a researcher who may be extremely interested in research of a historical or philosophical nature finds that s/he has no financial support. The latter subjects are simply not conducive for quick fixes and the problem-solving ideology. Although a few donor-driven research organisations do conduct research of some quality, a large number of NGOs produce an enormous amount of material that is based on surveys, percentages and the quick information methods such as rapid rural appraisal or participatory rural appraisal (PRA). Needless to say, these methods yield superficial information and not necessarily understanding or knowledge. The very ideology of speed and quickness discourages the detailed, thorough and painstaking work required to produce
good analytical research. However, since the NGOs are concerned with the notion of quick and cheap problem solving, they cannot be expected to produce research of high quality and international standards. They are usually required merely to report.

Nevertheless, the multiple sites of the production and dissemination of knowledge and information ensure that knowledge will not remain entirely homogenetic. On a small scale, alternative forms of knowledge are created by individuals committed to a cause. For example critical and thoughtful pieces of work on globalisation have emerged from various sources working on the issue from the point of view of farmers, workers or women. Their views diverge from those of powerful donors they nonetheless produce the knowledge and keep the debate alive. There is a need greater links between such individuals and NGOs on the one hand, and universities on the other so that there can be a sharing of knowledge and students can be familiarised with good research, based on issues that are vital and research that is intellectually challenging.

In conclusion it can be said that while there are many universities and institutes, teachers and students, degrees and courses, journals and conferences, the level of teaching and research in social sciences in Pakistan leaves much to be desired. The teachers, students, degrees, journals and papers do not come up to international standards for various reasons including authoritarian structures, dearth of facilities, overburdening of teachers, meagre resources, poverty and the urgent need for jobs, lack of encouragement by the state, and a private sector that does not invite innovative, critical thought.

Another reason that has affected research and writing globally is the dominance of the image over the word, and the desire to watch TV rather than read. Although many of these limitations characterise neighbouring India, it nevertheless produces scholars of international reputation and new ideas and theories abound in the subjects of History, Literature, Women’s Studies,
Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile

Education, Sociology, Cultural Studies and so on. Pakistan lacks a scholarly tradition, and state interference in universities has stifled the growth of independent inquiry. The right to dissent has been taken away through a number of publication ordinances, and libel and defamation laws that curtail not only press freedom, all freedom of thought and action is diminished.

The state of Pakistan needs to inject massive funds into public sector universities stopping interference and strangulation of thought. Only then can teachers of quality be hired and retained and modern facilities provided for research and teaching. Stringent standards of academic work need to be created so that only committed and serious students can be induced to join the universities. The Higher Education Commission needs to give high priority to the social sciences and offer competitive salaries so that private sector institutions such as LUMS do not absorb all the quality minds. Students who cannot afford the LUMS fee structure and are bright, committed and serious must get competitive opportunities at public sector institutions. The emphasis on social sciences and humanities needs to be balanced along with science, technology, IT and management so that all the resources are not diverted to the latter subjects under a narrow vision of technical economic development. Only a serious commitment by the state to divert resources from defence and non-development expenditure, into education can ultimately solve the problem of a good higher education in the social sciences disciplines and humanities.
Contributors

Anwar Shaheen is an Assistant Professor at the Pakistan Study Centre, University of Karachi. She did MA and MPhil degrees in Pakistan Studies and an MA in Gender and Development from the University of Sussex. She has worked for the Women Studies Centre, University of Karachi, Allama Iqbal Open University and in many NGOs. Her special areas of interest have been gender, culture and social impact of development.

Ayesha Siddiq (Dr.) did her PhD in War Studies from King's College, London. She is the author of Pakistan’s Arms Procurement and Military Build-up, 1979-99 in Search of a Policy (Palgrave Press, 2001). She writes columns in Friday Times regularly and has contributed various articles in international journals as well. She is currently a fellow at the Woodrow Wilson International Centre for Scholars in Washington DC.

Farhan H. Siddiqi is lecturer, Department of International Relations, University of Karachi and Coordinator, Programme in Peace Studies and Conflict Resolution. Presently, he is doing his PhD in Government and Politics at the London School of Economics and Political Science.

Inayatullah (Dr.) is PhD in Political Science. He has worked with a number of international and national research organisations including United Nations Research Institute for Social Development (UNRISD), Geneva, and UNDP supported Asian Pacific Development Centre (APDC), Kuala Lumpur. He was associated with Department of International Relations, Quaid-i-Azam University from 1971 to 1973. Currently, he is preparing several studies on the development of social sciences in Pakistan under the auspices of Council of Social Sciences, Islamabad.

Kamran Ahmad (Dr.) received his education and training in Clinical Psychology in USA. For five years he served as adjunct faculty at
Quaid-i-Azam University. He has worked on psychological issues in over 20 countries around the world and is presently working with the UN, heading the Staff Counselling unit for the World Food Programme, in Rome.

**Karamat Ali (Dr.)** holds PhD from Vanderbilt University, USA. He is a Meritorious Professor of Economics and is currently (2005) the Vice-Chancellor of Bahauddin Zakariya University. He has published thirty-five research papers and edited two books one of which is *Pakistan: Political Economy of Rural Development*, published by Vanguards, Lahore.

**Mohammad Ashraf Adeel (Dr.)** is Professor of Philosophy at University of Peshawar and President of Pakistan Philosophical Congress (2005). He did his PhD at University of Hawaii in epistemology of science and language. His subsequent research includes analysis of epistemological issues in education, culture and religion. He was an Academic Visitor at the Sub-Faculty of Philosophy at Oxford University, also worked as Director Institute of Education and Research at Peshawar University, and was the founding Vice Chancellor of Hazara University as well.

**Mehdi Hasan (Dr.)** is PhD in Journalism. Presently (2005), he is the Dean of School of Media and Communication, Beacon House National University, Lahore. He served as a professor at the Department of Mass Communication in Punjab University, Lahore from 1967 to 1997, where he supervised more than four hundred research reports and Master degree theses. He has published a number of books in English and Urdu. They include *Working of Mass Media in Pakistan, Politics in Pakistan, History of Pakistan, Mass Communication Theories, Psychological Warfare and Public Relations*. Most of these books are textbooks at several universities of Pakistan.

**Moonis Ahmar (Dr.)** is Professor at Department of International Relations, University of Karachi, and Director, Programme on Peace Studies and Conflict Resolution. He specialises in the areas of conflict resolution and confidence-building measures with reference to Central Asia, South Asia and Middle East. He has written two books, four monographs. He edited eight books as well. His current research project is on, “A Study of the Afghan Conflicts: 1988-2004” sponsored by the Higher Education Commission, Islamabad.
Muhammad Hafeez (Dr.) is a Professor of Sociology at University of the Punjab, Lahore. He did his PhD from the Australian National University, Canberra. He is an MA from University of Saskatchewan, Canada. His research interests include sociology of development, population, health, and social change.

Muhammad Islam (Dr.) is Acting Director/Associate Professor at the Area Study Centre for Africa, North and South America, Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad. He has served at the Centre in different positions since 1986. He holds PhD in Political Science from Louisiana State University, USA, MPhil in US Studies and MSc in International Relations from Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad. He has published several articles in different research journals and has contributed chapters in several books. His areas of interest include American Foreign Policy and Politics of Central Asia, Afghanistan and Pakistan.

Muhammad Pervez (Dr.) is Professor at National Institute of Psychology, Centre of Excellence at Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad and is currently (2005) its Director. He started his academic career as a lecturer at Government College, Lahore and later shifted to the present Institute. Dr. Pervez’s primary academic interest is, intellectual development of children. His interest took him into the area of education of young children in Pakistani schools. He has been engaged in a variety of research projects focussing on children and their education.

Nadeem Omar Tarar is Assistant Professor, Department of Academics, National College of Arts (NCA), Lahore. He is an MA in Anthropology and MA in Critical Theory and Cultural Studies. He has initiated and supervised NCA Archives and is in charge, Research and Publication Centre, NCA. He has researched and published a book on the early history of the National College of Arts, titled Official Chronicle of the Mayo School of Arts: The Formative Years under Lockwood Kipling (1875-1894). He is currently pursuing his doctoral
research on the genealogical art and craft instruction in Pakistan, which is part of his research interest in the history of Orientalism in India.

Nasira Jabeen (Dr.) is a Professor at the Institute of Administrative Sciences in Punjab University, Lahore and has a PhD from the University of Stirling, UK. She teaches Public Administration and Management courses and is active in research and consultancy services in gender issues.

Pervez Tahir (Dr.) is a PhD in Economics and MPhil in Economics and Politics of Development from the University of Cambridge. Currently (2005) he is the Chief Economist of Planning Commission. Cambridge University awarded him the Joan Robinson Memorial Lectureship in 1990. He has published a number of books including, *Economic and Social Thinking of the Quaid-i-Azam* and also contributed chapters to several books.

Rasul Bakhsh Rais (Dr.) is PhD in Political Science from the University of California Santa Barbara and presently (2005), a Professor of Political Science and Head of the Department of Social Sciences, Lahore University of Management Sciences (LUMS). Before joining LUMS, he served as Professor/Director, Area Study Centre Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad. He is author of *War Without Winners: Afghanistan’s Uncertain Transition after the Cold War* (OUP, 1996), *Indian Ocean and the Superpowers: Economic, Political and Strategic Perspectives* (Croom Helm, 1986), and editor of *State, Society and Democratic Change in Pakistan* (OUP, 1997).

Rubina Saigol (Dr.) is an educationist by training who has conducted research on issues of education, gender, human rights and state and nationalism. She has also conducted teacher training in human rights and gender development in all the four provinces of Pakistan. She has published books, articles and papers on education, gender and human rights. Her work has been published in Pakistan and abroad. Some of her publications include *Knowledge and Identity, Symbolic Violence, Qaumiat, Taleem Aur Shanakht, Insaani Huqooq Ki Tehreek, Aurat Aur Mazahmat, Engendering the Nation-State* (co-edited) and *Locating the Self* (co-edited). Currently (2005), she is the Country Director of ActionAid in Pakistan.

Syed Jaffar Ahmed (Dr.) is Professor at Pakistan Study Centre, University of Karachi, where he teaches courses in modern history and
the Government and Politics in Pakistan. Apart from two books on the constitutional issues of Pakistan, he has written a number of articles in research journals and anthologies. Besides his teaching responsibilities, he is associated with various civil society organisations, and contributes, particularly, to their research and education programmes.

Tariq Rahman (Dr.) is a national distinguished Professor and Director of the Chair on Quaid-i-Azam and Freedom Movement at the National Institute of Pakistan Studies, Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad. He is presently serving at the government funded research chair at U.C. Berkeley, CA. He has been a Fulbright Scholar and a guest speaker in several American universities and a Guest Professor at the University of Aarhus in Denmark. Dr. Rahman has published about 80 research papers and nine books. One of his books, Language and Politics in Pakistan (1996) has been given two awards by Government of Pakistan.

Zafar Iqbal Jadoon (Dr.) is currently serving as the Director of the Institute of Administrative Sciences and of the Human Resource Development Centre at Punjab University, Lahore. Dr. Jadoon has an MPA degree and a PhD from the University of Southern California, USA. He has taught Management courses at universities in the US, UK and Pakistan.
## Index

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>A</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Academic Staff Association, 111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ActionAid Pakistan, 231, 488</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adeel, Mohammad Ashraf, 129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Afghani, Jamal-ud-Din, 134, 143</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aflab, Tahira, 365</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aftab, Mohammad Ashraf, 129</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Afzal, M. Rafique, 38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aga Khan Foundation, 446, 456</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aga Khan Rural Support Programme (AKRSP), 204, 231, 447</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aga Khan University, Karachi, 112, 420</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ahmad, Durre S., 50, 375, 385</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ahmad, Ghafoor, 50, 322</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ahmad, Kamran, 153, 485</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ahmad, Khurshid, 339, 401</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ahmad, Manzoor, 139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ahmad, Munee, 262</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ahmad, Rais, 301, 302</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ahmad, Riaz, 302</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ahmad, Sakhir, 229, 235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ahmad, Waheed, 339</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ahmar, Moonis, 29, 30, 387, 401, 402, 486</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ahmed, Akbar S., 38, 234</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ahmed, Feroz, 319, 340</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ahmed, Manzooruddin, 37, 50, 51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ahmed, Munir, 50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ahmed, Naveed, 401</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ahmed, Syed Jafar, 51, 305, 488</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ahsan, Aitzaz, 50, 214</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Akbar (Mughal emperor), 241, 242, 254, 329</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Akhtar, Raja Naseem, 416, 426</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Akhtar, Saleem, 423</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alavi, Hamza, 38, 228</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Al-Farabi, 134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Al-Ghazzali, 134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ali, Amir, 140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ali, Imran, 303</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ali, Karamat, 177, 194, 196, 241, 458, 486</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ali, Mubarak, 38, 113, 237, 254, 487</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ali, Shaheen Sardar, 363</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Allama Iqbal Open University (AIUO), Islamabad, 127, 182, 184, 201, 202, 231, 250, 258, 280, 337, 340, 341, 356, 357, 360, 362, 364, 365, 368, 370, 413, 485</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Allama, Ghulam Ali, 424</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alqama, Khawaja Syed, 50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>American and African studies, 313</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>American and British textbooks, 11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>American and British universities, 14, 16, 19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>American Foreign Policy, 302, 487</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>American universities, 10, 13, 14, 55, 489</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amin, Tahir, 29, 37, 51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anjad, Rashid, 194, 195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amnesty International (AI), 397</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anglo-American perspective, 12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anjuman-barai-Taleem, 92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ansari, Sarfaraz Hussain, 339</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aristotle, 136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian Development Bank, 364</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASR Resource Centre, 374</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Association of Commonwealth universities, 361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Associations of International Studies, 11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Atal, Yogesh, 234</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Attiq-ur-Rehman, Shaheen, 214</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aurangzeb, 241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aurat Foundation, 379, 434, 456, 457</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Awaz Foundation, 435, 457</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Azad, Abul Kalam, 49, 139, 140, 256, 258, 414, 423</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Azad, Muhammad Hussain, 139</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aziz, K. K., 38</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
COSS Bulletin, 150, 518

Curriculum Wing of the Ministry of Education, 243

D

Dacca University, 201
Dani, Ahmad Hasan, 225, 227, 234
Deconstructionist movement, 136
Department for International Development (DFID), 127, 367
Department of Defence and Diplomatic Studies, 62, 63
Department of Management and Business, 359

Discipline of:

International Relations
Course Content, 22
Department(s) of International Relations, 15, 16, 20, 49, 62, 391, 398, 401, 485, 486
in Pakistani universities, 12, 13
Indigenisation, 12
International Relations, 2, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 18, 19, 20, 22, 23, 24, 25, 26, 27, 29, 30, 48, 49, 50, 62, 66, 113, 251, 253, 267, 273, 274, 359, 388, 389, 390, 391, 392, 393, 398, 400, 401, 430, 464, 485, 486, 487
International Studies at Jawaharlal Nehru University, 27
Islamic theory of International Relations, 20
Major Challenges, 25
Mechanism of Transfer of Western Thought, 10
Pakistan Institute of International Affairs, 14, 15
programmes, 24
State of Indigenous Scholarship, 13
Study and Teaching of International Relations, 9, 15, 29, 401

Political Science
All Pakistan Political Science Association (APPSA), 41, 42, 46, 51
Articles in Professional Journals, 41
Conference of Pakistan Political Science Association, 45
Curriculum of Political Science, 35
Department of Political Science and International Affairs, 16, 41, 48, 49
Development of the Discipline of Political Science in Pakistan, 31
Evaluation of Qualitative Development of Political Science, 42
Growth of Departments, 32
Number of Teachers and their Qualifications, 33
Pakistan Political Science Association (PPSA), 41, 42, 45, 46, 51
Pakistan Political Science Review, 41
Pakistani political scientists, 36, 41, 43, 44
PhD and MPhil Theses, 39
Political Science Association, 41, 42, 44, 45, 46, 51
Political Science in Pakistan, 31, 32, 41, 42, 43, 44, 46, 47, 51
Political Science in Pakistani universities, 42
Political Science tradition, 42
Teaching Methods, 36

Defence and Strategic Studies
Defence & Strategic Studies (DSS) 13, 14, 16, 24, 26, 28, 49, 50, 53, 54, 55, 57, 59, 60, 61, 62, 65, 66, 67, 68, 71, 72, 73, 75, 251, 267, 359, 391, 392, 394, 464
Department of Defence and Diplomatic Studies, 62, 63
Department of Strategic Studies and Defence, 75, 359
Development of Strategic Studies, 53, 54
Discourse in Strategic Studies, 58
Military Educational Institutions, 66
Military sociology, 63
Research by Foreigners on Pakistan, 72
Visitors in Foreign Countries, 71
Research in Strategic Studies, 67
Strategic Plans Division (SPD), 66
Strategic Studies in Civilian Academic Institutions, 62

Education
Absence of a Community of Researchers, 105
Ali Institute of Education (AIE), 95, 100, 103, 108
Cross-fertilisation, 111
Donor-NGO Sector in Education, 89
Educational Discourse in Pakistan, 77, 80, 127, 385
Educational Psychology and Child Development, 117
Educational Reform, 84, 96, 126
Educationists in Pakistan, 85
Faculty and Students, 119
Historical Development of the Discipline, 77
Ideological Orientation, 115
Madrassah education, 104
Multi-disciplinary Nature of the Subject, 79
National Educational Policy of 1972-1980, 286
Overall Quantitative Development of Discipline of Education in Public Universities, 92
Pakistan Education Foundation, 88
PhD and MPhil Theses, 93
Public Orientation, 113
Sindh Education Foundation, 86, 125
Society for the Advancement of Higher Education (SAHE), 91, 92, 120, 127
Philosophy
Annual Meeting of Pakistan Philosophical Congress, 131
Continuation of the Islamic Tradition of Philosophy, 133
Courses, 131
Development of Philosophy as a Discipline, 129
Greek Philosophy, 135
Intellectual and Cultural Issues of Pakistan, 137
Islamic and Western traditions of Philosophy, 131
Islamic Philosophy, 131, 134
Islamic tradition of philosophy, 148
Modernism, 143
Muslim Philosophy, 48, 133, 151
Neo-Revivalism, 142
Pakistan Philosophical Congress (PPC), 130, 131, 137, 148, 150, 164, 486
Pakistan Philosophical Journal, 137
Philosophical Thought in Religion, 142
Philosophical Thought in Urdu Literature, 139
Philosophy department, 131, 132, 133, 135, 149, 150
Philosophy of Art, 136
Philosophy of science, 136
Politics and Philosophical Approaches, 147
Semantic Reconstructionism, 145
Theses, 131
Traditionalism, 146
Western Philosophy, 133, 135, 136

Psychology
Applied Psychology, 169, 174, 175
Clinical Psychology, 154, 157, 160, 162, 163, 169, 174, 485
Curricula of Psychology, 169
Department(s) of Psychology, 157, 158, 160, 172, 174, 175
Experimental Psychology, 163
Hindu Psychology, 154
Institute of Clinical Psychology, Karachi, 157, 160, 162, 169
Jobs in Psychology, 163
Libraries and Laboratories of Psychology, 159
National Institute of Psychology, 154, 157, 159, 160, 164, 173, 174, 175, 487
Pakistan Psychological Association, 155, 165
Pakistani psychologists, 155, 161, 171
PhD and MPhil Theses, 172
Postgraduate Students, 158
Problems and Prospects, 166
Professional Organisations, 164
Publication of Research, 170
Quantitative Development, 168
Research in Psychology, 160
Research Topics, 161
Social Psychology, 162, 170
State of the Discipline of Psychology in Public Universities in Pakistan, 7, 155

Economics
Applied Economic Research Centre of University of Karachi, 185
Applied Socioeconomic Research (ASR), 91, 127, 374, 375, 384, 385, 433, 449, 457

495
Causes of Underdevelopment of the discipline of Economics in Pakistan, 193
Curriculum and Teaching, 188
Department(s) of Economics, 40, 65, 187, 189, 359
Development of Economics, 177, 196, 197
Development of Professional Associations, 190
Economics Department of Karachi University, 189
Journals, 186
Lahore Journal of Economics, 187
London School of Economics, 201, 485
Macro Economics, 189
Pakistan Economic and Social Review, 187
Pakistan Economic and Social Review, 187
Pakistan Economic Association, 187, 190
Pakistan Journal of Applied Economics, 187
Pakistan Society of Development Economists, 191
PhD and MPhil Theses, 184
Qualitative Development, 191
Quantitative Development, 178
Research Output, 183
Student Teacher Ratio, 179
Text Books, 190

Sociology
Department(s) of Sociology, 199, 201, 202, 203, 206, 207, 211, 212, 214, 215, 218, 360
Growth of Sociology in Pakistan, 202
Macro-environment and Sociology, 209
Pakistan Sociological Association, 214, 219
Roots of Sociology, 200
Rural Sociology, 206, 208, 276
Sociological Association, 214, 219, 226

Sociology and economic development, 213
Sociology in Pakistan: A Review of Progress, 199
Syllabi, 208
Usefulness of Sociology, 212

Anthropology
at Quaid-i-Azam University, 224
Department(s) of Anthropology, 221, 224, 225, 226, 229, 230, 231, 232, 234, 235, 359
Development of Anthropology in Pakistan, 226
in Pakistan, 221, 224, 226
Western Anthropology, 221

History
Department of History, 250
General History, 239, 250
History of Pakistan, 239, 245, 247, 326, 328, 398
History Teaching at the School Level, 243
Indian History, 243, 247
Institute for Central Asian History, 248
Islamic history, 200
Muslim History, 239, 240, 241, 250
Pakistan Historical Society, 246
PhD and MPhil Theses, 251
Professional Societies, 246
Research Institutes, 247
Research Society of Pakistan, 247
Research Society of Punjab University, 254
Research, 244
South Asian history, 247, 249
State Ideology and History, 238
Teaching of History, 239

Public Administration
Administrative Science Association (ASA), 264
American Public Administration, 255, 256
Curriculum Revision Committee, 259
Department of Management and Business, 359
Departments/Institutes, 259
Future of Public Administration as an Academic Discipline, 264
Institute of Administrative Sciences, University of the Punjab, 256, 259, 263, 264, 488, 489
Institute of Public and Business Administration, 255
Master of Human Resource Management, 260
Master of Public Administration (MPA), 255, 257, 258, 259, 260, 261, 262, 264, 489
New Developments, 259
Other Aspects of the Discipline, 263
PhD and MPhil Theses, 266
Public Administration Programmes, 258
Public Administration/ Administrative Science, 49, 50, 251, 256, 259, 263, 264, 265, 266, 269, 488, 489
Public Administration/Business Administration, 19, 45, 49, 50, 251, 255, 256, 257, 258, 259, 260, 261, 262, 263, 264, 265, 266, 267, 269, 464
Punjab College of Business Administration (PCBA), 203
Research, 262
Syllabi and Courses, 260

Mass Communication
Curriculum, 273
Department(s) of Mass Communication, 272, 273, 275, 276, 277, 281, 486
Development Journalism, 275
Diploma in Development Communication, 275
Dr. Feroze Ahmad Institute of Mass Communication, 280
Employment Opportunities, 271
Evening Course, 275
Institute of Mass Communication, 280
Journalism, 269, 270, 271, 272, 273, 274, 275, 276, 278, 282, 486
Male-Female Student Ratio in the discipline of Mass Communication, 278
MPhil and PhD Courses in Mass Communication, 276
PhD and MPhil Theses, 281
Teachers of Mass Communication and their Qualifications, 277
Urdu Journalism, 274

Area Studies
American Studies in Pakistan, 301
Area Studies — Quantitative and Qualitative Development, 287
Area Studies in Pakistan An Assessment, 285
Area Study Act No. XLV, 286
Area Study Centre:
at Peshawar University, 294, 301
at Quaid-i-Azam University, 288, 291, 294, 296, 301
at the United States, 301
at the University of Karachi, 288, 291, 293, 294, 301, 303
at the University of Peshawar, 288, 289, 291, 294, 301, 303
at University of Balochistan, 302
at University of Sindh, Jamshoro, 291, 292, 302, 303
at University of the Punjab, 291
for Africa, North and South America (ASCANSA), 287
for Europe (ASCE), 286
for Far East and South East Asia (ASC FE&SEA), 286, 301
for Russia and Central Asia (ASCR&CA) at the University of Peshawar, 301
for Russia, China, and Central Asia (ASCRC&CA), 287
for South Asian Studies (ASCAS), at the University of the Punjab, 286, 288, 301
for the Middle East and Arab Countries (ASCME&AC), 286
Pakistan Association of American Studies (PAAS), 296
Rise of Area Study Centres in Pakistan, 286

Pakistan Studies
Act of the Pakistan Study Centres, 334
Bill for the establishment of Pakistan Study Centres, 320
Central Sway over Pakistan Studies Syllabus, 324
Compulsory Pakistan Studies, 326
Historical Development of Pakistan Studies, 314
Institute of Pakistan Studies, 323, 335, 359, 422, 425, 489
Potential of Pakistan Studies, 313
PSC (Jamshoro), 335, 336
Women's Studies
Books and Teaching Materials, 369
Courses and Training Programmes, 358
Degrees Awarded by Women’s Study Centres, 362
Faculty of Women’s Study Centres, 368
Feminist research, 344
Feminist Struggles in Pakistan, 348
Fourth World Conference on Women in Beijing, 375
Funding Sources of Women’s Study Centres, 367
Institutional Arrangements for Gender Integration, 353
Issues for the Future, 379
Journals, 365
Pakistan Association of Women’s Studies, 441
Professional Associations, 365
Research and Publications, 362
State of the Discipline of Women’s Studies in Pakistan, 50, 343
Students, 369
Summary and Reflections on Women’s Studies in the Public Sector, 370
UN Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women, 363
Women Development Studies at the University of Sindh, Jamshoro, 362, 365
World Conference on Women in Nairobi in 1985, 350

Peace and Conflict Resolution Studies
Centre for Policy Research and Analyses (CEPRA), 391
Centre for Research on Conflict Resolution, 389
Emergence of Peace and Conflict Resolution Studies in the West, 389
Institute of Conflict Management, Delhi, 390
International Centre for Peace Initiatives, Mumbai, 390
International Centre for Peace Studies, Delhi, 390
International Institute of Peace and Stability/Conflict Resolution, 398
Pakistan India Forum for Peace and Democracy, 397, 402
Paradigm Shift, 387
Peace and Conflict Resolution, 3, 387, 388, 389, 390, 391, 392, 393, 394, 395, 396, 397, 398, 399, 400, 401
Peace Research in Pakistani Universities, 392
Research on Peace and Conflict Resolution, 392
Role of the State, 395

Linguistics
A Survey of the Contemporary Situation, 403
Anthropological Linguistics, 414
Chomskyan theoretical linguistic tradition, 415
Chomskyan tradition, 411
Contemporary Linguists of Pakistani Origin, 416
Focus on English Language Teaching, 413
Historical Linguistics in the Comparative-Philological Tradition, 407
Languages of Northern Pakistan, 407
Languages of South Asia, 405, 406
Languages of the NWFP, 407
Linguistic Research Group of Pakistan, 410
Linguistics in Pakistani languages, 411
Modern Tradition in Theoretical Linguistics and Socio-linguistics, 410
National Language Authority, 416, 417, 423, 424
Pakistani languages, 142, 337, 404, 406, 411, 418
Professional Associations of Linguists in Pakistan, 417
Psycholinguistics, 414
Sindhi Language Authority, 417, 424, 425
Sindhi orthography, 411
Siraiki language, 409

Contribution of the NGOs to Social Science Research in Pakistan
Aurat Publication and Information Service Foundation, 434, 457
Classification of the NGOs Research, 431
Contribution of the NGOs to Social Science Research in Pakistan, 7, 427
Feminist research methodology, 453
Newsletter Aurat, 434
Newsletter Jahd-e-Haq, 437
Newsletter Khabarnama, 446
Newsletter Resistance, 442
NGO community, 452, 454
NGO movement, 431
NGO networks, 453
NGO sector, 21, 89, 90, 91, 112, 123, 204, 260, 427, 428, 446
NGORC, 92
NGOs in Pakistan, 431, 470
Review of Related Literature, 431
Review of Research Output of the NGOs, 433
Role of the NGOs regarding research, 431

Quantitative Development of Social Sciences
Quantitative Development of Social Sciences, 5, 459, 460

Edhi Trust and Campaign for Nuclear Sanity, 398
Eghlar, Zekiye, 234
Election Commission of Pakistan, 434
English and Urdu literature, 375
English-speaking cultures, 413
Esposito, John L., 150
Establishment Division of the Government of Pakistan, 470

Faculty of Law of the Colombo University, 391
Family Planning Association of Pakistan (FPAP), 204, 435, 457
Fatima Jinnah College for Women, Chuna Mandi, Lahore, 270
Fatima Jinnah Women University (FJWU), Rawalpindi 16, 63, 65, 66, 75, 127, 182, 232, 258, 357, 361, 362, 364, 367, 368
Jamiat-e-Ulema-e-Pakistan, 147
Jamil, Baela, 363
Jetmar Karl, 225, 226, 227, 234
Jinnah, Quaid-i-Azam, 16, 40, 62, 
63, 65, 88, 127, 182, 232, 258, 270, 
274, 280, 312, 317, 328, 339, 357, 
361, 362, 364, 367, 368, 420
Jones, Sir William, 405

K
Kant, 98, 136
Kardar, Shahid, 197
Kargil issue, 61
Karim, Arshad Syed, 50, 51
Kashmir issue, 17, 70
Kashmiri, 408, 423
Kennedy, Charles H., 50
Kent University, 225
Keynes, J. M., 178
Khan, Ayub, 50, 82, 99, 143, 219, 
243, 245, 461
Khan, Hamid, 48, 50
Khan, Nighat Said, 374, 375, 385, 
457
Khan, Omar Asghar, 442, 458
Khan, Rais Ahmad, 301, 302
Khan, Shahrub Khalfi, 91, 113
Khan, Sir Syed Ahmad, 84, 126, 
134, 139
Khattak, Saba Gul, 50, 51, 375, 378, 
385, 386
Khawar, Mumtaz, 50
Khuhro, Hamida, 423
Kumar, Krishna, 80, 114, 126

L
Lahore College for Women University, Lahore, 280
Lahore declaration, 398
Lahore School of Economics (LSE), 
203, 210
Lahore University of Management Sciences (LUMS), 210, 488
Law of Evidence of 1984, 348
Lawrence Ziring, 48
Lawyers for Human Rights and Legal Aid (LHRLA), 367, 437
Legal Framework Order, 386

M
Macaulay, Lord, 79
Madurai Kamaraj University, 390
Mahmood, Safdar, 38
Malik, Ifthikar H., 38, 301, 302
Malinowski, Bronislaw, 223
Management Sciences, 50, 170, 174, 
204, 259
Marsh, Alfred, 178
Marx, 151, 223, 308
Marxism, 86, 117, 132, 140, 147
Marxist theory, 43
Marxist thinkers, 86
Marxist, 43, 78, 83, 85, 86, 103, 
115, 119, 147, 151, 348, 477
Master of Development Management (MDM), 260
Master of Health Administration (MHA), 260
Master of Public Policy and Management (MPPM), 260
Masud, Khawaja, 139, 150
Masud, Muhammad Khalid, 150
Matinuddin, Kamal, 75
Maududi, Syed Abul Ala, 134, 142, 
151, 219
Mazari, Shireen, 57, 75
Meenai, S. A., 194
Mehdi, Sikandar, 30
Mernissi, Fatima, 375, 377, 385
Mian, Zia, 402
Militarisation of society, 396
Militarism and peace, 433
Ministries of Planning and Development, 211
Ministry of Foreign Affairs, 394
Ministry of Information, 394
Ministry of Women Development (MoWD), 353, 354, 355, 357, 361, 
363, 364, 368, 382
Mirza, Munawar, 114
Mirza, Naeem, 457
Mishra, Omprakash, 303
Moin-ul-Haq, 246
Moizuddin, Mohammad, 424
Pakistan Voluntary Health and Nutrition Association (PAVHNA), 440, 450, 452, 457
Pakistani nationalism, 315, 318, 320
Pakistani nationhood, 312, 315
Pakistani psychologists, 155, 161, 171
Pakistani scholars, 13, 19, 46, 222, 227, 392
Pakistani social scientists, 38, 43
Pakistani Society and the Intellectual Tradition of the West, 135
Pakistani-Islamic identity, 409
Participatory Rural Appraisal (PRA), 165, 166, 429
Pattan Development Organisation, 366, 439, 457
Peace Research Centre, 390
Peace Research Institute Oslo (PRIO), 389
Pervez, Ghulam Ahmad, 134, 142, 145, 151
Pervez, Muhammad, 7, 153, 171, 487
Piaget, Jean, 79, 102, 117
Planning Commission of Pakistan, 231
Plato, 48, 136
Political and constitutional development in Pakistan, 337
Political Economy, 13, 194, 195, 486
Politics of Pakistan, 36, 37, 44, 46
Population and Environment Communication Centre, 443
Population Studies, 201, 360
Poulantzas, Nicos, 318, 339
Poverty in Pakistan, 443
Powell, Baden, 222, 223
Prasad, Ishwari, 240
pre-Partition India, 42, 46, 178
Press Information Department (PID), 272, 278
Provincial Textbook Boards, 243
Public Services Commission, 155
Punjab Public Service Commission, 275
Pushto Academy, 417, 424
Q
Qasim, Muhammad Bin, 328
Qasmi, Ahmad Nadeem, 209
Qisas and Diyat Ordinances, 348
Qurat-ul-Ain Bakhteari, 92
Qureshi, Ishtiaq Hussain, 38, 48, 50, 51, 245
Qureshi, M. N., 75
Qureshi, S. K., 196
R
Rabbani, M. Ikram, 238, 254
Rahman, Tariq, 38, 85, 86, 123, 126, 403, 422, 423, 425, 426, 489
Rahman, Tariq, 403
Rais, Rasul Bux, 302, 303, 401
Rashid, Jamil, 194
Rauf, Muhammad A., 225
Regional Co-operation for Development (RCD), 40, 45
Regional Studies, 14, 26, 394
Rehman, Samina, 385
Rizvi, Hasan Askari, 29, 37, 51
Rosenau, James N., 29
Rousseau, 78, 126, 308
S
Sadeque, Najma, 50, 375
Said, Edward, 313, 422
Saigol, Rubina, 5, 50, 77, 127, 219, 343, 375, 385, 457, 471, 488
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Page Numbers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Salik, Siddiq</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sarkar, Jadunath</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sayeed, Khalid B.</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schellenberg, James A.</td>
<td>401</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Schimmel, Annemarie</td>
<td>406, 422</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School of Physiotherapy</td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Second World War</td>
<td>313, 387</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shafqat, Saeed</td>
<td>37, 42, 44, 47, 49, 51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shah Abdul Latif University,</td>
<td>16, 17, 18, 49, 94, 127, 164, 196, 197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shah, Mehtab Ali</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shahi, Nasim Hassan</td>
<td>50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shaheen, Anwar,</td>
<td>7, 234, 427, 485</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sharif, M. M.,</td>
<td>48, 50, 150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sharif, Nawaz</td>
<td>89, 355</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sheikh, Saeed</td>
<td>150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shirani, Hafiz Mahmood</td>
<td>423</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shirkat Gah Women’s Resource Centre</td>
<td>444</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shirkat Gah,</td>
<td>39, 367, 376, 378, 444, 445, 449, 456, 458</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Siddiqi, Ayesha</td>
<td>51, 53, 485</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Siddiqi, Farhan H.</td>
<td>387, 402, 485</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Siddiqi, Rehana</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Siddiqui, Rukhsana</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Simorgh,</td>
<td>39, 376, 377, 378, 385</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sindh Education Foundation</td>
<td>86, 125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sindh Text Book Board,</td>
<td>331, 340</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sindhi Adabi Board</td>
<td>248, 254</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sirhindi, Ahmad</td>
<td>241, 242</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Policy Development Centre (SPDC)</td>
<td>339, 445, 449, 456, 458</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Science Research Capacity in South Asia</td>
<td>234, 432, 457</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Sciences in Pakistan,</td>
<td>2, 4, 5, 7, 47, 49, 51, 174, 196, 219, 267, 301, 302, 339, 401, 402, 457, 459, 470, 485</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sindh,</td>
<td>367, 368, 430, 464</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Society for the Protection of Rights of Child (SPARC)</td>
<td>445, 448</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Society of Pakistani English Language Teachers (SPELT)</td>
<td>414, 417, 425</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Asia Institute of Heidelberg University</td>
<td>225</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Asia,</td>
<td>11, 13, 14, 21, 24, 28, 29, 30, 74, 75, 95, 109, 127, 225, 233, 235, 239, 247, 249, 254, 272, 286, 288, 301, 303, 360, 374, 376, 377, 390, 400, 401, 402, 404, 405, 406, 418, 422, 426, 474, 486</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation (SAARC),</td>
<td>392</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Asian Association of International Studies,</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South East Asia,</td>
<td>270, 286, 301, 316</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South East Asian Treaty Organiztion (SEATO),</td>
<td>270</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Special Session on Regional Co-operation for Development (RCD),</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spinoza,</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spooner, Brian</td>
<td>313, 339</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sungi Development Foundation,</td>
<td>446, 458</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sustainable Development Policy Institute (SDPI)</td>
<td>26, 39, 91, 366, 376, 378, 394, 442, 456</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Syed, G. M.,</td>
<td>254</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tablighi Jamaat</td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tahir, Pervez,</td>
<td>5, 51, 194, 196, 197, 459, 471, 472, 488</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Talbot, Ian</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Taliban regime</td>
<td>381</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tarar, Nadeem Omar</td>
<td>221, 487</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teaching Practice (TP),</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thardeep Rural Development Programme (TRDP),</td>
<td>446, 458</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tharparker</td>
<td>447</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
U

Uks, 447, 448, 458
Ullah, Shah Walli, 208
UN Conventions on the Rights of the Child, Islamic Law and Pakistan Legislation, 363
UNESCO Research Centre on Social and Economic Development in South Asia, 201
UNESCO, 201, 234, 274, 394
UNFPA, 231
UNIFEM, 369, 384
University Grants Commission (UGC), 2, 4, 7, 18, 20, 32, 169, 196, 197, 232, 250, 258, 262, 301, 332, 356, 367, 413, 470
University of Agriculture, Faisalabad, 201, 208, 214, 218
University of Azad Jammu and Kashmir, 258, 414
University of Heidelberg, Germany, 225, 227, 233
University of Jakarta, Indonesia, 366
University of London, 369
University of Lucknow, 225
University of Manchester, 368
University of Southern California (USC), 255
University of Sussex, 233, 485
Urban Resource Centre (URC), 439, 448
Urdu Journalism, 274
Urdu language, 98, 209, 275, 445, 448
Urdu Markazi Board, 254
Urdu Science Board, 248
USAID, 255, 465
USEFP NEWS, 234

W

Wage Board Award, 272
Wagha, Ahsan, 409, 424
Waseem, Mohammad, 29, 37, 51
Washington State University, 201
Weber, Max, 78, 313
Weiss, Anita, 458
Wheeler, R. E. M., 339
Wilder, Andrew, 50
Wittgenstein, 135
Wizarat, Talat, 29
Wolpert, Stanley, 50
Women Action Forum (WAF), 349, 397
Women Research and Resource Centre (WRRC), of the Fatima Jinnah Women University 357
World Summit on Social Development, 376

Y
Yusuf, Kaniz, 340

Z
Zafar, Fareeha, 375, 385
Zafar, S. M., 50
Zaheer, Hassan, 38
Zaidi, S. Akbar, 2, 44, 45, 51, 196, 197, 219, 402, 470
Zaidi, S. M. H., 171, 174
Zaidi, Zawar Hussain, 250
Zia regime, 72
Zia, Afiya Shaherbano, 375, 385, 457
Zia-ul-Haq, 116, 185, 188, 312, 319, 320, 323, 340, 348, 397, 461
List of Tables and Annexes

Teaching of International Relations in Pakistani Universities
Table 1: PhD and MPhil Theses Produced in Seven International Relations Departments by the Year 2002
Table 2: Theme of PhD and MPhil Theses Submitted in Seven Departments of International Relations by the Year 2002

Development of Philosophy as a Discipline
Table 1: The Number of MPhil and PhD Theses in the Field of Philosophy Produced During 1948 to 2001 in Four Universities of Pakistan

The State of the Discipline of Psychology in Public Universities in Pakistan: A Review
Table 1: The Number of MSc Students in Eight Postgraduate Departments of Psychology
Table 2: Research Topics of PhD Theses Produced During 1985-2000 Period
Table 3: Research Topics of MPhil Theses Produced During 1985-2000 Period

Sociology in Pakistan: A Review of Progress
Table 1: The Number of Sociology Departments with the Qualifications of Teachers and their Degrees (foreign or local) in years, 1963, 1987 and 2001 in Public Universities of Pakistan
Table 2: Number of MPhil and PhD Degrees in Sociology Awarded by Five Universities in Pakistan by 2001.
Annex 1: Number of Students and their MA theses at the Departments of Sociology in selected years at various universities across Pakistan

Anthropology in Pakistan: The State of Discipline
Table No. 1: The Profile of Teachers of Anthropology Department of Quaid-i-Azam University from 1976 to 2001
The Discipline of Public Administration in Pakistan
Table 1: The Programmes of Public Administration in Public Universities of Pakistan

Journalism and Mass Communication
Annex I: The Year Thirteen Universities and Colleges Started Offering Master Degree Programmes in Mass Communication

Area Studies in Pakistan: An Assessment
Annex I: Publications and Theses Produced by Six Area Study Centres in Pakistani Universities by the Mid of year 2004

Linguistics in Pakistan: A Survey of the Contemporary Situation
Annex I: PhD Degrees Awarded in Languages by Pakistani Universities (1957-2003)
Annex II: Doctoral Degree Holders in Linguistics/Applied Linguistics/Language-related Studies

Quantitative Development of Social Sciences
Table 1: Number of Departments, Teachers and their Qualifications in Pakistani Universities from 1963 to 2001
Table 2: Changes in Composition of Five Social Sciences Departments 1963-2001
Table 3: Changes in Relative Importance of Social Sciences Departments 1963–2001
Table 4: Changes in the Distribution of Teachers of Social Sciences during 1963-2001 by Categories of Disciplines
Table 5: Teachers’ Qualifications of Employment Oriented Disciplines Compared with Qualifications of Other Disciplines, 2001
Table 6: Degrees of Teachers in Three Categories of Disciplines in Different Years
Abbreviations

AI  Amnesty International
AIE  Ali Institute of Education
AIQU  Allama Iqbal Open University
AKRSP  Aga Khan Rural Support Programme
APPSA  All Pakistan Political Science Association
ASA  Administrative Science Association
ASR  Applied Socioeconomic Research
BA  Bachelor of Arts
BEd  Bachelor of Education
BZU  Bahauddin Zakariya University
CEDAW  Convention for the Elimination of All Forms of
CIDA  Canadian International Development Agency
COS  Council of Social Sciences
DDS  Department of Defence and Diplomatic Studies
DFID  Department for International Development
FAST  Foundation for Advancement of Science and
     Technology
FJWU  Fatima Jinnah Women University
FPSC  Federal Public Service Commission
HEC  Higher Education Commission
HRCP  Human Rights Commission of Pakistan
IAS  Institute of Administrative Sciences
IED  Institute of Educational Development
IER  Institute of Educational Research
ILO  International Labour Organisation
IMF  International Monetary Fund
IPRI  Islamabad Policy Research Institute
IPS  Institute of Policy Studies
IRS  Institute of Regional Studies
ISS  Institute of Strategic Studies
IWSL  Institute of Women’s Studies Lahore
JPR  Journal of Peace Research
LAMEC  Literacy and Mass Education Commission
LEAD  Literacy, Education and Development
LUMS  Lahore University of Management Sciences
MA  Master of Arts
MDM  Master of Development Management
MEd  Master of Education
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Full Name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>UNICEF</td>
<td>United Nations International Children’s Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WAF</td>
<td>Women Action Forum</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WID</td>
<td>Women in Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WRRC</td>
<td>Women Research and Resource Centre</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
COSS Publications

Books:

2. Inayatullah (ed.), *Towards Understanding the State of Science in Pakistan*, 2003

Monographs:


Bulletins:

5. COSS Bulletin No. 5, 2003
COSS Publications under Preparation

2. Professional Associations of Social Scientists in Pakistan: Some Case Studies.
Introduction to Council of Social Sciences, Pakistan [COSS]

Registered on 3rd June, 2000, Council of Social Sciences, Pakistan (COSS) is a service oriented, non-profit and autonomous organisation of social scientists. It is committed to:

- Work towards evaluating and raising the standard of social sciences.
- Fostering interdisciplinary orientation in social sciences and strengthening their links with natural sciences.
- Building and strengthening a community of social scientists belonging to different disciplines and working in recognised universities, research institutes and civil society organisations by providing them a platform that promotes interaction among them.
- Foster scientific approach among the public through means such as seminars, discussions in the media and dissemination of non-technical versions of outstanding works of social scientists in national and regional languages.

By January 2005 COSS had 293 members. They include 45 life members, 243 regular members and five institutional members. Since its inception COSS has reprinted the book The State of Social Sciences in Pakistan and published three books, Social Science in Pakistan in the 1990s, Towards Understanding the State of Science in Pakistan and Social Science in Pakistan: A Profile. It has also published three monographs, one by Ayesha Jalal, Religion as Difference, Religion as Faith: Paradoxes of Muslim Identity, second by S. Akbar Zaidi, The Dismal State of Social Sciences in Pakistan and third by Rubina Saigol, Becoming a Modern Nation: Educational Discourse in the Early years of Ayub Khan (1958-64). It has issued six bulletins, which carried reports on developments in Academia, publications and activities of social scientists and on seminars and conferences in which COSS members participated.

Council of Social Sciences, Pakistan [COSS]
Address: COSS, # 307, Dossal Arcade, Jinnah Avenue, Blue Area, Islamabad Tel. No. 051-2274565
Email addresses: coss@apollo.net.pk
Website www.coss.sdnpk.org
Printed at Pisces Enterprises, Islamabad